

A Very Brief Note on Why Bacterial Evolution has Physiology

James A Shapiro
DOI: 10.1113/JP284409

Corresponding author(s): James Shapiro (jsa@uchicago.edu)

The following individual(s) involved in review of this submission have agreed to reveal their identity: Michael J. Joyner (Referee #1); Denis Noble (Referee #2)

Review Timeline:

Submission Date:	24-Jul-2023
Editorial Decision:	07-Aug-2023
Revision Received:	10-Aug-2023
Accepted:	16-Aug-2023

Senior Editor: Laura Bennet

Reviewing Editor: Denis Noble

Transaction Report:

(Note: With the exception of the correction of typographical or spelling errors that could be a source of ambiguity, letters and reports are not edited. Depending on transfer agreements, referee reports obtained elsewhere may or may not be included in this compilation. Referee reports are anonymous unless the Referee chooses to sign their reports.)

Dear Dr Shapiro,

Re: JP-TR-2023-284409 "A Very Brief Note on Why Bacterial Evolution has Physiology" by James A Shapiro

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to The Journal of Physiology. It has been assessed by a Reviewing Editor and by 2 expert referees and we are pleased to tell you that it is acceptable for publication following satisfactory revision.

Please advise your co-authors of this decision as soon as possible.

The referee reports are copied at the end of this email.

Please address all the points raised and incorporate all requested revisions or explain in your Response to Referees why a change has not been made. We hope you will find the comments helpful and that you will be able to return your revised manuscript within 4 weeks. If you require longer than this, please contact journal staff: jp@physoc.org.

Your revised manuscript should be submitted online using the link in your Author Tasks: Link Not Available. This link is accessible via your account as Corresponding Author; it is not available to your co-authors. If this presents a problem, please contact journal staff (jp@physoc.org). Image files from the previous version are retained on the system. Please ensure you replace or remove any files that are being revised.

If you do not wish to submit a revised version of your manuscript, you must inform our journal staff (jp@physoc.org) or reply to this email to request withdrawal. Please note that a manuscript must be formally withdrawn from the peer review process at one journal before it may be submitted to another journal.

TRANSPARENT PEER REVIEW POLICY: To improve the transparency of its peer review process, The Journal of Physiology publishes online as supporting information the peer review history of all articles accepted for publication. Readers will have access to decision letters, including Editors' comments and referee reports, for each version of the manuscript, as well as any author responses to peer review comments. Referees can decide whether or not they wish to be named on the peer review history document.

ABSTRACT FIGURES: Authors may use The Journal's premium BioRender account to create/redraw their Abstract Figures (and any other suitable schematic figure). Information on how to access this account is here: <https://physoc.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/journal/14697793/biorender-access>.

This will enable Authors to create and download high-resolution figures. If authors have used the free BioRender service, they can use the instructions provided in the link above to download a high-resolution version suitable for publication. The link provided should only be used for the purposes of this submission. Authors will be charged for figures created on this account if they are not related to this manuscript submission.

LANGUAGE EDITING AND SUPPORT FOR PUBLICATION: If you would like help with English language editing, or other article preparation support, Wiley Editing Services offers expert help, including English Language Editing, as well as translation, manuscript formatting, and figure formatting at www.wileyauthors.com/eeo/preparation. You can also find resources for Preparing Your Article for general guidance about writing and preparing your manuscript at www.wileyauthors.com/eeo/prepresources.

REVISION CHECKLIST: Upload a full Response to Referees file. To create your 'Response to Referees' copy all the reports, including any comments from the Senior and Reviewing Editors, into a Microsoft Word, or similar, file and respond to each point, using font or background colour to distinguish comments and responses and upload as the required file type.

Please upload two versions of your manuscript text: one with all relevant changes highlighted and one clean version with no changes tracked. The manuscript file should include all tables and figure legends, but each figure/graph should be uploaded as separate, high-resolution files.

