

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

RECOGIMIENTO AND THE MEMORY OF GOD

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO
THE FACULTY OF THE DIVINITY SCHOOL
IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

BY

ANDREW REINSCH

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS

MARCH 2017

DEDICATION

To Becky and Grammy. This one is done, so I will get to work on the next thing to make you read.

Copyright © 2017 by Andrew Reinsch
All Rights Reserved

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	v
INTRODUCTION	1
THE ADVANCE OF INTERIOR SPIRITUALITY	7
BUILDING THE <i>ABECEDARIO</i> IN A TRADITION OF SPIRITUAL EXERCISES.....	41
THE CHARACTER AND NATURE OF <i>ALUMBRADISMO</i>	66
DISTINGUISHING GOD IN THE MEMORY	106
<i>EKPHRASIS</i> AND THE REFLEXIVE MEMORY OF GOD.....	143
CONCLUSION.....	180
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	185

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This dissertation would not have been possible without the support of Susan Schreiner. Since 2004, she has repeatedly rejected the option to leave this alone and instead chose to tear through it completely. I am deeply grateful for this trail of destruction. The insight and advice of my reading committee has also been incredibly helpful, and so I would like to thank Willemien Otten and David Nirenberg for pushing me to think deeper and investigate new sources. Additionally, I have depended on the support of the larger Divinity School community in the frequent moments when I had no idea what I was doing. Margaret Mitchell, Teresa Hord Owens, and Sandy Norbeck were always prepared to indulge any ridiculous question I had.

Finally, I would like to thank my family and friends. When this nonsense started, I never would have guessed how many people would be necessary to make it happen and how entirely prepared so many people would be to do anything to help. My parents, Bill and Susan, and my brother Christian never broke character and always told me this was something worth doing. My grandmother, Margaret Polley, never stopped pushing for more chapters to read. Matt Rose, who has standards, was my insider when I needed an insider and an outsider when I needed one of those. Lisa Haseltine literally ran a copy of my proposal to the Divinity School on her lunch break so that I could stop worrying about putting it in the mail. Greg Dunston gave me two hours a day where I was only allowed to think about kids running in circles. Jared, Lindsay, and Holly poured drinks, and stuck around after I started talking. Most of all, I am grateful for Jenny and Becky, who always made this seem like a normal thing to be doing. Becky, yours is longer but mine has more languages. Call it a tie?

INTRODUCTION

The religious atmosphere of early-sixteenth century Spain has been largely attributed to the reform efforts of the Inquisitor, Cardinal, and Crown Regent Francisco Ximenez de Cisneros. Scholarship on this period of Spanish history tends to view his top-down reform as one directed toward developing a revitalized lay Catholic spirituality based on publication of classics of interior spirituality, promotion of biblical scholarship, and a tolerant attitude towards the development of novel forms of spirituality, including those spearheaded by women. The work of Marcel Bataillon,¹ Melquiades Andrés,² and Pedro Santonja³ paint his administration of Spain's spiritual welfare as one which was both successful during his life but potentially unaware of its implications beyond his death in 1517. Those implications include the proliferation of a type of devotion known in Spain as *alumbradismo*.⁴

However, Spiritualist thought of this nature was not unique to Spain. North of the Pyrenees, the rest of Christian Europe was engaging spiritualist thought that described the immediate, intimate experience of the believer with God. The marks of this devotion appealed to that immediacy, and Susan Schreiner's work links its growth for a large-scale desire for experiential certainty during this period. Louis Dupré also understood the gradual shift toward locating meaning within the human mind as one which occurred outside the split in the western church. For advocates of practices like *recogimiento*, the development of the interior affections

¹ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007).

² Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975).

³ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001).

⁴ For a fuller understanding of the growth of *alumbradismo* in Spain, see: Stefania Pastore, *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)* (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010), 171-172.

through spiritual exercises, creation of vivid mental images, or union with God through divinely illumined interaction with scripture permitted the interior immediacy they sought.

The devotion offered in *alumbradismo* and other forms of interior spirituality appealed to the desire for an immediate experiential contact with God. In Erasmus', Juan de Valdés, and others' accounting, this desire was common in the late medieval Europe. Cisneros' reform efforts sought to treat this desire. Advocacy for interior spirituality, both in Spain and beyond, occurred initially as a reaction to the perception of late medieval Catholic spirituality as stagnant, owing too much to exterior formalities. This spirituality was built on tangible objects like relics and ritualized gestures such as pilgrimages that eventually came to be seen as tethering faith to simple external conformity to the Church without regard for the interior state of the Catholic believer. Erasmus' criticisms of this lifeless faith reverberated throughout early sixteenth century Europe, and they were supplemented with his call for a more engaged laity who were spiritually and mentally armed to battle sin and to welcome Christ's presence in their own hearts.⁵ Juan de Valdés career began in Spain shortly after Cisneros', but he fled to Italy to escape the Inquisition and to pursue a spirituality based in the certainty of direct, immediate experience of God. Interior experience, in his view, was the source of a vibrant, living faith rather than the rote and lifeless one that had become common.⁶ Valdés' movement in Italy, the *spirituali*, connected his concern for a faith in genuine contact with the lived experience of the believer to a return to biblical Christianity and a reform of the church based on the interior reform of the person.⁷

⁵ Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise: The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 209-260.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 216-226.

⁷ Elisabeth Gleason, *Renaissance Thought in Sixteenth-Century Italy* (Chico, CA: Scholar's Press, 1981), 104-105.

My dissertation will straddle the line between two previously distinct types of scholarship; examinations of the growth and diversity of interior, experiential spiritual devotion during the late-fifteenth and early-sixteenth century and studies describing the construction and operation of specific interior faculties, particularly the memory. Francisco de Osuna, the sixteenth-century Franciscan author of the six-volume masterpiece of interior spirituality called the *Abecedario Espiritual*, neatly ties these two aims together. His development of the practice of *recogimiento* occurred at a crucial intersection for Spanish Catholic spirituality, as the reforms led by Cardinal Cisneros began to blossom in forms that were variously welcomed by, and antagonistic to, the institutional church. Furthermore, the spiritual practice itself engaged the interior faculties, especially the memory, of lay Catholics in the daily service of personally forming their affections toward union with the divine.

Studying the work of an individual writer acknowledges the huge breadth of reactions to the sixteenth-century desire for spiritual immediacy, but the figure of Francisco himself offers a unique chance to explore both the common traits and the geographic peculiarities of these devotions. Beyond the careful reconstructive work of several authors, most notable Fidèle de Ros, Francisco's biographical details are obscure. The results of Cardinal Cisneros' reform efforts had a significant influence on Francisco's writing career. His formulation of *recogimiento* was developed in conversation with an alternate form of interior, experiential spirituality called *dejamiento*. The contrast between these two forms of *alumbradismo* provides a way to explore some of the key questions raised by interior spirituality, especially questions about the capability of the human believer to train his interior states toward union with God. Francisco's description of *recogimiento* in the *Abecedario Espiritual* makes assumptions about an active anthropology which stands in contrast to some of his local opponents.

I will discuss Francisco's spirituality through the lens of its active anthropology and with an emphasis on a specific mental faculty, the memory. The work of Janet Coleman⁸ and Mary Carruthers⁹ will provide a framework for discussing the long tradition of the trainable memory, and Francisco's work can be settled into that tradition but understood in the new context of sixteenth-century questions about anthropology and the capability of a believer to participate in interior union with God. The simultaneously passive and active traits of the human memory will play a key role in how *recogimiento* is employed, and my dissertation focuses on a lengthy analysis of what I have termed the "reflexive memory" in Francisco's understanding of *recogimiento*.

The first chapter will examine the sparse biographical detail on the life of Francisco de Osuna. Although there are substantial gaps in the story of his life, I supplement the existing information with a discussion of the growing interest in interior, experiential spirituality in sixteenth-century Spain spurred by Cardinal Cisneros' program of humanist reform. By placing Francisco's work in this context, I can speculate on the missing content in his biography as well as demonstrate that his spirituality paralleled the active anthropology being promoted by the reform movement.

The *Abecedario Espiritual* is structured as a prayer guide. With chapters corresponding to alphabetized maxims, the text requires active participation in an interiorly organized prayer life. An active anthropology pursued in the form of spiritual exercises can be fit into a context beyond Charles I's vision for early sixteenth century Spain. The second chapter turns to the practice of spiritual exercises, from ancient forms to practices nearly contemporary to the *recogimiento* of the Franciscans in Spain. From Philo of Alexandria through the deeply influential *Devotio Moderna*,

⁸ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

⁹ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

Francisco inherited a tradition of organized, active spirituality that implicitly supported the active anthropology required for *recogimiento* and described in the first chapter.

The practice of *recogimiento* falls under a broader umbrella of Spanish illuminism called *alumbradismo*, and the third chapter surveys the historiography for this term. A competing spirituality within *alumbradismo* called *dejamiento*, or “abandonment,” depended on a far more negative anthropology, and the chapter sorts through the complex discussion of these practices in pursuit of a usable, fixed definition for them both. This analysis includes a wealth of secondary literature, primarily the work of Jose Nieto and Marcel Bataillon, as well as primary source material from the volatile sixteenth century discussion of *alumbradismo*. Trial records from the Inquisition provide the bulk of written thought from the *dejado* movement and help modern scholars understand how the Spanish church authority distinguished between acceptable and unacceptable illuminist practice.

Recogimiento's official sanction depended largely on its preservation of the faculties of the soul. The practice is active and requires a view of the human believer that has some capability in his own salvation. My fourth chapter takes the faculty of the memory as the most interesting site for Francisco's discussion. He is deeply ambivalent about the receptivity of the memory insofar as it can be vulnerable to all of the distractions of the created world, but he is also intrigued by the creative, active capacity of memory. Francisco inherited a tradition of memory training which was not satisfied with passively receiving images but sought to organize and reconstruct those images in ways that were spiritually edifying. As such, *recogimiento* depends on the reflexive nature of memory and pushes the practitioner towards a dynamic where he is simultaneously remembering God and placing himself within God's own memory. This chapter looks at Francisco's use of

memory techniques in *recogimiento* to discard distracting images in the memory and to retain God in the memory.

The other side of reflexivity is explored in the fifth and final chapter. A common feature of memory training was the use of carefully constructed geographic spaces. Memory images could be placed within these mental spaces so that they could be retrieved later and used in an organized fashion. Working from this understanding of the memory, Francisco insists that while the reader is remembering God constantly he is simultaneously positioning himself within the memory of God. The preferred geographic space for this reflexive act is Christ's crucifixion, upon which the *recogido* should meditate in order to have a place within God's memory.

This dissertation will add to the existing literature on the growth of interior, experiential spirituality in sixteenth-century Spanish Catholicism with a thorough exposition of how that interiority was expressed in the practice of *recogimiento*. Building on ancient understandings of how memory stores and uses information, Francisco created a spirituality that was rigorously active as it was interior and receptive to God's ingress to the soul.

THE ADVANCE OF INTERIOR SPIRITUALITY

This chapter will explore the historical context for the development of interior spirituality during the early sixteenth century in Spain. Of key importance in this analysis will be the intersecting biographies of two figures in early sixteenth century Spanish spirituality, Francisco Jiménez de Cisneros and Francisco de Osuna. Cardinal Cisneros' long and broad career is worthy of discussion from any number of perspectives, but particular attention will be paid here to the heritage that he left behind with regard to illuminism and interior spirituality in Spain. These contributions were the result of a specific and intentional campaign to encourage the growth of humanism and philology in Spain¹ and especially flourished due to a high view of human nature implicit to the project.²

In fact, the career of Francisco de Osuna can be understood as a result of that campaign. This chapter will additionally show how the available details of Francisco de Osuna's life illustrate the lasting effects of Cisneros' reform. An administrator more than a theologian, one of Cisneros' most lasting contributions was facilitating work like Francisco's *Abecedario Espiritual* by providing an atmosphere where that work would be consumed and considered by lay readers.³ This atmosphere included the substantial commitment to philological scholarship that required interaction with leaders in the humanist movement beyond Spain and Erasmus. After Cisneros' death, Erasmus' work became a wedge in a struggle to control the growth of interior, experiential spirituality in Spain.⁴ Philological advances were subject to scrutiny for their orthodoxy in the

¹ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica 2007), 112.

² Ibid, 112-113.

³ Gillian T.W. Ahlgren, *Enkindling Love: The Legacy of Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2016), 2-3.

⁴ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 110-112.

same fashion that Spanish illuminist groups, *Alumbrados*, which practiced interior, experiential spirituality and blossomed from Cisneros' program would face over the coming decades.⁵ Cisneros' reform was premised on a positive anthropology which accepted that the human intellect could participate actively in a relationship with God.

The ambition of Cisneros' movement advanced beyond philological achievement, and can be understood as continuous within humanism.⁶ This continuity requires close examination. Because there is no necessary relationship between reviving the classical authors and assuming a positive stance regarding human capability, the relationship between the Greek and Latin past and anthropological exuberance during this period can be seen as practical and theoretical prongs in a discussion of human potential.⁷ Within this anthropological framework, the scope of humanist achievement may be broadened to include civil law, demonstrating that humanist development was closely connected to the growing tension between state and religious authority during this period.⁸ However, for an individual sixteenth-century thinker the reception and filtering of these often competing strains of thought was a different project. This chapter will engage the continuity between Cisneros' movement and humanism, as well as the wider tension between state and religious authority, to describe the atmosphere in which Francisco de Osuna's work flourished.

An intense conversation occurred early sixteenth-century Spain amongst practitioners and advocates of interiorized, experiential spirituality. These groups, called *Alumbrados*, are divided into practitioners of two main forms of interior spirituality, *recogimiento*, or "recollection," and

⁵ A. Gordon Kinder, "Protestantism in Sixteenth Century Spain," *Mediterranean Studies* 3 (1992): 61-70.

⁶ Anthony Levi, *Renaissance and Reformation: The Intellectual Genesis* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 8.

⁷ *Ibid*, 10.

⁸ *Ibid*, 12.

dejamiento, or “abandonment.”⁹ In beginning a study of Francisco de Osuna’s doctrine of *recogimiento*, an understanding of the humanistic context from which he emerged provides valuable insight into the intellectual and religious background of Francisco’s theology. A view of the spiritual atmosphere Cisneros fostered permits us to see Francisco’s work as something greater than a direct and immediate confrontation of his chosen theological antagonists, especially *dejados* locally.¹⁰ Rather, we can view it as part of a broad late medieval spectrum that occurred in conversation with particularly Spanish developments within three fields: Renaissance humanism, the Franciscan order, and experiential, interiorized devotion. In this chapter, I hope to demonstrate the fields of thought that Francisco’s work sought to assimilate and, further, the way in which his occasionally shadowy biographical details can be better understood as products of a carefully cultivated spiritual environment.

The influence of Cardinal Jiménez de Cisneros serves to form the three potentially distinct fields into concentric circles. In these spaces, a writer like Francisco de Osuna and some of his local opponents would interact with all three as both distinct forces and as combined ones. Additionally, acknowledging that early sixteenth-century Spain was so thoroughly shaped by Cardinal Cisneros’ program of reform that his influence was durable well beyond his death in 1517 allows us to engage the emergence of a thinker like Francisco de Osuna as a product of Cisneros’ Spain.¹¹

⁹ Melquiades Andrés, *Historia de la mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1994), 274-281.

¹⁰ Reference to Francisco’s *dejado* opponents in the *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* are sparse but pointed. See Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), Tr. 3.2, 5.2, 17.1, 17.6, 17.6, 17.7.

¹¹ Mary Laven, “Encountering the Counter-Reformation,” *Renaissance Quarterly* 59 (2006).

Given the substantial holes in Francisco de Osuna's biography, we are obliged to induce biographical data from the notion that this era in Spain was given an explicit set of questions and answers to guide theological discussion from Cardinal Cisneros.¹² Mariano Quirós García acknowledges the gaps in data and explains that, "After almost five hundred years, the life of Francisco de Osuna remains for us a set of tiles that only permits that we imagine the splendor of an old and already missing whole."¹³ An understanding of early sixteenth-century Spain as constructed by Cardinal Cisneros fixes these tiles into place, so to speak, and pushes our imagination of Francisco's lost biographical time into something full and meaningful.

There is very little that can directly tie the life of Cardinal Cisneros to Francisco de Osuna's except to understand the latter's career the product of the former's. Nearly a half-century sits between both men's births, but it was time ambitiously spent for Cisneros. His education was focused on a career in the church, likely finishing a degree in canon law at Salamanca while also attending lectures in theology.¹⁴ Soon, he moved on to Rome for a five year period that concluded in 1465 with a papal letter giving him the first available benefice in Spain. This letter initially led to his installation at Uceda, but was contested by Archbishop Carillo of Toledo. The resulting controversy led to a short imprisonment for Cardinal Cisneros in Santoreaz.¹⁵

¹² Stafford Poole, "Juan de Ovando's Reform of the University of Alcalá de Henares," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 21 (1990): 575-584.

¹³ Mariano Quirós García, *Abecedario Espiritual: V y VI partes. Vol. I: Estudio Introductorio* (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002), 27. "Transcurridos casi quinientos años, la vida de Francisco de Osuna continúa siendo para nosotros un conjunto incompleto de teselas que sólo nos permite imaginar el esplendor del viejo y ya perdido conjunto." Translation by author unless otherwise noted.

¹⁴ Erika Rummel, *Jimenez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 12.

¹⁵ *Ibid*, 13.

In contrast to the well-organized ambition he displayed early in his career, Cisneros' rise to power within Spain was patchwork and idiosyncratic. After his installation at Uceda and a move in 1476 to Sigüenza¹⁶ he maintained a low profile until an abrupt decision in 1484 to abandon his career track and join the Franciscan Order. Erika Rummel¹⁷ and Alastair Hamilton¹⁸ attempt to establish chronology for this period, while Marcel Bataillon omits it in favor of a focus on its conclusion.¹⁹ That conclusion to this lost period occurs when Cisneros surfaces at the retreat at Notre Dame de Salceda in 1484. This retreat house famously adhered to the practice of *recogimiento*²⁰ and would also host Francisco de Osuna in 1523 as well as the early *Alumbrado*, Pedro de Alcaraz.²¹

Beyond a simple chronology, what is further missing from this period in Cisneros' life is a suitable explanation for the sudden shift in lifestyle and career so shortly after finally achieving his hard-won positions in Spain's church. Without evidence from Cisneros' own writing to explain himself, we are left with contemporary accounts of his holiness to indicate that the conversion was as deeply felt as it was abrupt.²² In retrospect, his conversion to the Franciscan Order and the reputation of the retreat at Salceda offer background for the depth of his commitment to interior

¹⁶ Ibid, 14.

¹⁷ Ibid, 15.

¹⁸ Alastair Hamilton, *Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth Century Spain: The Alumbrados* (Cambridge: J. Clarke, 1992), 10.

¹⁹ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 1-40.

²⁰ Alastair Hamilton, *Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth Century Spain: The Alumbrados* (Cambridge: J. Clarke, 1992), 10.

²¹ Fidele de Ros, *Un maître de sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna. Sa vie, son œuvre, sa doctrine spirituelle* (Paris: G. Beauchesne, 1936), 58-59.

²² Lynn H. Nelson and Arnold H. Weiss, "An Early Life of Francisco Jiménez de Cisneros," *Franciscan Studies* 42 (1982): 160.

devotion and mysticism, and even his occasionally reckless support for visionaries²³ like María de Santo Domingo.²⁴

The retreat at Salceda provides a straight line from the 1480s to the early 1520s in explanation of Cisneros' cultivation of interior spirituality in Spain. However, it takes Cisneros' resumption of an upward career trajectory for us to understand how the quiet work done at the Salceda *recolectorio* can bear fruit like Francisco de Osuna's carefully alphabetized six volume masterpiece dedicated to the art of searching one's interior depths for God.

In the case of Cisneros, opportunities to form Spanish spirituality in his own image arose less out of a unique spiritual genius and instead out of a more mundane but no less important aptitude. At Salceda, Erika Rummel observes that "his administrative talents, at any rate, were not overlooked."²⁵ Dull praise though that may be, this ability returned Cisneros to a path that would additionally see his integrity, austerity and talent for administration rewarded with a place as the Queen's Confessor in 1492, and then installment as the Archbishop of Toledo, ostensibly making him the head of the Church in Spain. Further promotion and responsibility came with his appointment as Inquisitor General in 1508 and two separate engagements as the Regent to protect the Spanish crown in between successions by the royal family. Increasing proximity to the throne theoretically offered a way for Cisneros to combine state building and piety in an organized way.²⁶ However, his personal devotion seemed to make this path a bit less clear.

²³ Ronald E. Surtz, "La madre Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534) y la cuestión de la autoridad religiosa femenina," *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 33 (1984): 483.

²⁴ Jodi Bilinkoff, "A Spanish Prophetess and Her Patrons: The Case of Maria de Santo Domingo," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 23 (1992).

²⁵ Erika Rummel, *Jimenez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 15.

²⁶ *Ibid*, 66-94.

Though initially an enigma, his commitment to meditation won over Queen Isabella and eventually his colleagues.²⁷ Stories of ostentatious austerity accompanied his elevation at Toledo, with a surprising amount of attention paid to his footwear, which he wore in strict following with the Franciscan directions for the apostolic life.²⁸ His program of reform can be rather neatly itemized according to his collected job titles. As Provincial of the Franciscans, he moved decisively to resolve the Conventual and Observant debate in Spain in favor of the latter group.²⁹ In his role as Archbishop of Toledo and in twice-appointed position of Regent, he was able to actively take part in the reform of the Church. He revitalized Spanish spirituality through publishing and translation of classic mystical texts like Pseudo-Dionysius' *Mystical Ascent*, the works of John Climacus, Thomas á Kempis' *Imitation of Christ*, and Vincent of Ferrar's *Tractatus de Vita Spiritualli*. Interestingly, Cisneros' editorial work on this last text included a very deliberate excising of segments where Vincent recommends caution in the practice of religious ecstasy.³⁰ This move is emblematic of Cisneros' aggressive and unrestrained approach to this interior, experiential Catholic spirituality.

The final decade of the fifteenth century in Spain has rightly engaged scholarly attention because of exploration to the Americas and the expulsion of Spain's Jews in 1492. During this period, Cisneros continued his campaign on behalf of the Observant faction of the Franciscan Order against the Conventual houses. This dispute was the residual effect of a debate over the ownership of property and the proper interpretation of the Franciscan rule that had raged almost

²⁷ Ibid, 15-17.

²⁸ Ibid, 21-22.

²⁹ Ibid, 8-19.

³⁰ Alastair Hamilton, *Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth Century Spain: The Alumbrados* (Cambridge: J. Clarke, 1992), 16.

since the moment of Francis of Assisi's death in 1226.³¹ Francis' instructions were extremely explicit that his rule should never be modified or glossed.³² Nevertheless, even granting Francis' fame this request seemed beyond the normal authority given a document or a writer.³³ Pope Gregory IX inherited the late medieval notion of papal supremacy and ruled in *Quo Elongati* in 1230 that Francis' written legacy was indeed in need of further explanation.³⁴ This was particularly true with regards to a distinction between *dominium* and *usus*; where the former was prohibited as the ownership of goods while the latter a permitted use of property.³⁵ The issue was further addressed nearly one hundred years after Francis' death when Pope John XXII condemned the doctrine of absolute poverty in his bull *Cum Inter Nonnullos*.³⁶ The twin emphasis in the Franciscan Order on poverty and urban preaching was consequently pared down to preaching,³⁷ a priority that Cisneros' reform on behalf of the Observant Franciscans continued.

Another enduring characteristic of the order emerged from this period of conflict; namely, the struggle over the person of Francis of Assisi and the relationship between humankind and the created world. This tension will drive a great deal of Francisco de Osuna's work, and is explored first in the work of Bonaventure. Bernard McGinn sees the thirteenth century Franciscan Bonaventure as instrumental in offering a new understanding of Francis' life as the perfect example

³¹ Erika Rummel, *Jimenez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 19-22.

³² Francis of Assisi, *The Testament of St. Francis* (1226), ¶ 4.

³³ Thomas Frank, "Exploring the Boundaries of Law in the Middle Ages: Franciscan Debates on Poverty, Property, and Inheritance," *Law and Literature* 20 (2008): 243-260.

³⁴ Gregory IX, *Quo Elongati* (1230), ¶ 2.

³⁵ *Ibid*, ¶ 8.

³⁶ Bernard McGinn, *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism – 1200-1350* (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1998), 70-71.

³⁷ Carolyn Muessig, "Bernardino da Siena and Observant Preaching as a Vehicle for Religious Transformation," in *A Companion to Observant Reform in the Late Middle Ages and Beyond*, ed. Bert Roost and James D. Mixson (Boston: Brill, 2015), 191.

of the symbiosis between experiential spirituality and purposeful devotion to the life of Jesus Christ. This symbiosis emphasizes Christ's passion, as seen in the tangible example of Francis' stigmata. Furthermore, Bonaventure adapts the work of Pseudo-Dionysius on the mystical ascent to God and the law of love offered by the Victorine Thomas Gallus. McGinn observes, "As befits the eminently practical character of even his deepest speculations about the journey into God, Bonaventure's primary intention was to encourage himself and his readers to follow Francis upward into the mystery of the cross."³⁸

The character of this encouragement within the Franciscan order is one we should carefully note. McGinn sees a direct line of communication between the Franciscans and the Victorines through Thomas Gallus with attention to the faculties of the soul.³⁹ Although McGinn's purpose in drawing this connection is to provide a theoretical framework for both the spiritual Franciscans' embrace of Joachite apocalypticism and Bonaventure's more careful understanding of the different stages of history through the mystical ascent of the soul, the common denominator is this interest in the abilities of the soul. Within the Franciscan tradition⁴⁰ this interest magnifies the question of anthropology by shifting the perspective towards the self and its capabilities before God.

The issue of anthropology is evident in Bonaventure's analysis of the relationship between humankind and the created world. Bonaventure anticipates how the turn towards the self also complicates the interaction between senses and creation. In *The Soul's Journey into God*, he writes, "From these visible things, one rises to consider the power, wisdom, and goodness of God

³⁸ Bernard McGinn, *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism – 1200-1350*, (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1998), 112.

³⁹ Ibid, 83.

⁴⁰ Ibid, 95.

as existing, living, intelligent, purely spiritual, incorruptible, and unchangeable.”⁴¹ There is a tension between anxiety over the flood of temptations provided in the material world and contemplation that permits the soul to ascend to God through understanding of God’s work in the world. Francisco grapples with Bonaventure’s treatment of the interior faculties in relation to the distracting created world in the third treatise of his *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, concluding that “... the soul’s essence is perfected through the powers and they in turn through their acts and operations.”⁴² The soul, in its faculties, must be closed to distraction, but simultaneously available for God’s grace.

The tension of a soul which is simultaneously closed to distraction but open to God’s disclosure in creation requires examination of the self. Louis Dupré takes a grand view of this interest occurring within the Franciscan order and moving all of Western Christendom. This occurs first following the “barely educated religious genius” of Francis through Bonaventure’s location of the Platonic terms within the “incarnated Word as their divine archetype”⁴³ and further, through the scholastic movement with Duns Scotus and eventually, William Ockham. The Franciscan scholastic thinkers are credited with the most radical shift. As Dupré observes, Scotus’ contribution was that “The singularity of the individual adds a *formal* characteristic to the universal forms of genus and species. Individuality, then, far from being a mere sign of contingency,

⁴¹ Bonaventure, “The Soul’s Journey into God,” in *Bonaventure: The Soul’s Journey into God, The Tree of Life, The Life of St. Francis*, trans. Ewert Cousins (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978), 63.

⁴² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 149. “...la esencia se perfecciona por las potencias, y las potencias por sus actos y operaciones medias...” Translation in Francisco de Osuna, *The Third Spiritual Alphabet*, trans. Mary Giles (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1981), 107.

⁴³ Louis Dupré, *Passage to Modernity: An Essay in the Hermeneutics of Nature and Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 38.

constitutes the supreme form, and perfect knowledge consists in knowing this individual form.”⁴⁴ For Dupré, the implosion of the medieval synthesis resulted in a substantial movement in western Christendom’s understanding of humankind’s view of the self and the relationship of that self with God and the cosmos. The corresponding shift to a traditional understanding of humankind as a microcosm of the created order is tied specifically by Dupré to the anthropological optimism that would flourish during the Renaissance and early modern period. Cardinal Cisneros will inherit this as he begins his project of re-shaping Spanish devotion.⁴⁵

Cisneros’ ambitious project assumed that the powers of the human intellect were able to assist a well-educated laity to thrive with exposure to classic texts of Christian mysticism and interior spirituality.⁴⁶ Additionally, the scholarship of the biblical humanists would facilitate a culture where innovative Christian spirituality would continue to grow and benefit this newly invigorated Spanish Catholicism.⁴⁷

Cisneros was also the beneficiary of a rather unique set of circumstances created by Ferdinand and Isabella’s union of Castille and Aragon and their joint vision for Spain. Though nearly a generation older than both *los Reyes Católicos*, his gradual ascent within the Spanish church and the Franciscan order dovetailed nicely with their objectives for empire building and

⁴⁴ Ibid, 39.

⁴⁵ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 25.

⁴⁶ Taryn E.L. Chubb, “De vita spirituali: San Vicente Ferrer, Cardinal Cisneros, and Fifteenth-Century Devotional Practices in Castilla,” *La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures* 41 (2012): 105.

⁴⁷ This process was as much backwards-facing as it was progressive, and the work of printers as curators of the tradition of interior spirituality was essential for the growth of Cisneros’ vision for Spanish Catholicism. See: Alejandro Coroleu, “Christian Classics and Humanism in Renaissance Barcelona: The Case of Pere Miquel Carbonell (1424-1517),” in *Humanism and Christian Letters in Early Modern Iberia (1480-1630)*, ed. Alejandro Coroleu and Barry Taylor (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars, 2010), 37-46.

the consolidation of the power of the church and the crown. In turn, his usefulness to Ferdinand and Isabel permitted the cultivation of his own view for the future of Spain's church, built around reform of the religious orders, humanistic learning, and the cultivation of interior spirituality.⁴⁸

Cardinal Cisneros' most visible contributions to the thriving culture of humanism in Spain were the founding of the University of Alcalá and the commission and oversight of the Complutensian Polyglot Bible. In contrast to his often uneasy and reluctant handle on the volatile mix of political and ecclesial affairs,⁴⁹ Cisneros pursued an invigorated religious culture in Spain with directness and intent that took on a particularly textual character, a reformation in books.⁵⁰ The uniqueness in Cisneros' program is in his enthusiasm for placing written output into lay hands with the expectation that an educated clerical class would operate as thoughtful managers in the interpretive process.⁵¹ These objectives, well-structured though they appeared in conception, met with results which are generally considered to be unanticipated by their architect.

Erika Rummel credits Cisneros' enthusiasm for Christian humanism and the study of the Biblical languages for making Alcalá a unique university. Biblical humanists elsewhere were subject to suspicion, and careful limits were imposed in the scope of their work. This is particularly true with regards to the complicated line between philology and theology,⁵² an ambiguous one that

⁴⁸ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 1-2.

⁴⁹ Erika Rummel, *Jimenez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 29-52.

⁵⁰ Bataillon traces the shift overseen by Cisneros at Alcalá toward publication of works of interior spirituality and directly links that to an increased interest in defending the faith through translation and scholarship of the Bible. See: Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 18-19.

⁵¹ Jose Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Droz, 1970), 53-54.

⁵² Alejandro Coroleu, "Anti-Erasmianism in Spain," in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 73-92.

did not always make a strong connection between academic achievement and moral growth.⁵³ However, in Cisneros' Alcalá, humanists were given a wider berth for their research, with an eye towards its implications that is better understood as careful rather than obstructionist.⁵⁴

The career of Antonio Nebrija, Alcalá philologist and Spain's most celebrated humanist biblical scholar is a useful example of the changing attitude Cisneros brought to his oversight of Spain's Church. His predecessor as Grand Inquisitor, Diego Deza, had an antagonistic attitude towards Biblical scholarship and towards *conversos* (i.e. Jewish converts to Christianity and their descendants,) issues that Nebrija would embrace.⁵⁵ Nebrija's 1508 piece, *Apologia*, which "constitutes a true landmark in the history of biblical scholarship in Spain, defending the use of the original Hebrew and Greek texts.... an excellent example of the new attitude, on the part of the humanists, to biblical exegesis"⁵⁶ was dedicated to Cardinal Cisneros, a supporter of his scholarship.⁵⁷ Deza, however, had confiscated Nebrija's previous book, *Quinquagena*, between 1500 and 1504. In defense of his piece, Nebrija offered a distinction that joins biblical humanists more with historians than theologians, preserving the careful line between theology and philology that landed his colleagues in trouble while clearing the way for an occasion to step over it in the

⁵³ Katherine Elliot Van Liere, "After Nebrija: Academic Reformers and the Teaching of Latin in Sixteenth-Century Salamanca," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 34 (2003): 1076.

⁵⁴ Erika Rummel, *Erasmus* (New York: Continuum, 2004), 53

⁵⁵ J.H. Edwards, "Religious Belief and Social Conformity: The 'Converso' Problem in Late Medieval Córdoba," *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 31 (1981): 121.

⁵⁶ Carlos del Valle Rodríguez, "Antonio Nebrija's Biblical Scholarship," in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 65.

⁵⁷ Theodor Dunkelgrun, *The Multiplicity of Scripture: The Confluence of Textual Traditions in the Making of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible (1568-1573)* (PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2012), 32.

future. Nebrija argued that the issues at stake in meaning and translation were matters of fact outside of faith.⁵⁸

While Alcalá bears some similarity to other Renaissance institutions, Cisneros can be credited with many of its unique attributes. With a distinct emphasis on training the clergy, essential in Cisneros' desire to pull the laity into his vision for a reinvigorated Spanish spirituality,⁵⁹ studies at Alcalá revolved around the Biblical languages taught at the College of Ildefonso. After conceiving of the project in 1497 when he and Diego Deza were charged with the responsibility to visit Spanish universities and determine the need for reform, construction of university buildings began in 1499 and progressed quickly. Satellite religious houses helped the college expand, and classes began in 1508. In addition to the centrality of language studies, the other curricular innovation was the addition of a Chair in Scotism, elevating the great Franciscan scholastic to the level of the already established chairs in Thomism and nominalism⁶⁰. Commonly credited to Cisneros' Franciscan background, this move brought Alcalá's curriculum further into line with its Northern European counterparts.⁶¹

University of Alcalá's most famous achievement, the creation of the Complutensian Polyglot Bible, secured its early role among the tri-lingual colleges in sixteenth century Europe under the Erasmian vision for Christian biblical humanism while creating and reinforcing networks

⁵⁸ Carlos del Valle Rodríguez, "Antonio Nebrija's Biblical Scholarship," in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 65-66.

