THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

Making up Problems: International Non-Governmental Organizations and Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

By

Valentine Hallard

August 2022

Paper submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Master of Arts degree in the
Master of Arts Program in the Social Sciences

Faculty Advisor: Jennifer Cole
Preceptor: Mary Elena Wilhoit

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

Abstract:
In Madagascar, child domestic work is a long-standing and widespread practice. Previously ignored in global discussions on child labor, since the 2010s, the domestic work performed by girls has gained substantial attention among international organizations and (I)NGOs and has been redefined as a form of exploitation. While there has been extensive research on the different conceptions of childhood that intertwine in shaping child labor, there has been little consideration for the problematization of child labor at a particular moment in time. In this paper, I argue that understanding the sudden interest in girls' domestic work requires first considering how it has been problematized. Drawing from Foucault's concept of problematization, I show that the reframing of girls' domestic work as a form of exploitation in the ILO report (2012) and (I)NGOs' discourses is embedded in broader social, economic, and political dynamics. As global discourses and intermediaries condemn the work performed by girls, they define certain factors – education, family, culture, commodification, and poverty – as objects of knowledge and power. In particular, global discourses on girls' domestic work shift the attention away from substantive drivers of poverty and associate child suffering with local forms of kinship and cultural practices. These discourses have the effect of controlling young women's bodies, material desires, movement, and kinship relations while benefiting local intermediaries, who position themselves as an emerging middle-class. In so doing, they disconnect children from their family and community, thus enhancing their social and economic disadvantage.

<center>**Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar**</center>

<center>**Making up problems: International Non-Governmental Organizations and Girls'
Domestic Work in Madagascar**</center>

> *Increasingly impoverished families send their children to work in other families in the hopes that the host families will support them materially and maybe even provide them with an education…; "less poor" households are employing children of "poorer" households for domestic work in exchange for "peanuts" paid to their parents. Some children work under civil debt bondage. The United Nations Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of slavery noted that [in Madagascar] "the exploitation of child domestic workers is comparable to domestic servitude" (*The Association for Women's Rights in Development*, 2014).[1]

Introduction

In Madagascar, one of the poorest countries in the world, child domestic work is a widespread practice that has long historical roots.[2] For centuries, children have been sent to perform domestic work for other families, including taking care of younger children, cleaning the house, doing the laundry, buying food, and cooking (Ballet and Bhukuth 2010; Gardini 2020; Sharp 1996, 2002). Previously understood as a mere subcategory of child labor, since the 2010s, however, the domestic work performed by girls has gained substantial attention among international organizations and child-focused (I)NGOs.[3] In parallel with girls' empowerment discourses, policymakers, and international and national aid workers now largely condemn girls' domestic work.[4] Several campaigns have been conducted in Malagasy cities to prevent young girls from engaging in domestic labor.

The percentage of children aged between five and seventeen engaged in domestic work was reported to be as high as 11 percent in 2007.[5] Among them, 44,81% were between 10 and 12 years old at the time of their first employment (UNICEF 2018). The umbrella term

---

[1] Available at: https://www.awid.org/news-and-analysis/fight-against-exploitation-underage-domestic-workers-madagascar

[2] Madagascar's Human Development Index (HDI) is at 164 out of 189 countries and territories (UNDP).

[3] (I)NGO is the acronym for (International) Non-Governmental Organizations.

[4] For example, the "Programme international pour l'abolition du travail des enfants" (IPEC) in collaboration with ILO, the Ministry for the Civil Service and Social Laws, and UNICEF, 2008. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/ipecinfo/product/download.do?type=document&id=9350

[5] ENTE, "Programme international pour l'abolition du travail des enfants" (IPEC), 2007.

Valentine Hallard

domestic work encompasses a variety of working conditions, ranging from kin-based labor to slavery-like situations. Specifically crucial to the Malagasy extended-family economy, young girls' labor clearly plays an important role in individuals' survival strategies (Delaunay 2013). Yet, global discourse tends to focus only on the harmful and exploitative aspects of the practice. In recent years, domestic work has been increasingly associated with traffic, migration, violence, sexual abuse, and forms of bondage (Gardini 2020).

This paper attempts to expand on scholarly understandings of girls' domestic work – designated as work done by those aged five to fifteen – by asking why this long-standing practice has been problematized now and who benefits from such concerns and prohibitions. Most specifically, I am concerned with investigating what has made the work performed by girls a pressing concern for national and international actors. What are the effects of this discourse on the people who depend upon or engage in such work? How does this discourse impinge upon Malagasy girls' socioeconomic needs or family obligations? And what do such designations tell us about international organizations and (I)NGOs interests in broader dynamics of social, economic, and political changes in Madagascar and the Global South?

The reframing of domestic work as a form of exploitation by international organizations and child-focused (I)NGOs can be understood in part as a response to policies of economic liberalization that took place in Madagascar in the early 1990s. Since then, unbridled capitalist activities combined with state corruption have contributed to the country's impoverishment. Yet, the sudden interest in children's domestic work cannot be solely understood as a response to poor working conditions and degradation of standards of living. Global discussions on girls' domestic work are shaped by universal standards that tend to ignore the plurality of childhood. To comprehend why girls' domestic work has become an object of concern in the last decade, we must acknowledge that different conceptions of childhood co-exist. We also need to investigate how girls' domestic work has been

problematized. Global discourses are always translated at the local level by intermediaries who problematize some issues and not others as an object of knowledge and power (Merry, 2006). In this paper, I bring together insights from the critical literature on childhood and child labor in the global south and Madagascar with Foucault's concept of problematization. Based on ten interviews conducted with (I)NGOs working in Madagascar, I analyze the International Labour Organization (ILO) document on child domestic labor (2012), along with (I)NGOs discourses, to show that this practice is constructed as a problem that arose as a consequence of the lack of education, family, culture, commodification, and poverty, and requires specific responses. Finally, I examine the consequences of this problematization for the actors involved in it.

Global Childhood, the Problem of Child Labor, and the Work of International Organizations and (I)NGOs

Processes of globalization have contributed to raising awareness and giving visibility to disadvantaged childhood worldwide. Growing attention has been directed toward global problems that children encounter, including poverty, war, sexual exploitation, and abuse. In an era of children's rights and globalization, child workers represent a category of victims whose "stolen childhood" justifies the moral imperative of humanitarian actions (Bluebond-Langner and Korbin 2007). International organizations, including UNICEF and the ILO, exercise a large amount of power, depicting children's suffering as a problem and urging human actors, particularly in the Global North, to take action in the Global South.

In the collective imagination, the essence of humanitarianism lies in saving children's lives (Malkki 2015). This project can be traced back to the 19th century and the emergence of the image of the innocent child in Europe. It culminated in 1959 with the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of the Child, later replaced by the Convention on the Rights of the

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

Child (CRC) in 1989. The ratification of the CRC by many governments from the Global South took place within processes of globalization and the proliferation of (I)NGOs in the 1990s and 2000s. Despite efforts to assert regional autonomy, the CRC remains shaped by universal standards based on "modern" theories of social progress and child development (Cheney 2019).

In most definitions, child labor is described as conditions that "harm children's physical, developmental, and social well-being and impede their access to education" (Hinrichsen 2017, 84). The CRC marked a turning point in the global movement to end child labor, characterized by "a moral preoccupation with abolition through legislation and a zealous belief in the desirability of extending Western childhood ideals to poor families worldwide" (Nieuwenhuys 1996, 241).

The moral condemnation of child labor by the Global North combined with a top-down approach to children's rights risks reproducing colonial imaginaries of the North-South divide. Literature on African childhood often focuses on children who are victims of poverty, war, or illness (e.g., Archambault 2011; Howard and Millard 1997; Lockhart 2008). By focusing on childhoods that are considered the most marginal or "at-risk," this literature tends to depict African children as fundamentally deviant from universal standards defined by the Global North. An excessively narrow focus on marginalized children risks pathologizing African childhood and reproducing stereotypes of disadvantaged childhood.