You may also upload:

- 'Potential Cover Art' for consideration as the issue's cover image
- Appropriate Supporting Information (Video, audio or data set: see https://jp.msubmit.net/cgi-bin/main.plex?form_type=display_requirements#supp).

We look forward to receiving your revised submission.

If you have any queries, please reply to this email and we will be pleased to advise.

Yours sincerely,

Professor Laura Bennet

Senior Editor
The Journal of Physiology
<https://jp.msubmit.net>
<http://jp.physoc.org>
The Physiological Society
Hodgkin Huxley House
30 Farringdon Lane
London, EC1R 3AW
UK
<http://www.physoc.org>
<http://journals.physoc.org>

EDITOR COMMENTS

Reviewing Editor:

Please consider the idea of a didactic figure.

Please also see 'Required Items' below to comply with the journal's requirements.

REFeree COMMENTS

Referee #1:

This short paper makes interesting points about populations of bacteria and how the cells in these populations interact, signal and transfer DNA. If the author cares to make a simple didactic figure for the paper that would excellent.

Referee #2:

This is a brief but very clear review on why and how bacteria use physiological messaging to enable their evolution. It would help some physiologists oriented towards vertebrate animal physiology to draw attention to the fact that, in addition to bacterial films, the microbiome in animals can use the same processes of lateral DNA transfer.

REQUIRED ITEMS

-Please include an Abstract Figure file, as well as the figure legend text within the main article file. The Abstract Figure is a piece of artwork designed to give readers an immediate understanding of the Review Article and should summarise the main conclusions. If possible, the image should be easily 'readable' from left to right or top to bottom. It should show the physiological relevance of the Review so readers can assess the importance and content of the article. Abstract Figures should not merely recapitulate other figures in the Review. Please try to keep the diagram as simple as possible and without superfluous information that may distract from the main conclusion of the Review. Abstract Figures must be provided by authors no later than the revised manuscript stage and should be uploaded as a separate file during online submission labelled as File Type 'Abstract Figure'. Please ensure that you include the figure legend in the main article file. All Abstract Figures will be sent to a professional illustrator for redrawing and you may be asked to approve the redrawn figure before your paper is accepted.

-Your MS must include a complete "Additional information section" with the following 4 headings and content:

Competing Interests: A statement regarding competing interests. If there are no competing interests, a statement to this effect must be included. All authors should disclose any conflict of interest in accordance with journal policy.

Author contributions: Each author should take responsibility for a particular section of the study and have contributed to writing the paper. Acquisition of funding, administrative support or the collection of data alone does not justify authorship; these contributions to the study should be listed in the Acknowledgements. Additional information such as 'X and Y have contributed equally to this work' may be added as a footnote on the title page.

It must be stated that all authors approved the final version of the manuscript and that all persons designated as authors qualify for authorship, and all those who qualify for authorship are listed.

Funding: Authors must indicate all sources of funding, including grant numbers. If authors have not received funding, this must be stated.

It is the responsibility of authors funded by RCUK to adhere to their policy regarding funding sources and underlying research material. The policy requires funding information to be included within the acknowledgement section of a paper. Guidance on how to acknowledge funding information is provided by the Research Information Network. The policy also requires all research papers, if applicable, to include a statement on how any underlying research materials, such as data, samples or models, can be accessed. However, the policy does not require that the data must be made open. If there are considered to be good or compelling reasons to protect access to the data, for example commercial confidentiality or legitimate sensitivities around data derived from potentially identifiable human participants, these should be included in the statement.

Acknowledgements: Acknowledgements should be the minimum consistent with courtesy. The wording of acknowledgements of scientific assistance or advice must have been seen and approved by the persons concerned. This section should not include details of funding.