⁵⁹ *Ibid*, 54.

⁶⁰ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 16.

⁶¹ For an example of a fully continental set of educational priorities for Franciscans focused on Scotus and the university, see: Anne A. Davenport, "Scotus as the Father of Modernity. The Natural Philosophy of the English Franciscan Christopher Davenport in 1652," *Early Science and Medicine* 12 (2007): 55-90.

of scholars across national boundaries.⁶² Named after the Roman name for the town of Alcalá, the project was conceived in 1502 by Cisneros, six years before classes commenced at the University.⁶³ The first fruits of the project appeared with the 1512 arrival of the fifth volume. The entire effort, including printing, was finished in 1517 but final publication waited for papal approval, a necessary step due to the aforementioned suspicion over the intersection between philology and biblical studies, which Rummel claims “was suffering from the stigma of heterodoxy.”⁶⁴ The final project eventually arrived in six volumes, the sum of which included the entire Bible, in parallel columns with several biblical languages. In a nod to Origen’s *Hexapla*,⁶⁵ the Polyglot Old Testament contained four columns for the entire Pentateuch in Hebrew, Greek, Latin, and Syriac, omitting Syriac after that point. The New Testament took the remaining two volumes and devoted two columns to Latin and Greek.⁶⁶

Two *conversos*, Pablo Coronel and Alfonso de Zamora, edited the Hebrew portions of the text while the only foreigner on the editorial staff, Demetrios Ducas, oversaw the Greek work with several others.⁶⁷ One of the best-known participants, Juan de Vergara, achieved his greatest success after the 1517 completion of the Polyglot. However, Cisneros recruited further support. Nebrija joined in 1515 but resigned shortly afterwards because of controversy about editorial

⁶² Theodor William Dunkelgrün, *The Multiplicity of Scripture: The Confluence of Textual Traditions in the Making of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible (1568-1573)* (PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2012), 8-12.

⁶³ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 10-12.

⁶⁴ Erika Rummel, *Erasmus* (New York: Continuum, 2004), 62.

⁶⁵ Theodor William Dunkelgrün, *The Multiplicity of Scripture: The Confluence of Textual Traditions in the Making of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible (1568-1573)* (PhD diss, University of Chicago, 2012), 12.

⁶⁶ Teresa Ortega-Monasterio, “Textual Criticism of the Bible in the Spanish Renaissance,” *TC: A Journal of Biblical Textual Criticism* 13 (2008): 1-10.

⁶⁷ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 20-21.

method. According to Rummel, Nebrija disagreed with the decision not to check the Latin translation “which was instead, compiled solely from other Latin texts, against the Greek,”⁶⁸ a complaint which she adds the completed project would not bear out.⁶⁹ Erasmus was also recruited to the task, but rejected the invitation on several reported bases, the most likely of which being that he would have to travel to work side by side with people who had criticized his method, specifically Diego López de Zúñiga.⁷⁰

Erasmus himself would experience rapidly oscillating reputation in Spain. Luann Homza observes that “His critical interest in sacred writings and awareness that the early Church differed radically from his own also constituted the basis for his most profound spiritual counsel.”⁷¹ Erasmus’ belief in a causal relationship between philological achievement and growing congruence of the church with its ancient roots led to labels of “Erasmians” for supporters of these ideals, an association that met with suspicion during the 1520’s in Spain.⁷²

Cardinal Cisneros’ preface to the Polyglot Bible, which doubles as a defense of the project’s worthiness to Pope Leo X, is instructive in both its existence and in its content. Theodor Dunkelgrün aptly observes that Cisneros’ decision to privilege Latin, born out in his telling simile comparing Jesus’ place on the cross between two thieves to Latin’s place in the middle of Hebrew and Greek, risked subverting the project of philology to doctrine to some degree.⁷³ However, that Cisneros felt a need to explain the project’s value to a pope and a public suspicious of novelty

⁶⁸ Ibid, 61.

⁶⁹ Ibid, 63.

⁷⁰ Ibid, 64.

⁷¹ Lu Ann Homza, “Erasmus as Hero, or Heretic? Spanish Humanism and the Valladolid Assembly of 1527,” *Renaissance Quarterly of America* 50 (1997): 81.

⁷² Ibid, 81-83.

⁷³ Theodor William Dunkelgrün. *The Multiplicity of Scripture: The Confluence of Textual Traditions in the Making of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible (1568-1573)* (PhD diss., University of Chicago, 2012), 26-27.

provides relevant context in understanding how ambitious the philological scope of the project was for its time. In his explanation, Cisneros shows both a carefully tuned understanding of the humanist project⁷⁴ and a desire to negotiate the tension between orthodox goals in an objective that many suspected was dangerous to the deposit of faith. He begins the address with acknowledgement of the difficulty of the vast translation project while simultaneously claiming the lasting necessity of biblical scholarship even beyond the efforts of the team of scholars at Alcalá.⁷⁵

Cisneros' introduction carefully leaves an opening for a mediator between closer understanding of the original biblical texts and development of the faith. He writes, "Words have their own unique character and no translation of them, however complete, can entirely express their full meaning."⁷⁶ Embedded in this sentence is a humble obeisance to the teaching tradition of the Church, which alone possesses the deposit of faith and is guided by the Holy Spirit. It also acknowledges an understanding of that teaching tradition as ongoing and, to a degree, collaborative.

This is especially the case for Scripture, which is paradoxically hidden and dizzyingly abundant. Arguing that this is by design, he reconciles the paradox by observing, "Indeed there can be no language or combination of letters from which the most hidden meanings of heavenly

⁷⁴ Ibid, 32.

⁷⁵ Carlos del Valle Rodríguez, "Antonio Nebrija's Biblical Scholarship" in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 67-68.

⁷⁶ Jiménez de Cisneros, "Prologus," in *Complutensian Polyglot Bible*, fol. iii. "Que cum unicum idiomatis suae sint verborum proprietates quarum totam vim non possit quam tum libet absolut traductio prorsus exprimere." Translation: John C. Olin, trans., *Catholic Reform: from Cardinal Ximénes to the Council of Trent, 1495-1563: an essay with illustrative documents and a brief study of St. Ignatius Loyola* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1990), 62.

wisdom do not emerge or burgeon forth, as it were.”⁷⁷ Because translators, well intentioned though they may be, can only offer readers a fraction of those “hidden meanings of heavenly wisdom,” preserving and disseminating the text in its original language is hugely important.

To accomplish this in Cisneros’ Polyglot Bible, the “diversity” in the Latin manuscripts⁷⁸ required retracing steps back to an uncorrupted original. In support of this academic project’s congruence with church tradition, Cisneros enlisted the support of Jerome and Augustine for returning to “examine the authenticity of the books of the Old Testament in the light of the correctness of the Hebrew text and of the New Testament in the light of the Greek copies.”⁷⁹ After explaining his method briefly, including an appropriate nod towards the intended audience of “every student of divine literature”⁸⁰ he is careful to mention the included lexicons for Greek, Hebrew, and Syriac,⁸¹ translation of proper names, and a Hebrew grammar.

In his introduction to the text, Cisneros discusses the most difficult and important part of the endeavor: the measures to ensure orthodoxy and correctness along with his translators’ scholarly pedigrees. The credentials and breadth of his chosen group are emphasized, along with the volume, accuracy, and age of the manuscripts.⁸² His preamble to the text offers modern readers a succinct view into both Cisneros’ understanding of the issues at stake in the Polyglot Bible and of his unique willingness to push forward in spite of the considerable risk.

⁷⁷ Ibid, fol. iii. “Quippe cum nulla dictio nulla litteratum connexio esse possit ex qua non emergent et veluti pullulent reconditissimi coelestis sapientiae sentis.” Trans. John C. Olin, 62.

⁷⁸ Ibid. Fol. iii. “...varietas...” Trans. John C. Olin, 62.

⁷⁹ Ibid. Fol. iii. “...ita ut libroru Veteris testameti synceritas ex Hebraica veritate. Novi aute ex Graecis exemplaribus examinatur.” Trans. John C. Olin, 62.

⁸⁰ Ibid. Fol. iii. “...divinaru litteraru studiosus...” Trans. John C. Olin, 62.

⁸¹ Ibid. Fol. iii.

⁸² Ibid. Fol. iii.

These theological and spiritual goals took place in the midst of Cisneros' extensive duties for Spain's crown and church. In addition to his close relationship with Queen Isabella as her confessor, he was twice needed to serve as Regent during periods between rulers. The first time, in 1506 after the death of Philip, Cisneros' regency lasted until the following year when Ferdinand was able to return from Naples and rule over Castile. In 1516, after the death of Ferdinand, another regency was needed because Castile's new heir, Charles, was only sixteen and living in the Netherlands. For nearly two years, Cisneros balanced diplomacy, Charles' desire to circumvent the rules of succession, and Spain's needs until Charles eventually took his place as King of Castile shortly before Cisneros' death in 1517.⁸³

As Grand Inquisitor, Cisneros' attention to detail and reputation for integrity offered the possibility of a new reputation to the office whose reputation was still tarnished after the disclosure of a corrupt and cruel process under Diego Deza and his lieutenant Diego Lucero. Deza and Lucero's aggressive campaign against the perceived threat of insufficiently-converted new Christians in Cordova was motivated and supported by property confiscation.⁸⁴ While late medieval Spain had a great deal of stake in the variety of methods for social isolation of the new Christians,⁸⁵ the Lucero affair was remarkable insofar as it provoked popular sentiment against the institution that went around both Deza and the King and straight to Rome for assistance against Lucero's menace.⁸⁶ Netanyahu explains that Lucero's ambition in zealous persecution was also ultimately what turned sentiment against him, "For what was unique about him was not the

⁸³ Erica Rummel, *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 66-94

⁸⁴ *Ibid*, 29.

⁸⁵ David Nirenberg, "Conversion, Sex, and Segregation: Jews and Christians in Medieval Spain," *The American Historical Review* 107 (2002): 1065-1093.

⁸⁶ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 32.

magnitude of the crimes he committed or the scope of the excesses he perpetrated – namely, that he burned so many innocent people, or violated so many maidens and matrons, or confiscated such enormous amounts of property – but the fact that he persecuted, apart from conversos, many Old Christians of all urban classes.”⁸⁷ While Cisneros was both unwilling and likely unable in terms of contemporary norms to bring moderation to the role of Inquisitor, his appointment was aimed at bringing some measure of integrity to an office that was still seen by the crown as necessary in spite of being incredibly flawed.⁸⁸

Overstating Cisneros’ role in shaping the spirituality of Catholic Spain is evident in the volatility around suspect forms of spirituality and scholarship shortly after his death. However, the rapid and dangerous changes in Spain cannot be wholly attributed to a power vacuum after Cisneros’ death, as unhelpful as it was to preserve order. The resulting instability was exacerbated by the emergence of Martin Luther.⁸⁹ The shock to the church resulted in a shift in the attention of the Inquisition away from the ambiguous specter of relapsed *conversos* and towards domestic strains of Reformation thought.

One of the results of this change in focus was increasing tension in the relationship between orthodoxy and philology. Alejandro Coroleu sees 1516 as a pivotal point in the relationship between Spanish humanism cultivated by Cisneros and Erasmus, Europe’s most renowned humanist thinker. At this point, only a year before Cardinal Cisneros’ death, Erasmus published his own edition of the New Testament. Within the same year, Diego López de Zúñiga, an

⁸⁷ Benzion Netanyahu, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain* (New York: New York Review Books, 2001), 1037-1038.

⁸⁸ Erica Rummel, *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 30-32.

⁸⁹ Melquiades Andrés, “Alumbrados, Erasmians, ‘Lutherans,’ and Mystics: The Risk of a More ‘Intimate’ Spirituality” in *The Spanish Inquisition and The Inquisitorial Mind*, ed. Angel Alcalá (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), 471-473.

accomplished philologist working on the Complutensian Polyglot, decided to respond with a vigorous defense of the Vulgate against Erasmus' corrections. The response was sufficiently impolitic that Cisneros forbade its publication, but three years later and free of Cisneros' oversight, López de Zúñiga published the piece. Coroleu describes little immediate impact of the apparently frequent attacks on Erasmus over most of the next decade, "due to the narrow chauvinism exhibited by the Spaniard."⁹⁰ However, the feud was kept alive through Erasmus' lengthy responses and periodic exchanges. Continued correspondence had the net effect of eroding Erasmus' reputation for both scholarship and orthodoxy within Spain to the point where he was extremely vulnerable to the more organized assault that would occur at Valladolid in 1527.⁹¹

The Valladolid Conference was convened in 1527 at the request of Pope Clement to Cisneros' successor as Inquisitor General, Alonso Manrique, to investigate Erasmus' work.⁹² Coroleu notes a fairly even split within the opinion of the delegates with regards to Erasmus' orthodoxy, but patterns were detectable, particularly with regards to University affiliation of the delegates. Theologians from Alcalá sat firmly in the pro-Erasmus camp, while their colleagues at Salamanca took the contrary position. The plodding deliberations permitted the conference to address only four of Erasmus' propositions out of twenty two.⁹³ As a result, Manrique preemptively ended the affair in response to the potential chaos of a verdict against Erasmus' work and the limited value of a verdict in his favor.⁹⁴ The career of Erasmus in Spain became fulcrum

⁹⁰ Alejandro Coroleu, "Anti-Erasmianism in Spain," in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 77.

⁹¹ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 236-237.

⁹² *Ibid*, 236.

⁹³ Alejandro Coroleu, "Anti-Erasmianism in Spain," in *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*, ed. Erika Rummel (Boston: Brill, 2008), 88.

⁹⁴ *Ibid*, 88.

in successive debates. The first debate was on his methods, pitting humanistic biblical scholars against scholastics. The second was over his orthodoxy, which was different in tone and in scope because of the atmosphere in Catholic Europe immediately following Luther's emergence.⁹⁵

Erasmus' strange career following the fruitful years for humanist thought in Spain is typical of a quick turnaround on what would eventually come to be viewed as some of the excessive leniency of Cisneros' administration on potential threats to traditional Catholic devotion. These threats were troubling due to untethering of devotion from the heavy oversight of the teaching authority and sacraments of the Church.⁹⁶ While different strains of thought and practice would receive attention from the Inquisition on a case by case basis, the driving philosophy behind the atmosphere where they were allowed to flourish remained intact. Developing an anthropology with the ability to interact with God interiorly, experientially and with Holy Scripture is a necessary step toward devotional diversity. While this guiding anthropology might have resulted in forms that, if not unwanted by Cisneros were almost certainly unanticipated, the career of Francisco de Osuna can be seen as the product of the values that Cisneros labored so tirelessly to instill in sixteenth century Spanish Catholicism.

It was during the 1490's, a formative decade for Cisneros' career and the future of the Franciscan Order, that Francisco de Osuna was born in Osuna, a small Andalusian town. The precise year of his birth is unknown, but those who try to determine the date have narrowed the two potential answers down to 1492 or 1497 with recent favor, owing more to common sense than

⁹⁵ Ibid, 92.

⁹⁶ Christine Christ-von Wedel details the relationship between Erasmus' works and the *Index librorum prohibitorum*, most notably the (eventually reversed) placement of his entire corpus on the list in 1558. She also discusses large-scale burnings of his books conducted in 1543. See: Christine Christ-von Wedel, *Erasmus of Rotterdam: Advocate of a New Christianity* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013), 88 and 181.

any new evidence, preferring the earlier option. The debate and tentative consensus surrounding his birth year is representative of the crumbs of biographical data that have survived Francisco's career.

While he was not averse to sprinkling the odd bit of personal detail into his own work, particularly in his series of Latin sermons presented during his later career excursions north of the Pyrenees, these facts were never intended to serve any systematic attempt at biography. All of his principal biographers lean on the same piece of information, a mention in a 1533 collection of his sermons entitled *Santuarium Biblicum*, or, alternately, *Pars Septentrionalis*, probably given while Francisco was in Toulouse,⁹⁷ that he was at the 1510 conquest of Tripoli. Mariano Quirós García parses Francisco's hints like a careful detective, observing that his presence there was "active"⁹⁸ and he called himself "*puer*,"⁹⁹ two details that risk drowning the reader in implication without offering any specificity.

His earliest modern biographer, Michel-Ange Sarraute, narrows his focus down to the admission of youth and estimates a birth year of 1497,¹⁰⁰ while his subsequent biographers reject the possibility that a thirteen year old would be present in active capacity during this military endeavor. Fidèle de Ros' analyzes the etymological use of the term "*puer*" and sees an extraordinarily tight window wherein Francisco could be both a cognizant attendant, of some nature, in the conquest of Tripoli, and a "*puer*" as the Latin term would have been used in recalling one's youth. In his analysis, the term is reserved for certain nostalgic properties, permitting one

⁹⁷ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 147.

⁹⁸ Mariano Quirós García, *Abecedario Espiritual: V y VI partes. Vol. I: Estudio Introductorio* (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002), 28. "activa"

⁹⁹ *Ibid*, 28

¹⁰⁰ Michel-Ange Sarraute, "La Vie Franciscaine en Espagne entre les deux couronnements de Charles Quint," *Revista de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos* 29 (1913): 1.

to recall their youth in a larger sense that includes late adolescence.¹⁰¹ Accounting for the unlikelihood that anybody would willingly accept responsibility for a younger boy during an active military venture, Fidèle de Ros' view primes future biographers¹⁰² to look past Michel-Ange's estimation and conclude that Francisco was indeed an eighteen year old in Tripoli, born in 1492¹⁰³.

After his time as a spectator at the conquest of Tripoli, an eighteen year old Francisco returned to Spain to embark on yet another prolonged absence from his Andalusian hometown. Fidèle de Rós claims that Francisco made the pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela,¹⁰⁴ a trip potentially consisting of more than six hundred walking miles if we assume that Francisco took the route starting the closest to Osuna. This trip, which occurred between 1510 and 1513, may be seen as both indicative of Francisco's devotion and formative of his career path within the Franciscan order.

The considerable space between the most certain data, his written product, and his forays into the relative independence of a life beyond his hometown, presumes an education that would provide valuable biographical detail that has been incredibly elusive to contemporary scholars.¹⁰⁵ A thorough review of the citations in any critical editions of the *Abecedario Espiritual* will start to resemble a reading list that would meet with approval from Cardinal Cisneros. This congruity with Cisneros' educational program leads to the entirely fair speculation that Francisco studied at

¹⁰¹ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit), 1936. 6-7.

¹⁰² Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 107.

¹⁰³ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 6.

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid*, 34.

¹⁰⁵ Quirós García offers a caution against overreaching on many long-held biographical details for Francisco de Osuna. See: Mariano Quirós García, *Francisco de Osuna y la imprenta: catálogo biobibliográfico* (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 2010), 18.

Alcalá. However, this speculation is not borne out conclusively. Fidèle de Rós offers two alternatives to Alcalá. The first is the new University of Seville, which was nearer to Osuna. Geography seems to be Seville's main recommendation in educated speculation, as Salamanca joins Alcalá as co-favorite due to their higher profile in Spanish higher education and their proximity to where Francisco would eventually settle and begin his career with the Franciscans.¹⁰⁶

There are twists to be added to these speculations about a traditional higher education; namely, the possibility that Francisco's education at a university was truncated and split between two sites. Fidèle de Rós favors the position that Francisco studied at both Alcalá and Salamanca while actually receiving the bulk of his formative education as a Franciscan novice. Most historians have been simply comfortable guessing a single destination out of the two primary ones, with the slight majority¹⁰⁷ favoring Alcalá.

After this period, it is fairly certain that Francisco entered the Franciscan Friars Minor around 1515, with Toledo as the likely destination for anybody entering the order in the province of Castile. At this point, it is worth observing that time in the Friars Minor would similarly familiarize Francisco with Cisneros' reform agenda. Whether this fact can be seen as augmenting or replacing the possible education that Francisco experienced at Alcalá is a matter of some uncertainty, and even Fidèle de Rós is left to conclude in frustration, "Pedro Salazar, official analyst, in creating in 1612 a small bibliography of his province, cited amongst the writers who have left a trace: Cardinal Cisneros and his Polyglot Bible, Alonso de Madrid and his Art of

¹⁰⁶ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 28.

¹⁰⁷ See: Alastair Hamilton, *Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth Century Spain: The Alumbrados*, (Cambridge: J. Clarke, 1992) and Bert Roest, *Franciscan literature of religious instruction before the Council of Trent* (Boston: Brill, 2004).

Serving God (1521)... And Francisco de Osuna? He is an unknown.”¹⁰⁸ De Rós offers some alternatives, with Alcalá, Madrid, and Guadalajara as other likely candidates for this period of rest, study, and prayer in Francisco’s life. The best guess indicates that Francisco likely spent the late 1510s through the early 1520s in and around Toledo and Madrid, far north of his Andalusian hometown but in a satellite position to the centers of sixteenth-century Spanish culture and society.

Somewhat subverting the impact of the discussion about Francisco’s more formal education is the program of scholarship at Castile’s Franciscan houses. Certain houses specialized in certain subjects, though all fed into a well-rounded religious education so it is difficult to fully narrow our focus to Alcalá’s house for its specialty in theology (where Torrelaguna specialized in philosophy). Fidèle de Rós seems most comfortable taking a wide approach to this problem, and places Francisco at St. Antonio Cabrera for the study of the humanities, followed by three years at Torrelaguna for philosophy, and four at Alcalá for theology. This last period had him studying under Francisco Ortiz shortly before his ordination in 1519-1520.¹⁰⁹ Francisco’s eventual arrival in Notre Dame de Salceda, however, is another matter entirely.

That matter is, mercifully, more certain than any other fact between his pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela and his published debut in 1527. Fidèle de Ros writes, “One thing is beyond contest: In 1523, Osuna is ordained as a priest and in residence at Salceda, where he consulted on the delicate problems of the mystical paths.”¹¹⁰ The retreat house at Salceda is

¹⁰⁸ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d’Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 34. “Pedro de Salazar, annaliste officiel, dressant en 1612 un petite bibliographie de sa Province, cite parmi les écrivains qui ont laissée une trace: le Cardinal Ximénès et sa Bible polyglotte, Alonso de Madrid et son *Arte de server a Dios* (1521)...Et Francisco de Osuna? C’est un inconnu.”

¹⁰⁹ Ibid, 34.

¹¹⁰ Ibid, 45. “Une chose est hors de conteste: en 1523, Osuna est prêtre et en résidence à la Salceda, où on le consulte sur les délicats problèmes de voies mystiques.”

referred to occasionally as a *Recolectorio*, because of its designated specialty in the practice of recollection that came, officially, rather late in the life of the house.¹¹¹ The house was discovered in the late fourteenth century by Pedro de Villacreces and shortly after gained its reputation as an important part of the Observant Franciscan movement and the push for reform within the order.¹¹²

Villacreces and a small cohort became well known for founding religious houses similar to La Salceda for both men and women across Castile. These houses placed a keen emphasis on combining traditional Franciscan austerity with meditation that focused on mental prayer. In his extraordinarily careful analysis of religious instruction in the Franciscan Order prior to the Council of Trent, Bert Roest observes that a revived interest in Villacrecian thought, previously suppressed, around 1487 led to a Spanish and Portuguese renaissance for the “Recollect” movement that centered on the same principles of austerity and mental prayer that Villacreces taught to his hermitages¹¹³ and which we will soon see elaborated in exquisitely creative detail in Francisco’s *Spiritual Alphabet*. As we may perhaps expect from an author who dedicates his biographical work to his Franciscan mentor, Michel-Ange Sarraute, Fidèle de Ros has a high opinion of the program of learning and discipline undertaken there and compares it favorably to the hypothetical alternative of “speculative and sterile study”¹¹⁴

During Francisco’s tenure at Salceda, the work and thought of the group known as *Alumbrados* began to gather attention amongst the Church hierarchy in Spain. Estafania Pastore

¹¹¹ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos: Madrid, 2005), 14.

¹¹² Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d’Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 58.

¹¹³ Bert Roest, *Franciscan Literature of Religious Instruction Before the Council of Trent* (Boston: Brill, 2004), 152-153.

¹¹⁴ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d’Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 74. “étude speculative et sterile.”

describes an important overlap between *converso* identity in Spain and the development of *Alumbrado* spirituality focused around the “Pauline” language of an unmediated interior examination.¹¹⁵ This specific theological expression will be examined in greater detail in chapter three, but the fluidity Pastore describes between *converso* and *Alumbrado* spirituality is a crucial step in understanding the transition in attention from the Inquisition.

The group in Toledo had a history dating back more than a decade, notably featuring women in leadership roles.¹¹⁶ Their emergence and their radically passive spirituality, the practice of which has come to be known as *dejamiento* or “abandonment”, can be connected to Cisneros’ permissive stance towards novel and potentially heterodox devotion of a certain stripe. The Spanish reformer had a track record of interaction with thinkers who would be, in time, charged with heresy.¹¹⁷ Women can be added to the list of Cisneros’ tolerated purveyors of questionable ideas, as one of Cisneros’ most famous incidents of theological indiscretion was the protection of Sor María de Santo Domingo. Sor María gained some infamy in the early sixteenth century for her ostentatious religious ecstasy. Ultimately, she was acquitted in front of a deeply supportive tribunal due to her strong, powerful friends.¹¹⁸

Cisneros has therefore been perceived as responsible for the growth of illuminism, some expressions of which would be seen as dangerous and heretical a mere decade later. He accomplished this by tolerating new forms of spirituality during his oversight of Spain’s Church

¹¹⁵ Estafania Pastore, “Mujeres, Lecturas Y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan de Castillo,” trans. Josep Monter, *Historia Social* 57 (2007): 51-73.

¹¹⁶ Gillian T.W. Ahlgren, “Negotiating Sanctity: Holy Women in Sixteenth Century Spain,” *Church History* 64 (1995): 373-388.

¹¹⁷ Jose Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the origins of the Spanish and Italian reformation* (Genève : Droz, 1970), 54.

¹¹⁸ Jodi Bilinkoff, “A Spanish Prophetess and Her Patrons: The Case of Maria de Santo Domingo,” *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 23 (1992).

and his reform program, which took on unpredictable forms outside of Alcàla and in the custody of Spain's increasingly literate and curious populace.¹¹⁹ What this analysis fails to consider, in my view, is the possibility of a stable illuminism both prior to and beyond Cisneros' regime owing to older mystical traditions both foreign and domestic. Recent scholarship, like Pastore's work, describes a persecutorial continuity that casts important suspicion on the notion that the Inquisition was tracking meaningful trends in spirituality.¹²⁰ The changes that we observe are therefore less changes within the tradition but rather in its visibility, due largely to a combination of ongoing efforts to persecute *converso* identity and the effect of the Reformation in moving the focus of the Inquisition toward the heresy of "Lutheranism."¹²¹ Any continued conversation within the field of illuminism also raised the considerable stakes for Francisco de Osuna.

Francisco's period at Salceda generally considered to have concluded shortly before the 1527 publication of the third part of the *Spiritual Alphabet* was an intellectually fruitful one for the late-blooming Francisco. The period between 1522 and 1527 was also marked by some travel within Spain to the province of Los Angeles and to Escalona. This second destination brought Francisco into contact with Diego López, the Marqués of Villena, to whom Francisco dedicates of both the third part of the *Spiritual Alphabet* and his 1531 piece *Norte de Los Estados*. Additionally, he developed a friendship with Francisco Ortiz, a fellow advocate of *recogimiento* within the Franciscan order. Their preaching came into early formative conflict with the thought of the

¹¹⁹ Jessica Boon, "Mother Juana de la Cruz: Marian Visions and Female Preaching," in *A New Companion to Hispanic Mysticism*, ed. Hilaire Kallendorf (Leiden: Brill, 2010), 127-148.

¹²⁰ Estafania Pastore, "False Trials and Jews with Old-Fashioned Names: Converso Memory in Toledo," *La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literature, and Cultures* 41 (2012): 235-262.

¹²¹ John Longhurst, *Luther's Ghost in Spain (1517-1546)* (Lawrence, KS: Coronado Press, 1969), 14-15.

Toledo *Alumbrados*, led by Isabel de la Cruz and Alcaraz, but it was a conflict without the benefit of clarifying theological language prior to the Edict against the Alumbrados of Toledo of 1525.

Melquiades Andrés Martín describes the conflict between *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* as a largely internal matter to the Franciscan Order, as advocates of both sides had relatively collegial awareness of each other and saw a debate on equal terms. He explains that, prior to 1525, “‘recogimiento’ and ‘dejamiento’ had no fixed meaning.”¹²² In contrast to Andrés Martín’s description, Francisco’s other biographers¹²³ tend to see only theological antagonism between parties with similar fervor for prayer and meditation. Greater discussion of the meanings which these two terms acquired during Francisco’s lifetime will occur during chapter three.

We can attribute an impressive trajectory within the order to his preaching on *recogimiento* during this period, a trajectory which increased in magnitude by the beginning of his writing career. The most productive period for Francisco was between 1527 and 1531.¹²⁴ This period saw the first three parts of the *Spiritual Alphabet*, a piece which put the exposition of the practice of *recogimiento* into careful focus. In 1527, the third part was published, though its opening sentences refer to the existence of the yet-unpublished first two parts.¹²⁵

His second publication was the first part of the Alphabet, and arrived to the public the year after the third part. Both the second and fourth parts were released in 1530 and would be the final parts of the *Spiritual Alphabet* published during Francisco’s lifetime. The twelve year gap in

¹²² Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 173. “... ‘recogimiento’ y ‘dejamiento’ no tienen sentido fijo.”

¹²³ See: Andrés Martín, Alistair Hamilton, Fidèle de Ros, Mariano Quirós García.

¹²⁴ For discussion of Francisco de Osuna’s possible methodology in this unorthodox publication scheme, see: Mariano Quirós García, *Francisco de Osuna y la imprenta: catálogo biobibliográfico* (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 2010), 27.

¹²⁵ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 87.

publication between the fourth part and the fifth part extended two years past the Francisco's death, which was announced in the publisher's introduction to the fifth part in 1542.¹²⁶

In 1554, another dozen years later, the sixth part was published. While each part can stand independently, the finished structure of the six parts leads most analysts to conclude that the *Spiritual Alphabet* is best understood as a single work consisting of six parts.¹²⁷ The odd lags between installments of the *Spiritual Alphabets* did not mean similar gaps in his publication record. In 1530, he also published a Eucharistic treatise called *Gracioso Combite de las Gracias del Sancto Sacramento del Altar*. His work on marriage and family life, *Norte de los Estados*, arrived the following year. That work also hints at the degree of his ascension within the Franciscan Order by 1531. The frontpiece to the text refers to Francisco as "Commissioner General of the Order of St. Francis in the Indies"¹²⁸ but it is unanimously agreed upon by his biographers that the administrative duties of this position, which would have taken him across the Atlantic, were declined by Francisco in order to continue his writing and preaching.

Turning down a trip halfway around the world did not, however, mean that Francisco was content to remain in the traditional orbit of influence in Spain. In 1532 he set north for France and beyond, first arriving at Toulouse. The actual purpose of his whole trip is unknown. Nevertheless, based on his increasing responsibility and title within the Franciscan Order, Francisco's visit to a

¹²⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Vol. II Quinta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002), 248.

¹²⁷ Mariano Quirós García, *Vol I: Estudio Introductorio*, (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002), 45-53.

¹²⁸ Illustration published in Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 115. "comissario general de la orden de sant Francisco en las provincias de las indias del mar oceano,"

Toulousian Franciscan chapter likely had an official function, either to represent Castile's own Franciscans or to push for a greater Franciscan presence in the New World.¹²⁹

After publishing a series of sermons called *Sanctuarium Biblicum*, Francisco departed Toulouse in 1533 and moved on to Paris where he published another group of sermons called *Pars Meridionalis*. After moving on from Paris in 1535, he travelled north and east towards the Low Countries. Francisco made two extended stays in Flanders, first in Bruges and then in Antwerp, where he spent nearly two and a half years. There was a common personnel exchange between Castile and the Low Countries, began through shared trade interest and blossomed economically in the sixteenth century. This exchange went on to include religious personnel during the early decades of the Reformation.¹³⁰ Interestingly, the geographical connection typified by the movement of a theologian frequently understood as a mystic actually reflects, in reverse, the intellectual exchange observed by Pierre Groult's 1927 piece *Les Mystiques des Pays-Bas et la Littérature Espagnole du Seizième Siècle*. This ambitious piece posits an influence of the Low Country mystics of the middle ages, particularly the women, on Spanish Golden Age thought.¹³¹

This period, when Francisco was closer to the front lines of the Reformation, would have been a logical point to turn attention to the split within the Catholic Church that had been progressing since well before his career began. Antwerp in particular was gripped with the fallout from the Radical Reformers during the period that Francisco spent in that city.¹³² As early as the first part of the *Spiritual Alphabet*, he had shown some awareness of the Reformers north of the

¹²⁹ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 158.

¹³⁰ *Ibid*, 146.

¹³¹ Pierre Groult, *Les Mystiques des Pays-Bas et la Littérature Espagnole du Seizième Siècle*, (Louvain: Uystpruyst, 1927).

¹³² Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 155.

Pyrenees. In the fourth part, he alludes to Luther specifically as “martin luterо, capitán de los apostatas”¹³³ and in the fifth he mentions with disappointment the schism caused by Henry VIII’s divorce from Catherine of Aragon.¹³⁴ So, while his own work failed to register beyond Spain or Franciscan circles outside of Spain, he was obviously keenly aware of the strong shifts in the landscape of European Christendom and wrote with those shifts in mind.