The presence of child labor has become an indicator of modernity and development, embedded in broader processes of diffusion of western norms and values. "Modern" societies are marked by a conceptual shift in the valuation of children. In the Global North, the "useful child" who contributes to the family economy has been replaced by the economically "useless child" yet emotionally priceless (Zelizer 1985). In contrast, child labor in the Global South has been defined as a sign of underdevelopment (Nieuwenhuys 1996). While global

discourses largely condemn child labor, similar activities, such as working for the family or for "pocket money," are not considered harmful. "Work is alright so long as it is unpaid; children may also work for pay when they do not need to (for "pocket money") but not when they need to; children may help their parents' income earning efforts … only if their parents own a family enterprise, but not if they are propertyless wage-workers" (Ennew et al. 2005, 28). The Northerners' ideas of what constitutes a "normal" childhood are exported around the world. As children work outside of what has been institutionalized as acceptable forms of work by the Global North, they are considered to suffer from abnormal childhood, thus justifying the intervention of humanitarian actors.

Global discussions surrounding child labor are shaped by homogenized definitions based on western representations of childhood; these definitions tend to ignore important strategies by which young people try to achieve survival, assert rights, and obtain education (Okyere 2012), as well as undermine the network of social relationships in which children are embedded (André and Godin 2014). By proposing a universal standard of childhood embedded in civilizational trajectories of Western modernity, global discourse does not reflect local notions of childhood and children's material conditions outside the Global North (Hart 2006). The predominance of a western conceptualization of childhood in humanitarian discourses and practices may obscure the social, economic, and historical dimensions of children's lives while attributing "deviancy" from western standards to local forms of parenthood or cultural beliefs.

Representations of childhood and children as embodying the future have been mobilized by international organizations and (I)NGOs to promote education and condemn child labor in the Global South in ways that have proven socially problematic. For example, the human capital approach to childhood emphasizes the crucial role of children in contributing to society's economic future (Bolotta and Devine 2022). However, this approach conflicts with

the immediate needs of families living in extreme poverty. Often, children's contribution to the household economy is indispensable to household survival. These different conceptions of temporality – the futurity of childhood and the present needs of poor families – constitute domains of contention.

Malkki (2010) notes that children are generally considered "supra-political," as though they exist beyond the realm of politics. Children are constructed as the embodiment of innocent humanity, disconnected from the cultural and historical context that shapes their subjectivities (Ibid, 80). Such decontextualized images of childhood embody politics of future-making shaped by the circulation of Western social values, technologies, and professional forces (Scheper-Hughes and Sargent 1998). Children's humanitarian policy has become the place of ideological struggle over the political future of childhood, as lobbyists compete to define how childhood – and society's future broadly construed – should be legislated. Malkki proposes to rethink children "as *subjects* – as *persons* and not just as elementary forms of our shared humanity" and to adopt a political reading to children and their representation in the humanitarian realm (2010, 110).

Much of the tension present in global debates over child labor arises from different views of what constitutes "childhood" and children's agency and from the fact that the Western conception of childhood has been presented as a universally accepted and shared reality (Khan 2010; Rosen 2007). Anthropological research has long demonstrated that there is no single, universal understanding of childhood (Montgomery 2009; Lancy 2015); rather, childhood is a social and historical construct that varies widely across and within different societies (James and Prout 1990). A growing body of ethnographies acknowledges youth agency in Africa (e.g., Cole 2004, 2010; Weiss 2009). The "new sociology of childhood" opposes the idea that children are incomplete beings and passive actors and instead emphasizes children's ability to act and interpret the world around them (Allerton 2016).

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

Recent studies situate children and youth in relation to the future and focus on their role in processes of globalization (e.g., Cole and Durham 2008). As we investigate the role of international and humanitarian discourse, it is essential to recognize how youth are thus vessels through which notions such as risk and hope are negotiated (Ibid).

Western interest in "saving" children in the Global South is a powerful justification for interventions by foreign powers. In her study of population control and "girls' empowerment" in Uganda, for example, Moore (2018) argues that institutional forces increasingly control women's reproductive labor. Under the guise of "empowerment," the INGO structures the economic and social life of many young women, transforming them into "economically fit and thus reproductively circumscribed subjects" (Ibid, 83). In a similar vein, Gardini (2020) argues that rhetoric on the transnational "traffic" of Malagasy domestic workers is part of wider global political strategies that aim to control migratory trajectories. As national and international institutions seek to control and shape young women's labor, sexuality, and mobility, they fail to acknowledge the underlying causes of such practices. Global discourses on child labor systematically ignore the economic and political forces that impact children in the first place (Omoike 2014). Not only do they refuse to question the global allocation of power and resources (Hickel 2014), but they also disguise the broader political agenda (Gardini 2020).

The help offered by Northerners to Southerners is, then, far from being neutral but is embedded in political-economic agendas and cultural regimes (Burman 2017). International organizations and (I)NGOs shape – and are shaped by – global discourses about the value of childhood, global education, and society's future. These global discourses are embodied in health policies, education programs, and child labor policies that aim at reconstructing local childhoods according to universal standards of the "modern child" (Bolotta and Devine 2022). However, the idea that childhood's value should move from economic to emotional

reflects middle-class Northerners' ideals and should not be translated outside this context (Bolotta 2020). This is especially true in situations of widespread poverty where children's participation in the household economy is particularly important to the family's survival.

<u>Norms of childhood in Africa and Madagascar</u>

Madagascar can be regarded as a key site for humanitarian interventions. Early child marriage, child labor, sex tourism, violence, and poverty have been defined as problems that need to be urgently addressed. Since the late 1980s, non-state actors such as international organizations and (I)NGOs have become highly influential. The Malagasy government has become inextricably linked with networks of transnational actors (Duffy 2006). However, the global representations of Malagasy children as powerless victims in need to be saved by local and international actors may considerably differ from children's realities and positionalities.

Children play a crucial role in forging relations in Africa and beyond. In her study of Cameroonian migrant mothers, Feldman-Savelsberg (2016) demonstrates that through their children, women expand their network of social relationships both in Africa and in Europe. Similarly, Coe (2013) shows that children's physical location plays a crucial role in reproducing kinship and society at large. For example, the practice of fostering – a dynamic and distributed form of parenting – challenges Western understanding of the family as an emotionally stable unit and care as unidimensional.

Moreover, in many African countries, children's economic contribution to the household and lineage is perceived as a structural requirement. Parents raise children in part to benefit from their labor force, an old-age pension, or social security. For example, Einarsdottir (2004) notes that in Guinea-Bissau, because infant mortality is very high, women want to have as many children as possible to "help with work, contribute to their emotional well-being, take care of them in old age" (Ibid, 86). Children's work is crucial to family livelihood

Valentine Hallard

strategies and is part of broader hierarchical systems that promote interdependence. Fass (2016) shows that this conception of childhood contrasts sharply with the American form of childhood that promotes children's independence and little parental control.

In Madagascar, fulfilling kinship obligations is particularly important. As Cole (2010) demonstrates, in the town of Tamatave, in Madagascar, many young women obtain money through sexual and intimate relations. They further redistribute the money to their kin. These flows of resources are necessary for constructing persons and social relations. Through sexual and intimate relations, young women cultivate relations of sociality and become themselves an integral part of familial life. In this context, the social worth of children lies not only in their emotional value but also in their economic potential. Sharp notes that children are among "the most precious forms of wealth that can be shared among kin" (2002, 261). Children frequently circulate among different households to respond to economic and emotional needs. The economic value of children is particularly important for women, who rely heavily on children to maintain their households. Children have always worked in the family sphere. The word *asa* traditionally refers to work owed to kin and ancestors (Feeley-Harnik 1984). An ideology of kin-based effort requires each family member to participate in domestic labor according to their age, gender, and position in the kin group. Successful children are those who contribute to the economic independence of their family members. Malagasy children also allow their parents to secure a respectable funeral, attain the status of ancestors, and perform ancestral rituals (Rovalolomanga and Schelemmer 1994). Having descendants is thus crucial, and infertility is perceived as a curse.