-Author profile(s) must be uploaded via the submission form. Authors should submit a short biography (no more than 100 words for one author or 150 words in total for two authors) and a portrait photograph of the two leading authors on the paper. These should be uploaded, clearly labelled, with the manuscript submission. Any standard image format for the photograph is acceptable, but the resolution should be at least 300 dpi and preferably more. A group photograph of all authors is also acceptable, providing the biography for the whole group does not exceed 150 words.

-Please include a full title page as part of your article (Word) file (containing title, authors, affiliations, corresponding author name and contact details, keywords, and running title).

END OF COMMENTS

Confidential Review

24-Jul-2023

RESPONSE TO REFEREE COMMENTS

Referee #1:

This short paper makes interesting points about populations of bacteria and how the cells in these populations interact, signal and transfer DNA. If the author cares to make a simple didactic figure for the paper that would be excellent.

- The Graphical Abstract will serve that purpose.

Referee #2:

This is a brief but very clear review on why and how bacteria use physiological messaging to enable their evolution. It would help some physiologists oriented towards vertebrate animal physiology to draw attention to the fact that, in addition to bacterial films, the microbiome in animals can use the same processes of lateral DNA transfer.

- I have added a reference to microbiome biofilms in the human intestine.

Dear Professor Shapiro,

Re: JP-TR-2023-284409R1 "A Very Brief Note on Why Bacterial Evolution has Physiology" by James A Shapiro

We are pleased to tell you that your paper has been accepted for publication in The Journal of Physiology.

TRANSPARENT PEER REVIEW POLICY: To improve the transparency of its peer review process, The Journal of Physiology publishes online as supporting information the peer review history of all articles accepted for publication. Readers will have access to decision letters, including Editors' comments and referee reports, for each version of the manuscript, as well as any author responses to peer review comments. Referees can decide whether or not they wish to be named on the peer review history document.

The last Word (or similar) version of the manuscript provided will be used by the Production Editor to prepare your proof. When this is ready you will receive an email containing a link to Wiley's Online Proofing System. The proof should be thoroughly checked and corrected as promptly as possible.

Authors should note that it is too late at this point to offer corrections prior to proofing. The accepted version will be published online, ahead of the copy edited and typeset version being made available. Major corrections at proof stage, such as changes to figures, will be referred to the Editors for approval before they can be incorporated. Only minor changes, such as to style and consistency, should be made at proof stage. Changes that need to be made after proof stage will usually require a formal correction notice.

All queries at proof stage should be sent to: TJP@wiley.com.

Are you on Twitter? Once your paper is online, why not share your achievement with your followers? Please tag The Journal (@jphysiol) in any tweets and we will share your accepted paper with our 30,000 followers!

Yours sincerely,

Professor Laura Bennet
Senior Editor
The Journal of Physiology
<https://jp.msubmit.net>
<http://jp.physoc.org>
The Physiological Society
Hodgkin Huxley House
30 Farringdon Lane
London, EC1R 3AW
UK
<http://www.physoc.org>
<http://journals.physoc.org>

P.S. - You can help your research get the attention it deserves! Check out Wiley's free Promotion Guide for best-practice recommendations for promoting your work at www.wileyauthors.com/eeo/guide. You can learn more about Wiley Editing Services which offers professional video, design, and writing services to create shareable video abstracts, infographics, conference posters, lay summaries, and research news stories for your research at www.wileyauthors.com/eeo/promotion.

IMPORTANT NOTICE ABOUT OPEN ACCESS: To assist authors whose funding agencies mandate public access to published research findings sooner than 12 months after publication, The Journal of Physiology allows authors to pay an Open Access (OA) fee to have their papers made freely available immediately on publication.

The Corresponding Author will receive an email from Wiley with details on how to register or log-in to Wiley Authors Services where you will be able to place an order.

You can check if your funder or institution has a Wiley Open Access Account here: <https://authorservices.wiley.com/author-resources/Journal-Authors/licensing-and-open-access/open-access/author-compliance-tool.html>.

EDITOR COMMENTS

Reviewing Editor:

Thank you for dealing with the suggested revisions.