He moved on from Antwerp to work his way into Germany, with a particular interest in the great Cathedrals along the Rhine like those at Cologne and Aachen.¹³⁵ Though a hypothetical trip to Rome is considered in some of Francisco’s later works, there is little evidence that this ever occurred. His travels ended in 1537 and he returned to Spain for what is generally assumed was the last three years of his life. The notice in the prologue of the fifth part of the *Spiritual Alphabet* is the only certain confirmation of his death, and that was released finally in 1542. However, the lack of verified activity or further publication seems to point most scholars towards his death at the age of forty-eight in 1540.

Francisco’s death in 1540 neither finished any meaningful period in Spanish history nor completed his publication career since the final two parts of the *Spiritual Alphabet* still had not seen the light of day. It does, however, provide a frame for the present work that will examine his construction of the practice of *recogimiento* as the result of the active anthropology that Cardinal Cisneros’ program left to Spanish thought during his incredibly fruitful two decade oversight of the nation’s religious thought and practice.

¹³³ Francisco de Osuna, *La Cuarta Parte del Abecedario Espiritual* (Valladolid, 1551), Fol. ccii.

¹³⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI Partes: Vol. II Quinta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002).

¹³⁵ Pére Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître De Sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d’Osuna: Sa Vie, Son Oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Beau-Chesne-Croit, 1936), 155.

Francisco's career can be seen as a result of the program of reform that Cisneros instituted. This is seen in Francisco's likely education at Alcalá and his embrace of the classics of interior spirituality that Cisneros fed to an eager public to a manner of spiritual exercise that takes the ability of the human memory to open itself to find, admit, and retain God in prayer will be seen as absolutely central. What we will see in the following chapter is the further detailed development of the practice of mental prayer and spiritual exercises. Francisco de Osuna's notion of *recogimiento* is at the forefront of this development but it did not stand alone in the 1520s and 1530s in Spain and was rather in conversation with several different understandings of the legacy that Cisneros left behind.

BUILDING THE *ABECEDARIO* IN A TRADITION OF SPIRITUAL EXERCISES

The complex nature of meditation and prayer is central in Francisco's creation of the *Abecedario Espiritual*. Orbiting the category of prayer, however, are a series of suppositions about how one understands and responds to the relationship between God and the interior and exterior realms of creation. As we will see, Francisco's active anthropology, in contrast to his *Dejado* opponents, posited that this response required a rigorous program of prayer. Physical asceticism was not necessarily required, as the interior act of organized contemplation inviting God into the soul was both sufficiently difficult for even an experienced practitioner of *recogimiento* and effective for lay and religious alike. Development of this activity placed Francisco in a long history of spiritual exercises. Though he demonstrated familiarity with some of these predecessors,¹ my objective in this chapter is not establishing a causal relationship between specific authors and Francisco's *Abecedario*. Rather, I will explore how Francisco's work can be seen as part of a thematically continuous tradition of spiritual exercises from antiquity through the sixteenth century.

Pierre Hadot points to Philo of Alexandria's spiritual exercises composed of "research (*zetesis*), thorough investigation (*skepsis*), reading (*anagnosis*), listening (*akroasis*), attention (*prosoche*), self-mastery (*enkrateia*), and indifference to indifferent things."² Philo's list is instructive for all the subsequent generations of spiritual exercises in its attentiveness to the need to control what the senses receive, how they receive the created world, and how the disclosure of the created world is organized within the human mind. The categories of *prosoche* and *enkrateia*

¹ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 54.

² Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 84.

will retain their importance unbroken into the Christian tradition, dispersed amidst the martyrs and spiritual athletes of the early Church and adapted by Evagrius of Pontius into the monastic movement that would sweep across Christendom.³ Hadot's categories of *zetesis*, *skeptis*, *anagnosis*, and *akroasis* are of particular importance for the strictly interiorized vision of the *Abecedario Espiritual* because they refer directly towards the soul's governance of its powers of reception, both in the cluttered created world and in our deliberate reception of Christian wisdom in written form.

Hadot's specific mention of Philo demonstrates the credit he gives to the Stoics for their efforts to control the passions. What is central to the careful maintenance of the passions, then, is minding the way in which we perceive the exterior world beyond our control that, nevertheless, seems to govern our passions whether or not we desire. Hadot describes how creation is controlled mentally, noting, "We must keep life's events 'before our eyes,' and see them in the light of the fundamental rule. This is known as the exercise of memorization (*mneme*) and meditation (*melete*) on the rule of life."⁴

Hadot's cross-cultural survey requires occasional resort to the term "fundamental rule," which is best understood as the organizing principle which is lived in action through ethics or spiritual exercises.⁵ The Christian rule of life developed for millennia beyond Philo or any other Stoic's sight, but the intense struggle to control the relationship between the soul and the created world in all of its volatility, will remain central to everybody who accepts the challenge of spiritual

³ Nicole Kelley, "Philosophy as Training for Death: Reading the Ancient Christian Martyr Acts as Spiritual Exercises," *Church History* 75 (2006): 733-735.

⁴ Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 85.

⁵ Arnold Davidson, introduction to *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 24.

exercises. According to Hadot, Neo-Platonism had a large influence on the direction of the spiritual exercises prior to its welcome reception in the Church.⁶ Plotinus' instructions in the *Enneads* prods its readers past a bland improvement of the interior self and towards a fuller notion of the spirit, a total identification with the Good and the annihilation of the individuated, diffuse self. He explains, "Think of the traces of this light upon the soul, then say to yourself that such, and more beautiful and broader and more radiant, is the light itself; thus you will approach to the nature of the Intellectual-Principle and the Intellectual Realm, for it is this light, lit itself from above, which gives the soul its brighter life."⁷ Sorting through the clutter received from the created world and assimilated into the aforementioned individuated self is as crucial a part of the Neo-Platonic interior excavation as it was for the Stoics. In the latter case, however, Hadot is more comfortable drawing a direct line to Christian thought through the figure of Augustine and, more specifically, in his work *De Trinitate* where, "...by making the soul turn inward upon itself, he wants to make it *experience* the fact that it is an image of the Trinity...it is in the triple act of remembering God, knowing God, and loving God that the soul discovers itself to be the image of the Trinity."⁸

Essentially, spiritual exercises are directed toward two objectives: creating an interior affection and strengthening the soul to continuously persevere in that affective state.⁹ Moreover, as the tradition moved toward early modernity, the act of reading was fundamental to the spiritual

⁶ Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 101.

⁷ Plotinus, *Enneads*, trans. Stephen McKenna and B.S. Page (London: Aeterna Press, 2015), 7.

⁸ Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 107. My emphasis.

⁹ Aaron Stalnaker describes a distinction between "fact" and "task" in the believer realizing his creation in God's image. This distinction points towards the need for perseverance in a created affection. See: Aaron Stalnaker, "Spiritual Exercises and the Grace of God: Paradoxes of Personal Formation in Augustine," *Journal of the Society of Christian Ethics* 24 (2004), 158-159.

exercise not only because it is how instructions are communicated but also because a book provides a lasting, present partner to engage the soul's faculties in pursuit of the genesis and durability of these affections. Brian Stock sees in Augustine's *Confessions* the highest example of the centrality of reading to self-directed spiritual progress. In Stock's view, "...the narrative becomes an object of thought while retaining its links with sense perception, since, in constructing its meaning, we have to recall the words that have passed before."¹⁰ He understands Augustine's project in *Confessions* as embedding this principle within the content and structure of the life of Christ, available to the senses in finitude and then absent again, leaving believers to approach the Christ that lingers after the senses withdraw within their own interior state.¹¹ *The Confessions*, therefore, discloses as much about the mechanics of spiritual progress as advice on how to attain it. This is extremely clear in Augustine's meditations during Book XI where he draws an analogy between time, the senses, and reading a psalm as whole that consists of parts to spiritual progress, observing, "It is also valid of the entire life of an individual person, where all actions are parts of a whole, and of the total history of 'the sons of men' (Ps. 30:20) where all human lives are but parts."¹² This standard for Christian spiritual exercises will persist through the time of Francisco de Osuna, as a certain work of lasting influence that attempts to describe properly the intent of spiritual exercises.

According to Hadot, the experiential aspect of Augustine's fusion of Trinitarian theology and his theology of the self is what early modern entrants into the field of spiritual exercises seek

¹⁰ Brian Stock, *Augustine the Reader: Meditation, Self-Knowledge, and the Ethics of Interpretation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996), 75.

¹¹ *Ibid*, 75.

¹² Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 243. "hoc in tota vita hominis, cuius partes sunt omnes actiones hominis, hoc in toto saeculo filiorum hominum, cuius partes sunt omnes vitae hominum."

to emulate in their own work.¹³ Hadot's primary concern in this work was not the development of a theoretical framework, but rather the manner in which philosophy was subsumed into and then eventually subverted to the service of Christian theology.¹⁴ However, the theoretical framework that he attributes to an ancient pre-Christian tradition will be exactly our focus as we proceed towards a more uniquely early modern construction of the enterprise of the spiritual exercise. The underpinning for an early modern construction of the spiritual exercise has at least as much referent in late medieval analogues¹⁵ as in the ancient roots that Hadot has helpfully elucidated.

The emotional and affective dimension of spiritual exercises and devotional practices was particularly emphasized in the early modern era.¹⁶ This emphasis develops as the interaction of believers with vivid imagery inserted into familiar narratives to heighten affections, called *ekphrasis*.¹⁷ Margery Kempe, for example, famously inserted herself into visually detailed descriptions of Christ's life that she claimed to perceive spiritually.¹⁸ In the tradition of spiritual exercises, the importance of images was crucial as a constant theme.¹⁹

The importance of imagery is discussed at length by Sarah McNamer. In her work on affective meditation, McNamer makes the case that the two different images that the Pseudo-Bonaventure author of *Meditationes Vita Christi* carefully details, one on an upright cross,

¹³ Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1995), 66.

¹⁴ *Ibid*, 107-108.

¹⁵ Piroska Nagy, "Religious Weeping as Ritual in the Medieval West," *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice* 48 (2004): 119-137.

¹⁶ Hans Belting, *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997).

¹⁷ John Slater, "History as Ekphrastic Genre in Early Modern Spain," *MLN* 122 (2007): 217-232.

¹⁸ Kathleen Kamerick, "Art and Moral Vision in Angela of Foligno and Margery Kempe," *Mystics Quarterly* 21 (1995): 151-152.

¹⁹ Louis L. Martz, *The Poetry of Meditation: A Study in English Religious Literature of the Seventeenth Century* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976).

perpendicular to the ground and another in a reclining position, near the ground and therefore vulnerable to the mocking onlookers, “contradicted each other in terms of the emotional response they are designed to elicit.”²⁰ McNamer’s view is that the second position emphasizes compassion for Christ’s state as a victim to aggressive crucifiers. Christ’s lordship and majesty is not mentioned, nor even something as small as his voluntary embrace of his sacrifice.²¹ Meanwhile, the alternate image is a largely contrary understanding of Christ as “fully in control of his thoughts, actions, and destiny, obediently climbing toward his death, actively stretching his ‘royal’ arms up to his crucifixes, offering himself to the Father in full sight of the crowd, is not designed primarily to produce pity in the heart of the reader.”²² This is the martyrs’ position, according to McNamer, and it is predicated on strength. She attributes the incongruity to an addition in the text by “a redactor whose aims, stylistic propensities, and habits of thought are often dramatically different from those of the original author,”²³ but an incongruity in affective outcomes does not necessarily represent a corruption within the text.

The affections developed within spiritual exercises are a means rather than an end. The expected end is that once a welcoming affection is present and durable within the believer, the ingress of God’s transformative grace is possible.²⁴ The variety of affections that can capably welcome God’s presence in the soul invites a corresponding diversity of approaches, tailored to different types of readers. McNamer’s excavation of the diverse origins of the pseudo-Bonaventuran text concludes that a strong case can be made for, if not female authorship of the

²⁰ Sarah McNamer, *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 97.

²¹ *Ibid*, 97.

²² *Ibid*, 97.

²³ *Ibid*, 98.

²⁴ Andres G. Nino, “Spiritual Exercises in Augustine’s *Confessions*,” *Journal of Religion and Health* 47 (2008): 90.

piece, then a devotional discussion which is aimed specifically at women. While her concerns are more narrowly focused on the background of this piece, her conclusion offers some symmetry with Hans Geybels' observation of a trend during this period towards a "democratization" of spirituality.²⁵ Bernard McGinn's work offers the most usefully broad exposition of this term, defining it as "... a conviction that it was practically and not just theoretically possible for all Christians, not just the *religiosi*, to enjoy immediate consciousness of God's presence."²⁶ In his studies of early modern Spain, Melquiades Andrés applies the same language of "democratization" to describe the increasing availability of the idea of religious perfection, and attributed it to the growth of mental prayer.²⁷ McGinn understands these changes as proceeding from Bernard of Clairvaux's discussion of individual experience and developing into thirteenth-century movements which increasingly viewed an escape from the world as unnecessary to union with God.²⁸

For Geybels, this individualization of spirituality is tied by necessity to democratization, specifically around the phenomenon of religious texts written in the vernacular. Both of these developments are relevant for the practices that will emerge more than a century later in Spain. He is careful to observe that the resulting democratized religious experience may be one that is no longer exclusive to the monastic life, but it remains beholden to a well-educated upper class. Increasing participation by the laity does not include the lower-class laity, as it remains a project for an educated urban class.²⁹

²⁵ Hans Geybels, *Cognitio Dei Experimentalis: A Theological Genealogy of Christian Religious Experience* (Charlottesville, VA: University Press, 2007), 235-242.

²⁶ Bernard McGinn, "The Changing Shape of Late Medieval Monasticism," *Church History* 65 (1996), 198.

²⁷ Melquiades Andrés, *Historia de la Mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1994), 67-68.

²⁸ *Ibid*, 196-198.

²⁹ *Ibid*, 242.

Eric Jager's *The Book of the Heart* traces the broadening availability of interior spirituality through his titular metaphor, arguing "... the interior book mainly underwrote the subjectivity of a privileged clerical elite, until the romance, the saint's life, popular piety, and visual art greatly extended its social range and psychological applications."³⁰ Those "psychological applications" needed to be responsive to an expanding audience for prayer that focused on the interior experience of the individual believer. However, Jager argues that this requirement did not indicate a turn away from language focused on the corporeal. Rather, prayer "...emphasized the parallel between the wounded heart of Christ and the heart of each believer as a record of Christ's Passion."³¹ Christ's heart is a point of affective contact for every individual believer, and spiritual exercises of the middle ages sought to facilitate that connection in a specific, repeatable manner.

Scholarship on the history of emotions and imagery has focused on depictions of the Passion and its fruits in the astonishing variety of individual, affective experience. Susan Schreiner observes that Jean Gerson was a pivotal figure in the wide growth of late medieval fascination with experience. In her view, the manner in which Gerson joined affective experience and knowledge prompted the development of spiritual exercises based on the transformation of the heart.³² Sarah McNamer understands the variety of affective outcomes as the result of democratization, but these may also be seen as the cause of that democratization. Readers were invited to meditate on several different images of the crucified Lord, resulting in a proportionate variety of affective states created interiorly.³³ William Christian Jr.'s work on the active,

³⁰ Eric Jager, *The Book of the Heart* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2000), 136.

³¹ *Ibid*, 113.

³² Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise: The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 212.

³³ Sarah McNamer, *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 97-98.

manipulated use of weeping for religious purposes posits that the emotions elicited served as public and private tests of a believer's spiritual state. Training these emotions and inclining them towards tears at the horror and magnitude of Christ's sacrifice was common in sixteenth century Spanish devotion.³⁴ Anne Derbes argues that the increasingly vivid representations of Christ's passion in thirteenth century Italian art was instrumental in establishing the spiritual identity of "poverty and self-sacrifice" in the Franciscan Order in particular.³⁵ Because these states are only a means toward creating a state which welcomes God into the soul, the multitude of affective states invite a similar multitude of readers and engage them experientially. Barbara Rosenswein rejects the arc of "emotionology" studies which posited that "the history of the West is the history of increasing emotional restraint."³⁶ She tracks a tendency to set earlier moments in history as unrestrained emotional foils for their more developed successors.³⁷ Her opposing model is based on the idea of "emotional communities" wherein members evaluated and managed emotions mutually.³⁸ Furthermore, people navigate shifting expectations as they inhabit different emotional communities as members. As she rejects the idea of historically progressive emotional restraint in favor of diverse emotional communities, I would add that there is room to understand spiritual exercises designed to provoke and channel emotions as part of the process of emotional community building.

³⁴ William A. Christian, Jr., "Provoked Religious Weeping in Early Modern Spain," in John Corrigan, *Religion and Emotion: Approaches and Interpretation* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 33-51.

³⁵ Anne Derbes, *Picturing the Passion in Late Medieval Italy: Narrative Painting, Franciscan Ideologies, and the Levant* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 156-157.

³⁶ Barbara Rosenswein, "Worrying About Emotions in History," *The American Historical Review* 107 (2002): 827.

³⁷ *Ibid*, 828-834.

³⁸ *Ibid*, 842.

Francisco de Osuna was well-positioned to inherit this wide-ranging affective tradition, and to focus it with spiritual exercises. In Hadot's excavation of the term "spiritual exercise" the adjective "spiritual" is both the subject and the object of the exercises.³⁹ A practitioner examines the interior self and seeks to reform that self through strictly interior means. Because the object of reform is the elusive spiritual self, the restriction of the exercises to the interior states is less of a limitation than an acknowledgement of the infinitude of the spaces within, Augustine's "vast fields and palaces."⁴⁰

In order to bring into clarity the fullness of the field of spiritual exercises, this chapter will offer an examination of some texts that emerged from *Devotio Moderna*. The first text, *The Spiritual Ascents*, was written by Gerhard Zerbolt and is included in this analysis due to its heavy influence within that movement.⁴¹ Additionally, I will examine a second, more well-known piece by Thomas à Kempis, *The Imitation of Christ*. John Van Engen grandly states the cross-continental influence of this work with reference to readers and enthusiasts as diverse in geography and career as Erasmus, Luther, Calvin, and Ignatius.⁴² However, he also makes a valuable point about the contrast between the historical durability of the *Devotio Moderna* and the way in which their thought permeated late medieval and early modern thought. Van Engen explains, "Because brothers and sisters were finally not an institutionalized order, their spirit could quickly disappear

³⁹ Pierre Hadot, *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*, trans. Michael Chase (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1985), 82

⁴⁰ Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 185-187.

⁴¹ John Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Latter Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988), 5-36.

⁴² *Ibid*, 315-316.

obviously, as their houses did, but also the more easily infiltrate new and different settings and situations.”⁴³

Francisco worked under the direct influence of *Imitation of Christ*, available in multiple vernacular editions throughout Spain between 1482 and 1523,⁴⁴ and the indirect influence of *Devotio Moderna* suggested above by Van Engen and confirmed with specific respect to Spain by Saturnino Lopez Santidrian.⁴⁵ Zerbolt’s importance within the *Devotio Moderna*, as well as passionate advocacy for spiritual publications written in the vernacular⁴⁶ insist that his work be included in this analysis. From this earlier, continental view of the development of spiritual exercises directed towards lay audiences, I intend to compare developments within their work to the mechanics of Francisco de Osuna’s own spiritual exercises within the third volume of the *Spiritual Alphabet*.

During this period, the *Devotio Moderna* movement in northern Europe represented perhaps the purest distillation of the ancient tradition of spiritual exercises and the increasing exposure that interior spirituality was receiving amongst the laity. Hans Geybels’ meticulous volume, *Cognitio Dei Experimentalis: A Theological Genealogy of Christian Religious Experience* places the *Devotio Moderna* at the end of the same curve previously suggested by Louis Dupré, a move towards greater spiritual individualization that runs through Bernard of

⁴³ Ibid, 316.

⁴⁴ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 2007), 48.

⁴⁵ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 13-14.

⁴⁶ John Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Latter Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 274-275.

Clairvaux and then finds its peak with Francis of Assisi directing devotion towards the humanity of Jesus of Nazareth⁴⁷.

The particular set of educated urban elite that would become the *Devotio Moderna* was established in the Dutch city of Deventer about 1375 by a university-educated man of not inconsiderable financial assets named Geert Groote when he was around thirty five years old. Ordained as a deacon, he donated his house to women living in religious poverty and set out about Utrecht to preach on conversion and repentance. Groote died in 1384 from the plague. Though he was struggling with disapproval from the church in Utrecht, he left behind a group of interested followers, both men and women, that started to gather in privately owned homes to practice the non-regulated devotion to conversion, humility, and repentance that he had taught.⁴⁸ Within a short time, these private houses for the lay devout had spread throughout the Netherlands and into parts of Belgium and Germany.⁴⁹

Local reception of this movement was varied, but initially seemed to range from suspicious to intolerant. Analogies with the Beguine and Beghard movements from a century prior were easy to make independent of the theological content of the respective movements,⁵⁰ and those earlier groups had managed impressive levels of unpopularity just by giving the appearance of anti-social freeloaders who were taking marriageable women off the market.⁵¹ Additionally, the movement

⁴⁷ Hans Geybels, *Cognitio Dei Experimentalis: A Theological Genealogy of Christian Religious Experience* (Leuven: University Press, 2007), 237-238.

⁴⁸ R.R. Post, *The Modern Devotion: Confrontation with Reformation and Humanism* (Leiden: Brill, 1968), 178-184.

⁴⁹ John Van Engen, introduction to *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings* (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), 12

⁵⁰ R.R. Post, *The Modern Devotion: Confrontation with Reformation and Humanism* (Leiden: Brill, 1968), 281.

⁵¹ Walter Simons, *Cities of Ladies: Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200-1565* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), 121.

initially found resistance to their enthusiasm for works written in the vernacular, a trend which was somewhat reversed by the work of Gerhard Zerbolt.⁵²

Unlike their freely-associating predecessors, the *Devotio Moderna* proved capable of turning around the tide of public opinion. Van Engen credits previously achieved social status and the relative fidelity to church authority and teaching for this somewhat uncommon shift in reception. Curiously, this change was so thoroughly accomplished that the movement came under later criticism for a perceived overabundance of fidelity to the papacy in an era of increasing civic tension with Rome.⁵³

However, this odd reversal of reputation was not as instrumental in their slow decline as the pure difficulty of the balance that the movement tried to maintain from its beginning between their simultaneous refutation of and participation in contemporary late medieval urban life, local parishes, and religious orders. Van Engen claims that the communities largely dissolved into analogous living situations in groups that lived under a rule, namely Tertiary Franciscans and Augustinians.⁵⁴ What remained was a nearly century-long success in lay enthusiasm for interior devotion, humility, and penance without a systematic governing rule and the texts that so successfully provoked this enthusiasm in the followers of the *Devotio Moderna*.

We turn now to the work of Gerhard Zerbolt. Van Engen notes the importance of Zerbolt's *The Spiritual Ascents* in the earliest stages of the *Devotio Moderna* and the popularity of this text which was reproduced in nearly one-hundred hand written versions and twenty-nine printed

⁵² John Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Latter Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 98-101.

⁵³ John Van Engen, introduction to *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings* (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist, 1988), 12-14.

⁵⁴ *Ibid*, 19.

versions.⁵⁵ If modern readers take Gerhard Zerbolt's own colleagues at their word, his work was an important statement of the method and belief of the *Devotio Moderna*. Furthermore, its popularity persisted beyond the lifetime of the *Devotio Moderna* among a group that Francisco de Osuna would find even more familiar: Tertiary Franciscans.⁵⁶

Shortly before his death from the plague at age 31 in 1398, Zerbolt composed *The Spiritual Ascents*. This text is notable for its dedication to describing the process of devotion rather than providing convincing detail regarding the resulting union with the Divine. Zerbolt wants to reform the soul systematically and unceasingly, and the ascent described in the text is notably disinterested in describing what a restful soul feels. Rather, his interest is in exploring the chasm between what our fallen capacity can achieve without God's grace and what it can with the ascent brought by grace.⁵⁷ Relevantly, he remains suspicious of the fallen human capacity's lingering tendency to wrongly inspire our trust. He cautions that in spite of a "natural desire for ascent and for the heights, ... (you) must therefore dispose your heart to these ascents, not trusting to make the climb on the strength of your own virtue but resting constantly upon the aid of the Almighty and the protection of the God of heaven."⁵⁸

Tellingly, Zerbolt situates the anthropological problem for the fallen man as a problem of the interaction between our capacity for reason and the senses. Prior to the Fall, no tension existed between the created world in which God placed humankind and the senses that people used to take in and enjoy God's universe. Zerbolt positively hums about this glorious past, observing that

⁵⁵ Ibid, 56.

⁵⁶ John Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Latter Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 276.

⁵⁷ R.R. Post, *The Modern Devotion: Confrontation with Reformation and Humanism* (Leiden: Brill, 1968), 327.

⁵⁸ Gerard Zerbolt, "The Spiritual Ascents," in *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*, trans. John Van Engen (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), 245.

“Outwardly you enjoyed a pleasant place sweet with delights; inwardly you possessed a full knowledge of things and affectations, all in a quiet and peaceful harmony.”⁵⁹ Even after this, however, Zerbolt continues to twist the knife in describing the depth our humankind’s fall in terms that highlight the shadow sin casts on our interior faculties. He explains of this period that, “Your intellect was illumined like your first parent, and although, as we believe, it did not see God in his essence, it nonetheless gazed upon him with the pure intuition of the mind and at the limits of contemplation.”⁶⁰ It is toward this prior state of perpetual illumination attained by grace that Zerbolt hopes to direct the active reader in his spiritual exercises in *The Spiritual Ascents*. The difficulty for any reader who hopes to accomplish this by the heft of his own interior faculties is explicit in the text. Humankind’s fallenness is manifested in its deepest form in these faculties, so whereas once “...sense obeyed reason, and reason the mind....,”⁶¹ now the mind is divided from God and its rightful place. With This division results in the fact that “Reason itself, made blind, erroneous, and obtuse, often holds the false for true and frequently involves itself in the useless and merely curious.”⁶² Fallen reason no longer finds God disclosed in the world. Now, creation taken in through the senses becomes a distraction pointing the well-meaning believer towards everything but God.

Christ’s sacrifice on the cross offers the chance for redemption from the unhappy but largely unconscious fallen state in which believers suffer. However, Zerbolt is careful to point out that in our terrestrial lives “...there is no damnation for those who are in Christ Jesus, yet he in no way restored us to our pristine state of rectitude, nor did he reform the powers of our souls....”⁶³

⁵⁹ Ibid, 247.

⁶⁰ Ibid, 247.

⁶¹ Ibid, 248.

⁶² Ibid, 249.

⁶³ Ibid, 249.

The statement of goals represented in this sentiment foreshadows a piece that will largely eschew description of the eventual union with the divine in the delivery of a consistent prod towards ascendant progress. The exercises offered by Zerbolt to his readers in *Devotio Moderna* and beyond do not include spiritual rest. The “pristine state” prior to the Fall is to be desired daily, ceaselessly and pursued actively.⁶⁴ However, he does strongly believe that “for the sake of our own exercise and merit he left those (our faculties) for us to reform through holy exercises.”⁶⁵ This advice is consistent with the greater emphasis in *Devotio Moderna* on growth and advancement instead of union.

The exercises themselves promote a reflective oscillation in the reader’s consciousness between contemplating his dismal state before God in order to comprehend fully the need for illumination of our interior faculties so that they may work in harmony with God and nature and contemplating the grace of that illumination. These former contemplations take the form of generalized examinations of conscience which increase in scope when understood in the context of our decreasing proximity to God. Of fallen reason, which appears over the course of the text to be Zerbolt’s stoutest interior opponent, he instructs the reader to ask himself, “Is it not proud, thinking itself something when it is nothing, preferring itself to the good, and refusing to learn from anyone? Unspeakable, and unteachable, and incapable of good counsel?”⁶⁶ The relational perspective that the exercises are intended provoke is deeply reminiscent of Bernard of Clairvaux’s

⁶⁴ Daily, physical labor as a common metaphor for the active work of interior reform of the human soul was heavily used by the *Devotio Moderna* and Zerbolt himself. See: Philip H. Stump, “The Continuing Relevance of the Idea of Reform,” in *Reassessing Reform*, ed. David Zachariah Flanagan, and Christopher M. Belitto (Washington D.C.: Catholic University Press, 2012), 53-56.

⁶⁵ Gerard Zerbolt, “The Spiritual Ascents,” in *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*, trans. John Van Engen (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), 249.

⁶⁶ *Ibid*, 253.

own work, which took frequent opportunity to highlight the distance of God from man and how that distance is traversed by God's own effort and not our own. Bernard's sermon on the kiss which opens the Song of Songs reveals his relational understanding of interior devotion by unfolding the layers of God's condescension towards humankind, where God mediates every step of God's approach.⁶⁷

Zerbolt's ascents, as contrasted with the descents designed to demonstrate the perspectival chasm between the believer and God, exist to provoke the proper affective framework for the approach to God. Qualities like humility and remorse are heightened during these ascents, and Zerbolt is not afraid to enlist the interaction of senses and imagination in order to create visually evocative subjects for meditation. For instance, to move the reader towards remorse for their sins, meditation on our imminent death is required. He instructs the reader, "On another occasion, place before your eyes the image of some dying man.... His whole body withers, all its members grow stiff, the eyes turn up, and so on. Then think about how the demons will arrive expectantly, like beasts preparing to eat...."⁶⁸

The experience of remorse is closely related to the way Zerbolt's constructs the desire for union with God.⁶⁹ The affective link is supported with similarly creative visualizations, but more pleasant ones than a withering corpse being consumed by demons. He exhorts readers to meditate on the Passion, "... animatedly gathering and devoutly impressing his passion on your heart as the first myrrh. This will happen when you devoutly, thoughtfully, and sadly reflect on Christ's

⁶⁷ Bernard of Clairvaux, "Sermon 2: On the Kiss," in *Bernard of Clairvaux: Selected Works*, trans. G.R. Evans (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1987), 215-220.

⁶⁸ Gerard Zerbolt, "The Spiritual Ascents," in *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*, trans. John Van Engen (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), 253.

⁶⁹ John R. Decker, "Engendering Contrition, Wounding the Soul: Geertgen Tot Sint Jans' 'Man of Sorrows,'" *Artibus et Historiae* 29 (2008): 67-68.

passion, scrupulously imagining it literally or according to the first meaning of the words.”⁷⁰ Additionally, it is noteworthy that the visualization that Zerbolt offers of the Kingdom of Heaven is extraordinarily specific with respect to architectural details. He writes, “That city is therefore most glorious in breadth, of the purest gold and wonderfully constructed out of the most precious gems with pearls for each of its gates. It is a spacious field abloom with all the most beautiful flowers.”⁷¹

Decorating the interior city with rare and precious items, and taking particular care to note its vastness, is a step that intends to embed the image of the celestial kingdom in the mind of the believer and to make it an appealing place to inhabit.⁷² Describing heaven as heavenly, however, is not as interesting a maneuver as the push for the reader to inhabit this space interiorly. To dwell there often in our interior life and to decorate the space with not only traditional signs of earthly beauty but more importantly with ourselves is a hint of how these spiritual exercises will be expanded into new proportions by Francisco de Osuna. Presence of the believer interiorly at the Passion of Christ is perhaps the most scenic background for this method of devotion and it is consistent with the Franciscan Order’s enthusiasm for detailed visual elaboration on Christ’s suffering and sacrifice,⁷³ a tradition with which Francisco de Osuna was certainly familiar.

⁷⁰ Gerard Zerbolt, “The Spiritual Ascents” in *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*, trans. John Van Engen (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1988), 281.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, 268.

⁷² Though this passage does not explicitly address the faculty of memory, encouraging the reader to visualize a specific architectural shape and to furnish it with memorably beautiful items indicates a possible familiarity with the art of memory training, particularly the architectural mnemonic. The relationship between the memory arts and spiritual exercises will be explored at length in chapters four and five. See: Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 89-98.

⁷³ Peter Loewen, “Portrayals of the Viti Christi in the Medieval German Marienklage: Signs of Franciscan Exegesis and Rhetoric in Drama and Music,” in *Comparative Drama* 42 (2008), 317.

There is one text produced during the late medieval period which succeeded in totally overwhelming local boundaries, finding an eager, enormous lay audience it arrived.⁷⁴ That piece, Thomas à Kempis' *Imitation of Christ* was likely written in the early fifteenth century when Thomas was newly ordained and in his early thirties. The subsequent forty years until his death in 1471 were spent as an Augustinian canon with a close association to the *Devotio Moderna* and included the production of a substantial collection of similar works of interior spirituality as well as biographies of some early luminaries of his movement.⁷⁵

Though it cannot be categorized as spiritual exercise, the four part *Imitation of Christ* offered spiritual advice to both lay and religious readers on the spiritual life, the inner life, inward consolation, and then the Eucharist. This piece by Thomas à Kempis had a transnational, lasting impact and brought the thought of the *Devotio Moderna* to the rest of late-medieval Europe. The book's popularity has been observed to precede directly the growth of Spanish spirituality in Italy, starting with its arrival there in 1483 and Italian translation five years later.⁷⁶ The wild popularity of this book, which found itself on the shelves of some of the next century's most powerful thinkers, Catholic and reformed alike, has also resulted in a spirited scholarly debate on the value of the movement to the tumult of the sixteenth century.⁷⁷

The scope of this chapter is limited to a look at the availability and influence of *Imitatio Christi* in sixteenth-century Spain amongst the early purveyors of spiritual exercises and interior

⁷⁴ Liudmilla Charipova, "Peter Moyhla's Translation of 'The Imitation of Christ,'" *The Historical Journal* 46 (2003): 237-261

⁷⁵ Leo Sherly-Price, introduction to *Imitation of Christ* by Thomas à Kempis (New York: Penguin, 1952), 22.

⁷⁶ Paul F. Grendler, "Form and Function in Italian Renaissance Popular Books," *Renaissance Quarterly* 46 (1993): 462-467.