In Madagascar, sending children to perform domestic work for other families has a long history, embedded into debt repayment, domestic labor, and child fosterage (Gardini 2020). The rise of liberalized economies and their entanglement with national and international institutions provide new contexts for the life course of children. Since the 1990s, economic

crises and structural adjustment measures have affected the practice of child circulation (Ballet and Bhukuth 2010). The practice has intensified, the motivations have changed, and the movement patterns have diversified.

There are different ways for children to become domestic workers. Domestic work can take place within the family through the practice of fosterage (Delaunay 2013). The foster family offers care (e.g., food, accommodation, education) in exchange for the child labor force. However, the line between the expected domestic tasks of foster children and exploitation is often crossed. Children who are fostered by kin are exposed to many forms of discrimination and are more likely to be exploited. Current conditions of child circulation within the extended family often place children in a situation of vulnerability and put them at risk of violence or sexual abuse. Poverty, Delaunay (2013) contends, has transformed the social norms of child circulation. Children are increasingly placed in foster families for economic reasons. Furthermore, the recruitment of child domestic workers can occur through an intermediary, either known to the family or a representative from a placement agency (Ballet and Bhukuth 2010). When the placement is made by an intermediary or an agency, the parents do not know the family in which their children are placed and thus have limited control over their children's working conditions. Young girls usually work for three to four years for the same employer (Ibid). When they reach 16 years old, employers often end the contract. One of the reasons is that younger children are supposedly more compliant, docile, and highly dependent on their employers. As girls get older, they become independent and more difficult to control. Moreover, as they reach puberty, they are perceived as a threat to the employer's spouse, who fears sexual relations between their husband and the domestic worker (Ibid). Because employers usually do not employ married or pregnant workers, they control young women's sexuality and free time (Gardini 2020).

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

International organizations and (I)NGOs play a particularly crucial role in transmitting and translating children's rights concepts from the Global North to the Global South. In recent years, they have redefined domestic work as highly exploitative. According to them, child abuse and violence are widespread. The average working time for domestic children is 14 hours and can reach 18 hours per day (INGO Sentinelles). Working children start work early, between four and six o'clock in the morning, and stop around six to eight o'clock in the evening. Insults and psychological violence toward children are common, as are various forms of physical violence, including deprivation of food, deprivation of wages and rest periods, and even beatings and rape. While most (I)NGOs emphasize the sense of powerlessness that girls in situations of exploitation experience, others highlight their agency. Young girls may escape from their employer's household. In these cases, they find themselves on the street, often with no other option than to engage in juvenile prostitution (NGO Sarobidy; INGO ECPAT France). Others rebel against exploitative working conditions by stealing property or food, or in rare cases, by attempting to take their employer's life (INGO Sentinelles). Although the working conditions of children and the financial compensation that they receive for their work vary considerably, employers have a considerable amount of power over domestic workers.

Problematizing Child Labor in the Global South

International organizations and (I)NGOs present a universal standard of childhood that excludes child labor. Yet, the definition of child labor as a global problem does not account for the diversity of contexts, nor for the plurality of children's experiences. Global discussions on child labor remain, nonetheless, highly influential in shaping attitudes, values, and behaviors, as well as national and international actions. In addition to being negotiated by various actors, child labor is problematized at a certain moment in time. By investigating how

certain aspects of child labor have been made into problems, one can better understand how this problematization shapes specific international and humanitarian responses.

From a Foucauldian perspective, the notion of "problematization" draws attention to how and why certain things and not others become problems and the consequences of particular framings for the ways in which the "development of a given into a question … transform[s] a group of obstacles and difficulties into problems to which the diverse solutions will attempt to produce a response" (Foucault 2000, 118). Problematization has real effects on the world. The discourse surrounding child labor needs to be historically situated and considered within economic, social, and political structures of power. The way child labor is thought about, described, and spoken of, deeply influences and shapes both international and national actions. Thus, the ways in which one particular discourse is mobilized to represent reality impact how policies and projects will be implemented (Khan 2010).

The framing of problems determines not only how discourse is shaped but also how it is contextualized. Examining social currents genealogically enables one to investigate "Why a problem and why such a kind of problem, why a certain way of problematizing appears at a given point in time" (Foucault 2007, 141). The emphasis on certain social issues affecting children, rather than others, is historically and culturally situated. For example, Fass (1997) demonstrates that the act of abducting, murdering, or abusing children is nothing new, but their meaning took on new cultural importance in the last century. She shows how the problem of kidnapping has transformed over time, becoming a complex phenomenon that reflects changing sexual norms, cultural fears, and the spread of mass media. Kidnapping is publicly represented in a sense that is culturally relevant, capturing and representing problems that are considered urgent in their time.

In a similar vein, "prostitution" has been problematized at a certain moment in time. Its condemnation took place in the late 18th century in the broader context of regulation of

sexuality through discourse as a way of exercising power (Foucault 1980). Poor women, and especially "prostitutes," have been the object of state scrutiny and disciplinary control. As Agustìn (2005) explains, social reforms targeted "deviant" people who did not embrace the middle-class' ideology. The bourgeoisie sought to regulate the working class by promoting moral standards, particularly the norm of the nuclear family and the values of domesticity. The dominant discourse on "prostitution" positioned sex workers as victims in need of rescue and control. The middle-class also developed a sense of pity for poorer women and children and a strong desire to help them. Philanthropy became an appropriate form of employment for middle-class women who were considered the most legitimate to care for poor women, especially the "prostitutes."

Drawing from Fabian (1983), the need to help lower social classes is embedded in different time scales in which the bourgeois way of life was considered more "advanced" in comparison to the "backwardness" of poverty. The presupposed capacity for rational thinking provided the middle-class with the duty to care for and "civilize" the poor. Amidst the institutionalization of the social sector, the professionalization of help has proliferated among middle-class women. These careers continue to serve the interests of the dominant class and provide them with a social status they would probably not have reached otherwise (Agustìn 2005).

The consequences of the problematization are manifold. The importation of concepts such as children's rights or the deployment of certain ideas about gender from the Global North can destabilize local structures that govern social reproduction. For example, drawing from the concept of gender panic, Cole and Moore (2020) argue that some recent cases of gender-based violence in the Global South can be attributed to the disruption of gender hierarchies caused by global policies of economic liberalization that took place in the 1980s and 1990s. Gender panic appears as a response to the disturbance of social structure and the demand for

greater social control. It also reflects the willingness of a certain portion of the population to return to more "traditional" values. In the same vein, the diffusion of empowerment initiatives in the Global South does not necessarily reflect women's realities, aspirations, and self-representations, and can have unintended effects. Drawing from the concept of *aspirant feminism*, Moore (2016) argues that participation in transnational feminist movements constitutes a path for young women in the Global South to achieve upward social mobility and material wealth while reproducing class differences.

Historically, discussions of child labor were characterized by significant gender disparities. On the one hand, the work of boys – especially in factories – was generally recognized and condemned. On the other hand, girls and women's economic contributions to households, although productively essential, remained ideologically invisible at the global level (Nieuwenhuys 1994). Marxist feminists have long decried such blind spots, explaining that the social devaluation of domestic work is intrinsically linked to the gendered and racialized dimension of the labor force (Gutiérrez-Rodrìguez 2010). The past two decades, however, have witnessed a growing debate over girls' domestic work in the global south and the growth of an international campaign committed to its abolition (Jacquemin and Tisseau 2019). International organizations and child-focused (I)NGOs advocate against domestic work in a blanket way, increasingly conflating it with women and children trafficking and modern slavery.

An analysis of the ILO Report and (I)NGOs' Discourse on Girls' Domestic Work

In 2012, the ILO published a report on the domestic work performed by children under fifteen years old in Madagascar. [6] In a preliminary investigation conducted in the Malagasy

---

[6] *Madagascar, Etude de base sur le travail domestique des enfants* / Organisation internationale du Travail, Programme international pour l'abolition du travail des enfants (IPEC) - Genève: OIT, 2012 – 108 p.

capital, Antananarivo, international experts noted disparities in the regions that provided

domestic workers. Many child workers came from the central regions of Amoron'i Mania,

Analamanga, and Vakinankaratra. The report aimed to build a general understanding of

domestic work, assess why these regions provide more children than others and offer tailored

solutions to this issue. According to the ILO, the factors that explain why children engage in

domestic work are related to education, family, culture, and poverty. In addition, the

commodification of childhood has been defined by UNICEF as a determinant factor in

explaining child domestic work. Using these factors as a frame of reference, I will analyze

how girls' domestic work has been problematized in global discourse.

The ILO Report and (I)NGOs' Discourse

According to the ILO report and (I)NGOs' discourse, education and work are mutually

exclusive. Children engage in domestic work because they are not in school. Non-enrollment

can be caused by living too far from a school or by a lack of financial resources to attend

(inability to afford school materials, uniforms, transportation, etc.)[7]

Marie, a French woman in her mid-fifties, is responsible for the INGO Madamoramora.

The organization has built three schools in the region of Ranomafana because "the biggest

problem in Madagascar is education." Without education, she contends, "how can you think

by yourself?" On several occasions, the directors of the schools called Marie to inform her

that some parents wanted to remove young girls from school and send them to work as

domestics in the capital, Antananarivo. In these situations, Marie intervenes by organizing

special meetings with the parents. She tries to convince them of the importance of school, at

least until the end of primary school.

---

[7] Madagascar is the 5th country in the world with the highest number of children who do not attend school. 30% of children have never been to school and 66% of children do not finish primary school, World Bank.

Valentine Hallard

The ILO report further emphasizes the role of the family in explaining the issue of child labor. Families often undermine the importance of education and instead encourage their children to work. Parents' level of education is determinant in sending children to work. The less educated the parents are, the more likely they will send their children out to work instead of school. [8] As a representative of UNICEF told me during an interview, "because parents are not educated, they are not aware of the risk … they don't think by themselves and follow what the others do."

[The parents] need to understand that school is important, that they must send their children to school. Education is the key to success. So, we educate the parents; we explain to them that if they want to overcome their situation, they need to send their children to school (INGO Aïna).

Parents' responsibility is further highlighted by the representative of UNICEF, who affirms that "to prevent this form of exploitation, everything starts with a change in parents' behavior." Marie, from the INGO Madamoramora, adopts a more nuanced stance, noting that "it is not *always* [the parents'] fault."

The family structure is construed as another contributing factor in girls' domestic work. The larger the family, the more expenditure is required, leading impoverished parents with no choice but to send young girls to work in cities. In doing so, they have fewer family members to take care of and obtain a much-needed supplementary source of income. Not only do large families encourage domestic work, but divorced parents and single-parent families are also perceived as a significant factor explaining child labor. Because they are less financially stable, single parents often rely on child labor to make ends meet.

The ILO report further states that if the three regions mentioned above provide more domestic labor than the rest of the country, this is for cultural reasons. Notably, the funerary

---

[8] In 2012, 3 600 000 people older than 15 years old were illiterate, UNESCO.

ceremony, the *Famadihana,* which takes place in central highland Madagascar, leads local families to promote this form of labor. The *Famadihana* is organized around the memory of ancestors whose presence in the lives of their descendants is of predominant importance in Madagascar. The ritual is held for the purpose of "transferring a body from a temporary grave to its ancestral tomb, or from one tomb to another, or simply to open a tomb and remove the bodies temporarily for the purpose of wrapping them in new *lambamena*, or silk shrouds" (Graeber 1995, 259). The *Famadihana* involves substantial costs for the ancestor's family around whom the ceremony is organized. According to the NGO Sarobidy – which works in collaboration with the ILO – parents send young girls to work in cities (from January to February) to afford the cost of the *Famadihana* (from July to September).

INGOs also point to the role of gender inequality in domestic work. The INGO ECPAT France currently works on a project co-financed by the French Agency of Development and the European Union Delegation, addressing the issue of gender and promoting equality between men and women.[9] The Malagasy representatives of ECPAT France explain that in Malagasy culture, women are subordinated to men. Violence against women and girls is widespread, especially in the household, and as they grow up, young girls interiorize a position of inferiority. For this reason, ECPAT France "attack(s) gender inequality to break it down." They intervene in schools to "educate and sensibilize on gender issues, on gender stereotype, and equalitarian relations."

Additionally, the "commodification of childhood" is mentioned as a critical factor explaining domestic work. As the representative of UNICEF Madagascar remarks, many young girls want to go to cities to work as domestics to attain a certain standard of living. As girls' domestic workers return to their home village for holidays, they demarcate themselves from those who have not left the village. They have phones, nice clothes, and "cities'

---

[9] ECPAT is initially an acronym for End Child Prostitution in Asian Tourism.

haircuts." They proudly display these commodities, rendering other girls envious. In turn, the others may decide they want to work in the cities to access these highly-prized commodities and modern lifestyles. This constitutes a real problem, the responsible of UNICEF contends; cities attract young girls with promises of modernity. As they wish to forge an identity and signal femininity, these young girls fall into the traps of urban consumerism. This problem is reasserted by the NGO Sarobidy, which deplores the consequences of "globalization, Facebook, internet and so forth" that create unnecessary needs for young girls who live in the countryside. Social media are a real challenge to development because now, Marie argues, "children see many things that they want to reproduce and commodities they want to acquire … many of them want to leave for Europe."

Finally, poverty is mentioned as a factor contributing to domestic work. Because many Malagasy have poor income and live below the poverty line, they need to send their children to work. The ILO report states that as families' living standards diminished, the percentage of children who engage in domestic work rises. This observation is reasserted by small INGOs, such as Les enfants de Tana (created in 2008), who emphasize the high level of poverty as the main reason for sending children to work; "they are so poor that they have no other choice than to send their children to work."

Analyzing the Discourse on Girls' Domestic Work

Having spelled out the main reasons girls engage in domestic work – as primarily reported in the ILO report – let me now analyze this discourse. First of all, the order chosen by the ILO demonstrates the value it gives to each factor. Although the ILO report acknowledges that poverty is the first reason given by the respondents, it is the last reported in the document. The report does not reflect individuals' voices but assigns its own value to the reasons for sending children to work. From this perspective, education, family, and

culture prevail over poverty in explaining girls' domestic work. Thus, growing attention is being paid to the interrelation of these factors.

The lack of education is perceived as a significant impediment to thinking by oneself and making good decisions regarding children's education. Uneducated parents are deemed incapable of making an informed decision about what constitutes the best interest of their children. According to international organizations and (I)NGOs, children must learn, and that learning must take place in school and other formalized institutions. In saying this, they undermine other forms of learning that take place within the family, the community, or through work (see Lancy 2018). Global education is perceived as a fundamental right that all societies should seek to achieve. The ILO states that "the single most effective way to stem the flow of school-age children into abusive forms of employment is to extend and improve schooling so that it will attract and retain them" (ILO 1996). Going to school is thought to prevent children from engaging in economic activities, therefore, avoiding exploitation and abuse. However, contrary to reports' construction of education in opposition to child labor, it has been empirically demonstrated that school and child labor often go hand in hand. In many cases, formal education is not achievable without work. For example, Sharp (2008) explores the phenomenon of children who relocate to the Malagasy town of Ambanja, by themselves, in order to attend school. In view of their parents' poor income, these children are economically responsible for sustaining themselves. Children migrants who succeed in school are those who develop urban survival strategies, in other words, those who work. Many of them, however, do not succeed and live in situations of extreme precarity. Unable to handle school and work, many children abandon school and return to their parents' village.