⁷⁷ Steven Ozment, *The Age of Reform: 1250-1550: An Intellectual and Religious History of Late Medieval and Reformation Europe* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 97-98.

devotion. Marcel Bataillon traces its emergence in Spain to, at the latest, 1482. The text was printed under the title *Contemptus Mundi* and frequently misattributed to the French conciliarist John Gerson. Furthermore, he claims that it enjoyed great popularity, which we may measure by numerous imprints, before a definitive Castellan translation in 1536 by Luis de Grenada.⁷⁸ Melquiades Andrés Martín includes it among the books considered staples of Cisneros' educational program⁷⁹ and we may therefore suppose it often found its way into the eager hands of Spain's brightest during this period. Along with Ludolph of Saxony's *Life of Christ*, the text is counted among the most formative for Ignatius of Loyola during his long, bedridden recovery from military injuries.⁸⁰ Furthermore, due to the common misattribution of *Imitation of Christ* to Jean Gerson,⁸¹ it is likely that many of Francisco de Osuna's references⁸² to the work of Gerson are actually to Thomas à Kempis' text. For instance, in the third volume of the *Spiritual Alphabet*'s third letter, Francisco writes, "...If we wish to engender in our souls the Lord's grace through his favor and know how to speak gloriously of heavenly things, we must first be dumb, as Gerson says, even within the heart..."⁸³ While Gerson's work focused narrowly on interior prayer, it is difficult to ignore the fingerprints of *Imitation of Christ*'s first book on the spiritual life in the

⁷⁸ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 48.

⁷⁹ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Espanola (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1975), 25.

⁸⁰ Steven Ozment, *The Age of Reform: 1250-1550: An Intellectual and Religious History of Late Medieval and Reformation Europe* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1980), 410.

⁸¹ Maxmilian Von Habsburg, *Catholic and Protestant Translations of the Imitatio Christi, 1425-1650: From Late Medieval Classic to Early Modern Bestseller* (Farnham, Surrey: Routledge, 2011), 216.

⁸² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 479.

⁸³ *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 148. "Si queremos engendrar en nuestras animas la gracia del Señor mediante su favor, y saber gloriosamente hablar de las cosas celestials, primero, como dice Gerson, hemos de ser mudos, aun en lo interior del corazón" trans. Mary Giles, 105.

instructions to “be dumb.” In his twentieth chapter of this section, entitled “De Amore Solitudinis et Silentii” Thomas advises “In silence and quietness the devout soul makes progress and learns the hidden mysteries of the Scriptures. There she finds floods of tears in which she may nightly wash and be cleansed. For the further she withdraws from all the tumult of the world, the nearer she draws to her maker”⁸⁴ Silence steadies and empties the consciousness for the reception of God’s grace, a gift that we fumblingly fail to hold onto when distracted by the clamor of the world and the consequent clamor of our own thoughts.⁸⁵ Between the common misattribution of the period and Francisco’s shared enthusiasm for a stillness of spirit with Thomas á Kempis, we can be confident in the judgment that a great deal of the citations for Jean Gerson in *Spiritual Alphabet* are properly owing to *Imitatio Christi* and that Francisco de Osuna was well acquainted with the work.

In a general avoidance of labelled steps in a process toward union, Thomas’ work seems less of a certain fit into the category of spiritual exercises than Zerbolt’s earlier work within the *Devotio Moderna*. However, a conclusion that focuses on the Eucharist moors the piece in the sacraments of the church and directs individual ruminations on the interior life in a way that pushes readers towards an organized, active pursuit of the reception of God’s grace. To this end, the piece offers three sections preparing the reader interiorly for the interior approach of God and then

⁸⁴Thomas á Kempis, *Imitation of Christ*, trans. Leo Sherley-Price (New York: Penguin, 1952), 5. “In silentio et quiete proficit anima devote, et discit abscondita Scripturarum. Ibi invenit fluent lacrymarum, quibus singulis noctibus se lavet et mundet, ut Conditori suo tanto familiarior fiat, quanto longius ab omni saeculari tumultu degit,” trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁸⁵ Francisco attributes the exhortation to spiritual silence to Jean Gerson at several other instances throughout the *Tercer Abecedario*, including “hemos de ser mudos” in Tr. 3.3 and 21.6. Additionally, he cites Gerson’s recommendation that believers search for God “en simplicidad de corazón” in Tr. 6.6 in an echo of Thomas á Kempis’ dual mentions of a “simple heart” in 4.4 and 4.15.

finishes with a fourth wherein the recollected state of the prior sections permits a physical, exterior approach of God in the sacrifice of the Mass.

Thomas à Kempis' twenty sixth chapter of *The Imitation of Christ's* third book, on inward consolations, lays out the benefits of a mind which has been freed from the accumulated clutter of his contemporary material world. Thomas observes that the perfect man's objective is "never to slacken his mind from attention to heavenly things."⁸⁶ What is interesting in this mostly standard account of the conflict between the spirit and the body is how the focus on interior states is maintained by framing the dangers with effects both troubling and tempting to the spirit. What Thomas describes as "affectioe undue attachment to worldly things"⁸⁷ limits both our ability to love properly and to trust properly, removing God as the right focus of both. The former obstacle is clear, that a love rather than an unattached use of created things can confine the soul to a search for pleasure, but the former shows a prescient emphasis on the volatility of certainty and trust in God. In Thomas' view, the plea to God "Let me not be overcome by flesh and blood"⁸⁸ includes the desire to not be overwhelmed with anxiety about the frail, finite world.

This is the peace that is necessary to receive God's grace, and in helpfully sacramental terms, to receive the Eucharist. The perseverance to preserve this peace is, however, a difficult and costly task to which the *Imitatio Christi* devotes serious thought. His solution is single-mindedness, an objective to which he assigns the verb *colligere*, a reasonable translation for Francisco de Osuna's *recogimiento* insofar as it refers to an organized gathering of the interior states. He writes, "How can anyone remain long at peace who meddles in other people's affairs;

⁸⁶ Thomas à Kempis, *Imitation of Christ*, trans. Leo Sherley-Price (New York: Penguin, 1952), 45. "numquam ab intentione caelestium animum relaxare," trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁸⁷ *Ibid*, 26. "creatura inordinate," trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁸⁸ *Ibid*, 81. "non me vincat caro et sanguis," trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

who seeks occasion to gad about, and who makes little or no attempt at recollection? Blessed are the single-hearted, for they shall enjoy much peace.”⁸⁹ He recommends this interior recollection on a daily basis because of the difficulty in persevering in that recollected state.⁹⁰

This emphasis on the development of the interior state of peace and unity leads the reader towards Thomas’ concluding book, where the body of Christ in the Eucharist offers the literal and exterior, physical unity with God’s grace for which the believer has prepared. As Thomas points out in the introductory chapter to this fourth book, the blessed sacrament is itself a recollection. It is obvious to Thomas that if the body of Christ could only be offered in one place in the whole world that Christians would scramble from all corners of the globe to be there at that time. Instead, all of Christendom benefits due to the fact that this is not the case. Thousands of priests can offer the Eucharist in thousands of locations so that believers, understood by Thomas as “paupers and exiles,”⁹¹ in a scattered and diffuse state, can universally enjoy the grace of God offered in the sacrament of the altar. In this sense, the grace of God reaches out into the world to recollect its diffuse souls back into unity. The abundance of God’s grace overflows even the fully recollected soul. Thomas states that “Such a person will overflow and wonder, and his heart will be enlarged within him, for the hand of the Lord is upon him, and he has placed himself wholly in His hand forever.”⁹² The transformative grace described here, where God’s guiding hand is felt, is available

⁸⁹ Ibid, 11. “quomodo potest ille in pace die permanere, qui alienis curis se intermiscet qui occasiones forinsecus quaerit, qui parum vel raro se intrinsecus colligit? Beati simplices, quoniam multam pacem habebunt,” trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁹⁰ Ibid, 19.

⁹¹ Ibid, 61. “pauperes et exules,” trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁹² Ibid, 75. “Tunc videbit et affluet et mirabitur et dilatabitur cor ejus in ipso, quia manus Domini cum illo est, et ipse se posuit totaliter in manu ejus usque in sæculum,” trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

in the Eucharist; this point highlights the congruity between Christ's sacrifice and the interior state where "he does not look to his own devotion and comfort."⁹³

The union with Christ found in the holy sacrament taught by Thomas in the conclusion of *Imitation of Christ* demonstrates how thoroughly any suspicion of heterodoxy amongst the *Devotio Moderna* was deflated by an examination of their actual work and devotion.⁹⁴ It is an odd coincidence that, in an era of similar suspicion towards interior spirituality for its potential independence from the authority of the church, the advice for frequent reception of communion can be found in both Thomas à Kempis and Francisco de Osuna, and it is the only suggestion by the latter that ever resulted in censorship from the Inquisition.⁹⁵ Francisco's carefully organized interior spirituality holds little in common structurally with either of the previously discussed works attributed to the *Devotio Moderna*, but he does carefully navigate the same manner of suspicion as his Northern European predecessors and takes the same tactic of using spiritual advice in order to cultivate an interior affection which is capable of welcoming God's grace. The development of this capability, which is defined as passive reception of a gift freely given by God, is nevertheless an active and rigorous endeavor in all of these works. Saturnino López Santidrián described *recogimiento* as simultaneously active, acquired, passive and infused from the perspective of a practitioner.⁹⁶ What is also important about Francisco's work, however, is how

⁹³ Ibid, 75. "non respicit ad propriam devotionem et consolationem, sed ad Dei gloriam et honorem," trans. Leo Sherley-Price.

⁹⁴ John Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 84-92.

⁹⁵ Mary Giles, introduction to *Third Spiritual Alphabet* by Francisco de Osuna (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1981).

⁹⁶ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 43-44.

the very structure of his work is designed to cultivate the interior faculty that he will emphasize so heavily within the actual exercises, the faculty of memory.

Francisco de Osuna inherited and cultivated many of the themes and devices that previous authors of devotions and spiritual exercises bequeathed to sixteenth century Catholicism. In the *Abecedario Espiritual* we will see Francisco discussing the use of exterior senses, the development of interior affective states and the soul, the practice of *recogimiento*, the entrance of God into the soul, and the ascent of the soul and the necessity for grace. Most important will be Francisco's discussion of the role of memory in all of these various aspects of the spiritual exercises. However, before examining these aspect of Francisco's thought, it is necessary to address the context in which he worked. This requires a discussion of the spiritual and meditative context of Spain, especially the group known as the *alumbrados* and the meditative practice known as *dejamiento*.

THE CHARACTER AND NATURE OF *ALUMBRADISMO*

In the following overview several overlapping issues will emerge that recur throughout the historiography on the group known as *alumbrados*. These issues include questions about the origins and influences that gave rise to the phenomenon of *alumbradismo*. The role of the church, the nature of prayer, particularly mental prayer, and the problems of spiritual oversight are themes that permeate this scholarship. For the purposes of this dissertation, the studies regarding the role of creation or the exterior world and the nature and function of the human faculties are of singular importance for the subsequent chapters on the thought of Francisco de Osuna.

A review of the scholarship surrounding Spanish illuminist groups will lead towards a functional definition for the practice of *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*. Furthermore, these definitions will be integrated into a deeper understanding of the origins of these two movements and the primary source documents surrounding their early stages of development. The evolution of these groups during their lifetimes has made establishing clear definitions of their spiritual practices difficult for scholars.¹ Often, there appears to be as much difference within categories as between them.² To guide analysis, I will focus on how the topic of anthropology prompted discussion of spiritual practice during this period and in contemporary scholarship. The two most popular practices, *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*, each assumed a different perspective about the capability of human believers before God. *Recogidos* adopted an active anthropology, while the *dejados* took a less active view of human nature.

¹ For two very divergent approaches to describing the relationship of these illuminist groups to and against each other, see: Massimo Firpo and John Tedeschi, "The Italian Reformation and Juan de Valdés," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 27 (1996): 357. Melquiades Andrés, *Historia de la Mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1994), 277.

² Paul Whitehill, "The 42 Names of 'Recollection': Meaning and Aesthetics in the Third Spiritual Alphabet," *Mystics Quarterly* 33 (2007): 18-22.

Illuminist groups within Spain reflected a desire for an interiorized, experiential spirituality and the ongoing spiritual democratization spreading across Europe.³ Mariano Quirós García observes a close relationship between the search for interiorized devotion and a sort of religious populism, but is careful to note the impact of persecuting bodies like the Inquisition on the growth of these movements.⁴ His analysis suggests a certain arbitrariness in which movements were persecuted and which ones were permitted to thrive. Even the seemingly careful focus on the *dejamiento* of the Toledo *Alumbrados* was driven, in Quirós García's view, by the internal distress the movement caused to the Franciscan Order rather than any necessary doctrinal objections.⁵

However, discarding the judgment of the Inquisition as a primary marker for distinguishing between the practices of *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* does not rule out meaningful theological differences between the two groups. Quirós García takes note of *recogimiento's* theology of love which requires an active anthropology for a believer to move from interior examination into the imitation of God. He explains, "Based exclusively in love – Franciscan affection – and the will of man to realize the vision of the Creator...."⁶ The interaction of love and will is essential to the practice of *recogimiento*; relies on an active theological anthropology that presupposes a believer is capable of willing the vision of the Creator; and distinguishes it from the practice of *dejamiento*.

Stefania Pastore has skillfully connected the focus of the Inquisition prior to the Reformation, suspicion of insufficiently converted Jews, to its focus after 1517 through analysis

³ Kocku von Stuckrad, *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities* (Leiden, Brill, 2010), 110-114.

⁴ Mariano Quirós García, "El itinerario del recogimiento en la quinta parte del Abecedario espiritual de Francisco de Osuna. Aspectos doctrinales y léxicos," *Revista de Lexicografía* 5 (1998): 115.

⁵ *Ibid*, 116-117.

⁶ *Ibid*, 20.

of a devotion she sees as “Pauline” in origin.⁷ This spirituality is interior in its focus, but achieves fruition in surrendering the will of the believer entirely to God’s divine will.⁸ Furthermore, the origins of this blossoming spirituality have been attributed to new Christians in early modern Spain as an effort to establish a distinctive Christian identity.⁹ This analysis adds continuity of the spirituality of converted Christians and their families into the sixteenth-century spiritual atmosphere¹⁰ and can provide a helpful framework for understanding how the thin lines between types of illuminist spirituality are not reflected in the Inquisition’s pursuits.

There were frequent breakdowns in collegiality between the parties standing at the front of humanist biblical scholarship in the first quarter of the sixteenth century,¹¹ and Erasmus stood out as a particularly divisive figure within that movement.¹² However, it is the similar outlook with regards to the potentiality of the human intellect which unites them and which drives toward refinement of interior, experiential devotion within the Church. Both of the primary types of spiritual practice to emerge in Spain during this period, *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*, reflected values of the humanist movement in Spain without necessarily owing their entire existence to it. *Recogimiento* was congruent with a humanist theological anthropology that valued the activity of the human soul, but the latter movement also demonstrated the desire for an immediate spirituality

⁷ Stefania Pastore, “Mujeres, Lecturas, y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan del Castillo,” trans. Josep Monter, *Historia Social* 57 (2007): 51-73.

⁸ Ibid, 65.

⁹ María Laura Giordano, “‘La Ciudad de Nuestra Conciencia:’ Los Conversos y la Construcción de la Identidad Judeocristiana (1449-1556),” *Hispania Sacra* 62 (2010): 43-91.

¹⁰ Stefania Pastore, “Mujeres, Lecturas, y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan del Castillo,” trans. Josep Monter, *Historia Social* 57 (2007): 66.

¹¹ Erika Rummel, *Jiménez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain’s Golden Age* (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 1999), 59.

¹² Thomas M. Conley, “No Way to Pick a Fight: A Note on J.C. Scaliger’s First *Oratorio contra Erasmus*,” *Rhetorica: A Journal of the History of Rhetoric* 26 (2008): 255-265.

and direct engagement with the biblical text among the educated laity.¹³ The question of what the Christian believer was capable permeated sixteenth-century Christianity. Some illuminists, like Francisco's opponents in the *dejado* movement focused their spirituality on the believer's lack of capability in relation to God. *Dejados* abjured the ceremony of the church in order to remain available to the immediate experience of God.

Clouding the distinctions between *dejamiento* and *recogimiento* is the term *alumbradismo*. Though the term *Alumbrado* is used to describe a variety of illuminist movements in and beyond sixteenth-century Spain, it most commonly describes heretical groups owing their thought to the group referred to as the *Alumbrados* of Toledo. This group coalesced around 1510, but largely avoided attention from the Inquisition for more than a decade.¹⁴ The oversight seems to be attributable to the relative looseness of the group, characterized by their lack of printed dogmatic material, as well as different priorities for the Inquisition prior to the threat of Luther and under the more flexible jurisdiction of Cardinal Cisneros.¹⁵ Cisneros' laxity towards this group is notable because of their prominence within his own Franciscan order.¹⁶ Conceived amongst the tertiary Franciscans, the *Alumbrado* movement in Toledo has been generally attributed to the

¹³ Victor Pérez-Díaz, "State and Public Sphere in Spain During the Ancient Regime," *Daedalus* 127 (1998): 261-262.

¹⁴ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 81-100.

¹⁵ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 56.

¹⁶ Melquiades Andrés Martín, "Alumbrados, Erasmians, 'Lutherans', and Mystics: The Risk of a More 'Intimate' Spirituality," trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel, in *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*, ed. Angel Alcalá (Highland Lakes, NJ: Columbia University Press, 1987), 468.

charismatic *beata*, Isabel de la Cruz, and her earnest pupil, Pedro Ruiz de Alcaraz, both of whom were imprisoned in 1524.¹⁷

Strictly speaking, *alumbrados* may refer to anybody who practiced a spirituality centered on immediate, experiential illumination from God. In this sense, it can describe practitioners of both *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*. Marcel Bataillon's work was notable for preferring to work around the more specific, heretical imputations on *alumbradismo*, and instead discussing the different practices of believers under the broader umbrella of "Spanish illuminism."¹⁸ These believers grew further or closer to the poles set by Francisco de Osuna and Pedro Ruiz de Alcaraz, the chief proponents of each respective practice, in the early part of the sixteenth century while still staying faithful to the loose organizing principles of interior illumination.

The Franciscan Order in Toledo was a fertile ground for the growth of *alumbradismo*, and both *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* had their origins within the order.¹⁹ There is evidence that Alcaraz was familiar with Francisco de Osuna²⁰ and his theretofore unpublished writings, and Francisco took rhetorical aim at what he understood as this errant group.²¹ This intra-Franciscan disagreement changed shape in 1525 with the "Edict against the *Alumbrados*." This document, a list of forbidden beliefs and practices identified with the movement by the Inquisition, is an important source for scholars of this period. However, it is limited by substantial imprecision in distinctions between several different unapproved strains of thought and cannot be taken at face

¹⁷ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 60-61.

¹⁸ Melquiades Andrés, *Historia de la mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América*. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1994), 265.

¹⁹ *Ibid*, 265.

²⁰ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 83.

²¹ Melquiades Andrés, *Historia de la mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América* (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1994), 268.

value as a test for distinguishing between *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*. The edict's value is found in demonstrating the theological priorities of the persecuting Church rather than the *alumbrados* and therefore, in offering a stable interlocutor for the trial documents produced by *dejado* figures who otherwise did not produce much written material.

What will emerge over the course of this chapter is a review of the ways *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* have been understood by scholars. The practices of *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* will be compared to each other and to the parallel growth of thought understood as Erasmian and Lutheran in that period. Though this chapter will focus on the relationship between these kinds of devotion within Spain, types of spirituality that craved immediacy with God were spreading widely throughout Europe during this period.²² An understanding of the origins of these two modes of devotion depends on discussion of their relationship with each other, and that discussion requires a focus on Spanish spirituality.

Origins and Influences

José Nieto's work is helpful for appending the terms *recogido* and *dejado* upon identifiable sets of theological ideals, expressed by the work and testimony of Francisco de Osuna and Alcaraz, respectively. He makes a point of observing the internal consistency of both Francisco and Alcaraz throughout their thought, particularly with respect to their anthropology.²³ The attitude of the Spanish church towards these forms of spiritual expression was in a state of flux from the periods

²² Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise? The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 209-258.

²³ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 86-87.

of Francisco's education and Alcaraz and Isabel de la Cruz' early careers through the third and fourth decade of the sixteenth century.²⁴ However, Alcaraz' written output is entirely related to his trial, in his testimony or correspondence while imprisoned and must be considered according to those circumstances.²⁵

In his controversial work on the origins of the Italian and Spanish reformation, Nieto describes Osuna's *Tercer Abecedario* as a defining statement of the *recogido* movement which is both pure and original in its distillation of that movement's beliefs.²⁶ Nieto's conclusions with respect to the exclusively Spanish origins of these movements has been largely discredited,²⁷ but his analysis is instructive in that he goes further than other scholars in not viewing the *recogidos* as an independent movement. Rather, he views them as group which shared space under the umbrella of *alumbradismo* with their familiar and local opponents, the *dejados*. He leans on Francisco de Osuna and Alcaraz as very roughly contemporary leaders in these paired movements and establishes points of rupture and connection to demonstrate a symbiosis between them.²⁸ Building on a shared allegiance to the Marqués de Villena, Alcaraz' patron at Escalona and the dedicatee of the *Tercer Abecedario*, *alumbrados* are characterized as sharing an interest in interior,

²⁴ Lu Ann Homza, introduction to *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*, ed. Lu Ann Homza (Indianapolis:Hackett, 2006), xxviii-xxxvii.

²⁵ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 60-61.

²⁶ *Ibid*, 81.

²⁷ The problems with Nieto's insistence on native origins for Spanish illuminist thought are succinctly outlined in E. Randolph Daniel, "Review: Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 41 (1973): 252-254.

²⁸ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 85.

experiential spirituality which is expressed to lay audience through discussion of prayer practice and objectives.²⁹

Since their thought is the most comprehensively recorded of their early compatriots, naming Francisco as a de facto leader of the *recogido* movement and Alcaraz of the *dejado* movement has a convenient sense to it. The differences between the two groups are what drive Nieto's analysis, however, and those differences also exist at the demographic level. The *recogido* group represents the establishment of the Franciscan order, while the *dejados* found not only their audience but their leadership from the laity.³⁰ Furthermore, we may understand the groups as diverging in mode of expression, nearly exclusively preaching in the case of the *dejados* and preaching alongside written guides for the *recogidos*.³¹

Particular attention to the divide between lay and Franciscan leadership permits a shift in focus to structural differences between the two approaches to interior spirituality. Because both groups sought what can be loosely understood as "illumination" it is necessary to focus on the precise nature of that illumination. According to Nieto, the illumination which was received by the *dejados* was directed towards reading Scripture and apprehending it in a spiritual sense. He explains that Alcaraz, "...is not saying that the Bible should not be read and meditated upon; rather he says that we should have no recourse to other books, the products of man's wisdom, in order to know what the Bible says to us."³² More recent scholarship on the continuity between fifteenth

²⁹ Ibid, 81

³⁰ Ibid, 65.

³¹ "Edicto de los Alumbrados de Toledo," *Los Alumbrados: Orígenes Y Filosofía 1525-1559*, ed. Antonio Márquez (Madrid: Taurus Ediciones, 1972), 69. See also: Stefania Pastore, *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)* (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010), 171-172.

³² José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 74.

century *converso* spirituality and the *alumbrados* has emphasized the notion of Paulinism, which features a spiritual illumination and consequent conversion caused by personal engagement with Scripture.³³ In contrast, the practice of *recogimiento* was as tethered to the interpretive teaching authority of the Church as it was to the external practices of the Church. Francisco de Osuna describes the importance of yearning for and receiving spiritual instruction in the fifth treatise of the *Abecedario Espiritual*. Though the content of a spiritual understanding of Scripture is similar, he also emphasizes the role of the *recogido* in seeking that gift through active use of the prior gifts of our intellectual faculties.³⁴ Nieto attributes the increased emphasis on teaching authority in *recogimiento* to the stronger connection of that practice to the Franciscan Order.³⁵

Though Francisco was aware of Alcaraz and his oeuvre due to their shared Franciscan culture,³⁶ he does not attack him by name in any of the *Abecedario*.³⁷ In 1527, the year the *Tercer Abecedario* was published, two years after the edict against the *Alumbrados* of Toledo, and already into Alcaraz' prison term, a direct confrontation of his ideas would be unnecessary because the Inquisition had already settled the matter definitively.³⁸ The difficulty with assuming an adversarial relationship that is necessarily directed towards the defeat of *dejamiento* is that it ignores the similarities between the practices. The extreme interiority they share forces us to

³³ Claude B. Stuczynski, "Pro-*Converso* Apologetics and Biblical Exegesis," in *The Hebrew Bible in Fifteenth-Century Spain: Exegesis, Literature, Philosophy, and the Arts*, ed. Jonathan Decter and Arturo Prats (Leiden: Brill, 2012), 156.

³⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 187-188.

³⁵ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 85-86.

³⁶ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 179.

³⁷ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 81.

³⁸ *Ibid*, 84.

understand any argument as part of a conversation within a field rather than a winner-take-all disputation.

One of the challenges in modern scholarship's varying definitions of *alumbradismo* is that *Alumbrados* did not always necessarily view themselves as directly competing. In criticizing the 1525 Edict as a tool for illuminist taxonomy, Pedro Santonja points out that theological nuance is compounded by the difficulty of testimony and even political considerations.³⁹ Gillian Ahlgren observes that entangled political and theological considerations were a trend that continued through two centuries of pursuing the *Alumbrado* heresy.⁴⁰ An umbrella term which includes heretical movements and is not limited to orthodox movements or to liminal movements like Erasmianism, Lutheranism, or more generalized humanism, complicates comparison between usages.

Melquiades Andrés Martín's scholarship offers readers a useful framework for understanding *alumbradismo* by holding it against a matrix of four categories of thought which are overlapping but ultimately non-identical. The four categories, which may be instructive even when they falter, are *Alumbrados*, Erasmians, "Lutherans,"⁴¹ and mystics. Each of these purported to offer a greater sense of intimacy with the divine.⁴² The nature of that intimacy and the agency of the human believer will remain crucial points of separation between the categories. The relative

³⁹ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 141.

⁴⁰ Gillian Ahlgren, *Francisca de los Apostoles: The Inquisition of Francisca: A Sixteenth-Century Visionary on Trial* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005), 3.

⁴¹ A term of frequent abuse during the period, often applied to any heretical thought

⁴² Melquiades Andrés, "Alumbrados, Erasmians, 'Lutherans,' and Mystics: The Risk of a More 'Intimate' Spirituality," in *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*, trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel, ed. Angel Alcalá (Highland Lakes, NJ: Columbia University Press, 1987), 457.

abruptness with which the Inquisition determined to face these categories⁴³ meant that they were frequently conflated in the Inquisitorial process.⁴⁴ This corresponding danger to the accused exposes both the heightened risk of intimate, unmediated spirituality in the early sixteenth century in Spain and the intricacy, owing to the volatility of the period, with which these categories could end up tied to each other.

Andrés Martín's first principle in sorting out chaotic early modern Spanish devotional practices is that all four of these categories are directed towards a contemporary thirst for interior spirituality, a devotion that promises direct and unmediated relationship with God and that consequently places great value on the individual experience of the believer. The term "interiority" serves as a "common denominator" between the four axes of this matrix, but Andrés Martín notes differing approaches to interiority at the outset, writing, "Renaissance humanism, and reforms all stress the individual's more intense concern with himself than his community. *Alumbrados*, Erasmians, mystics, and Lutherans⁴⁵ insist on the personal relationship between the self and God, without mediation of persons (priests), institutions (the church), or the intellect."⁴⁶ In this sense, "interiority" is valuable for both its simplicity and its versatility. It describes the sought-after proximity to God, but is constructed and attained differently in each of these groups. Those differences permit a careful focus on the relationship between illuminism and anthropology.

⁴³ Maria-Paz Aspe, "Spanish Spirituality's Mid-Sixteenth-Century Change of Course," in *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*, trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel, ed. Angel Alcalá (Highland Lakes, NJ: Columbia University Press, 1987), 422-423.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 424-425.

⁴⁵ That "Lutherans" did not have a place for mediation of the church is a common mischaracterization of their ecclesiology and is overly simplistic here. Andrés Martín is using the term "Lutheran" to describe the type of belief known in Spain as "Lutheranism" during this period.

⁴⁶ Melquiades Andrés, "Los Alumbrados de Toledo en el Cuarto Abecedario Espiritual, O Ley de Amor de Francisco de Osuna (1530)" *Archivo Ibero-Americano* 41 (1981): 459.

The scope in Andrés Martín's article on the confrontation between *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* is the pivotal period for the development of interior spirituality between 1500 and 1530.⁴⁷ The roughly contemporary development of both forms during this period prompts Andrés Martín to assign an identical goal, "a specific spiritual path seeking Christian perfection,"⁴⁸ to both movements. However, they show progressive divergence after a mutually recognized principle that the love of God in man is itself God.⁴⁹ The work of this love depends strongly on an anthropology which differs between the two practices. Francisco's more focused attack on *dejamiento* in the fourth edition of the *Abecedario* shows his suspicion that the activity of God's love within the "abandoned" believer⁵⁰ involves a problematic abdication of the commandments and the intentional progress toward spiritual purity.⁵¹ The complex line between wholly vacating the senses and recognizing that the heart moved by God's love operates with intact faculties is emphasized in contrast to those who "quiere vacar" the soul for an unmediated experience of God's love.⁵² The continued use of these faculties is primarily at issue in Spanish interior spirituality during this period.

⁴⁷ Ibid, 459-460.

⁴⁸ Ibid, 479. "...una vía spiritual concreta que busca la perfección Cristiana."

⁴⁹ Ibid, 480.

⁵⁰ "Abandonment" bears a similarity to the interest in *Gelassenheit* in the tradition of the radical German reformers such as Karlstadt and Müntzer. See: Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise? The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 90.

⁵¹ Melquiades Andrés, "Los Alumbrados de Toledo en el Cuarto Abecedario Espiritual, O Ley de Amor de Francisco de Osuna (1530)," *Archivo Ibero-Americano* 41 (1981): 480.

⁵² Francisco de Osuna, *Ley de amor y quarta parte del abecedario espiritual do[n]de se trata[n] muy de rayz los misterios y preguntas: y exercicios del amor: y la theologia que pertenece no menos al entendimie[n]to*, (Burgos, 1536), Fol. xciii.

Andrés Martín's work affirms that Cisneros' reform was the primary agent of the growth of Spanish interiority.⁵³ This position is common in scholarship on this period. However, the clarity of his division into the categories of "illuminism, Erasmianism, and Lutheran reform"⁵⁴ makes his account unique. The Observant sect's victory in its struggle is cited as part of the reason for the flowering of devotion centered on the interior, because of their adherence to the principals of "... the specific and methodic spirituality of the *Devotio Moderna*, the Spanish and Italian reformers, and Renaissance humanism."⁵⁵ The active assertion of love amongst the other theological virtues is seen as Francisco's systematic response in the *Abecedario Espiritual*,⁵⁶ a rebuttal necessitated by the patchwork approach in the 1525 Edict's condemnation of the branch. The 1525 Edict document attempted to address individualized articles of theological importance but did so, in Andrés Martín's mind, "without regard to the theoretical principles from which they were deduced."⁵⁷ Francisco's *Ley de Amor y quarte parte* is treated as a strong, and most importantly, extant statement of an original principle for interior illumination centered on God's love. Francisco advises the reader in the *Tercer Abecedario* to "draw love for God from all things, comparing it to all created things you see and contemplating how love is the spiritual, blessed earth

⁵³ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 108.

⁵⁴ Melquiades Andrés, "Los Alumbrados de Toledo en el Cuarto Abecedario Espiritual, O Ley de Amor de Francisco de Osuna (1530)," *Archivo Ibero-Americano* 41 (1981): 460. "...alumbradismo, erasmismo y reforma luterana..."

⁵⁵ *Ibid*, 460. "... de la espiritualidad metódica concretada en la Devoción Moderna y en las reformas españolas e italianas, y del humanismo renacentista..."

⁵⁶ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 236.

⁵⁷ Melquiades Andrés, "Los Alumbrados de Toledo en el Cuarto Abecedario Espiritual, O Ley de Amor de Francisco de Osuna (1530)," *Archivo Ibero-Americano* 41 (1981): 460. "...sin atender a los principios teóricos de los cuales se deducen."

that sustains us and on whose fruit we live and how it is the water that refreshes us....”⁵⁸ This is a particularly active description of love, and characteristic of the positive anthropology of *recogimiento*.

In contrast to Nieto’s assertion, those principles in *alumbradismo*’s origins have also been identified as geographically and intellectually far afield. Miguel Asín Palacios, as part of a career dedicated to demonstrating the relationship between Christian thought such as Dante and John of the Cross to its Muslim antecedents from Al-Ghazali to Ibn-Arabi, examined the relationship between the Sufi order known as the Shadhili tariqa and the work of the *Alumbrados*. In discussing the practice of *recogimiento*, he assents to the practice’s origins with the Franciscan order and begins his definition with the common broad strokes: an interior search for God within the soul. However, his definition departs from an understanding of two competing approaches under the umbrella of *alumbradismo* with one that sounds closer to the practice of *dejamiento* in its relationship to the interior faculties. He writes that in *recogimiento* the believer assumes a stance with respect to the created world that requires “dissolving the world so completely, that he comes to discard all discursive thought, every idea of things which are not from God, emptying them from the heart.”⁵⁹

Asín Palacios’ negative verb choice here, that the believer is to “dissolve the world” and “discard” earthly things demonstrates his eccentric analysis, but it is the objects of those actions

⁵⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 429. “...saca de todas las cosas el amor de Dios que compara el amor a todas las cosas criadas que ve, contemplando cómo el amor es tierra espiritual y bendita que nos sustenta, de cuyo fruto vivimos, y es el agua que nos refresca” trans. Mary Giles, 419.