Education is a means that affects a lot of other changes. For example, the correlation between education and women's fertility has long been recognized (e.g., Martìn and Juàrez 1995). Education is associated with the increased use of contraception, delayed marriage, and

eventually, a decline in fertility rates (Singh and Casterline 1985) and the reduction of family size (Caldwell 1980). In Madagascar, early marriage and early age at first birth are constructed as problems and schooling as the solution. Educational attainment of girls (and their parents) results in delaying marriage, first birth, and total fertility (Glick et al. 2015). Schooling is also thought to produce gender equality and greater bargaining power within marriage (Ibid).

It is often assumed that children do not want to work and instead want to go to school. From international organizations and (I)NGOs' perspectives, work is perceived as a constraint that is imposed on children by their parents. However, in many cases, young people make the decision to work for reasons of their own. For example, Montgomery (2001), in her study of child prostitution in Thailand, demonstrates that children who engage in prostitution do not perceive themselves as victims who deserve compassion and pity. Rather, they are social agents who have the ability to make decisions for themselves. She deconstructs the model of childhood innocence that shapes much of Northern opinions and policies and critically engages with the moral panic around child prostitution. Children's views change radically from those of Northerners; "prostitution, for the children themselves, is not an issue of morality versus immorality, but of turning a socially unacceptable form of earning into a way of fulfilling their familial obligations" (Ibid, 157). While international organizations and (I)NGOs often referred to the well-being of children and constructed education as holding the promise of a better future, children more explicitly refer, for example, to the responsibility they have toward their parents or the advantages of working.

Global discussions on girls' domestic work reveal implicit and explicit values about family and parenthood. The decision to involve children in child labor is strongly motivated by parents, who – unaware or uneducated – normalize child labor at the expense of children. In emphasizing the parents' role in the decision to send children to work, international

organizations and (I)NGOs directly held them responsible for harmful practices that may impact children. Moreover, these discourses refer to the nuclear family as the primary caregiver for children, thus undermining other forms of family organizations. In Madagascar, children belong to the extended kinship rather than the nuclear family, and the role of kin in childcare is of predominant importance (Delaunay 2013). Children frequently circulate among different households where they are taken care of by members of their extended kinships over a certain period. Conversely, the CRC states that the nuclear family is the "natural environment" for the growth and well-being of children (preamble), and adoption must be considered only when it is in "the best interest of the child" (article 21). The reshaping of children's upbringing as a global social issue does not necessarily fit with local conceptions of parenthood.

(I)NGOs adopt global discourses which they then transpose to local realities; intermediaries connect local, regional, national, and international levels (Fisher 1997). These (I)NGOs share common interests with their international donors and the help recipients without whom they would not exist. In the NGO Sarobidy, one person oversees project proposals. His job consists in applying to international projects to obtain the financial support necessary to implement projects at the local level. This is how the NGO got involved in a one-year project – which has been extended twice – addressing the issue of AIDS in Madagascar in the 2000s, and since 2014, in projects related to domestic work. The NGO is entirely dependent on international donors and short-term contracts. As they adopt top-down approaches, they have limited options. They cannot promote community interests if they differ from international donors' interests.

Global ideas about gender relationships are directly translated from the Global North to the Global South. Along with the importance of education, gender equality is globally perceived as the *sine qua non* condition for girls' empowerment. For example, making girls

more independent and more capable of deciding what is best for them is a crucial principle shared by many (I)NGOs. Hanitra, a Malagasy aid worker in her mid-thirties working for the INGO Aïna, told me, "Our objective is to accompany [women] toward autonomy so that they are no longer dependent." Talking about the different trainings offered by the INGO, she continued, "It really depends on what the beneficiary [of the program] wants to do. We encourage them to find their life project, know what they really want to do." These (I)NGOs want to offer young women the opportunity to decide what is best for them. In so doing, they reflect broader global discourses of women's political, social, and psychological empowerment, notably the importance of self-esteem, that have emerged in the development industry. As Hanitra explains,

> Personal development is very important. The problem we encounter the most in our projects is young mothers' lack of self-esteem and confidence. Very often, the young mother thinks that she is incapable of achieving something, so she is stuck … self-esteem is really what we need to build so that they can achieve a project.

Since the early 1990s, girls' low self-esteem has been a pressing concern for development agencies and (I)NGOs, especially in the Global South. Moore (2016), in her study of girls' empowerment initiatives in Uganda, demonstrated that the interest in girls' presumed crisis of self-esteem emerges from western developmental psychology. To reach their full potential, women must overcome their lack of confidence. However, Northerners' emphasis on the lack of self-esteem and self-confidence does not necessarily fit with local experiences and representations of the self. The issue of personal development and the "problem" of self-esteem, as developed by Hanitra, is directly translated from global discourse on women's empowerment and a cross-cultural conception of women as subordinates.

The focus on women's "subordinate" position in relation to men or the lack of self-esteem is drawn from a specific representation of gendered relationships that does not always reflect

local perspectives. In Madagascar, women have a strong sense of agency in gender relations (Cole 2004, 2010). During the fieldwork I conducted in 2019 on the island of Nosy Komba, located off the Western coast of Madagascar, one of my informants, Sita, told me, "here, it is always the woman who keeps all the money and who decides how it will be spent." Although the intersection of age, kinship, economic capital, and social position considerably influence women's ability to negotiate gender relationships, they are supposed to have economic power within the household. Women's status in Malagasy society thus differs from the global perception of women as inherently subordinate. Yet, global concepts are routinely applied here, notwithstanding the plurality of local contexts. In so doing, they undermine women's sense of agency, entrepreneurship, and drive.

Empowerment discourses objectify poor, racialized girls by portraying them as the recipient – yet active agent – of development. Since the late 1990s, girls in the Global North have been constructed as ideal neoliberal subjects, shaped by liberal feminist principles of individual empowerment, choice, and self-invention (Gonick 2006). International agencies and (I)NGOs campaigns have contributed to displaying the image of the uneducated girls, victims of culture and patriarchal structures, that need urgent help from the Global North to reach their potential and contribute to the development of their nation. Global discourses of an empowered neoliberal girlhood objectify the lives of disadvantaged girls around the need to save them.

According to UNICEF, unhealthy exposure to the market renders young girls highly vulnerable to moral corruption. Children are usually depicted as innocent beings, in contrast to the market-mediated corruption of adult life (Bauman 2006). As they rescue children from domestic work, (I)NGOs are also concerned about saving young girls from their consuming and un-childlike desires. As they criticize the adverse consequences of commodified girlhood, (I)NGOs do not recognize the socializing effect of commodities. Nor do they

acknowledge the essential role it plays in forming identities. Many girls in Madagascar are looking for social recognition and a sense of identity associated with material consumption (see Cole 2010). (I)NGOs' discourses against children's consumption directly oppose cultural practices and the formation of girlhood. Moreover, the representative of UNICEF argues that it is mainly because of this desire for commodities and modernity that the line between domestic work and prostitution is crossed. Because they are used to having access to commodities and pocket money, some girls decide to engage in prostitution after being domestic workers. Once they are used to a particular lifestyle, it is also difficult for them to return to living in the countryside. As Cole (2004) demonstrates, transactional sex is nothing new in Madagascar, yet the practice has undergone significant changes as a consequence of policies of economic liberalization in the early 1990s. While young women previously mobilized their sexual capacity to attain adulthood and reinforce kinship relationships (Ibid), transactional sex is now increasingly encouraged by youth's interest in consumer goods and the hope for a "modern lifestyle" (Cole 2004; Stoebenau et al. 2011).

Poor racialized girls in the global south who do not attend school are perceived as suffering from a "backward" culture. Young girls are presented as being trapped by cultural beliefs that inevitably lead to a vicious cycle of child labor, prostitution, and poverty. In contrast, normative childhood ideals are promoted among international agencies and (I)NGOs that position the racialized girl in the Global South as aspiring to a Western form of girlhood, thus ironically exacerbating the need to purchase commodities and participate in consumer culture.

Finding Solutions to Problems

The ways in which girls' domestic work have been problematized by international organizations and (I)NGOs produce particular responses. To tackle the problem of girls'

domestic work, international and national actors now propose a universal standard based on rights discourses, emphasizing girls' education, empowerment, and sexual health. These discourses, however, may have the effect of controlling young women.

<u>Rights Discourses</u>

In recent years, there has been a growing interest in informing the population about child's rights at the national and regional levels. UNICEF Madagascar is working on a national project that aims to include child's rights in the school curriculum. Likewise, (I)NGOs increasingly insist on the importance of knowing the "rights of the child" in many of their projects. Nataly, a French woman in her mid-forties from the INGO Aïna, explained that within their program of professional reintegration for young mothers, "once a month, during half a day, there is the mandatory school. During this time, we work on women's rights and the child's rights. It is very important for us." The right of the domestic worker is equally important. Before working on a project that strictly condemns girls' domestic work, the NGO Sarobidy developed solutions to make domestic work more bearable. The critical component of the campaign was to teach young girls their rights; "children need to know their rights. If the law says that they can work from 8 in the morning until 5 in the evening, and the employer asks them to work more, then they can cite the Malagasy articles of the penal code … After our training, they all know the 100 pages of Malagasy law." In cases where girls' domestic work is inevitable, the strategy adopted by the NGO was to reinforce working girls' knowledge of the law to limit the risk of exploitation. However, it has been shown that it is not a lack of knowledge of the law that encourages employers to be violent or exploitative toward their employees. Gardini (2020) explains that in Madagascar, domestic workers' working conditions are shaped by the intersection of age, gender, origin, class, and the ability to deploy one's social network. Poor working conditions, he pursues, are mainly due to the workers' poor rural origin, their young age, and their inability to mobilize kinship

relationships. Rights discourses, nonetheless, allow for state intervention in the affairs of the family and the community. The state implements social welfare, compulsory education, and labor legislation on behalf of children.

Controlling Movement

The law might also be used as a direct tool to control domestic workers. The NGO Sarobidy, in an attempt to limit domestic work, actively tried to change the Malagasy law. Because domestic work results from migration from rural areas to urban ones, they thought that prohibiting interregional movement for children would limit domestic work. The NGO proposed a communal draft law to the deputies of the region of Vakinankaratra. The deputies, however, did not approve the project because it opposed the "right to circulate freely." This attempt demonstrates that for the NGO, circulation is a fundamental problem that needs to be addressed. Because of interregional migration, young girls go to the cities to work as domestic workers and thus are exploited. If the movement from poor areas was prohibited, families would not be tempted to send their daughters to the cities. Yet, the more impoverished individuals are people living in the countryside; by confining them to rural areas, these projects may further marginalize them. Moreover, such a proposal profoundly conflicts with the long tradition of Malagasy movement. Historians and ethnographers have documented the historical propensity for Malagasy people to circulate, affirming, for example, that "Everywhere and always we find movement!" (Deschamps 1959, cited in Feeley-Harnik 1991, 1). Since the neoliberal policies of the early 1990s, the expansion of capitalist activities has triggered an unprecedented movement of people within and beyond the country. Therefore, preventing the right to circulate is profoundly disconnected from Malagasy people's realities.

Controlling Sexuality

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

International organizations and (I)NGOs seek to help young women navigate their intimate life. UNICEF proposes the "Life Skills" program that teaches young girls different skills to "better manage their lives." Offered at school and in community structures, this program addresses some common issues that young women face, such as "questions related to puberty and how to prevent early pregnancy." It also provides information regarding more specific prevention systems (e.g., family planning) that these young girls can access. This program is part of a larger attempt from the Malagasy government to tackle the issue of early sex. Since 2016, the government has expanded the school curricula to include sexual education, mainly focusing on the dangers associated with teenage sexuality.[10] This concern is shared by all the (I)NGOs I interviewed. Some of them talked about the lack of awareness of sexual health; others deplored the lack of access to birth control. All interviewees were critical of early pregnancy, considering it an obstacle to building a better future. Nicole, a French woman in her mid-sixties from the INGO Les Enfants de Tana, told me that the main problem she encountered was that many young girls – around 15 years old – got pregnant and were compelled to drop out of school. On several occasions, Nicole used the expression "lost generation" to describe these young girls. This view reflects most development discourses that consider teenage pregnancy an obstacle to personal and national development.

In addition to conducting awareness campaign, some (I)NGOs directly intervenes in young girls' reproductive decisions. One of the conditions to entering the program of the INGO Aïna is for young mothers to formally engage not to have more children during the training, which last three years.

Here in our center [contraception] is really mandatory for young mothers. Why is it mandatory? Because it's going to be difficult if they get pregnant during the training or

---

[10] Article available at: https://www.africanews.com/2016/03/28/madagascar-to-combat-teenage-pregnancy-through-school-curriculum/

the internship. So, we told them that family planning [contraception] is mandatory. If they have health problems and cannot go to the family planning, we ask the young mothers to sign a commitment letter: if they get pregnant, they will be removed from the training. So, they need to be responsible; it's like this.

In this case, the INGO's involvement in reproductive issues is evident. Given the length of the training, it might pose certain problems. However, the message is unequivocal: one cannot be pregnant and follow professional training simultaneously. The INGO uses direct coercion to control reproductive behaviors and practices. In general, it is perceived as an obstacle to girls' empowerment. According to the United Nations (in Cairo, 1994):

Early childbearing continues to be an impediment to improvements in women's educational, economic, and social status in all parts of the world. Overall, for young women, early marriage and early motherhood can severally curtail educational and employment opportunities and are likely to have a long-term, adverse impact on their and their children's quality of life.

Early pregnancy is not only constructed as a threat to education but also to the production of the modern subject, whose function is assessed in terms of economic productivity within development discourses.

What Does the Discourse on Girls' Domestic Work do?

Global discourses focus on certain aspects of child labor, deemed to be the most exploitative, and ignore the others. In doing so, they create problems that necessitate specific responses and benefit certain actors.

Downplaying Poverty

Global discourse's focus on culture and local forms of kinship results in downplaying poverty. The ILO undervalues poverty in a video describing the issue of domestic work and

the actions undertaken by the international organization in collaboration with the Malagasy NGO, Sarobidy. [11] In this video, a representative of the ILO says, "We are often told: "we send our children out to work because we're poor" … but it's time to look at things the other way round: you're poor because you send your children out to work." This sentence emphasizes the responsibility of the parents while undermining the role of poverty in explaining child labor. Poverty appears not as the reason but as the consequence of child labor. These discourses associate child labor with the parents and local forms of kinship while shifting the attention away from more substantive drivers of poverty.

In many instances, what might be perceived as a violation of the child's rights in the Global North may be considered a vital mechanism for group solidarity in the Global South. Hinrichsen (2017) demonstrates that child labor is not a choice contrary to the neoliberal conception of individual responsibility. All too often, the parents are considered responsible and blamed for sending their children to work. However, child labor is often the best option that these people have. The global discourse on child labor undermines the broader structural issue of poverty and its impact on families.

Justify Humanitarian Intervention

The reframing of domestic work as an exploitative practice justifies external intervention. Marie, who was introduced above, emphasizes the profound "need to help" enmeshed in discourses and images of disadvantaged childhood. Just like many others, she decided to create her INGO following a trip to Madagascar, during which she "could not bear" the poverty she witnessed and felt an urgent need "to do something for them." Helping "poor" children become for (I)NGOs a moral and global legal imperative. To emphasize the need for intervention, one French aid worker told me that "in the countryside, it's still feudal time." This conceptualization of "otherness" has deep-rooted historical origins. This comment

---

[11] Video available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Px6ThbQe0XY

echoes classical literature that presupposes that "non-western" societies were embedded in a timeless state before being "found" and "saved" by the "West." Defined as "traditional," in contrast to the more advanced and modern "West," the "other" belongs to a different space-time (Fabian 1983), clearly separated from the aid worker's reality. This conceptualization of the "other" results in highly asymmetrical relationships between donors and recipients.