⁵⁹ Miguel Asín Palacios, “Sadilies y Alumbrados,” *Al-Andalus* 9 (1944): 331. “...desasiendo de todo lo creado tan por completo, que llega a desechar todo pensamiento discursivo y toda idea de las cosas no son de Dios, vaciando de ellas el Corazón...”

which depart even further from Francisco de Osuna's construction of the term. While Francisco shows a heightened awareness of the obstacles that the created world can create for a believer, he is not interested in advising readers of the *Abecedario* to let go of the world entirely. He adds in defense of the physical world, "...sensuality will also inherit something, for if the bodily senses obey reason, which is the voice of conscience, and are conformed to it, they will delight in perfect joy and be occupied in perfect works in heaven."⁶⁰ Asín Palacios' addition of "discursive thought" however, does resonate with Francisco's insistence that the believer keep his interior state organized and focused on the objective of union with God.⁶¹

The method Asín Palacios describes results in a state that resembles Francisco's definition insofar as the faculties are driven by God's grace in union rather than surrendered permanently in that process. Asín Palacios writes, "...so that, once emptied, God alone inhabits it, whose love and intimacy entomb the soul in its hopes."⁶² The replacement that he describes here, wherein the "hopes" of the soul are infused into it by the love of God, allows the reader to understand a unitive state where the soul is capable of having aspirations of its own to love God.

According to Asín Palacios, the development of this particular interior spirituality was indebted to Islamic thought as part of an incredibly diverse theological and literary culture in late medieval Spain.⁶³ Specifically, he points to the *Sadilies*, a Sufi mystical and ascetic group between

⁶⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 107. "...heredará la sensualidad, porque en los cielos estos nuestros sentidos corporales, si obedecieren y fueren conformes a la razón, que es el dictamen de la conciencia, allá estarán en perfecto gozo y ocupados en perfecta obra." trans. Mary Giles, 61.

⁶¹ *Ibid*, 93-114.

⁶² Miguel Asín Palacios, "Sadilies y Alumbrados," *Al-Andalus* 9 (1944): 331. "...a fin de que en él, una vez vacó, habite solo Dios, en cuya amor y trato intimo cifre al alma todas sus aspiraciones."

⁶³ *Ibid*, 337-338.

the thirteenth and fifteenth century who share some affective similarities, like “spiritual nudity”⁶⁴ so that “contemplation and illumination elevate the perfect soul to the dwelling of divine love and the mystical union with Him through ecstasy and rapture....”⁶⁵

While Asín Palacios’ phrasing is not cited directly from any medieval sources, his terminology for “the dwelling of divine love” in the interior states is apt for both *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* and refers to the original principles that Andrés Martín found lacking in the 1525 Edict. Each of them is presented as a theology of love, but the question of anthropology is what separates them. Asín Palacios’ analysis treats all of *Alumbrado* spirituality, insofar as it owed some origins to the thought of the *Sadilies*, as one of renunciation of the faculties. He explains that what was taken from that group was “a passive abandonment of the will, which renounces all desire, even of charisms and union with God.”⁶⁶ The abandonment of the will and desire is a hallmark of *dejamiento*. However, Asín Palacios’ language is insufficiently precise to determine that he is strictly identifying the *Alumbrado* movement with *dejado* belief, only that it seems the passive aspects of *Alumbrado* spirituality seem to owe to the *Sadilies* movement.

Andrés Martín’s view that Continental intra-Franciscan disputes spurred the growth of *alumbradismo* and Asín Palacios’ genealogical approach through Islam stand in contrast to José Nieto’s previously mentioned claims that these new forms of devotion in Spain were wholly native to Spain. This inconvenient limitation is made in spite of the fact that there was a well-publicized dispute between Erasmus and those Spanish humanists who collaborated on the Complutensian Polyglot Bible nearly a decade earlier that indicated not only an awareness of his work, but a

⁶⁴ Ibid, 341. “...desnudez spiritual....”

⁶⁵ Ibid, 342. “La contemplación y la iluminación elevan al alma perfecta a la morada del amor divino y la mística unión con Él por el éxtasis y el rapto....”

⁶⁶ Ibid, 342-343. “...un abandono pasivo de voluntad, que renuncia a todo deseo, incluso al de los carismas, y al de la unión con Dios....”

willingness to engage it.⁶⁷ The idea that only Spanish language works are capable of inspiring Spanish thought supports the overarching agenda within Nieto's work that preserves a native influence on all of sixteenth-century Spanish spirituality. This position is difficult for him to fully sustain with respect to *recogimiento*, and he is willing to concede some Erasmian fashion in Spain after the translation of his *Enchiridion* around 1524-1526 into Spanish.⁶⁸ However, Alcaraz and his mentor, Isabel de la Cruz, had already been noticed as part of a growing trend by this time and the Edict of 1525 was a response to that attention. Therefore, Nieto tries to keep his high standards for cultural transmission in place with respect to the growth and development of the *dejado* movement.⁶⁹ His analysis of Asín Palacios' suggestion that prayer of the *Alumbrados* had substantial roots in Islamic mysticism of the late Middle Ages is both emblematic of his approach and relevant for demonstrating the range of sources which may be enlisted as predecessors of Spanish illuminism.⁷⁰

Nieto disregards the argument for Islamic roots as too hasty in overlooking Neo-Platonism as a common source for many types of mystical thought throughout the medieval West. As such, he argues that Asín Palacios' reasoning is too general in its case to consider the *Sadilies* part of the lineage for *alumbradismo*.⁷¹ The rejection of Martin Luther's influence is based largely on the formation of the Toledo *Alumbrados* prior to 1517. He offers a rigid linguistic analysis and restricts observation to the independent terminology in the scant available work of this group of

⁶⁷ Erika Rummel, "The Importance of Being Doctor: The Quarrel Over Competency Between Humanists and Theologians in the Renaissance," *The Catholic Historical Review* 82 (1996): 196.

⁶⁸ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 87.

⁶⁹ *Ibid*, 80.

⁷⁰ *Ibid*, 89-90

⁷¹ *Ibid*, 57.

thinkers.⁷² Though his thought on the topic of Lutheran influence in Spain refuses to accommodate any possible evidence that Luther's thought could have infiltrated Spanish thought without requiring that Alcaraz used identical language, his distinction posits a bright line between the categories of "Lutherans" and *Alumbrados* that the Inquisitors themselves were often frustratingly unwilling to draw.⁷³

Nieto looks back to Edward Boehner's nineteenth-century work on the period and credits him with suggesting distinction in subsequent literature between types of *alumbradismo*,⁷⁴ wherein the term is used to describe a full spectrum of positions seeking an interior illumination from God. In this sense, both *recogidos* and *dejados* fall under the umbrella term *Alumbrado* for Boehner and Nieto, but the process of sorting out what *alumbradismo* was is hamstrung by the fact that Boehner's expansion of the term was not observed in the sixteenth century. The 1525 edict was directed against the *Alumbrados*, but Alcaraz was prosecuted while Francisco de Osuna was not. In the end, the debris created by a persecuting religious state created a distinction between orthodox and heterodox that threatens to obscure the similarities between illuminist groups.

Recent scholarship has focused on the causal relationship between the persecuting religious state of Spain and the construction of *Alumbradismo*. In contrast to a strong distinction between the theological objectives of the Inquisition before and after the dawn of the Reformation,⁷⁵ and to a distinction between native and foreign religious expression,⁷⁶ Stefania Pastore observes a

⁷² Ibid, 67-68.

⁷³ Ibid, 76-80.

⁷⁴ Ibid, 59.

⁷⁵ Ibid, 65-67.

⁷⁶ Werner Thomas, *La represión del protestantismo en España, 1517-1648* (Leuven: Leuven University Press), 2001.

continuous focus on *converso* spirituality.⁷⁷ The category of *alumbrado* contains too much internal diversity for her to overlook their shared *converso* background and their consequent distress of both the crown and the Inquisition.

For all the above-mentioned diversity, one spiritual strain that the *alumbrados* did not possess was lingering Judaism. According to Pastore, the best efforts of Inquisitors to find actual hidden, residual Jewish practices amongst the *alumbrados* were unsuccessful.⁷⁸ She sees a strong spiritual forebearer in fourteenth-century Hieronymite spirituality, the thought of Erasmus, and the Franciscans under Cisneros' reform.⁷⁹ These influences establish continuity from the fourteenth century Inquisition through and beyond the threat of the Reformation in Spain. The persecution of *conversos* acts as a driving force for this continuity, but Pastore blurs the line between cause and effect by pointing to a particular type of *converso* spirituality which is shared by *alumbrados*. The resulting movement is distinctive of "new Christians" and expressed a desire for "A tradition based ... on establishing the differences between the Mosaic Law, based in rites and prescriptions, and the New Law, bearing a burning spiritual freedom."⁸⁰ Pastore describes this spiritual freedom as "Pauline," owing to the Paul the Apostle's desire to move away from external works, and further attributes the *alumbrado* push into annihilation of the will and the interior faculties to this tradition.⁸¹

⁷⁷ Stefania Pastore, *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)* (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010), 171-2.

⁷⁸ *Ibid*, 174.

⁷⁹ *Ibid*, 171-177.

⁸⁰ *Ibid*, 178. "Una tradición basada, todo ella, en establecer las diferencias entre la ley mosaica, anclada en ritos y prescripciones, y la Nueva Ley, portadora de una encendida libertad de espíritu."

⁸¹ Stefania Pastore, "Mujeres, Lecturas, y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan del Castillo," trans. Joseph Monter, *Historia Social* 57 (2007): 62.

Pastore's scholarship leaves readers with a new way of understanding the relationship between *alumbradismo* and religious authority in sixteenth-century Spain. She pairs the lasting sentiment against *conversos* with the suggestion that these new Christians had a formative role in sixteenth-century Spanish spirituality. This conclusion moves readers away from the distinction between heresy and orthodoxy and toward a continuum of Spanish illuminism, but also implicitly identifies a problem of sources because of the uneven prosecution of the movement by the Inquisition.

Analysis of the scant work left for consideration by the two best known *Alumbrados* focused attention to the illumination of the interior relationship to scripture. The availability, since 1478, of a Catalan translation of scripture facilitated this relationship.⁸² As previously discussed, the *Alumbrados* believed that reading is illuminated, and consequently felt free to offer exegesis that struck listeners as unorthodox.⁸³ In a close examination of Isabel de la Cruz' testimony, Nieto concludes that the *beata* did not teach her charges to seek a mystical union with the divine but mediates a relationship with Holy Scripture that permitted the reader access to the spiritual sense of the written work. He argues, "This 'love of God' is not conceived as a mystical union with the divinity, but as the absolute assurance that He guides and directs the human mind which can read the Scriptures in absolute freedom and persuasion that no dogmatic error can be committed."⁸⁴ The "freedom" in this account is the most relevant for a scholar and the most troubling for an Inquisitor. Because the claim of an immediately perceived relationship with God⁸⁵ evades the

⁸² Maas, Anthony, "Versions of the Bible," *The Catholic Encyclopedia* 15 (1912).

⁸³ Stefania Pastore, "Mujeres, Lecturas, y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan del Castillo," trans. Joseph Monter, *Historia Social* 57 (2007): 66.

⁸⁴ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 63.

⁸⁵ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2007), 171.

oversight of a religious teaching authority such as the church, critics of mystical movements usually had an easy time turning claims like Isabel's into charges of antinomianism.⁸⁶ In Isabel's case, she compounds this move away from the teaching authority of the Church by advocating an interior illumination of the correct, spiritual understanding of Scripture and further shedding any need for human work and cooperation with the sacraments of the Church.⁸⁷ Freedom is liberation from any source of authority, transcends the requirement for any works, and occurs through an interior illumination of the spiritual sense of the word of God.

As we have noted, Nieto insisted on the purely Spanish origins of these groups. However, this insistence excludes any possibility that Luther's works had any influence on the alumbradismo phenomena. Reading accounts of Alcaraz or Isabel de la Cruz' thought, with its emphasis on a Christian freed by faith in God's grace to do good works, leave the impression that the *Alumbrados* were at least acquainted with the work of Luther.⁸⁸ Nieto's argument hinges on the crucial point that Alcaraz claimed his group began in 1512.⁸⁹ This ultimately unpersuasive conclusion relies on the notion that an illuminist group could not have formed an affinity for Luther's work prior to Alcaraz' interrogation.

Contrary to Nieto's approach, Angela Selke de Sánchez describes the explicit objective of the 1525 Edict against the Toledo *Alumbrados* as curbing Lutheranism in Spain.⁹⁰ She attributes the connection between *alumbradismo* and Lutheranism in the document to the established trope

⁸⁶ Bernard McGinn, "Evil-Sounding, Rash, and Suspect of Heresy': Tensions between Mysticism and Magisterium in the History of the Church," *The Catholic Historical Review* 90 (2004): 193-212.

⁸⁷ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 68.

⁸⁸ *Ibid*, 72.

⁸⁹ *Ibid*, 66.

⁹⁰ Angela Selke de Sánchez, "Algunos datos nuevos sobre los primeros alumbrados. El Edicto de 1525 y su relación con el proceso de Alcaraz," *Bulletin Hispanique* 54 (1952): 129.

of tying new developments to ancient, defeated heresy.⁹¹ She continues, however, to offer a serious consideration of whether or not the Toledo *Alumbrados* owed the structure and content of their thought to Luther's work north of the Pyrenees.

After some broad thematic similarities are named, primarily relating to the immediate experience of God in the soul,⁹² Selke de Sánchez embarks on a narrower analysis of *alumbradismo*. She stakes her early argument by working backwards, playing Luther's understanding of sin and freedom against the frequent accusation towards illuminist movements of antinomianism.⁹³ Alcaraz experienced this criticism in his trial through the accusation of "the doctrine of 'sinlessness.'"⁹⁴ Selke de Sánchez' analysis deviates from the conventional wisdom in the degree to which she trusts the Edict of 1525 as a reliable statement of some of the key tenets of *alumbradismo*. Her introduction reveals open eyes to the Edict's drawbacks as a theological document⁹⁵ but it is successful insofar as she limits its scope to delineating the differences between Alcaraz' group and other liminal groups such as "the Franciscan recollected."⁹⁶

The narrowing offered by the 1525 Edict and the disclosures of Alcaraz to the Inquisition prompt Selke to consider how much Alcaraz owed to Lutheran roots. On the lookout for Lutheranism due to outbreaks in Seville and Valladolid,⁹⁷ the Inquisition focused on strains of thought that run through the Beghards in the form of "sinlessness"⁹⁸ and one amidst the

⁹¹ Charles Henderson, *Construction of Orthodoxy and Heresy: Neo-Confucian, Islamic, Jewish, and Early Christian Patterns* (Albany: SUNY Press, 1998), 119-170.

⁹² Angela Selke de Sánchez, "Algunos datos nuevos sobre los primeros alumbrados. El Edicto de 1525 y su relación con el proceso de Alcaraz," *Bulletin Hispanique* 54 (1952): 129.

⁹³ *Ibid*, 131-132.

⁹⁴ *Ibid*, 135. "...la doctrina de la 'impecabilidad....'"

⁹⁵ *Ibid*, 127.

⁹⁶ *Ibid*, 137. "...los franciscanos *recogidos*...."

⁹⁷ *Ibid*, 146.

⁹⁸ *Ibid*, 148. "...impecabilidad...."

Alumbrados in the form of *dejamiento*.⁹⁹ She distills *dejamiento* in a way which will permit a specious connection to Luther's theology of the cross, observing, "Alcaraz and the *Alumbrados*' abandonment is, then, reduced to its simplest formula, an abandonment to the love of God, which is to say, to faith...."¹⁰⁰ In Selke's view, *dejamiento*'s thoroughgoing, perpetual commitment to passivity has a partner in Luther's radical understanding of faith. She explains, "...for Luther, the ultimate goal of this effort is to reach fully an identification between faith and justification, and similarly, the main goal of the *Alumbrados*' abandonment is the complete fusion of the love of God, faith, and justification."¹⁰¹ However, in her haste to find similarity between two types of immediacy, the comparison paralyzes Luther's believer with a misunderstanding of the relationship between faith and the intellect in Luther's thought.

Still, the testimony of the Toledo *Alumbrados* contains too much coincidence with Luther's thought regarding the capability of the human believer with respect to his salvation. The Inquisitors agreed, though their ability to draw distinctions between Luther's thought and any other Christian heresy through the ages should be held in rightful doubt. For example, Alcaraz' *Proceso* included analogies to Jan Hus, Luther,¹⁰² and the beguines.¹⁰³ Nieto explains, "That they waited so long to put him in prison... is a clear sign that it was not until Lutheranism became a definite religious movement, independent from Rome, that the Inquisition began to be strongly suspicious

⁹⁹Ibid, 149.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid, 148. "El dejamiento de Alcaraz y de los alumbrados es, pues, reducido a su fórmula más simple, un abandonarse al amor de Dios, es decir, a la fe...."

¹⁰¹ Ibid, 151. "...para Lutero el fin último de ese esfuerzo es alcanzar plenamente la identidad de Fe y Justificación, así también la meta suprema del dejamiento de los alumbrados es la fusión completa del Amor de Dios, Fe y Justificación."

¹⁰²It was extremely common for Catholic critics to associate Luther with Huss during the sixteenth century. See: Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise? The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 138.

¹⁰³ "Proceso contra Pedro Ruiz de Alcaraz" *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI*, ed. Pedro Santonja (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 307.

about Alcaraz' theological ideas and their implication."¹⁰⁴ What remains is a theological distinction that took its form from a new, parallel distinction in the Inquisition's objectives. Additionally, it should be considered that some of Alcaraz' similarities with "Lutheran" thought may be the result of examination by the Inquisition rather than the cause of it. Luther provided an identity to this heresy for Inquisitors. Pastore's narrative of continuous persecution of new Christian spirituality and observation that both Alcaraz and Isabel de la Cruz were *conversos*¹⁰⁵ provides a motive and direction for Inquisitorial attention.

Trial Records and Primary Sources

The primary sources of information about the Toledo *Alumbrados* come, directly or indirectly, from their prosecution by the Inquisition. The letters written by Alcaraz during his imprisonment in 1524 and the "Acta del Tormento de Alcaraz," his confession under torture collected by the Inquisition, are all part of the collected document called *Proceso Alcaraz*¹⁰⁶. Meanwhile, Isabel's own confession is preserved as "Confesiones de Isabel de la Cruz."¹⁰⁷ Finally, scholars can also consult the initial codification of condemnation against the movement called "Edicto de Los Alumbrados de Toledo" which was written on September 23, 1525, and the eventual sentence passed against Alcaraz for heresy in 1529.

These documents provide some breadth of perspective about the beliefs of the prosecuted individuals, though it is conditioned by the prosecutorial circumstances. Expressing the belief that

¹⁰⁴ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 68.

¹⁰⁵ Stefania Pastore, *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)* (Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010), 171-2.

¹⁰⁶ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1970), 61.

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid*, 61.

he was being held on some tragic misunderstanding, Alcaraz' letters offer some important insight on the way he understood his own thought, particularly insofar as he outwardly opposes the groups known to the Inquisition as "*Alumbrado, dexado, or perfecto.*"¹⁰⁸ However, his rejection of those terms is more appropriately characterized as a rejection of their representatives. Alcaraz distinguishes between his strong enthusiasm for *dejamiento* and the practitioners of the devotion who remained within the Franciscan fold, whom he called *dejados*.¹⁰⁹

That the Inquisition is responsible for the production of some of the only available written work from so many key figures of this period demonstrates the degree to which the questions it asked guides our understanding of these terms. The trial of María González in 1511 is a useful example of the theological priorities of the Inquisition before the threat of Protestant thought changed its focus. González was accused of judaizing. However, this describes a wide variety of behavior ranging from assertions of Jewish practice to an active indifference to the Christian faith. The former category often required detailed explanation from investigators to explain how traditional Jewish practices had been adapted in order to hide in plain sight. For instance, the confession portion of González' trial described a group's observance of Sabbath, noting that, "They ate pancakes and other things, according to the season and what was available. On those Friday nights, María González... lit two clean oil lamps with new wicks hours before it was dark. She adorned and cleaned her house, and adorned it on those Friday nights out of esteem for the Law of Moses."¹¹⁰ This accusation purportedly describes González' desire both to keep the

¹⁰⁸ Ibid, 61.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid, 61.

¹¹⁰ "Document 6: Inquisition Trial of María González, Wife of Pedro de Villareal. Ciudad Real, 1511-1513" in *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*, ed. and trans. Lu Ann Homza (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 2006), 53.

Sabbath and to avoid detection by lighting oil lamps so far prior to actual darkness and using new wicks to ensure the flame's durability.

The latter category focused on the Mass and participation in observable Christian ritual. González' attitude was characterized as insufficiently reverent, with the accusation noting that "...they talked about matters of the Church and the Christian Faith, and ridiculed the Mass."¹¹¹ Furthermore, her attitude played out in the apparently regular practice of avoiding their obligations with respect to the Mass. The claim articulates, "She knows that many times they made themselves sick to get out of going to Mass.... she did the same thing. She knows that all of them observed some fasts of the Jews two days a week, she believes on Mondays and Fridays, or Thursdays...."¹¹² Lu Ann Homza observes that though weekly fasts were not practiced in orthodox Judaism that this was a possible adaptation.¹¹³

In contrast, the prosecution of Francisco Ortiz demonstrates the new issues brought to the Inquisition's attention after it perceived the threat of Lutheranism. The theme which lingers throughout this second phase is that experiential, interior spirituality is extraordinarily volatile and therefore requires careful control. Prior to his conflict with the Inquisition, Ortiz was a popular and successful preacher well within the mainstream Franciscan fold. However, the arrest and prosecution of the *Alumbrado* Francisca Hernández in 1529 so angered him that he publicly denounced the move and was arrested for this dissent. His subsequent letters in his defense detail an entirely different vision for Spanish spirituality than the one being carried out in the 1520s.

Ortiz expresses a deep concern for preservation of the category of a spiritual savant from which all of the laity can learn. Furthermore, he wished to cast a wide net for somebody capable

¹¹¹ Ibid, 53

¹¹² Ibid, 53

¹¹³ Ibid, 53.

of clearly articulating their interior experience of God, and he does not exclude women or those who are outside the religious orders. He explains in frustration, “I say that one of her greatest persecutors, the one who has warred against me the most with your Lordship, told me simultaneously that in his eyes there was no other St. Catherine of Siena or Angela of Foligno.”¹¹⁴ Ortiz makes a savvy appeal here to the importance of articulating interior experience as a spiritual guide to the laity. Both of these women related intensely personal and difficult visions to their confessors but were simultaneously able to communicate an inner experience of God which inspired and motivated lay believers in Spain. The church, in Ortiz’s view, would be impoverished without their work.

He stretches this criticism to point out that “it is heresy, already condemned in many church councils, to maintain that a state of spiritual perfection cannot be reached except by members of religious orders....”¹¹⁵ Francisca’s personal holiness was sufficient testimony for Francisco to accept that she was not preaching as a subtle enemy of the church and that God would indeed be likely to grant her the spiritual gifts which she claimed.¹¹⁶ Available records of the trial against her reveal that the bulk of Francisco’s defense came from a between-the-lines reading of her prosecution as a move against interior, experiential spirituality. The Inquisition’s tactic appears to largely consist of trying to undermine her claim to personal holiness by attacking her sexual purity and then letting that complaint reflect in her claims to spiritual gifts. One of the more tendentious accusations would easily qualify as impossible to defend except for her alleged ability to discern

¹¹⁴ “Document 9: Letter from Friar Francisco Ortiz to Inquisitor General Alonso Manrique, April 9, 1529, Composed Inside the Toledo Tribunal of the Inquisition” in in *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*, ed. and trans. Lu Ann Homza (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 2006), 97.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid*, 97.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid*, 98-99.

the state of a believer's soul.¹¹⁷ Friar Pedro de Segura was alleged to have "... tried to kiss her and take her hands, and he attacked her, saying he would die. When he found no corresponding disposition in this defendant, he said, 'How is this lady, that your kindness could not stop my wickedness.'"¹¹⁸ Holding Francisca Hernández responsible for the lascivious actions of this friar permitted the Inquisition to depict her personal holiness as a farce and, furthermore, that at least one of her alleged spiritual gifts was also deficient.

Another high profile case that occurred during Francisco's career with which he was probably familiar was the arrest and imprisonment of the *Alumbrado* María de Cazalla in late 1532 and 1533. María petitioned the Inquisition no fewer than three times for further information regarding the witnesses and charges against her¹¹⁹ before she was ultimately tried in the spring of 1533.

The notion of *recogimiento* is notably used in the questions prepared for her defense witnesses. Item five asks whether these witnesses had any awareness that María "endeavored, with her confessors' help, to become more recollected [*recogida*] and devout, in order to perform her duty to God, rather than to please the community."¹²⁰ This question fits a general defense pattern of trying to establish María's orthodoxy in both belief and practice, as the question rather simply laid aside the adjective "devout" in that question and proceeded to questions about her adherence to fairly conventional means of devotion, such as whether she received the Eucharist more than the minimum once a year but less frequently than might be understood as too often.¹²¹

¹¹⁷ Ibid, 107.

¹¹⁸ Ibid, 107.

¹¹⁹ "Document 12: Excerpts from the Trial of María de Cazalla, 1532-1534" in in *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*, ed. and trans. Lu Ann Homza (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 2006), 138-140.

¹²⁰ Ibid, 140-141.

¹²¹ Ibid, 140.

Additionally, several questions were devoted to her prayer habits, which may point a reader towards a more direct understanding of how the term *recogimiento* was being used in this context. After question seven addressed her behavior at Mass, question eight asks of the witnesses "...if they know, etc., that María de Cazalla had a custom at that time of praying frequently and vocally from some books of hours that she had."¹²²

The connection between an orthodox understanding of what it means to be recollected and to participate in vocal prayer is noteworthy. Francisco de Osuna had emerged with the publication of the third volume of the *Abecedario* as a strong advocate of mental prayer as a way of organizing the interior state.¹²³ However, he well understood the importance of preserving the long tradition of vocal piety with the stipulation that, due to the vulnerability of "words of devotion" in the memory, vocal prayer must be supported by cultivating the interior states.¹²⁴ His attitude is best understood as one interested in promoting a practice which was gaining in influence during this period but which would ultimately stand beside the established tradition. In this respect, María's defense was similarly interested in portraying her devotion as one which conformed perfectly to the lines of established tradition for prayer, extending beyond it in degree but not in type.

The discussion in Inquisition proceedings surrounding vocal prayer and mental prayer showed *recogidos* were more comfortable expressing a preference for mental prayer amidst a full, acceptable range of Christian devotion¹²⁵ while the *dejados* were understood as aggressively aligned against any form of vocal prayer.¹²⁶ Similar to the way in which this stance cut them off

¹²² Ibid, 141.

¹²³ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 366-371.

¹²⁴ Ibid, 201. "...palabras de devoción...." Trans. Mary Giles, 162.

¹²⁵ Ibid, 201.

¹²⁶ "Edicto de los Alumbrados de Toledo" in *Los Alumbrados: Orígenes Y Filosofía 1525-1559*, ed. Antonio Marquez, (Madrid: Taurus Ediciones, 1972), 275.

from conventional sixteenth-century devotion, the accusations against Alcaraz describe the practice of *dejamiento* as one which cuts off communication between the soul and virtues like hope, as they “prohibit the work of hope.”¹²⁷ This full disconnect from the exterior, in thought and in practice, places the *dejados* not only outside of contemporary devotional norms, but outside the purview of the Church and its sacraments. This attitude toward the exterior world applied to the faculties of the soul as well. Alcaraz and his cohorts were said to “deny free will”¹²⁸ which is a serious offense and which is paired with their similarly active disregard for one of the central practices of Franciscan life, meditation on the Lord’s Passion.¹²⁹ For the *recogidos*, however, the Passion was a palpable event in the exterior world that persisted vividly in the mind of a believer, interacting with the faculties of the soul in a way that God intended, the way of *recogimiento*.¹³⁰ Francisco seems to address *dejados* who have ignored this meditation and became dissatisfied with their lack of spiritual progress, advising that they return to some embrace of the physical suffering of the Passion. However, he also continues to privilege mental prayer and suggest that *dejados* returning to the fold benefit from their continued practice, that “...if they act in this way, they will have lost nothing and will profit more than previously.”¹³¹

Openness to controlled and regimented activity in the interior, spiritual faculties is where *recogimiento* and *dejamiento* are divided and where scholars can begin to define the two terms as

¹²⁷ “Proceso contra Pedro Ruiz de Alcaraz” in *La Herejía de los Alumbrados Y La Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI*, ed. peero Santonja (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 307.

“...prohibian la operacion de esparança...”

¹²⁸ *Ibid*, 307. “...niegan el libre alvedrio...”

¹²⁹ *Ibid*, 307.

¹³⁰ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 96-101.

¹³¹ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 475. “y si de esta manera lo hace, sepa que no ha perdido nada, sino que antes le irá major que solía si en esto para mientes.” Trans. Mary Giles, 469.

discrete practices. At this point, I will conclude the chapter by summarize and analyze this distinction in preparation for my discussion of its value to Francisco de Osuna's discussion of memory. Nieto offers a useful definition of *recogimiento*, stating, "The 'gathering up' of the senses in recollection to achieve, finally, illumination and union with God is the path to the mystical transformation of the soul in God, where the soul becomes united with Him who is the mold of the soul."¹³² Francisco's concern for *dejados*' lack of spiritual progress is indicative of a daily, habitual practice of *recogimiento* in service of union with God. Interestingly, he describes the teaching authority of the Church as something both diverse and welcoming but absolutely necessary. He warns, "The most serious spiritual error is to dawdle, contrasting the devotions of the sacred passion and recollection and debating which is superior."¹³³ The path of *recogimiento* described in the *Tercer Abecedario* relies on example of experience conditioned by teaching authority, something which the passive interiority of *dejamiento* refuses. The twelfth treatise of that work features a full chapter addressing theological opponents who, congruent with the *dejados*,¹³⁴ rejected the value of spiritual consolation on the path to union with God by "... equating spiritual and worldly consolations, saying that both constitute self-love."¹³⁵ This willingness to accept the disclosure of spiritual consolations combined with his insistence on the value of teaching

¹³² José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 82.

¹³³ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 252. "En lo que más yerran acerca de esto los que se dicen espirituales es en pararse a debater y cotejar el ejercicio de la sacra passion y del recogimiento, par a ver cuál ha de ser antepuesto...." Trans. Mary Giles, 219-20.

¹³⁴ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 68-70.

¹³⁵ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 343. "... pues que igualan la consolación spiritual con la mundana; y ambas dicen que son amor propio...." Trans. Mary Giles, 323.

authority¹³⁶ tethers *recogimiento* to the experience of the believer and to the authority of the Church.

The illumination of the *dejados* was directed towards “God’s love in man.”¹³⁷ The empty and unmediated vessel described by the word “man” here explains the increasing danger that this wing of the *Alumbrado* movement posed to the church in Spain. The spiritual understanding of scripture privileged an individual and provided an experiential authority that was, in the case of this undiluted indwelling of God’s love, unmoored from any oversight by the teaching and interpretive authority of the clerical class.¹³⁸ This independence was facilitated by the *dejados*’ familiarity with Scripture.¹³⁹ Given the general lack of formal theological education exhibited by the group’s leadership, this familiarity likely came from the first widespread printing of the Bible in the Catalan dialect in 1478, based on the work of Boniface Ferrar.¹⁴⁰ Though Alcaraz had very little formal academic training and worked as an accountant,¹⁴¹ he possessed sufficient talent in theology to marshal the church’s authorized spiritual tradition, particularly Augustine and Pseudo-Dionysius, to his support during his trial.¹⁴²

In contrast to the anthropology of *dejamiento*, the *recogimiento* described by Francisco hinged on the intact faculties of the mind, cooperating with grace as it perfected nature. His reading of Paul’s letter to the Romans treated good works as not superfluous but rather necessary

¹³⁶ Ibid, 408-413.

¹³⁷ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 71.

¹³⁸ Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise? The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 220.

¹³⁹ Marcel Bataillon, *Erasmus y España*, trans. Antonio Alatorre (México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 2007), 169.

¹⁴⁰ Maas, Anthony, "Versions of the Bible," *The Catholic Encyclopedia* 15 (1912).

¹⁴¹ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 60.

¹⁴² Ibid, 77.

for this cooperation.¹⁴³ This is the foundation for Francisco's doctrine of holiness; it is participatory through an interior unity with the divine. This active anthropology is contrasted with Francisco's ambivalence over how to express the humanity of Christ in active spirituality. However, this difficulty is not a prominent feature of his prayer method so much as a concern that Francisco works through in the same way that he deals with preliminary concerns about the created world.¹⁴⁴ Pointing to his caution about an activist view of human nature may demonstrate Francisco's care for the orthodoxy of *recogimiento*, asserting the movement as an alternative to *dejamiento*.¹⁴⁵ However, he clarifies that, "All the malice of the world, however, is not enough to obscure Christ's road totally, though more instruction than ever is needed to travel it nowadays because the road is unused and snowbound."¹⁴⁶ *Recogimiento's* active anthropology serves a fuller purpose than keeping it on the right side of a line drawn by the Inquisition, a line never clearly drawn, but rather asserts the practice as something which daily requires the intact faculties to walk a difficult path to union.

As previously mentioned, Pedro Santonja's attempt to tease apart the four intertwined categories of "Illuminists, mystics, Erasmians, and Lutherans" who each "...sought the salvation of man through the pure love of God"¹⁴⁷ avoids any suggestion of direct antagonism between these

¹⁴³ Ibid, 68.

¹⁴⁴ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 87-96.

¹⁴⁵ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 80.

¹⁴⁶ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 462. "No puede, empero, tanto la malicia del mundo que del todo ciegue el camino de Cristo, aunque es menester ahora más aviso par air por él que jamás fue menester, por no estar usado el camino y estar nevado...." Trans. Mary Giles, 454-455.