The construction of childhood within aid discourses includes intrinsic "needs" based on children's nature rather than their social environment. Aid discourses, like those discussed by Marie, make children the singular object of aid and development, separated from their social environment. Such narratives reinforce the difference between perception and experience, reifying the child away from family and community. This representation of childhood justifies international interventions that aim at "rescuing" children from the local culture—defining, in the meantime, local forms of childhood as less valid.

<u>Gaining status: the emerging middle-class</u>

Global discourses hinge upon the neocolonial assumption that girls from the Global South are oppressed by their culture and need to be saved by western bodies (see Abu-Lughod 2002; Mohanty 1988). Local actors embrace global discourse on children's rights and position themselves as child-saviors. The discourse surrounding child labor, and more recently, domestic work, can be seen as profiting the emerging Malagasy middle-class (I)NGOs aid workers. Since the 1990s and the "globalization" of Madagascar, local middle-class people and elites have seized the opportunity offered by (I)NGOs to establish their social position. Because of this new focus on domestic work, several Malagasy NGO workers have experienced social mobility. (I)NGOs offer the opportunity for urban individuals to attain a new social status and to be part of an emerging middle-class, distinguishing themselves from poorer communities.

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

The problematization of domestic work transforms childhood into humanitarian and developmental tools that serve the interests of an emerging social class of "helpers." (I)NGOs have become a vehicle for upward mobility. These workers have certain advantages compared to the rest of the population, as well as power and authority over beneficiaries. By reifying the inferior position of children and their families, the "helpers" enhance their social status while reproducing structural inequalities and class hierarchies. They act as another medium of social control by intervening in young women's lives.

Conclusion: From Child Labor to Exploitation

In Madagascar, policies of economic liberalization adopted in the early 1990s have been followed by increasing economic disparities. In response to the degradation of the economy and the increased poverty, international organizations and (I)NGOs propose a standard based on the (fixed) nuclear family, education, international rights, and sexual health. However, the beliefs of international agencies and (I)NGOs regarding what should constitute a normal childhood may differ radically from those of children and families. All too often, there is a discontinuity between the global ideologies of childhood and the social, economic, and cultural realities of children and their families. For many children, global discourses do not translate into social changes and personal empowerment.

A focus on the problematization of girls' domestic work allows us to better understand how and why this practice has been redefined as a form of exploitation and who benefits from it. The recent interest in girls' domestic work is not the result of a change in the conception of women's reproductive labor, nor does it demonstrate the success of development or girls' empowerment initiatives in the Global South. These global discourses have the effect of controlling young women's bodies, material desires, movement, and kinship relations while benefiting local intermediaries who position themselves as an emerging middle-class. In so

Valentine Hallard

doing, they disconnect children from their family and community, thus enhancing their social and economic disadvantage. As global discourses and intermediaries condemn the work performed by girls, they shift the attention away from more substantive drivers of poverty and associate child suffering with local forms of kinship and cultural practices. By conflating the domestic work performed by girls with modern slavery or trafficking, they condemn the whole practice. They do not acknowledge the variety of situations that child workers encounter, nor do they listen to children and families' experiences of these phenomena. Myriad factors intertwine to create the conditions in which girls work. Child domestic work may certainly be exploitative. For poor families, work is also a mechanism for survival, often conceived as an integral part of family life and children's socialization.

International organizations and (I)NGOs have the potential to destabilize critical social values and norms. The "discovery" of domestic work in the 2010s and its problematization as a form of slavery or domestic servitude has not been accompanied by an easing of children's suffering, nor has it enhanced their rights. Conversely, such attention might even, as I have demonstrated here, be harmful.

.

Girls' Domestic Work in Madagascar

Bibliography:

Abu-Lughod, Lila. 2002. "Do Muslim Women Really Need Saving? Anthropological Reflections on Cultural Relativism and Its Others." *American Anthropologist* 104 (3): 783-790.

Agustìn, Laura Marìa. 2005. "Helping Women Who Sell Sex: The Construction of Benevolent Identities." *Rhizomes* 10.

Allerton, Catherine. 2016. "Introduction: Encountering Children." In *Children: Ethnographic Encounters*, edited by Catherine Allerton. London: Bloomsbury Academic.

André, Géraldine, and Marie Godin. 2014. "Children's rights in the Democratic Republic of Congo and neoliberal reforms: The case of mines in the province of Katanga." In *Children's Lives in an Era of Children's Rights: The Progress of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in Africa*, edited by Afua Twum-Danso Imoh and Nicola Ansell. London: Routledge.

Archambault, Caroline S. 2011. "Ethnography Empathy and the Social Context of Rights: "Rescuing" Maasai Girls from Early Marriage." *American Anthropologist* 113 (4): 632-643.

Ballet, Jérôme and Augendra Bhukuth. 2010. "Les enfants domestiques Madagascar." *Bulletin d'information sur la population de Madagascar* 53: 1–4.

Bauman, Zygmunt. 2006. "Children Make You Happier… and Poorer." *International Journal of Children's Spirituality* 11 (1): 5–10.

Berman, Jacqueline. 2003. "(Un)Popular Strangers and Crises (Un)Bounded: Discourses of Sex-trafficking, the European Political Community and the Panicked State of the Modern State." *European Journal of International Relations* 9(1): 37-86.

Bluebond-Langner, Myra and Jill E. Korbin. 2007. "Challenges and Opportunities in the Anthropology of Childhoods: An Introduction to "Children, Childhoods, and Childhood Studies." *American Anthropologist* 109 (2): 241-246.

Bolotta, Giuseppe. 2020. *"Children."* In *Humanitarianism: Keywords*, edited by De Lauri A. Leiden: Brill, 25–27.

Bolotta, Giuseppe and Dympna Devine. 2022. "Contested futures: The 'Humanitarian value' of childhood in rural Sierra Leone. *Current Sociology Monograph* 70 (4): 557-577.

Burman, Erica. 2017. *Deconstructing Developmental Psychology*. Routledge.

Caldwell, John Charles. 1980. "Mass education as a determinant of the timing of fertility decline." *Population Development Review* 6: 225–255.

Cheney, Kristen. 2019. "Anthropology and the Politics of Childhood in Africa." In *A Companion to the Anthropology of Africa*, edited by Grinker Roy Richard, Stephen C. Lubkemann, Christopher B. Steiner, Euclides Gonçalves. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Coe, Cati. 2013. *The Scattered Family: Parenting, African Migrants, and Global Inequality.* Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.

Cole, Jennifer and Deborah Durham. 2008. *Figuring the Future: Globalization and the Temporalities of Children and Youth.* School for Advanced Research Press.

Cole, Jennifer and Erin Moore. 2020. "Gender panics in the global south." *Anthropological Quarterly* 93 (3): 275-288.

Cole, Jennifer. 2004. "Fresh Contact in Tamatave, Madagascar: Sex, Money, and Intergenerational Transformation." *American Ethnologist* 31 (4): 573-588.

---- 2010. *Sex and Salvation: Imagining the Future in Madagascar.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Delaunay, Valérie. 2013. "L'exploitation économique des enfants à Madagascar à partir de l'Enquête démographique et de santé 2008." *Population* 68 (2): 331-348.

Duffy, Rosaleen. 2006. "Non-governmental organisations and governance states: The impact of transnational environmental management networks in Madagascar." *Environmental Politics* 15 (5): 731-749.

Ennew, Judith, William E. Myers and Dominique Pierre Plateau. 2005. "Defining child labor as if human rights really matter," In *Child Labor and Human Rights: Making Children Matter*, edited by Burns H. Weston. London & Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 27–54.

Einarsdottir, Jònìna. 2004. *Tired of Weeping: Mother Love, Child Death, and Poverty in Guinea-Bissau.* University of Wisconsin Press.

Fabian, Johannes. 1983. *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Fass, Paula S. 1997. *Kidnapped: Child Abduction in America*. New York: Oxford University Press.

---- 2016. *The End of American Childhood: A History of Parenting from Life on the Frontier to the Managed Child*. Princeton University Press.

Feeley-Harnik, Gillian. 1984. "The Political Economy of Death: Communication and Change in Malagasy Colonial History." *American Ethnologist* 11 (1): 1-19.

---- 1991. *A Green Estate: Restoring Independence in Madagascar*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Feldman-Savelsberg, Pamela. 2016. *Mothers on the move: reproducing belonging between Africa and Europe*. Chicago: University Press.

Fisher, William F. **1997.** "Doing good? The Politics and Antipolitics of NGO Practices." *Annual Review of Anthropology*. 26: 439-64.

Foucault, Michel. 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-79*. New-York: Pantheon.

Foucault, Michel. 2000. Polemics, politics and problematizations: An interview with Michel Foucault. In *Essential works of Michel Foucault 1954-84. Ethics: Subjectivity and truth*, edited by P. Rabinow, 1: 111-120. London, England: Penguin.

Foucault, Michel, Sylvère Lotringer, and Lysa Hochroth. 2007. *The politics of truth*. Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e).

Gardini, Marco. 2020. "The risk of sliding down: Domestic work and the legacies of slavery in the highlands of Madagascar." *American Ethnologists* 47 (3): 264-275.

Glick, Peter, Christopher Handy and David E. Sahn. 2015. "Schooling, marriage and age at first birth in Madagascar." *Population Studies* 69 (2): 219-236.

Graber, David. 1995. "Dancing with Corpes Reconsidered: An Interpretation of "famadihana" (In Arivonimamo, Madagascar)." *American Ethnologist* 22 (2): 258-278.

Gonick, Marnina. 2006. "Between Girl Power and Reviving Ophelia: Constituting the Neoliberal Girl Subject." *NWSA Journal* 18 (2): 1–23.

Gutiérrez-Rodrìguez. 2010. *Migration, Domestic Work and Affect: a Decolonial Approach on Value and the Feminization of Labor*. New-York: Routledge.

Hart, Jason. 2006. "Saving Children. What Role for Anthropology?" *Anthropology Today*, 22(1): 5–8.

Hinrichsen, Megan B. 2017. "Encountering Work: Intergenerational Informality, Child Labor, and Malnutrition in Urban Ecuador." *Anthropology of Work Review* 38: 81-91.

Hickel, Jason. 2014. "The 'girl effect': liberalism, empowerment and the contradictions of development." *Third World Quarterly* 35 (8): 1355-1373.

Howard, Mary Theresa and Ann V. Millard. 1997. *Hunger and Shame: Child Malnutrition and Poverty on Mount Kilimanjaro*. New York: Routledge.

Jacquemin Mélanie, and Violaine Tisseau. 2019. "Le Balai comme Object Politique. Regards sur les Domesticité en Afrique." *Politique Africaine* 154: 5-27.

James, Allison and Alain Prout. 1990. *Constructing and Reconstructing Childhood: Contemporary Issues in the Sociological Study of Childhood*. London: Falmer.

Khan, Ali. 2010. "Discourses on Childhood: Policy-Making with Regard to Child Labour in the Context of Competing Cultural and Economic Preceptions." *History and Anthropology* 21 (2): 101-119.

Lancy, David. 2015. *The anthropology of childhood: cherubs, chattel, changelings*. Cambridge: University Press.

---- 2018. *Anthropological Perspectives on Children as Helpers, Workers, Artisans, and Laborers*. New-York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Lockhart, Chris. 2008. "The Life and Death of a Street Boy in East Africa: Everyday Violence in the. Time of AIDS." *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 22 (1): 94-115.

Malkii, Liisa. 2010. "Children, humanity, and the infantilization of peace." In *In the Name of Humanity: The Government of Threat and Care,* edited by Ilana Feldman and Miriam Iris Ticktin. Duke University Press.

---- 2015. *The Need to Help: The Domestic Arts of International Humanitarianism*. Duke University Press.

Martìn Teresa C. and Fatima Juarez. 1995. "The Impact of Women's Education on Fertility In Latin America: Searching for Explanations." International Perspectives on Sexual and Reproductive Health 21 (2): 52-57-80.

Merry, Sally Engle. 2006. "Transnational Human Rights and Local Activism: Mapping the Middle." *American Anthropologist* 108 (1): 38-51.

Mohanty, Chandra. 1988. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." *Feminist Review* 30 (1): 61-88.

Montgomery, Heather. 2001. *Modern Babylon? Prostituting Children in Thailand*. UK: Berghahn Book.

---- 2009. *An introduction to childhood: anthropological perspectives on children's lives.* Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Moore, Erin. 2016. "Postures of Empowerment: Cultivating Aspirant Feminism in a Ugandan NGO." *Ethos: Journal of the Society for Phycological Anthropology* 44 (3): 375-396.

Moore, Erin. 2018. "Idle Women, Bored Sex, and the Temporal Interventions of Population Control." *Voices* 13 (1): 74-87.

Nieuwenhuys, Olga. 1994. *Children's Lifeworlds, Gender, Welfare and Labour in the Developing World*. London: Routledge.

Nieuwenhuys, Olga. 1996. "The Paradox of Child Labor in Anthropology." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 25: 217-251.

Okyere, Samuel. 2012. "Are working children's rights and child labour abolition complementary or opposing realms?" *International Social Work* 56 (1): 80-91.

Omoike, Evelyn. 2014. "In the best interest of the child: The case of child domestic workers in Ghana and Nigeria." In *Children's Lives in an Era of Children's Rights: The Progress of the Convention on the Rights of the Child in Africa*, edited by Afua Twum-Danso Imoh and Nicola Ansell. London: Routledge.

Rovalolomanga, Bodo and Bernard Schelemmer. 1994. "De l'enfant richesse à l'enfant fardeau: l'enfant au travail à Madagascar et sa place dans l'imaginaire." *Travail, capital et société*. 27 (2): 216-232.

Rosen, David M. 2007. "International Humanitarian Law, and the Globalization of Childhood." *American Anthropologist* 109 (2): 296-306.

 ---- 2002. *The Sacrificed Generation: Youth, History, and the Colonized Mind in Madagascar.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

 ---- 1996. "The Work Ideology of Malagasy Children: Schooling and Survival in Urban Madagascar." *Anthropology of Work Review* 17 (1-2): 35-42.

Sharp, Lesley. 2008. "The Work Ideology of Malagasy Children: Schooling and Survival in Urban Madagascar." *Anthropology of Work Review* 17 (1-2): 35-42.

Scheper-Hughes, Nancy and Carolyn Fishel Sargent. 1998. *Small Wars. The Cultural Politics of Childhood*. University of California Press.

Singh Sanajaoba and John Casterline. 1985. "The socio-economic determinants of fertility." In *Reproductive change in developing countries: insights from the World Fertility Survey,* edited by John Cleland and John Hobcroft, pp. 199–222. London, UK: Oxford University Press.

Stoebenau, Kristen, Stephanie A Nixon, Clara Rubincam, Samantha Willan, Yanga ZN Zembe, Tumelo Tsikoane, Pius T Tanga, Haruna M Bello, Carlos F Caceres, Loraine Townsend, Paul G Rakotoarison and Violette Razafintsalama. 2011. "More than just talk: the framing of transactional sex and its implications for vulnerability to HIV in Lesotho, Madagascar and South Africa." *Globalization and Health* 7 (34).

Weiss, Brad. 2009. *Street Dreams and Hip Hop Barbershops: Global Fantasy in Urban Tanzania, Tracking Globalization*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Zelizer, Viviana A. 1985. *Pricing the Priceless Child: The Changing Social Value of Children*. New-York: Basic Books.