¹⁴⁷ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 141. "Alumbrados, místicos, erasmitas, y luteranos buscaban la salvación del hombre por medio del amor puro a Dios."

movements helped to clarify them, but he does not skirt their points of contention. Referring to the trends in trial records discussed earlier, Santonja's analysis of the interior search revolves around mental prayer, drawing a distinction between advocating mental prayer and offering arguments against vocal prayer. Francisco de Ortiz was accused of "banning vocal prayer and religious ceremonies"¹⁴⁸ while Francisco de Osuna, his colleague within the Franciscan order, took a wider stance. He encouraged *recogidos* to "pray continuously"¹⁴⁹ while simultaneously asserting that mental prayer was the form "in which the highest part of the soul is lifted more purely and affectionately to God on the wings of desire and pious affection strengthened by love."¹⁵⁰

The *recogido* willingness to admit both vocal and mental prayer demonstrates an anthropology which has a role for the activity of the human intellect and the mediation of the Church. Ultimately, Nieto views anthropology as the unbridgeable gap between the *dejados* and Francisco. At issue is the capacity within the human believer to love God.¹⁵¹ He explains, "For Osuna, our works, although not meritorious in themselves, nevertheless are the only means of our being justified by God."¹⁵² In a similar vein of his reading of the grace of Romans as something which engaged our active participation,¹⁵³ there is an ethic of holiness in Francisco's work which does not exist in the *dejado* spirituality because, in abandonment, there are no good works and no

¹⁴⁸ Ibid, 142. "...desterrar la oración vocal y las ceremonias del culto...."

¹⁴⁹ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 380. "...orar siempre." Trans. Mary Giles, 365.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid, 366. "...con que se alza lo más alto de nuestra ánima más pura y afectuosamente a Dios con las alas del deseo y piadosa afección esforzada por el amor...." Trans. Mary Giles. P. 349.

¹⁵¹ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 85.

¹⁵² Ibid, 85.

¹⁵³ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 351-352.

holiness.¹⁵⁴ Nieto sees Alcaraz as claiming that “...This love of God in man... is not conceived as the mystical abiding of God in the substance of the soul or in its powers, but as the dynamic action of God in man.”¹⁵⁵ In this view, the activity of the human intellect is an obstacle to God’s intervention.

Pedro Santonja advocates similar turning point around total abdication of the human faculties, particularly the will. He refers to “an annihilation of the human will so that one may receive the divine will.”¹⁵⁶ The language of substitution of the human will for the divine will marks the practice as mystical, and further, has some analogy with the practice of *recogimiento*. Once again however, anthropology creates a key distinction. The act of love is the crucial point at which these spiritualities turn. The capacity to love is one that Alcaraz would argue believers do not possess.¹⁵⁷ However, Francisco points to a reciprocal exchange of love in *recogimiento* wherein by sending God’s begotten son in ransom for our sins, we are made able to love God.¹⁵⁸

Melquiades Andrés Martín devotes a chapter in the volume *Los Recogidos* to an attempt to systematize the work of the earliest proponents of *recogimiento* in sixteenth-century Spain and to place it within a broader context of early Spanish illuminism. While Francisco de Osuna dominates this conversation, he is integrated into a shared dialogue with writers including Bernabé de Palma, Bernadino de Laredo, Juan de los Ángeles, and Franciscan colleague, contemporary, and eventual

¹⁵⁴ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 70.

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid*, 71.

¹⁵⁶ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 148. “...un aniquilar la voluntad humana para que recibiese la voluntad divina.”

¹⁵⁷ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 70.

¹⁵⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 406-407.

Inquisition target Francisco de Ortiz.¹⁵⁹ Characterizing the practice as “methodical,”¹⁶⁰ he observes that the anthropology supporting *recogimiento* frequently calls upon different tripartite descriptions of the soul. Some of these distinctions are between constitutive parts, like the senses and the faculties. Others are of the functions, like the rational and the spiritual.¹⁶¹ That the early proponents of *recogimiento* found clearly delineated parts of the soul a useful way of describing this spirituality is further evidence of the importance of anthropology. The question of what the human person was capable of before God was essential in the development of a methodical prayer practice, and Andrés Martín determines that uniting these disparate parts and functions of the soul into “a full man, integrated into himself”¹⁶² is a key objective of *recogimiento*. For Andrés Martín the desired end of gathering up the disparate parts of the self is a transformation, as a full man who loves God, into somebody new who is loved by God.¹⁶³

The recollection of the parts of the soul that are hindered by the distraction of the created world is key to Andrés Martín’s description. However, he is careful to describe a system where these parts remain intact and functional for the believer. He explains of *recogidos*, “They only reject that which is a hindrance to the superior, and all that is illusory in our inner life.”¹⁶⁴ Andrés Martín calls the manner in which this occurs “annihilation”¹⁶⁵ but is careful to distinguish it from the total passivity of the *dejados*. In his view, the *recogidos* adopted the monastic virtues of humility and mortification for the end of controlling and suppressing the senses. Francisco makes

¹⁵⁹ Fidele de Ros, *Un maître de sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d’Osuna. Sa vie, son œuvre, sa doctrine spirituelle* (Paris: G. Beauchesne, 1936), 90-91.

¹⁶⁰ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975), 88. “...metódica....”

¹⁶¹ *Ibid*, 89

¹⁶² *Ibid*, 89. “...el hombre total, integrado en sí mismo....”

¹⁶³ *Ibid*, 104.

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid*, 90.

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid*, 93.

frequent use of monastic analogies, and takes care to place the specific steps of *recogimiento* in a strictly regimented schedule.¹⁶⁶ Andrés Martín uses the verb “vaciar” to describe the effect that these practices have on the senses, and the emptying which that word choice indicates must be distinguished from a practice where use of the senses is fully abdicated. According to Andrés Martín, lingering interest in physical austerity that helped accomplish annihilation is what distinguished the *recogido* movement from Erasmus’ spirituality as well as *dejamiento*. Though the Dutch humanist shared an interest in prayerful life leading to a self fully integrated and aligned with Jesus Christ, he did not, unlike the *recogido* authors surveyed by Andrés Martín, “make a banner of austerity, perfection, and spiritual nakedness.”¹⁶⁷

What Andrés Martín describes in *dejado* theology is a thoroughgoing theocentrism that is of particular concern when trying to unravel the precise value and vector of interiority in their spirituality. As he observes, a great deal of attention in the 1525 edict is directed towards the outward misbehavior of the *dejados* being placed under the umbrella term *Alumbrado*. Beyond rejecting an uncomfortable variety of the material trappings of sixteenth-century church life such as living by a religious rule and oral prayer, he describes the defiant absence of anthropological discussion as a radical new “law of love”¹⁶⁸ that fully negates the influence of not only human works but, further, human capacity.

¹⁶⁶ Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 367.

¹⁶⁷ Melquiades Andrés Martín, *Los Recogidos* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola, 1975), 96.

¹⁶⁸ Melquiades Andrés Martín, “Common Denominator of Alumbrados, Erasmians, ‘Lutherans,’ and Mystics: The Risk of a More ‘Intimate’ Spirituality,” in *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*, trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel, ed. Angel Alcalá (New York: Columbia University Press), 467.

The abdication of human faculties is particularly ironic given the Franciscan background within which the *dejados* originated because it appears as an almost intentional turn away from devotion focused on the person of Jesus Christ and meditation on the Passion. Christ's suffering on the cross was a key source of attention for Franciscan thinkers,¹⁶⁹ and in the *dejado* desire to look past any works done by humankind on behalf of his own salvation it occasionally appeared as though this group preferred to avoid the ambiguity that Christ's very human suffering and sacrifice demonstrated. Andrés Martín characterizes them as "closer to a theology of glory, or a static, impassive, Hellenistic God, despite their antagonism to scholasticism."¹⁷⁰ However, complementing the inert passivity of the human believer in their thought is not a similarly "static" God, but one which is responsive to emptiness with the inflow of transformative grace.

At the same time, there is a strain in Alcaraz' own thoughts that can be understood as a radical theocentrism which permits of a total transformation in the love of God. Nieto argues, "The love of God in man does not imply in any way that man reaches a state of perfection in himself, i.e. intrinsic or inherent, for Alcaraz recognizes in all its force that though God abides in man, through his love, nevertheless man is still a 'pecador muy defectuoso' who feels in himself the whole burden of all the sins of the world."¹⁷¹ In this sense, the height of the transformation is contrasted with the dim view of human capability that invites it. The law of love is centered on a theocentrism that draws its radicality from the need for the sinner to annihilate fully anything in

¹⁶⁹ Denise L. Despres, "Memory and Image: The Dissemination of a Franciscan Meditative Texts," *Mystics Quarterly* 16 (1990), 143.

¹⁷⁰ Melquiades Andrés Martín, "Common Denominator of Alumbrados, Erasmians, 'Lutherans,' and Mystics: The Risk of a More 'Intimate' Spirituality," in *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*, trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel, ed. Angel Alcalá (New York: Columbia University Press), 468.

¹⁷¹ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 71.

himself besides emptiness for God, including the awareness of sin.¹⁷² This is crux of the disagreement between the two illuminist movements.

Despite some adversarial language, Pedro Santonja's point about the relative priorities of Franciscan mystical thought contrasted with the framework for Thomist philosophy is helpful. He explains that "Franciscan mysticism... depended the primacy of the will over understanding: the beatific vision consists of an act of love in the will; theology is the science of love, theology of the heart."¹⁷³ The priority of love within Franciscan spirituality permits the inclusion of both groups within the *Alumbrado* category as, at least, Franciscan-proximate, regardless of the degree of affiliation of the writer with the order. This is a pleasant outcome due to the occasional obscurity of the careers of these writers, particularly the ones on the *dejado* side. This inclusive view of *alumbradismo* is supported by Franciscan Order's contact with the *dejados*, demonstrated in de Ros' piece¹⁷⁴ and backed up in José Nieto's detailed reading of the *recogido* motivations.¹⁷⁵ We can see that the *theologia cordis* that Santonja mentions hinges on the question of theological anthropology even if that question can be answered in two wildly divergent ways within the theology of the heart. If the object of these spiritualities is the love of God, then any doubt about whether the believer is even capable of loving God becomes a chief concern. Even if the answer to that question is positive, as the *recogidos* believe it is, analysis must then progress to the next question of how that love operates.

¹⁷² Ibid, 71.

¹⁷³ Pedro Santonja, *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI* (Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001), 102. "La mística franciscana... defendía la primacía de la voluntad sobre el entendimiento: la visión beatífica consiste en un acto de amor de la voluntad; la teología es ciencia de amor, *theologia cordis*."

¹⁷⁴ Père Fidèle de Ros, *Un Maître de Sainte Thérèse: Le Père François d'Osuna, Sa vie, Son oeuvre, Sa Doctrine Spirituelle* (Paris: Études de théologie historique, 1936), 84.

¹⁷⁵ José Nieto, *Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation* (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 51-59.

During the sixteenth century, theological anthropology provided a permanent separation between *recogimiento* and *dejamiento*. While there remains a substantial scholarly divide on issues surrounding the origins and the degree to which these two movements were conceived as necessarily adversarial to each other, their mutual commitment to mental prayer in order to achieve a spiritual stillness in preparation for receiving God requires that we examine the primary factor which separates them. In the next chapter, I will discuss the way in which a substantially more activist theological anthropology affects the operation of the memory in Francisco's *recogimiento*. Retaining the function of the interior faculties is absolutely key for the comparative activity of his described devotion, and a more active view of the way in which humans stand before God is necessary for that retention.

DISTINGUISHING GOD IN THE MEMORY

This chapter argues that the key human faculty in Francisco de Osuna's teaching is the memory. In order to understand the nature and role of the memory, Francisco must analyze the various faculties¹ and senses of the soul. Of particular importance is the care he takes in showing the reader how to organize the faculties in order for the soul to direct itself toward the divine. This task involves both the proper use of the exterior senses and their relationship with the external world as well as the restructuring of the interior faculties so that through the practice of *recogimiento* the memory can reach union with God. In highlighting the role that the memory plays in his interior spirituality, Francisco inherits a long and rich tradition especially including Augustine and Bernard of Clairvaux. These thinkers explored both the complex nature of the human soul and God's presence within the soul in ways that complemented Francisco's engagement with their theology.

According to Francisco, both the activities of receiving memories and retaining memories in the mind of the believer are harmonized in the mind of God, making memory a site of union with the divine.² There is no priority established by Francisco between the two activities of memory. Their identity with God's memory is something to be desired in those who are fully recollected. During this chapter, I will demonstrate that Francisco views the recollected memory as one which mediates between the exterior and interior senses. This mediation occurs through

¹ The discussion on the "faculties" of the soul was mostly settled by the sixteenth century and Francisco would have inherited a tradition that was comfortable with this language to describe any operation of the soul based on sensory information impressed on the mind. This includes the lingering *phantasmata* that were a favorite topic for studies on the operation of the memory. See: Dag Nikolaus Hasse, "The Soul's Faculties," in *The Cambridge History of Medieval Philosophy*, ed. Robert Pasnau and Christina Van Dyke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 318-324.

organization of the receptive and retentive aspects of the memory, and places God at the center of this process through meditation. Additionally, I will argue that Francisco based the recollection of the memory on ancient and medieval mnemotechnics which transmitted stable assumptions about how the memory operated and how it might be trained. Finally, the believer's goal of the reflexive, recollected memory will be discussed in terms of the precise means by which the believer places God in the memory.

Francisco faces an important problem in his initial discussion of the interior faculties, namely, the relationship between a fallen believer and the exterior world.³ His work is characterized by an ambivalence which grants the reflection of God in creation but is likewise troubled by the predictable ways in which the created world leads our mind into distraction. Francisco's prologue grapples with creation's potential as a distraction to contemplation. The vulnerability of the "will of the flesh"⁴ to temptation and distraction by creation adversely affects the mental faculties which remain active in contemplation.⁵ In the sixteenth chapter in *Tercer Abecedario*, Francisco uses his discussion of love to confront his caution for creation's role in *recogimiento*. One of his objectives in the chapter is demonstrating the diversity and magnitude of "love" as an act, outlining over forty different types of love. They range from the vastness of "infinite" to the precision of "sharp."⁶ The breadth of the types of love exists as a meditative subject, something which orders our interior towards a love for God which is active and capable

³ Ibid, 505-508.

⁴ Ibid, 90. "voluntad de la carne." Trans. Mary Giles, 40.

⁵ Exposition on the active role of the mental faculties in cooperation with the senses was refined during the thirteenth century within the Franciscan Order. See: José Filipe Silva and Juhana Toivanen, "The active nature of the soul in sense perception: Robert Kilwardby and Peter Olivi," *Vivarium* 48 (2010): 245-278.

⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 446. "infinito" and "agudo." Trans. Mary Giles, p. 438.

of placing all of creation in its proper order with respect to love for God. He explains, "...the most sublime meaning of our letter is to draw love from every created thing imaginable and place it in that highest good who created us and is our ultimate end."⁷ As this chapter continues, the reader will see how Francisco embraces the positive role for creation in *recogimiento*.

Receiving God through the exterior senses is, on its face, an uncomplicated act due to the passivity of the memory in reception of images.⁸ There is, of course, a distinction between the exterior senses and the interior senses. Because the conversion to God is interior, the interior senses must drive the reception of God.⁹ Of the relative insufficiency of the exterior senses before God, Francisco explains that, "Our understanding with respect to matters of God, however, is like the owl or bat, which cannot know or even look at the rays of the sun because the capacity of their small eyes to receive light is disproportionate to the sun's brightness."¹⁰ In this respect, the issue of anthropology becomes crucial. The interior senses are capable of perceiving God, but the function of the interior senses must be enhanced by a complementary silencing of the exterior senses. The analogy of sight, serving as a microcosm for the relationship between all of the physical senses and God, offers an early, clear exposition of how the memory should operate in its passivity: "These people gain effectively from their natural light and the soul's interior senses, and

⁷ Ibid, 447-448. "...el más alto sentido que damos a nuestra letra es que saquen el amor de toda cosa criada y toda cosa que se pueda pensar, y lo pongan en aquel sumo bien que nos crió y es el último fin nuestro." Mary Giles, 439.

⁸ On passivity as a power of the senses and the memory during the medieval period, see: Simo Knuuttila and Pekka Kärkkäinen, "Medieval Theories of Internal Senses" in *Sourcebook for the History of the Philosophy of Mind* Simo Knuuttila Juha Sihvola Editors *Philosophical Psychology from Plato to Kant* (New York: Springer, 2014), 131-145.

⁹ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 451.

¹⁰ Ibid, 141. "...como nuestro conocimiento se haya en las cosas de Dios a manera de lechuza o murciélago, con la claridad del sol, al cual no puedan conocer ni mirar siquiera sus rayos, por la improporción y poca lumbre que tienen, siendo sus ojos muy oscuros." Trans. Mary Giles, 97.

opening wide their heart's eyes, meaning information and understanding about things, they listen to and carefully analyze the relationship among mysteries...."¹¹ Enlisting one's "natural light and the soul's interior senses" however, engages the broader habit of *recogimiento* that permits these things to operate unencumbered from mental debris.

Even if overwhelmed by God in *recogimiento*, the interior faculties remain functional. The distinction between the non-functionality that I have attributed to his *dejado* opponents in chapter three and the faculties which operate but which we desire to be subsumed by God is complex and varies by task. Francisco reserves the complex project of assimilating Scriptural lessons into daily spirituality.¹² This active reading and studying contrasts with the practice of reading in *dejamiento*, which left understanding up to a purely spiritual illumination.¹³ Though the epiphanic contact with God in the form of revelation and spiritual understanding is sufficient to "destroy understanding,"¹⁴ that understanding remains intact because understanding as an interior faculty is "incorruptible."¹⁵ A prior, inferior understanding is destroyed, not the faculty itself. In the state that follows, with overwhelmed interior faculties, the believer is free to perceive God. This freedom indicates that interior functions persist in order to retain God within them.¹⁶ They belong to the spiritual believer

¹¹ Ibid, 142. "Éstos mucho se aprovechan de la lumbre natural y sentidos interiores del ánima, abriendo bien los ojos del corazón, que son las noticias y conocimientos de las cosas y escuchando y parando mientes en las correspondencias de los misterios...." Trans. Mary Giles, 98

¹² Ibid, 266.

¹³ Jose Nieto, "The Nonmystical Nature of the Sixteenth-Century Alumbrados of Toledo" in *The Spanish Inquisition* (Columbia University Press: New York, 1987), 444.

¹⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 143. "...corromper nuestro entendimiento...." Trans. Mary Giles, 99.

¹⁵ Ibid, 143. "incorruptible." Trans. Mary Giles, 99.

¹⁶ Ibid, 333.

to use and govern. The objective of this transformation is to free the interior faculties from limited reflection of the sensory world so that they may turn their attention fully to God.

Before addressing the ways in which the faculty of memory is used to capture and retain the illumination of God, Francisco must first address a continuously resurfacing ambivalence with respect to these faculties and the created world. The fulcrum for this ambivalence is humankind's fallenness, which includes the memory. Francisco describes the memory as that faculty most likely to lose its way because of its close, receptive relationship with the exterior world. Memory facilitates our greed,¹⁷ grudges,¹⁸ and our nostalgic lusts¹⁹ due to its vulnerability to the world. In drawing the usual distinction between our fallen selves and God's creation, including our interior senses, Francisco tellingly resorts to an architectural metaphor. He observes, "...the Lord also wishes us to forget the house of our evil father who is the devil. The depraved imagination is the house furnished by the devil..."²⁰ The metaphor of "furnishing" a geographical space was a common one in memory training from the ancient period all the way to Francisco's era,²¹ and his willingness to move beyond the simple "house" metaphor and provide that additional elaboration is a sign of his familiarity with ancient memory training.

The distinction between "imagination" and "memory" is a complex one during this period. The term "memory" is used to refer to a capacity that is more than simply retentive and

¹⁷ Ibid, 317. "De esta manera podrían decir los que dejaron riquezas en el siglo, y después por otras vías se trabajan de tornarse a ellas..." Trans. Mary Giles, 292.

¹⁸ Ibid, 317. "Otros hay que tienen siempre en la memoria las injurias recibidas, y casi nunca piensan otra cosa..." Trans. Mary Giles, 292.

¹⁹ Ibid, 317. "También hay otros tan malos que, habiendo por obra dejado los deleites, no los dejan por corazón..." Trans. Mary Giles, 293.

²⁰ Ibid, 318. "...y también quiere el Señor que olvidemos la casa del mal padre, que es el demonio; y esta casa es la depravada imaginación, donde el demonio tenía puesto todo su ajuar..." Trans. Mary Giles, 293.

²¹ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 54-55.

recollective. The memory is also creative. The creative memory was understood as capable of manipulating existing objects of data in creative ways, rather than creating them from whole cloth.²² “Imagination” frequently refers to a similar creative capacity, but it is frequently regarded as dangerous during the early modern period.²³ This perceived negativity of the imagination is due to its wildness. The creative capacity is directed towards indulgence of the mind’s baser or more trivial urges. Francisco explicitly blames the imagination for the error of claiming an easy, immediate experience of God. He has little trouble identifying the heightened stakes attached to an undisciplined imagination and affixing the adjective “depraved” to the trait.²⁴

Organizing the interior faculties and directing them towards the common goal of union with God is how Francisco recommends believers prevent this depraved mind. Therefore, attention should be paid to the distinction between the faculties of the soul within Francisco’s discussion of the practice of *recogimiento*. Despite an inclination toward redundancy, he is largely consistent within his terminology. To emphasize that each faculty is distinct from the others, Francisco latches onto Augustine’s classic overlay of the faculties of the soul and the Trinity in order to warn against another idea borrowed from Augustine, the dangerous divided soul.²⁵ Separate and coequal

²² Ibid, 4-8.

²³ The transition from concern about the precarious moral value of the faculty of imagination to an understanding of its usefulness in rational inquiry is detailed in Raz Chen-Morris, “Imagination, Passions, and the Production of Knowledge in Early Modern Europe: From Lipsius to Descartes” in *Knowledge and Religion in Early Modern Europe : Studies in Honor of Michael Heyd*, ed. Tamar Herzig, Michael Heyd, Asaph Ben-Tov, and Taacov Deutsch (Boston: Brill University Press, 2013), p. 49-86.

²⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 494-497.

²⁵ Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).

faculties, memory, will, and understanding still exist in unity and that unity must also be cultivated by the believer seeking *recogimiento*.²⁶

Distinct faculties, occupied by God, form corners in a triangle that anchor the soul, fighting the natural momentum of sin. Francisco explains, "... so the heart of man, which is fashioned after the triangle of the Holy Trinity, cannot be content with round vices that go rolling it to hell. Our hearts will not occupy the habitable land of the soul until the Father fills the corner of our memories, the Son of our understanding, and the Holy Spirit of our wills."²⁷ Francisco's terminology, consistent throughout the piece, frequently posits the heart as the sum of spiritual, interior faculties while taking time to describe the specific functions and attributes to memory, will, and understanding in relative congruence to Augustine's exposition of these faculties in *De Trinitate*.²⁸ As seen in the example of the understanding, Francisco will also frequently use each faculty as a microcosm to describe the relationship with God in greater specificity.²⁹ The understanding "is endowed by nature with God's light and reveals what we are to emulate or avoid"³⁰ As is the case with the whole interior of the believer, the external, created world offers distractions which can obscure that revelation. Within understanding, God has provided conscience and synderesis to aid discernment,³¹ but thinking with Augustine's admonition in *De*

²⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 156-160.

²⁷ *Ibid*, 157. "... así el corazón del hombre, hecho al molde triangulado y esquinado de la Santísima Trinidad, no puede ser hartado con los vicios, que son redondos, pues van rodando al infierno. Hasta que el Padre ocupe el rincón de nuestra memoria, y el Hijo el de nuestro entendimiento, y el Espíritu Santo el de nuestra voluntad..." Trans. Mary Giles, 114

²⁸ Augustine of Hippo, *On the Trinity: Books 8-15*, ed. Gareth B. Matthews, trans. Stephen McKenna (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

²⁹ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 543-44.

³⁰ *Ibid*, 543. "...señalado naturalmente con la luz de Dios, muestra lo que debemos seguir y lo que debemos evitar..." Trans. Mary Giles, 548.

³¹ *Ibid*, 544.

Trinitate, that the mind "...knows itself as seeking and not knowing, while it seeks to know itself."³² *Recogimiento* is the mind's guided, organized pursuit of itself and Francisco sees understanding as something which must be carefully guarded from distractions³³ that render the conscience "buried and fixed in the well of evil habit...."³⁴

Francisco's debt to Augustine's careful division of the interior faculties into the psychological metaphor of the Trinity in *De Trinitate* is apparent from his desire to explore the precise operation of the interior faculties. However, Francisco also relies on Augustine's more intimate and personal description of his own struggle with the divided interior self in *Confessions*.³⁵ The tenth book of *Confessions* deals specifically with the topic of memory and Augustine's search for God within the interior space of his own memory. Augustine addresses his attention early in the book to a problem of the vastness of memory similar to the one which Francisco will explore in his own discussion of memory.

According to Augustine, God can be hidden away in an infinite expanse in his own interior, "Lord, to your eyes, the abyss of human consciousness is naked...."³⁶ There is no hiding oneself from God, but the interior spaces are, to the fallen mind, sufficiently overwhelming that one may lose God within them. This is represented in Francisco's discussion of the higher and lower

³² Augustine of Hippo, *On the Trinity: Books 8-15*, ed. Gareth B. Matthews, trans. Stephen McKenna (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 48.

³³ Augustine also describes the vulnerability of the interior faculties to distractions, but does so in terms of the mind being dragged down by lower interests. See: Mateusz Stróżyński, "There is No Searching for the Self: Self-Knowledge in Book Ten of Augustine's *De Trinitate*," *Phronesis* 58 (2013): 292-293.

³⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 543-548. "...soterrada y metida en aquel pozo de mala...," trans. Mary Giles. 544.

³⁵ *Ibid.* Tr. 21. 5. P. 560.

³⁶ Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 179. "domine, cuius oculis nuda est abyssus humane conscientiae...," trans. Henry Chadwick, 179.

memories, and the intimidating vastness of the interior spaces are highlighted with his lower form of memory, sensitive memory.³⁷ In the sensitive memory images are preserved “on a particular level, with the special qualities appropriate to them....”³⁸ The higher memory, the intellectual memory, seeks unity and avoids fragmentation. It assimilates disparate things into the “general, and universal”³⁹ unity of God. Furthermore, its foundation in the believer is “...based on recollection and infused into man, seemingly raising him from death to life and vitalizing his innermost being and heart and eyes so that he lives for naught else but God because his memory is of naught else but God.”⁴⁰ The rebirth posited by Francisco and prompted by *recogimiento* relies on a reflexive connection between the believer’s memory of God and their interior state in God’s eyes. A similar reflexive link is established between finding God in the memory and ceasing the charade that one’s true self, which belongs to God, can be hidden inside away from God. These two sides reflect each other in the fact of confession, as Augustine says, “You hear nothing true from my lips which you have not first told me.”⁴¹

The memory occupies a special place among the faculties due to the passivity of its reception of images and its activity in creatively organizing those images. Mary Carruthers describes the phantasm impressed on the memory as both perception and the mind’s response to

³⁷ Juhana Toivanen, *Perception and the Internal Senses: Peter of John Olivi on the Cognitive Functions of the Sensitive Soul* (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 309-325.

³⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 324. “...la sensitive tiene en si la representación de la cosa particularmente con las especiales condiciones que conviene a la misma cosa...” trans. Mary Giles, 301.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 324. “universal y generalmente,” trans. Mary Giles, 301.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 324. “Si e acostumbrada sobre el recogimiento, revístese en el hombre y parece que de muerto lo hace vivo, y le aviva las entrañas y el corazón y los ojos; no a otra cosa sino a Dios, porque esta memoria es de solo Dios,” trans. Mary Giles, 301.

⁴¹ Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 179. “...aut etiam tu aliquid tale audis a me, quod non mihi tu prius dixeris,” trans. Henry Chadwick, 179.

that perception. Ideally, this pulls the believer toward holiness,⁴² but the vulnerability of the faculty is apparent as well in this synthesis. Francisco grafted a daily prayer habit onto this faculty which is most engaged and vulnerable to the world while simultaneously possessing the power to recall and manipulate the memories of God's creation.⁴³

Pursuit of this habit presupposes understanding of a long tradition about the operation and training of memory. Mary Carruthers finds origins in antiquity for the longstanding appreciation of memory as a faculty which "stores, sorts, and retrieves material through the use of some kind of mental image."⁴⁴ Cicero is credited with establishing the model that was dominant through the eighteenth century of the memory as a wax tablet upon which images are collected in a coherent spatial order in the same manner that letters and words create a text.⁴⁵ This understanding of memory developed as medieval commenters engaged their classical forebears in a manner which assumed the validity of these descriptions with extreme specificity, particularly with regards to the last two tasks of the memory: sorting and retrieving. Carruthers explains that writers were comfortable admitting a wide diversity in the ways in which information or ideas entered the memory.⁴⁶ As we will see in Francisco de Osuna's *Tercer Abecedario*, this diversity serves an important rhetorical purpose as it demonstrates the heightened danger for faculties of the soul whose operations depend on passive reception of information from the exterior world by the fallen soul.

⁴² Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 85.

⁴³ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 327-331.

⁴⁴ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 19.

⁴⁵ *Ibid*, 18-19.

⁴⁶ *Ibid*, 19.

A review of the history of the idea of memory assists us in discerning how Francisco used that tradition. Typically, discussion of the models for memory revolves around two central thematic metaphors, i.e., the wax imprint and the architectural metaphor. It is noteworthy that these two descriptions of the operations for memory are not treated as opposing schools of thought, but rather two common ways of describing the memory. Information enters the memory as image impressions, or *phantasmata*, that seal themselves in the wax of the memory. Francisco demonstrated an appreciation for the sealed wax model for memory, oddly compounding it in one instance and making the memory into the warming force which makes the soul pliable for imprinting.⁴⁷ This is emblematic of Francisco's approach, relying on the readers' familiarity with these well-known metaphors and twisting them for enhanced meaning. In this case, receptivity of the memory is itself the receptivity of the soul, capable of preparing it to be fully molded by God's grace.

The authors of mnemotechnics from the ancient to medieval period were certain that the memory's mode of retention occurred in images.⁴⁸ These images could be arranged and rearranged into orders of different but equally coherent meanings, which invited an additional common metaphor for remembering; namely, one of reading texts.⁴⁹ Carruthers explains this synthesis observing, "Visual coding, like writing, allows the memory to be organized securely for accurate recollection of a sort that permits not just reduplication of the original material, but sorting, analysis, and mixing as well - genuine learning, in short, rather than repetition."⁵⁰

⁴⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 328.

⁴⁸ Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks, 1984), 27-32.

⁴⁹ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 18-21.

⁵⁰ *Ibid*, 22.

Additionally, the emphasis on the improvement of memory to the end of “genuine learning” demonstrates the fuller sense in which this capacity was understood during the middle ages and, indeed, by Francisco de Osuna and his readers. The memory was a creative capacity which took in the exterior world and could reorganize and recreate it in the mind.

The ability to reorganize and recreate the world within the memory in a way which actually serves the believer’s relationship with God requires a memory which is actually capable of being trained. Ancient discussion of memory posits two types of memory, natural and artificial.⁵¹ The natural memory is innate, but may be improved with the artificial, trainable memory.⁵² In the medieval period, memory training was conflated with moral improvement. Mary Carruthers describes the tradition that Francisco directly inherits, “...possessing a well-trained memory was morally virtuous in itself. The medieval regard for memory always has this moral force analogous to the high moral power which the Romantics were later to accord to the imagination, genetrix of what is best in human nature.”⁵³ Francisco carefully constructs the memory with this “moral force” in mind, positing it as a capacity that initiates the movement of the will. Training, therefore, to initiate movement toward good, is absolutely necessary and the recollected memory “...is like a breeze enkindling the fire of love that had gone out, a drop of vinegar penetrating the soil of the heart, the sweet voice of someone we dearly love that awakens gentle delight in the inner being of the one listening, a fragrance that makes us yearn for its source, the remembrance of a past pleasure

⁵¹ Ibid, 88.

⁵² Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks, 1984), 21.

⁵³ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 88-89.

that instills joy in us once more.”⁵⁴ God is present in the natural memory, but the artificial memory is where God is disclosed as images cobbled together in coherent memory of God.

The task of this creative capacity is forming repeatable connections between the images retained in the memory. All mnemotechnics serve this end by establishing chains between one or more of the items persisting in the memory for the purpose of later retrieval-at-will.⁵⁵ Carruthers explains that “Recollection thus becomes a reconstructive act, analogous to reading letters that ‘stand for’ sounds (*voces*) that ‘represent’ things in a more-or-less adequate, fitting way.”⁵⁶ The use of the term “recollection” for this reconstructive act is informative for a study of the practice of *recogimiento* because the word comes from the very same act of “gathering up.” A *recogido*, then, is charged with mental exercises that govern the relationship between his mental faculties and the information they receive from the exterior world by gathering it up and directing it towards God. For example, the advice to remember God’s works trains the *recogido* to recall God as the worker.⁵⁷

In addition to sense images from the created world, printed texts served as another way in which information reached the memory. Janet Coleman traces a transition in the eleventh and twelfth century from a utilitarian monastic memory to one which “the sensual, visible world,

⁵⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 327-328. “No es así la memoria que los varones recogidos tienen de Dios, mas es como soplo que enciende el fuego del amor que estaba amortiguado, y como gota de vinagre que cava la tierra del corazón, y como voz muy dulce de persona que mucho amamos, causadora de suave deleite en las entrañas del que la oye, y como olor que nos hace desear aquello de do procede, y como la recordación del pasado placer, que nos causa otra vez gozo,” Trans. Mary Giles, 304-305.

⁵⁵ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 23.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 29.

⁵⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 326-327.

literally expressed in a sacred text, could be transformed metaphorically so that God might be remembered and known through his words.”⁵⁸ She observes that this transition occurred by grafting the new attention to interiority onto the classical forms adopted by monasticism. However, she appreciates that what emerges is something genuinely innovative insofar as it emphasizes the surpassing affective power of the interior soul that is based on a re-creative memory. She points towards two substantial figures of the twelfth century who exemplify the affective power of the soul.

The first of these is Anselm. Coleman understands Anselm as elaborating⁵⁹ on Augustine’s discussion in *De Trinitate* of the necessary relationship between thought and the images preserved in the memory.⁶⁰ Instead, Anselm treats his analysis with texts as a primary source of images in memory. In this sense, she explains, “...rational creatures ought to desire nothing so much as to express the image impressed on the mind as a natural ability. The expression of the natural mental word is the expression of man’s remembered history, less his own personal history than the species’ history as recorded in sacred history.”⁶¹ For Francisco de Osuna’s readers, this remembrance in Scripture, focused on the salvific event of Christ’s sacrifice, is one which is recapitulated in both the Mass and in the meditative commands. The *recogidos* “...who wish to meditate effectively on the passion of the Lord must withdraw from all other considerations and transform themselves into that very experience, as if they were personally present at the mysteries on which they reflect.”⁶² With Anselm’s transformation of the image-based intellect into a text-

⁵⁸ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 157.

⁵⁹ *Ibid*, 160-164

⁶⁰ *Ibid*, 101-102.

⁶¹ *Ibid*, 166.

⁶² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005).“...los que quieren contemplar bien la passion del Señor

based one, the relationship between the written word and the re-creative memory begins its harmonious history.

Coleman sees Bernard of Clairvaux following Anselm's interest in constructing the Christian mind with material built from Christian scripture. However, Bernard moves beyond Anselm in his understanding of the memory as something which needs to be purified of exterior influences before it can recreate itself in meditative constancy. This dynamic is similar to Francisco's ambivalence with respect to the created world and our necessary interaction with this world through the senses and capacities of the soul. However, Francisco retains a higher anthropology with respect to these capacities than Bernard, who "locks out all the advantages of the senses as the true but temporary means toward higher meaning. For Bernard, the sensual images are all frivolous."⁶³ Coleman views Bernard's extended treatment of the Song of Songs as a demonstration on how the sensual delights can be replaced with spiritual delights that are framed allegorically in Scripture. By contrast, Francisco insists on engagement of the senses in his analysis of Song of Songs and advises the teacher to "...shed tears for the humanity of your Bridegroom, Christ, but if you wish this well to become a bridge above you leading to eternal life, then strive so that the rushing water of the mountain Libanus, which are tears shed for his Divinity, come to you."⁶⁴ In this chapter on the role of tears in developing interior affections, Christ's humanity is

hanse de recoger de todas las otras cosas y transformarse en ella sola, como si estuviese personalmente delante de los misterios que piensen," Trans. Mary Giles, 385.

⁶³ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 183.

⁶⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 308-309. "...derramas lágrimas por la humanidad de to esposo Christo; empero, si quieres que este pozo de por cima se haga fuente que salte hasta la vida eternal, procura que venga a ti el ímpetu del monto Líbano, que son las lágrimas derramadas por su divinidad," trans. Mary Giles, 282-283.

used to represent the peak subject for contemplation of the physical world. The senses participate in the process of *recogimiento* for recalling and weeping over Christ's humanity.

Enlisting the faculty of memory in preparation for God's grace was, for Francisco, an appeal to an ancient tradition of memory training. Known primarily to medieval thinkers through *Rhetorica ad Herenium*,⁶⁵ the revival of classical constructions of mnemotechnics was also the site of a shift in understanding of the memory. This was a shift from antiquity's oral and visual culture to the medieval period's written culture without, according to Carruthers "losing its central place in medieval ethical life."⁶⁶ Central to this shift is the medieval authors' willingness to embrace the architectural mnemotechnic, wherein a practitioner creates a space in the imagination and fills it with items of memory and adapts it to their contemporary framework of the cloistered, contemplative life. Hugh of St. Victor's *Libellus de formatione archa*, overlays "a medieval education" on instructions for illustrating the construction of Noah's ark in one of the most famous and elaborate examples of the architectural mnemonic from the medieval period.⁶⁷ An adaptation, which began in the eleventh century, is credited with influencing Renaissance writers with respect to the operation and objectives of the memory.⁶⁸

Carruthers particularly attributes this development to the work of Thomas Bradwardine. Bradwardine advocated the development of carefully personalized and detailed images in order to provide mental signifiers during one's speech and contemplation.⁶⁹ In a description that bears striking similarity to *recogimiento*'s effect on the memory, Carruthers explains, "*Imagines rerum*

⁶⁵ First century text often, likely mistakenly, attributed to Cicero

⁶⁶ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 153.

⁶⁷ *Ibid*, 294-295.

⁶⁸ *Ibid*, 154-155.

⁶⁹ *Ibid*, 186.

can act as compositional sites and cues that can ‘gather in’ (*re-colligere*) much related material laid down elsewhere in memory, because they invite the orator’s mental eyes to stay and contemplate.”⁷⁰ This is the basis for the medieval art of memory transmitted by the university through the centuries to its Renaissance recipients, such as Francisco de Osuna. Carruthers credits the Dominicans, but she is comfortable leaving her thesis in this chapter open to include Franciscans.⁷¹

Continuity between the late medieval development of the memory arts and the preaching orders can also be seen in the Franciscan writer Francesc Eiximenis whose writings date from the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. Although his work *Ars praedicandi populo* was written in Latin, Eiximenis composed a great deal of his work in the vernacular. By writing in the vernacular, both Eiximenis and Francisco enhanced lay access to the discussions of the memory arts. The *Ars praedicandi populo* demonstrates Eiximenis’ interest in training preachers with regard to the use of memory.

His instructions are to help preachers develop sermons that they can hold in their own memory and that will persist in the memory of the listener. Eiximenis shows awareness of the architectural mnemonic that Carruthers observed persisting into the late medieval period. As he exhorts readers to construct their own mnemonics, “Also under this rule falls the whole order of logical places, by the ordering of which many mental prompts will occur to you immediately if you look for material for your theme.”⁷² The common-sense observation that a mnemonic crafted to the memory practitioner’s specific taste would be more effective does not prevent Eiximenis

⁷⁰ Ibid, 186.

⁷¹ Ibid, 193.

⁷² Francesc Eiximenis, “On Two Kinds of Order that Aid Understanding and Memory” in *The Medieval Craft of Memory: An Anthology of Texts and Pictures*, ed. Mary Carruthers and Jan Ziolkowski (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), 197.

from offering advice on the construction of a particularly common and evocative image for this purpose. He describes how a common example operates, "...when we have to remember things (*res*), then a single similitude or figure will represent the whole story to us, just as Christ's cross indicates to us the entire sequence of events of the passion of Christ and the image of a king with a lance will signify to us a victory in some battle."⁷³ This particular method of fixing several images to be remembered onto a particular site such as Christ's wounded body recalls a written text in its reliance on a sequential set of signs communicating an ordered meaning to an interpreter. Furthermore, this method is a variation on the classical architectural mnemonic that adapts nicely to late medieval meditative objectives and therefore serves the purposes of *recogimiento* as well.

Because memory is a means for eventual identification with God, Francisco constructs the faculty in such a way that its peak function is in imitation of God. Relying on a shared familiarity with his readers of ancient mnemotechnics, Francisco describes the operation of the human memory in the same way as he does the operation of God's memory, "Since we remember better that which we desire more, it is logical that the Lord will continuously hold in his memory the soul that loves him."⁷⁴ The passage continues with Francisco describing even the Lord's method of remembrance, in "sighs,"⁷⁵ in such a way that clearly establishes God's memory and the human memory as identical in function and, when perfected, in purpose. He joins a tradition of writers, consistent with Augustine, who located the *imago dei* in the intellect.⁷⁶ Francisco's work grafts the

⁷³ Ibid, 198.

⁷⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 318. "...y como aquello tengamos más en la memoria que más deseamos, síguese que el Señor tiene de continuo memoria del anima que lo ama..." trans. Mary Giles, 293.

⁷⁵ Ibid, 318. "suspiros," trans. Mary Giles, 293.

⁷⁶ Donald F. Duclow, "Whose Image is This?" in Eckhart's Sermons," *Mystics Quarterly* 15 (1989): 29-40.

“mimetic model” for *imago dei*, which emphasizes the similarity between the inner mind of the believer and God, and the “dynamic model” that emphasizes the perfectibility of the interior toward conformity with God.⁷⁷ He says to God, “You made me in your image so as to move me to love you more.”⁷⁸ This brief description describes a causal chain, but not necessarily a sequence of actions. In his more detailed descriptions, the identification between God’s mind and the interior of the believer is fully immediate. This is particularly the case in the memory. I will call “reflexivity” that dynamic whereby the recollected soul recalls God and is simultaneously recalled by God.

“Reflexivity” has two antecedents. The first is the simple, grammatical trait describing a “reflexive verb.” In these instances, the actor and the acted-upon are identical. So, a *recogido* remembering God as an agent is also recalled in the performance of this action. It is noteworthy that, as is the case in reflexive verbs, there is no embedded sequence in the reflexive memory. The act of remembering and the act of being remembered are not only simultaneous, but are themselves identical.

However, the category of reflexive verbs is not quite sufficient to describe the existence of a second actor in this dynamic, that is, God. To address how Francisco views God’s role in the recollected memory, the way the term “reflexivity” is used in anthropology is instructive. While the differences between anthropological research and the rigorous meditative life of the *recogido* are greater than the similarity, the way in which close study of the human person has a mutually affective relationship with the observer informs my use of the term “reflexivity.” Bob Scholte

⁷⁷ Claudia Welz, “*Imago Dei*: References to the Invisible” *Studia Theologica* 65 (2011): 74-91.

⁷⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Terçer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 455. “...hicísteme a tu semejanza por que más me moviese a tea mar...,” trans. Mary Giles, 447.

wrote of the place of reflexivity in the anthropological project, “The comparative understanding of others contributes to self-awareness: self-understanding, in turn, allows for self-reflection and (partial) self-emancipation; the emancipatory interest, finally, makes the understanding of others possible.”⁷⁹

While this definition lacks the simultaneity of the grammatical use of “reflexivity,” it offers a clearer understanding of how a singular action can make two different parties both act and be acted upon. In this dissertation, I will use the term with attention to both properties. The believer and God both use memories which are understood as operating according to the principles of ancient and medieval mnemotechnics in order to remember each other. The recollected memory therefore depends on the property of reflexivity because as the believer remembers God, he is remembered by God.

The oscillation between the positive and the dangerous actions of memory are of importance in Francisco’s scheme for *recogimiento* must be considered carefully. His adherence to Augustine’s three categories for the psychological Trinity gives him more than enough opportunity throughout the third volume of the *Abecedario Espiritual* to discuss memory in equal proportion to will and understanding, along with the various ways in which each of these faculties supplements and reinforces the other two. He sees memory as a protective faculty. He creates a mnemonic with the biblical figure of Meshach, who was condemned to the furnace along with Shadrach and Abednego for refusing to bow to Nebuchadnezzar’s idol. Each man is compared to

⁷⁹ Scholte, Bob, "Toward a Reflexive and Critical Anthropology," In *Reinventing Anthropology*, ed. Dell Hymes (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1972), 448.

one of the faculties of the soul, and Mesach "... is the memory that dams up the waters of fantasy and imagination when it is devoted to God and wishes only to remember him."⁸⁰

This particular function for the memory is instructive for several reasons. The first is that it addresses the persistent understanding of the imagination as something that is prone to frivolity and therefore dangerous. Its analogy with fantasy, in this instance, troubles the previously discussed role of memory as a creative, reconstructive faculty since these roles are presently taken by what moderns understand as the imagination.

The building material for the imagination is necessarily the created world because even fantasy is cobbled together from bits of reality to permit coherence. The potential tension between Francisco's desire for a reconstructive memory directed towards *recogimiento* and the runaway imagination is revealed in the second section of his agenda for Misac, the memory. In this section the memory possesses an extraordinary creative capacity by organizing information from the sensible world for later retrieval and for repeated reorganizations into a huge variety of edifying forms. But because the memory deals exclusively with material that it receives passively, its internal activity is similarly fraught with danger. The danger is expressed throughout Francisco's work. This appears occasionally in ancient through early modern work with unqualified reference to the imagination,⁸¹ but the curve toward wariness increases exponentially after the ancient period. Frances Yates describes the objective of Quintillian's memory training in terms of an active imagination in pursuit of rhetorical goals, neatly employing the architectural metaphor as well:

⁸⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 139. "...es nuestra memoria cuando detiene las fantasías e imaginaciones diversas aplicándose a Dios y queriéndose solamente acordar de él," trans. Mary Giles, 95.

⁸¹ James Wetzel, "Splendid Vices and Secular Virtues: Variations on Milbanks' Augustine," *The Journal of Religious Ethics* 32 (2004): 272.

“We have to think of the ancient orator as moving in imagination through his memory building *whilst* he is making his speech, drawing from the memorized places the images he has placed on them.”⁸² The alienation of our interior faculties from their perfect state requires writers after the ancient period to proceed cautiously.

For instance, Carruthers points out the careful distinction during this period between the *vis imaginativa* of Avicenna, which is directed towards combining the images impressed on the mind into larger concepts, and the imagination as we would presently understand it.⁸³ She attributes a linguistic change here, noting that “... now geniuses are said to have creative imagination which they express in intricate reasoning and original discovery, in earlier times they were said to have richly retentive memories, which they expressed in intricate reasoning and original discovery.”⁸⁴ Francisco’s tradition would understand the process of intricate reasoning and original discovery as vulnerable to the effects of sin into which human sinners so frequently stumbled. He prefers to see imagination in terms of Genesis 8:21, “for the imagination of man’s heart is prone to evil since his youth.”⁸⁵ In this way, the caveat that the memory is operating at its peak function when it aligns the believer toward God in exclusive remembrance of God is what prevents the creative capacity of Francisco de Osuna’s memory from escaping freely into the chaos of the frivolous invented world. The dangerous instability of the imagination is corralled by the recollected memory, mitigating its moral hazard.

Francisco appeals to the existing tradition of late-medieval mnemotechnics by referring immediately afterwards to a classic metaphor for the memory, namely, the metaphor of imprinted

⁸² Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks, 1984), 3.

⁸³ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 68.

⁸⁴ Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks: London, 1984), 4.

⁸⁵ Genesis 8:21. Douay-Rheims translation.

wax. He writes that the devil, the aforementioned “evil father,” clears space inside his home “...which he makes a place for imprinting things so that everything these people do comes out of the mould of the devil’s work.”⁸⁶ A reader familiar with the late medieval memory tradition would clearly recognize the referent for these two metaphors. He is introducing the topic in symbolic language which will create a mutually buttressing relationship between his own work on memory in the eleventh treatise and the common understanding of readers educated in the operation of memory.⁸⁷ His further use of two less-developed but still common metaphors for memory, the digestive stomach⁸⁸ and the vessel holding a fluid,⁸⁹ demonstrates his desire to appeal to readers based on mnemotechnic language.⁹⁰

Francisco moves beyond what the memory should avoid and directs it toward its proper focus. Careful to advise against indulging a fallen instinct to hold on to grievances or to reminisce over money lost, there remains an assertive quality to Francisco’s directive that the believer must also “have the memory always occupied.”⁹¹ Once again, the reason that the believer must keep the memory active at all times is because of the difficulty in controlling the relationship between the memory and the created world. Beginning with a problematic engagement with creation and moving to the conclusion that we must constantly engage the created world in a disciplined fashion

⁸⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 318. “...haciéndola como cosa de impresión, porque allí ponía él en molde todas sus obras para que saliesen a lo público de obra....” Trans. Mary Giles, 293

⁸⁷ Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks: London, 1984), 63-93.

⁸⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*. Ed. Saturnino López Santidrián. Madrid: BAC. 2005. Tr. 11.2. p. 319.

⁸⁹ Ibid. Tr. 11.2. p. 319.

⁹⁰ Mary Carruthers. *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 2008. P. 207-208.

⁹¹ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 318. “...tener la memoria ocupada....” Trans. Mary Giles, 294.

is impossible without a theological anthropology that depends on the activity of the faculties. Using these capacities for God is possible for the prayerful and carefully trained believer. He notes that, in an unoccupied moment, the brain will choose to occupy itself one way or another, and usually in a way which does not serve a union with God.⁹²

The analogy for the operation of the occupied memory is clear in Francisco's discussion of vision. He manages to fuse the ancient theory of "extromission," that the eye sent rays out to perceive objects,⁹³ and the medieval theory of "intromission,"⁹⁴ that suggested that objects emit rays perceived by the eye. The shared responsibility of the passive and active parts of the vision is the driving theme of his description of this faculty, as he explains that, "For these two lights must join: that is, the light outside and that within our eyes must meet so that the fusion of their beams will allow us to discern visible things."⁹⁵ The meeting of the two beams of light, one emitted from an object to be discerned and the other from our eyes, mimics the reflexive property of memory with respect to the believer and God. Francisco explains further that, "In spiritual matters our understanding is dependent on fusing the natural light imprinted on the soul with divine, heavenly light so that in their coalescence we may glimpse what we did not know previously...."⁹⁶ The union, achieved as literal sight, between the natural light from objects and the divine light from God is

⁹² Ibid, 317-318.

⁹³ Robert Pasnau, *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 169.

⁹⁴ David C. Lindberg, *Theories of Vision from Al-Kindi to Kepler* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1976), 61-67.

⁹⁵ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 141-142. "... mas es menester que entrambas estas los luces se mezclen: la luz de fuera y la que está dentro en nuestros ojos se han de juntar para que en la tal mezcla veamos las cosas visibles." Trans. Mary Giles, 98.

⁹⁶ Ibid, 142. "...en lo spiritual, es menester, para que se cause conocimiento, que con la lumbre natural que está impresa en nuestra ánima se junte la lumbre divina y celestial, para que en esta mezcla veamos lo que antes no conocíamos...." Trans. Mary Giles, 98.

where God is disclosed for the believer. This process of disclosure, furthermore, occurs in the intellect as the believer learns something which he had not previously known.

Citing Seneca, Francisco further establishes a relationship between creation and the interior which is premised on temporality.⁹⁷ The memory does not simply retain the external created world, but “the life of the secular world”⁹⁸ in its finite entirety. This existence both within and beyond time posits the human memory as something which knows God by imitating God, a comparison re-affirmed by Francisco in the litany of metaphors after this disclosure. He writes, “it is the place wherein is stored the treasure of the wise; it is the ark of the truth, the living book of man, the womb where the soul cherishes her sons so that they are not killed by forgetfulness.”⁹⁹ This last image must have been the most simultaneously horrifying and compelling to Francisco’s sixteenth-century audience, that condemnation before God was an act as aggressive as being killed but as blithely passive as being forgotten.

He elaborates with reference to Gregory, whom he credits as observing that this death “is a kind of death that removes from memory what once lived there, just as death drives out from present life what it kills.”¹⁰⁰ Posing a potential paradox, Francisco admits that forgetfulness is not a quality that exists in God. His resolution to this problem demonstrates a deepening commitment to the view that the memory of God can be metaphorically understood as something receptive to use of traditional mnemotechnics.

⁹⁷ Ibid, 319.

⁹⁸ Ibid, 319. “...la vida del siglo...” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

⁹⁹ Ibid, 319. “...es el lugar donde está el tesoro de los que saben, y arca de la verdad, y libro vivo del hombre, y vientre donde nuestra ánima guarda sus hijos por que no se los mate el olvido...” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid, 319. “...es una manera de muerte que hace que no sea en la memoria lo que antes era; así como la muerte hace que no esté en la vida presente lo que mata...” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

The objective of these mnemotechnics, training the memory, is smoothly adaptable for a more ambitious spiritual program in *recogimiento*. The daily, habitual act of *recogimiento* serves to sharpen the interior faculties in order to welcome God's grace. In Francisco's anthropology, these faculties that have proven troublesome to the believer's soul prior to *recogimiento* are not silenced in surrender to our fallen state but are rather acknowledged as essential means for perceiving God in a cluttered, complex world. In Francisco's *Abecedario*, the memory is the most essential of these faculties for negotiating between the endless distraction to our singular focus on God caused by the created world and God's disclosure to our faculties. The distinction between the innate natural memory and perfectible intellectual memory is helpful for understanding the complex balance forced on the recollected believer when it comes to the created world.¹⁰¹ When unrestrained by *recogimiento*, the depth of the memory's receptivity marks it as a hazard to the believer. Furthermore, memory's activity in this state distracts the believer from God. When trained by *recogimiento*, the memory's receptivity retains God's presence and its activity organizes and extracts memory of God for the purpose of conforming the soul.

God's illumination is required in every corner of the soul in order to keep the heart from giving into temptation and rolling, as it were, into hell. It is my view, however, that the simultaneous passivity and activity of the memory is what drives his discussion of *recogimiento* forward and past the radical vacancy of his *dejado* opponents. Scholarship on the abdication of the faculties in *dejamiento* focuses mainly on the will.¹⁰² However, the explicit *dejado* disenchantment

¹⁰¹ John N. Jones, "Honey Without God: Francisco de Osuna's Higher Memory" in *Spain and its Literature: Essays in Memory of E. Allison Peers*, ed. Ann L. MacKenzie (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2004), 84-87.

¹⁰² Charles F. Fraker, Jr., "The 'Dejados' and the Cancionero de Baena," *Hispanic Review* 33No. (1965): 99-101.

with religious ceremony¹⁰³ leaves little room for the actions and habits that could develop and reinforce the believer's memory of God. Furthermore, memory is the perfect site to mediate between the activity of *recogimiento* and the passivity of *dejamiento* because it, of itself, requires a balance between those two traits. The resulting spirituality is something which is therefore opposed to a line of thinking which we have examined in the previous chapter, but also something which asserts itself as over and against contemporary opponents.

God's memory can be understood to operate similarly to the human memory in Francisco's estimation. It is endlessly receptive. He writes, "...the infinite knowledge engendered by his [God's] understanding remains forever in his eternal memory where all things live and never are forgotten."¹⁰⁴ The difference in scale here, highlighted by the mention that God's memory is eternal and that all things persist in that eternal memory, is breathtaking but does not prohibit the analogy that forms the basis of Francisco's understanding of the memory. The analogy does require elaboration, however, because God's relationship with the world is different from the human relationship with the world. In this way, Francisco's ambivalence toward creation and the interior states which he has analyzed in all the prior treatises of the *Tercer Abecedario* only serves half of the conversation because God's knowledge and understanding reassimilates all things to God.

The issue of receiving God in the memory is complicated by the problem of epiphany. Francisco has spent considerable time discussing God's availability in creation, but that availability is also freighted with our own fallen relationship with nature. Relentlessly present by definition, our feeble capabilities do not necessarily assimilate God in the same way. Therefore,

¹⁰³ Ibid, 101.

¹⁰⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 319. "...teniendo siempre su eterna memoria aquella infinita noticia engendrada de su entendimiento, en cual todas las cosas viven, nunca jamás olvidándose...." Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

Francisco is forced to rely on the compatibility of our receptive faculties with momentary relationships with God. This reminder leads Francisco to depart briefly from the previously identified audience of the laity¹⁰⁵ and address himself to his fellow friars, encouraging them to “always keep in mind the day when they renounced the secular life because they felt obliged to strive for greater virtue and to have them commemorate every day the saint whose feast was celebrated when they took vows of increased perfection.”¹⁰⁶ The instruction to focus on a profound but nevertheless momentary experience of God’s grace, in this case the day in which his brothers converted and accepted the Franciscan rule, puts Francisco’s work here in excellent congruence with mnemotechnic instruction to rely on specific, evocative memories.¹⁰⁷ The exceptional is memorable. Because fleeting experiences in our lives work against perseverance in God’s grace, committing them in their epiphanic form as memory permits the believer to receive, to organize, and to use the memory as suits them in their search of union with God.

For his lay audience, Francisco’s instructions for capturing these epiphanies consistently point the reader towards a memory of an event for which they were not present for but which they have been recapitulating regularly at Mass throughout their Christian lives, namely, Christ’s passion. In fact, in order to return from the momentary digression to address the life of the Franciscan, he moves the narrative forward by analogy between the anniversary of the day a friar takes his vow with “that ... day when the Lord freed us from the house of slavery that is our habit

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, 93-97.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid, 320. “tengan continuo memoria de aquel día que, por obligación a mayor virtud, se apartaron de la vida mundana; y hagan cada día conmemoración del santo que se celebró el día que ellos votaron mayor perfección....” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

¹⁰⁷ Mary Carruthers, “Rhetorical *Memoria* in Commentay and Practice” in *The Rhetoric of Cicero in Its Medieval and Early Renaissance Commentary Tradition*, ed. Virginia Cox and John O. Ward (Boston: Brill, 2006), 209-210.

of sinning and the ever-present opportunity to do so...”¹⁰⁸ Scope is unnecessary as he draws a straight line through these moments of direct experience with God’s grace, both in a reader’s hypothetical experience and in Scripture¹⁰⁹ precisely because this text is a grand appeal to the individual experience of the believer. That there is no proportion between Christ’s sacrifice on the cross and the day Francisco decided to give away his possessions and only wear sandals is not relevant to the ability of such a memory to persist in his mind and transform him in identical union with the mind of God wherein Francisco is remembered for eternity.

In addition to its obvious relevance as the central event in humankind’s salvation from the death of sin, Christ’s Passion is also ideal for creation of a house of memory. This particular mnemotechnic requires creating a known, familiar space within the mind and populating it with images that will trigger the memory.¹¹⁰ In typical Franciscan fashion,¹¹¹ Francisco recognizes that Calvary as a geographic location and the wounded, beaten body of Christ are ideal for this purpose. The *recogido* turns his attention to his interior faculty and meditates on the details of Christ’s sacrifice, that most profound moment of God’s grace.

Francisco does not cordon off this advice for the laity. In his collection of homilies to his Franciscan counterparts gathered in France, *Trilogium Evangelicum* he advises them that though

¹⁰⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 320. “aquel... día en el cual quiso el Señor sacarnos de la casa de la servidumbre, que es la costumbre y continua ocasión de pecar....” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid, 320: “Lo último que dice es que nos sacó para que no comiésemos pan con levadura....” Trans. Mary Giles, 296.

¹¹⁰ See: Francis Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London: ARK Paperbacks, 1984), 244-45 and Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 94-98 for specific discussions of this mnemotechnic in use.

¹¹¹ Dennis L. Despres, “Memory and Image: The Dissemination of a Franciscan Meditative Text,” *Mystics Quarterly* 16 (1990): 134.

“bitter is the remembrance of your death”¹¹² it is the source of humankind’s peace and therefore something which must be considered within the memory. The congruence between the advice unique to his brothers under the rule and his lay audience reveals the degree to which *recogimiento* is a daily practice and not a final ascent. The *recogido* is recollecting himself at all times, retreating into the interior spaces in search of God at all moments, without the expectation of leaping some bar whereby holiness and union with God is an accepted and intractable fact. He explains, “He who exercises memory in this fashion will grow from virtue to virtue and be magnified in merit before God, and he will fulfill the counsel of the Lord....”¹¹³ The progress from virtue to virtue, with increasing merit, is not aligned towards a recommended cumulative level of grace, but rather toward the continual positioning and repositioning of the soul in such a manner that it may be perfectly reflective of God. It is noteworthy also that there is relatively little narrative of the “ascent” of the soul to God in *recogimiento*. Francisco prefers more flexible geographic descriptions of a relationship with God which exists primarily in the interior spaces. For instance, he directs the *recogido* to “... enter within ourselves and turn to our hearts. Each person is to rest within himself and not go outside; he is to close the door over himself, sealing himself inside, so that God may commune secretly with the soul.”¹¹⁴ Though the spirituality presented in *Abecedario*

¹¹² Francisco de Osuna, *Trilogium Evangelicum: Primum Christi passionem (quam ab infantia praesensit) docet, cui annectitur expositio accomoda canticorum graduum* (Toulouse, 1535) “O mors que amara est memoria tua,” fol. 2b.

¹¹³ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 320. “El que hiciese esta memoria crecería de virtud en virtud y acrecentaría merecimientos delante de Dios y cumpliría el consejo del mismo Señor...” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid*, 561. “... entrar dentro en nosotros mismos y tornaros al corazón, y que cada uno huelgue en sí, no saliendo fuera, sino que cierre la puerta sobre sí cerrándola muy bien, para que en secreto se comuniquen Dios al ánima.” Trans. Mary Giles, 566.

Espiritual is undoubtedly a more active one than his local *dejado* opponents, his thought remained close to that of Alcaraz or Isabel de la Cruz in its interest in spiritual stillness.¹¹⁵

The primary activity in this practice is due to God's initiative. Francisco notes that "... he freed us with a strong hand."¹¹⁶ Nevertheless, this observation offers an opportunity for Francisco to compare our hands to God's hands insofar as with the latter "we accomplish virtuous deeds."¹¹⁷ Keeping this virtuous hand in working shape, however, requires that one keeps the guidance of each letter in mind. This feat occurs through the most varied mnemotechnic of them all, alphabetization.¹¹⁸ The entirety of the *Tercer Abecedario*, as well as all of the subsequent volumes except for the fourth, are arranged in such a way that the reader can easily command the maxims in his memory. The glosses, Francisco's life's work arranged in sequential alphabetical observations and occasionally even alphabetized internally¹¹⁹ are supportive of the maxims' persistence within the mind.

Persistence within the mind is also useless without continued, easy access to its contents. Francisco once again reveals a shared awareness of mnemotechnics by referring to the "house of your conscience"¹²⁰ and insisting that the reader places the memory of his day of liberation from the world here. The purpose of this is not for the memory to simply sit, unaltered, in order to share

¹¹⁵ Alastair Hamilton, "The *Alumbrados: Dejamiento* and its Practicioners" in *A New Companion to Hispanic Mysticism*, ed. Hilaire Kallendorf (Boston: Brill, 2010), 103-126.

¹¹⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 320. "...nos sacó en mano fuerte...." Trans. Mary Giles, 296.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid*, 320. "...obramos las cosas de virtud...." Trans. Mary Giles, 296.

¹¹⁸ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 135-152.

¹¹⁹ Mariano Quirós García, "Volumen I: Estudio Introductorio" in *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI Partes* by Francisco de Osuna, ed. Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: BAC, 2002), 70-74.

¹²⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 320. "...casa de tu conciencia...." Trans, 296.

cumulative holiness with fellow blessed memories. Rather, it is to be retained in an organized place within the interior house of memory “by remembering it always; thus you may rejoice in it and praise the Lord who made that day good for you so that each time you remember the day you will be as deserving as you were then.”¹²¹ The essential part of this spiritual advice is that by retaining and manipulating that moment in the memory the believer can repeatedly be transformed by his own past. Devotion is actively centered around these moments with meditation on the Passion as the pinnacle. Furthermore, salvific grace recurs as the believer lives in these moments. As we will see, the Passion is the moment of entry for the believer to place himself in God’s memory, the reflection of the reflexive memory.

Activity in the remembrance of God is constant, and rather than a periodic intellectual recommitment to the idea of Christ’s sacrifice, the remembrance of God is an act which is tied intimately to another act, that is, “an untiring love for him.”¹²² The nominally separate actions of remembering God and loving God are in this case joined in the reflexive sense. The act of remembering God is inwardly transformative in such a way that facilitates the true love of God. Francisco refers to Ambrose of Milan, whom he credits with the observation that “only memory can provide a remedy if both past happiness and the hope of future happiness are wanting.”¹²³ A similar reflexivity is seen in the way that Francisco understands Ambrose as combining past and future within the memory. God stands outside of time, and if welcoming God inside the memory in active remembrance creates an identification with the subject of that memory then our minds,

¹²¹ Ibid, 320. “...por continua memoria de él, para en esto te gozar y alabar al Señor, que hizo aquel día bueno para ti, y de esta forma merecerás, cada vez que de él te acordares, tanto cuanto entonces mereciste.” Trans. Mary Giles, 296.

¹²² Ibid, 321. “...no cansable afección en el amor de él...” Trans. Mary Giles, 296.

¹²³ Ibid, 322.”... en la ausencia del bien pasado y esperanza del por venir sola la memoria de remedio...” Trans. Mary Giles, 298.

too, stand outside of time in love of God. The image of exile, demonstrated in the examples of the exiled Israelites alienated physically from the promised land,¹²⁴ offers a suitable analogue for Francisco to describe the way Christians behave prior to *recogimiento*.

Late in the second chapter of the eleventh treatise, Francisco finally addresses the complex difference between memory of things which can be sensed¹²⁵ and the memory of God. Though God is not visible, "...his merits and divine properties are numerous, however, we can have some memory of him through them..."¹²⁶ Assuming a properly ordered understanding of God's hand in the created world, Francisco notes that these traces of divinity can awaken the same love of God.¹²⁷ With the correct view to God's creating and ordering power over the created world, all of creation becomes a way to remember God. God is the cause of the entire natural world which was created for our use.¹²⁸

His analogy spirals back upon itself in the form with which readers had likely become accustomed by this eleventh treatise. Francisco observes that clothing, flowers, and the ground offer comfort, beauty, and support in exact proportion to God's intention for them.¹²⁹ He is careful to distinguish that we must not think "that God is the form of things..."¹³⁰ but rather that the external sense's proper function is expressive of God's creative role.¹³¹ This ordering is, for the

¹²⁴ Ibid, 322.

¹²⁵ Ibid, 322.

¹²⁶ Ibid, 322. "...sus excelencias muchas y sus divinas propiedades, mediante ellas podríamos tener de él memoria...." Trans. Mary Giles, 298

¹²⁷ Ibid, 322.

¹²⁸ Gilbert Meilaender, "Sweet Necessities: Food, Sex, and Augustine," *The Journal of Religious Ethics* 29 (2001): 3-18.

¹²⁹ Ibid, 322-323.

¹³⁰ Ibid, 323. "...que Dios es forma de las cosas..." Trans. Mary Giles, 299.

¹³¹ Ibid, 323.

purposes of contemplation, useful for holding God continuously in the mind as everything in the created world which serves humankind and takes God as its referent.

The third chapter of the eleventh treatise begins the complex task of differentiating types of memory. The full practice of *recogimiento* facilitates a higher form of memory that Francisco calls “the perfect memory of God”¹³² and which itself adds to *recogimiento*. Francisco’s understanding of the mutually buttressing relationship between memory and *recogimiento* is the fruit of a heightened description of the interior conversion resulting from God’s persistence in the memory. This description also goes further than Francisco had previously gone towards disclosing the purpose and limits of the sensual faculties. He explains first that, “Hence, the memory of God based on recollection is a spiritual resurrection.”¹³³ This fully spiritual resurrection does not occur in the senses and in fact proceeds from a temporary death of the senses. The spiritual death of the un-recollected believer in *recogimiento* is reflected when they “do not employ the exterior senses.”¹³⁴ In the spiritual resurrection, however, which is the fruit of habitual use of a higher memory of God, the senses and the interior faculty function according to God’s grace. He writes, “This memory of God causes all interior and exterior things of man to function because it provides them a simple operation that is compatible with recollection....”¹³⁵ That this is characterized as a simple exercise of the faculties is extremely important in that it represents a stripping away of the unnecessary clutter within our soul and our relationship to the created world. Our ordinary, un-recollected use of these faculties is unnecessarily complex by comparison. The result is the active

¹³² Ibid, 324. “La perfecta memoria de Dios....” Trans. Mary Giles, 300

¹³³ Ibid, 324. “Donde la memoria de Dios sobre el recogimiento es una resurrección espiritual.” Trans. Mary Giles, 300.

¹³⁴ Ibid, 324. “...no usando de los sentidos exteriores.” Trans. Mary Giles, 300.

¹³⁵ Ibid, 324. “...ca esta memoria de Dios hace que obren todas las cosas interiores y exteriores del hombre, dándoles una operación sencilla que se compadece con el recogimiento....” Trans. Mary Giles, 300.

operation of the recollected believer which is “representing God in his pure essence.”¹³⁶ While Giles’ translation focuses here on the purity of this image of God, Francisco’s more evocative adjective, “desnudo,” is intended to direct the reader towards a raw and un-cluttered immediacy of experience. That such an experience can be created within the mind without distraction is one of the truest signs of the extraordinarily high anthropology which the practice of *recogimiento* calls into service. At the same time, *recogimiento* facilitates this insofar as it is a rigorous, learned, daily receptivity toward God.

He explains, “This memory is based on recollection and is infused into man, seemingly raising him from death to life and vitalizing his innermost being and heart and eyes so that he lives for naught else but God because his memory is of naught else but God.”¹³⁷ Analysis of these passages in the third chapter of the eleventh treatise is complicated by what seems initially to be an unintentional transposition of the order of events between God’s grace, the movement of the interior faculties, and the interior conversion. Francisco’s intentions for the order of these three events are best understood when *recogimiento* is viewed as a practice that is made daily and honed throughout a lifetime. One constantly recollects their mind rather than achieves a durable state of recollection. When it is fully understood that *recogimiento* is practiced continuously, then the sequence of actions vanishes and the memory which is “infused into man” and “vitalizing” his being, heart, and eyes are reflexive actions identifiable to each other.

Notably, though this memory revives and re-orientes our physical senses as indicated by Francisco’s careful inclusion of “the eyes” in the list of revitalized human capacities, the memory

¹³⁶ Ibid, 324. “...una representación de Dios en su desnudo ser.” Trans. Mary Giles, 300-301.

¹³⁷ Ibid, 324. “Si es acostumbrada sobre el recogimiento, revístese en el hombre y parece que de muerto lo hace vivo, y le aviva las entrañas y el corazón y los ojos; no a otra cosa sino a Dios, porque esta memoria es de solo Dios.” Trans. Mary Giles, 301.

itself occurs in the “intellectual memory,” which he opposes to the “sensitive” memory.¹³⁸ In addition to trainability, another difference between these two types of memory is in how the memory is retained. The sensitive memory holds images in their specificity, retaining particularity between them. The intellectual memory, however, resists this disunity of qualities and understands the particular memory on the general level. He explains that this persistence in the intellectual memory is congruent with the proper way to understand God, that “In a lofty way, we remember God as unlimited being, immeasurable kindness, beginning without beginning, end without end, fullness that leaves nothing empty, invincible power, knowing that ignores nothing.”¹³⁹ In addition to offering the proper way in which God is to be held and contemplated within our memory, the reflexive property of this action is transformative in such a way that the recollected believer, converted by this memory, is himself preserved in God’s memory as something whole and without disunity. The point of this distinction is that the intellectual memory permits nothing fragmented in its memories. Memories are gathered together in a unity that transcends particularity. Memories are preserved intact and in congruence with their purpose according to God.

Francisco de Osuna uses the twofold receptive and active operation of the memory in order to highlight the reflexive nature of that quality with respect to unity with God. He relied on an ancient tradition which persisted through the medieval period and was transmitted as detailed mnemotechnics that understood the operation of memory as something known, stable, and trainable. This last quality of the mechanics of human memory coincides well with Francisco’s aims in the discussion of *recogimiento* as a daily habit rather than a progressive ascent to God. The

¹³⁸ Ibid, 324. “*memoria intelectiva*” and “*sensitiva*” Trans. Mary Giles, 301.

¹³⁹ Ibid, 324. “Por una manera alta se acuerda de Dios que es un ser no limitado, una bondad no medible, un principio que no se comienza, un fin que no se acaba, un henchimiento que nada deja vacío, una fuerza invencible, un saber que nada ignora....” Trans. Mary Giles, 301.

memory is trained daily to passively accept God amidst distracting and troubling surroundings, and to organize itself around the received image of God in order to align oneself with God.¹⁴⁰ In the next chapter, I will discuss the other side of the reflexive nature of this capacity. Francisco's frequent appeals to the mind of God place the human believer as an object to be received and organized within the memory of God, and understanding the process of memory permits the believer to find a place in God's mnemotechnics.

¹⁴⁰ Karl Enekel and Walter S. Melion, "Introduction: Types and Functions of Late Medieval Meditation in the Transition from Late Medieval to Early Modern Culture" in *Meditatio: Refashioning the Self: Theory and Practice in Late Medieval and Early Modern Intellectual Culture*, Karl A.E. Enekel and Walter Melion (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 1-24.

EKPHRASIS AND THE REFLEXIVE MEMORY OF GOD

In chapter four, I described memory as a “reflexive” faculty in Francisco de Osuna’s work. Through appeals to ancient and medieval mnemotechnics,¹ he positions his readers to receive God into the memory and to place themselves within God’s memory.² These two actions occur reflexively in the memory as one simultaneous action based on the *imago dei* in the human intellect. There is no sequence or progression to this memory of God, which occurs habitually through the daily practice of *recogimiento* as a single, unified action in the human and divine memory. Francisco’s work relies on descriptions of God’s memory in analogous terms to the memory of the recollected believer: retention and organization. In the same manner as the believer, the organizational capacity of God’s memory can also be a creative function, arranging the images in the memory according to God’s will. This chapter will focus on the development of God’s memory in Francisco’s thought, with specific reference to the objective in *recogimiento* of placing the believer inside the memory of God in order to avoid the condemnation of being forgotten.³

Additionally, this chapter will discuss the role of meditation on the Passion in *recogimiento* and the memory, using analysis from Francisco’s other volumes of the *Abecedario* at length. Understanding the absence of ekphrastic⁴ treatment of the Passion in the third volume requires an understanding of the *Abecedario* as a unified text. Mariano Quirós García’s scholarship not only

¹ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes. Vol. III: VI Parte*, Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca: 2002), 1083.

² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 317-336.

³ *Ibid*, 319.

⁴ For a discussion of the relationship between ekphrasis and phanasmata in the memory, see: Ruth Webb, *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice* (Farnham, England: Routledge, 2009):107-130.

offers a convincing case that, in spite of the lag in publication dates,⁵ the *Abecedario* is best viewed as a single work in multiple volumes whose differing emphases are intended to supplement and buttress a full treatment of the practice of *recogimiento*.⁶ With some consideration of revised dates for the composition of the parts of the alphabet, Quirós García describes a distribution of themes for this unified work that focus on the practice of *recogimiento* and the centrality of the Passion. The inter-relatedness of the *Abecedario*'s scheme is confirmed by the symmetrical way in which the elements recapitulate themselves. The first part deals with the Christ's passion while the final part deals with the wounds of Christ suffered in his ordeal on the Cross.⁷ In this way, the Passion bookends Francisco's exposition of *recogimiento* wherein the practice of prayer is treated in the second part's discussion of spiritual exercises and the third's overview of prayer and the interior life. Because it stands at the center of all six volumes, the third part serves as a recapitulation of the entire work.⁸ Before returning to the crucifixion, Francisco pauses in the fourth and fifth part for a discussion of the exterior religious life, love for the other and care for the poor.⁹

If the *Abecedario Espiritual* functions as a single text then its constituent parts must be understood as referents within that one work. Discussion in the third part of the *Abecedario* of the Passion takes its scope and definition from the fuller analysis of Christ's suffering body in the first and sixth part. Though Francisco's first volume, the *Tercer Abecedario* functions as a

⁵ There is a seventeen year gap between the publication of the *Tercer Abecedario* and the 1554 appearance of the *Sexto* volume. See: Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 27.

⁶ Mariano Quirós García, *Volumen I: Estudio Introductorio* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca: 200), 245-47.

⁷ *Ibid*, 46-47

⁸ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 34.

⁹ *Ibid*, 30-32.

representative of the entire project; the other parts of the *Abecedario* can supplement an analysis of the way Francisco enlists the memory in *recogimiento* – placing oneself in the presence of the crucified Christ and therefore in God’s own memory. The creative reconstruction of the Passion is essential to this objective, in congruity with Adrian Rifkin’s observation that *ekphrasis* creates a timelessness wherein, “The moment of the future is no longer future, in Saint Augustine’s terms, but only that space of the envisageable, where it might now appear that a decision has been made, or that an event either has or has not yet taken place.”¹⁰ Christ’s final days serve as a perfect subject for envisioning, and as we will see, Francisco advocates prayer focused on recapitulating this period in a way that sees the believer occupy Christ’s own geographic space.

Before turning to the Passion, it is useful to summarize the role of memory in belief and interior spirituality. Francisco’s exploration of the operation of human memory and its divine counterpart relies on a coherent tradition of the memory’s role in belief, as well as its powers and limits. The ancient sources for this tradition were discussed in my fourth chapter, but Francisco’s own Franciscan order played an important role in the genealogy of the human intellect during the late middle ages. Prior to the acceptance of the works of Aristotle at the University of Paris in the late thirteenth century, Augustine’s thought established a norm when it came to understanding the relationship between human cognition and the created world. The memory stood at an important place in Augustine’s understanding of the intellect, developed primarily in *De Trinitate*, because of the paired receptivity and activity that we have discussed in previous chapters. Coleman describes this activity more clearly as “actively producing mental conceptions of objects that either

¹⁰ Adrian Rifkin, “Addressing Ekphrasis: A Prolegomenon to the Next,” *Classical Philology* 102 (2007): 75.

were no longer actually present to the senses, or never had been sensually perceived.”¹¹ The passive reception of the object persists as a permanent state in the vastness of memory, available for active use by the thinker.

Janet Coleman’s discussion of the transition from ancient memory arts to the monastic period, a movement spearheaded by Augustine and St. Bernard’s work on the topic of memory, nicely maps out the soteriological directionality applied to traditional mnemonics by these monastically inclined thinkers. She explains that, as the history of these mnemonics moved into a medieval spirituality informed by monastic sensibilities, “The memory storehouse was a varied collection of paving stones on the path to the kind of knowledge that is atemporal, eternally present, a knowledge that requires for its achievement the forgetting of all those paving stones, all the constituents of the past which comprised the material, experienced world of a man’s private past and personality.”¹² Furthermore, Coleman traces the transition from knowledge received by the senses which is temporal, finite, and particular to the “experienced world of a man’s private past and personality” to a higher knowledge which is “atemporal, eternally present”¹³ and prompts an union with the divine that dissolves in the memory “the constituents of the past which compromised the material, experienced world of a man’s private past and personality.”¹⁴ This transition is one which is naturally facilitated by *recogimiento* and Francisco’s careful exposition of the tension between the created world received by the senses and the interior spiritual life of the believer seeking recollection. The images of objects and knowledge to be contained in the memory serve a dual purpose that make them the site of reflexivity. Coleman explains, “If memory and

¹¹ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: University of Cambridge, 1995), 467.

¹² *Ibid*, 156.

¹³ *Ibid*, 156.

¹⁴ *Ibid*, 156.

understanding require likenesses or images which represent their objects to the soul, the aim of the monastic mediator is to use such images as signs or ‘speaking’ to attain what is ultimately ineffable and unimageable.”¹⁵

Francisco is not purely a monastic mediator, though. The reflexivity that *recogimiento* cultivates within the mind and memory of God through our own holiness is not a separate action from the interior transformation which occurs when God has become safely nested in our own memory. That holiness is not in itself ineffable. Francisco pins reflexivity to two different ways of moving toward God which are both equally important but unequal in their potentiality. He explains, “Our exterior person, or animal body, is born to labor and run after Christ in the ways described: following him in hardship and penitence and poverty in all things. But our soul with its superior part is a very swift bird, born to fly to divinity...”¹⁶ The point of this treatise is not to minimize one task with respect to the other, though it is very obvious which of the two approaches to the divine is the one to which *recogidos* are to pin their greatest aspirations. Rather, it is to acknowledge that believers approach God’s memory as living humans who possess both an interior and an exterior state and that, to exist in the eternity of God’s memory requires crafting the memory to reflexively retain God.

The task of directing memorable images toward an interior objective that seems paradigmatically opposed to the initial reception of those images in the senses may be counter-intuitive but becomes understandable given the narrowed focus that the monastic movement

¹⁵ Ibid, 156.

¹⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 470. “Este nuestro hombre exterior, este cuerpo animal, nace para trabajar y correr siguiendo a Cristo en la manera a dicha, que es siguiendo su aspereza y penitencia y pobreza en todas las cosas; mas nuestra ánima y parte superior de ella, que e save muy ligera...” Trans. Mary Giles, 464.

applied to mnemonics. The images created by the memory for organized storage and eventual retrieval ultimately serve a specific re-creative purpose and our monastic authors set that purpose toward a rigorously pursued union with the divine. *Recogimiento* qualifies as one of many entries in that field, but, more than many other types of devotion, Francisco de Osuna's practice also makes information received by and available to the senses a pivot point for a devotion in a way which muddles the acts of forgetting and remembering in one interior mental act that demonstrates complete training and governance over the mental faculties.

Furthermore, the pivot within mental images invites the recollected believer into a reflexive memory of God through recognition of the common reference point. Images refer to objects and knowledge in the world but their sensory referent is turned toward ineffability as they are re-configured by the creative memory. *Recogimiento* goes beyond the purely retentive memory process and enlists the organizational and re-creative functions of it. But because it grounds the turn toward God's ineffability in these sensory images created in the mind, it establishes their value for the divine memory that Francisco has already posited as trainable, the artificial memory of God. There is an understandable tension in this characterization of God's memory. In spite of his evocative description of memory as "...the womb where the soul cherishes her sons so that they are not killed by forgetfulness," God's own memory is characterized as "where all things live and are not forgotten."¹⁷ At the same time, he also says of salvation that "...it is logical that the Lord will continuously hold in his memory the soul that loves him"¹⁸ and pairs that observation with the

¹⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 319. "... y vientre donde nuestra ánima guarda sus hijos por que no se los mate el olvido..." Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

¹⁸ *Ibid*, 318. "...síguese que el Señor tiene de continuo memoria del ánima que lo ama..." Trans. Mary Giles, 293.

exhortation to the Jews in Psalms 137:5-6 to hold Jerusalem in their own mind.¹⁹ Jerusalem, in addition to serving as a geographical location to hold in the mind, offers an excellent example for the structure of the reflexive memory of God. Francisco compares the city in the memory to "...the soul devoted to recollection, which is not to forget the one who so lovingly vowed never to forget it..."²⁰ God's own memory is characterized as infinite in mercy, but the promise of mercy heightens the need for a reflexive dwelling in God's memory. That the memory of the recollected soul is characterized as a specific, knowable geographic location is also important here for disclosing Francisco's understanding of God's memory as sharing in the same structure as the human memory.

This shared structure and function provokes questions about the role of forgetting in God's reflexive memory. Francisco expresses some difficulty with the notion that forgetfulness can be a characteristic of God, a doubt which we have treated in the *Tercer Abecedario* as well, but refuses to abandon the language of God's forgetting. Francisco transforms Isaiah in 26:1's discussion of the walls and ramparts into an interior architecture, where the "walls,"²¹ can function to retain God. However, though he notes God's collaboration in this construction he also observes that "it is impossible to fall into oblivion in Christ."²² In this metaphor, God's memory shares our interior fortification but does not suffer from the same vulnerability to forgetfulness.

¹⁹Ibid, 319.

²⁰ Ibid, 318. "el ánima dada al recogimiento; y ésta, por corresponder a Dios en los serivicios según las Mercedes que recibe, no debe olvidar al que con tan amoroso juramento dijo que no la olvidaría..." Trans. Mary Giles, 294.

²¹Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Volumen III, Sexta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1083. "muros"

²² Ibid, 1083. "...es imposible que en Christo caya olvido."

The practice of recogimiento, even if only implicitly in discussion of the memory of God, extends beyond gathering up mental debris to redirect towards its proper object in God. The less carefully articulated art of forgetting, *ars oblivionalis*²³ demonstrates the urgency of letting the mind release memory images which do not serve the pursuit of the rightful focus of memory: God, in Francisco's case. Mary Carruthers explains the role of forgetting in the medieval construction of recollection, explaining that "Recollection is a rational procedure, involving associated conceptual sequences, with a variety of starting points from which one can find (invent) what one is attempting to retrieve from memory. There are three basic categories of such starting points: from exact likeness; from opposition; or from some similarity...."²⁴

That this is the case with the believer's has been established in chapter four of this dissertation. Memory, particularly memory trained in the *ars memorativa*, is a creative capacity which can turn seemingly disparate memory images impressed and organized within into new and compelling articulations. Carruthers explains how this larger re-creative project can be rightly understood as recollection: "Recollection begins with what is forgotten and seeks to reconstitute the ways to recover it. This description assumes that a memory, once laid down, is always in the brain, and so can be uncovered by reconstructing its tracks (*vestigia*)."²⁵

We must consider then that this relationship between remembering and forgetting, where there is no memory which is not impressed in the memory but rather only memories which are not retroactively tracked back to their proper organizational source, explains Francisco's difficulty with the concept of God's forgetfulness. It is Francisco himself who plays with the possibility that

²³ Mary Carruthers, "Ars Oblivionalis, Ars Inveniendi: The Cherub Figure and the Arts of Memory," *GESTA* 48 (2009).

²⁴ *Ibid*, 100.

²⁵ *Ibid*, 101.

God can forget, offering it as a darkly familiar analogy for damnation, where one is not condemned to a physically unbearable eternal suffering but rather a psychically horrifying oblivion. But with each tentative offering of this image, Francisco backtracks in an almost palpable discomfort with the suggestion that God is capable of forgetting.

The forty-second chapter of the *Abecedario*'s sixth volume progresses with a lengthy engagement with the memory arts. It is the purpose of these memory arts to "...search for the son of God so that he would not forget us."²⁶ Christ is the center of this activity, but the activity is composed of both the search for the Son of God and the objective of not forgetting him. Retention is beginning the transformative aspect of the remembrance of God, the sign that the believer holds and fully welcomes God into the memory. He continues to walk the careful line that he has established in prior discussion of memory arts,²⁷ that God does not need mnemonic devices to remember nor is God vulnerable to forgetfulness. Search and retention are the primary functions for these arts, but "even without these, he can never forget us..."²⁸ However, because Francisco describes God's memory as functioning identically to the human memory, he must repeatedly return to the question of God's forgetfulness.

Finally, this volume turns to lengthy treatment of the Gospels' most intense discussion of Christ's memory and forgetfulness, the exchange with the thieves on Calvary in Luke 23. Repeating the metaphor of remembering and forgetting with salvation and condemnation that he

²⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Volumen III, Sexta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1083. "...buscó el hijo de Dios para no poder olvidarnos."

²⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 318-324.

²⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Volumen III, Sexta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1083. "Aunque sin ella jamás nos olvidara..."

began in the third volume, he deposits the reader in the place of the criminals next to Christ.²⁹ Building on the already-furnished geographical space of Calvary, Francisco engages the memory tradition through the connection between God's memory and salvation. The criminal's plea to not be forgotten by God is a natural role in which readers can substitute themselves. He supplements the scant but evocative dialogue of Luke, begging further in the voice of the criminal, "Lord, even in this world you forget me, leaving me on the cross to suffer until death.... Do not forget me in your kingdom, leaving me out as a stranger...."³⁰ The differing contexts for forgottenness demonstrate the place of memory as a locus for reflexivity. Being forgotten in the world by God and society alike, left to die on the cross, is a cruel fate but does not invoke the terror of being forgotten by God for eternity. Describing that terror relies on an understanding of being forgotten as an apt description of condemnation, and Francisco's engagement with a late medieval understanding of the *imago dei* in the memory.

In addition to an ancient tradition of mnemotechnics, Francisco also inherited a medieval Christian understanding of the human interior faculties as created in the *imago dei*. Janet Coleman's *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* places the work of John Duns Scotus at a crucial point in the dispute between the *via antiqua* and the *via moderna* with respect to the intellect.³¹ Coleman identifies the above Augustinian formulation as

²⁹ Alan F. Westphall, "On Not Melting into Tears: Managing Meditative Reading in Michigan State University Library, MS1 and Cambridge, Magdalene College, MS Pepys 2125," *Medium Aevum* 74 (2015): 231-242 and Stephen L. Shoemaker, "Mary at the Cross, East and West: Maternal Compassion and Affective Piety in the Earliest *Life of the Virgin* and the High Middle Ages," *The Journal of Theological Studies* 62 (2011): 570-606.

³⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Volumen III, Sexta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1084. "Señor, aunque en este mundo me olvides, dexándome padecer en esta cruz hasta la muerte... no me olvides en tu reyno dexándome fuera d'el como a estraño...."

³¹ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 541-547.

the *via antiqua*. Meanwhile, an emerging neo-Aristotelian view gained popularity into the fourteenth century, particularly among the Franciscans. Mary Carruthers characterizes the neo-Aristotelian view, particularly in its thirteenth and fourteenth century reception, as one which separates the active and passive aspects of memory, where "...recollection is the active, intellectual process, distinct from the passive, receiving nature of memory."³² Reconciling the receptive and re-creative aspects of memory into unified function is the step which will provide the backbone for reflexivity within God's memory. The Franciscan Duns Scotus created a rough reconciliation between the *via antiqua* and the *via moderna*, though his work seemed to grow beyond their competing conceptions. The "agent intellect" joins two separate actions within the mind. Coleman explains that "The first is to make the potentially intelligible actually intelligible, or the potentially universal actually universal. The second is to make the potentially understood actually understood."³³ This sequence describes ability of the human thinker to have an awareness of an individual thing as something which is unique. Scotus did not believe that the mind necessarily had the ability to understand an individual thing in this way, but simultaneously recognized the need for this capacity in order for union with the face of God.³⁴ Instead, he argues that the ability to recognize an individual thing as unique within the mind is an ability which is natural to us, but one which has been compromised by the Fall.³⁵

Coleman further draws out a tension between intuition and abstract cognition. We can know, intellectually, that an object being perceived is an individual object but it is not, strictly

³² Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 20008), 79.

³³ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 489.

³⁴ *Ibid*, 488-489.

³⁵ *Ibid*, 471.

speaking, perceived that way. Rather, "...knowledge of the individual depends on the imagined species which says nothing of the presence and existence of the individual and is, rather, more universal and hence, known by abstraction."³⁶ Our limited intellect permits universalization from species but not individuation. Coleman explains, "When the intellect later remembers my past act of sensing or thinking, it cannot have present to it either these acts or the objects which are no longer present to it.... What *is* present in the act of memory is the species, effected by previous acts of perception or intellection in confrontation with their objects."³⁷ Awareness of these species and their compatibility for mental acts is crucial for an understanding of how the memory can be trained in *recogimiento* to gather mental clutter into a coherent memory of God. Furthermore, Scotus' description highlights a key distinction between the capability of human memory relative to God's memory in the former's inability to know individuals as such. This distinction also points toward the manner by which one is saved in God's memory, recognized and gathered in as an individual.

God's memory operates in the same manner as human memory, though without the burden of the Fall. Even in our fallen human memory, there is a reflexive link between the memory and the thing remembered. Therefore the objective of memory training is to conform the fallen human memory to its ideal form in God, through the reflexive memory of God. Coleman writes that "Scotus argues for a co-causality of mind and object, where the soul is really identical with (and only formally distinct from) its cognitive faculties, and this soul functions as an active but partial cause, the conceptual, mental object or species as the other partial cause."³⁸ The interaction between mind and object here is foundational for the principle of reflexivity in *recogimiento*,

³⁶ Ibid, 472.

³⁷ Ibid, 478.

³⁸ Ibid, 476.

where the *recogido* and God are both simultaneously mind and object. Scotus affirms that the mechanics of remembering involve an imprinting, facilitated by the act of perception.³⁹ This adheres to a traditional understanding of memory established from Aristotle onwards.⁴⁰ As a part of the curriculum developed by Cardinal Cisneros in his reform of Spanish spirituality during the early sixteenth century, Scotus' epistemology may have influenced Francisco de Osuna.⁴¹ Scotus' elaboration on this principle is a likely mechanical detail for the operation of memory from which Francisco was working.⁴² Memories of particular past acts are stored and then triggered by an external reminder of the event which holds a "discontinuous presence in our minds"⁴³ but which remains permanently in the form of its original perception.

Memory's highest objective, which Coleman sees as "an active, productive aspect of man's mind when man forms a concept or mental word"⁴⁴ also describes the activity of God's mind, except insofar as this action occurs sequentially in time. Coleman claims that in God's memory, as a cause, "there is no distinction between His nature, His intellectual power, and His actual knowledge."⁴⁵ We may view this as a detailed explanation of what it means to be assimilated to God in holy union through the memory of God, an assimilation initiated by an act of God's memory.⁴⁶

³⁹ Ibid, 477.

⁴⁰ Ibid, 15-33.

⁴¹ Saturnino López Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 12.

⁴² Ibid, 59.

⁴³ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 477.

⁴⁴ Ibid, 479

⁴⁵ Ibid, 480.

⁴⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 319.

Scotus' work, among other pieces, informs Francisco's view of how the memory operates from perception to organization to retrieval to understanding. Furthermore, because memory was created in God's image, that God's memory operates likewise. Believers are saved in God's memory through recollection – where the scattered and disparate memory images are gathered and reformed into something good and holy. The obscurity of ascent in Scotus' *Quodlibets* remains in doubt by Coleman, and rather she seems to hold the view that a union with God which occurs in the intellect is "... the highest moment when knowledge is actualised and expressed, and he (Scotus) draws on the Augustinian analogy whereby perfect memory in us begets our thoughts or mental words, the *verbum mentis*, by a kind of eternal speech act."⁴⁷ If this moment of actualization is inverted to demonstrate the reflexive property, then the perfect memory in the mind of God actualizes its own memory of a soul as one in union with God. In short, God recollects. Based on the frequent calls within the *Abecedario* for focused meditation on a vividly recalled scene of Christ's crucifixion,⁴⁸ an image which persists by virtue of this perfect memory, Calvary can be seen as the reflexive point between God's memory and the believer's memory.

Francisco also owes a great deal to Bonaventure's genealogy of memory in *Itinerarium mentis in Deum* for its construction as infinitely retentive, creative, and capable of identification with the divine. Bonaventure's distinction between the image and likeness of God provides a good foundation for the objective of *recogimiento*. Gregory LaNave argues that God's image is inherent to the human soul, even one without grace which remains "one substance with three powers...

⁴⁷ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 480.

⁴⁸ Advice to keep the Passion constantly as a focus of meditation in the memory is issued in: Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 321 and Francisco de Osuna, *Primera Parte del Libro Llamado Abecedario Espiritual* (Lyon, 1537), Fol. Clxxviii.

however deformed by sin, are ineluctably turned toward God.”⁴⁹ Likeness occurs in the succession of apprehending God in the soul, taking pleasure at that apprehension, and conforming the soul to that apprehension.⁵⁰

In many ways, Bonaventure exalts the capability of the human intellect even more than Francisco, but it may be reasonable to suggest that the different rhetorical objectives shaped their analysis and that Francisco’s emphasis on the trainability leads to an additional caution that Bonaventure finds unnecessary. Francisco himself credits Bonaventure’s theory of the inner sense of God, but insists on the need to distill that into a spiritual practice.⁵¹ The turn described above by LaNave is, in Francisco, an interior turn toward a likeness which is present but obscured. Francisco explains, “Although this primal knowledge of God is in the soul, we know it lies dying and buried because of sin. . . . It was replaced by our very painful occupation of investigating human affairs.”⁵² The category of “spiritual exercise” becomes a practical genre distinction when discussing the difference in Bonaventure’s work, which was formative for Francisco, and the *Tercer Abecedario*. The “painful” attention to human affairs is replaced by rigorous examination and attention to the interior self. Bonaventure acknowledges the fallen-ness of the interior faculties,⁵³ but the interior turn required to remedy this state and find the reflection of God’s image in the mind is not guided as specifically. Iliia Delio observes, “While Bonaventure uses the Augustinian notion of image to ground the essential relationship between God and human persons,

⁴⁹ Gregory LaNave, “Knowing God Through and In All Things: A Proposal for Reading Bonaventure’s *Itinerarium Mentis in Deum*,” *Franciscan Studies* 67 (2009): 278.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, 282.

⁵¹ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 106.

⁵² *Ibid.*, 103.

⁵³ Bonaventure, *Journey of the Mind into God*, trans. Simon Wickham-Smith (2005), Chp. I.1. <http://faculty.uml.edu/rinnis/45.304%20God%20and%20Philosophy/ITINERARIUM.pdf>

it is only in the explicit turning to the image through knowledge and love that the image of the eternal God in the human person is illuminated.”⁵⁴ This is part of a careful distinction that Delio describes in prepositions, where the 13th century author posits that, rather than being formed *in* God’s image, we are formed *to* God’s image.⁵⁵

The latter description of the human relationship to the *imago Dei* takes on an aspirational character, where our interior faculties, fallen though they are, can be perfected through the interior turn that conforms the believer to their true and natural state, the previously mentioned “likeness” to God. Pushing Delio’s understanding of Bonaventure’s use of *ad imaginem* further, we can see how this objective of conforming the interior self to God’s interior self applies to the eternity of the memory.⁵⁶ When we are created *ad imaginem* creation becomes an ongoing task, rather than one which is fixed in temporality. The memory is the faculty of the soul which is the most capable of reconciling God’s eternity for the temporally-bound believer.

Atemporality is therefore an objective of memory for Bonaventure. He describes the twofold task of memory in slightly different terms than we have previously discussed. Retention remains the obvious primary task, but he refers to the secondary one as *repraesentatio*.⁵⁷ The fallen memory has no difficulty, even without training, achieving its creative objective. This is visible in this word choice. Bonaventure explains this secondary task through temporality. Retention is the memory of past events, images, and ideas. The eternity of memory which was created in God’s

⁵⁴ Ilia Delio, “Theology, Spirituality and Christ the Center: Bonaventure’s Synthesis” in *A Companion to Bonaventure*, ed. Jared Goff, J.A. Wayne Hellman, Jay M. Hammond (Boston: Brill, 2013), 375.

⁵⁵ *Ibid*, 376.

⁵⁶ Louis Dupré, “Alienation and Redemption Through Time and Memory: An Essay on Religious Time Consciousness,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 43 (1975): 673-675.

⁵⁷ Bonaventure, *Journey of the Mind into God*, trans. Simon Wickham-Smith (2005), Chp. III.2. <http://faculty.uml.edu/rinnis/45.304%20God%20and%20Philosophy/ITINERARIUM.pdf>

image pushes Bonaventure to broaden the activity of the faculty in time. He explains that it also deals in the present, "... through grasping it, and what is future, through foresight."⁵⁸ These two activities tend to blur the lines between the traditional Augustinian capabilities of the soul, particularly memory and understanding,⁵⁹ but Bonaventure does not seem troubled by the potential conflation. The ascent of the mind into God is itself the increasing identity of the mind with God's own mind, perfection through union.⁶⁰ In this way the ability to emphasize the unity and coequality of these faculties is one which rightly highlights the perfected, holy mind with God.

Bonaventure continues to blur the lines between the previously-outlined temporal stages, the result of an emphasis on the eternity of the memory identified with God. Temporal information received through the senses has "... an image of eternity whose indivisible present extends throughout time."⁶¹ Apprehending this image of eternity resembles the reflexive state that we have previously observed in Francisco de Osuna's discussion of the memory of God. He observes that in the historical practice of *recogimiento*, the prophet Elias recommended "... the exercise of imagining that we are in God's presence and that he always sees us. In his presence we are to be as quiet and composed within and without as pages who stand fixed before their Lord, exceedingly attentive to his every command."⁶² Francisco frequently reminds *recogido* to understand their relationship with God in terms of geographical space, and the instruction to

⁵⁸ Ibid, III.2

⁵⁹ Augustine, *On the Trinity*, trans. Stephen McKenna (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 73-75.

⁶⁰ Bonaventure, *Journey of the Mind into God*, trans. Simon Wickham-Smith (2005), Chp. VI.7 <http://faculty.uml.edu/rinnis/45.304%20God%20and%20Philosophy/ITINERARIUM.pdf>

⁶¹ Ibid. Chp. III.2

⁶² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 326. "...este ejercicio, que es un pensar hombre que está delante de Dios y que siempre nos ve; delante del cual debíamos estar tan quietos y compuestos de dentro y de fuera como los pajes, que están delante de su señor suspensos en él y muy atentos para ver lo que manda." Trans. Mary Giles, 302.

remain still and fixed in God's sight is a natural part of this language.⁶³ Just as *recogimiento* is directed towards gathering the dispersed mind, the believer is to become a fixed subject in God's mind, facilitating God's recollection of our soul.

The occupation of God's memory requires an extremely active theological anthropology that specifically manifests in the trainability of the human mind that views union with the mind of God as both the cause of and the result of perfection by God's grace. Bonaventure writes, "And so it appears, through the activity of the memory, that the soul itself is the image and likeness of God, to the extent that it is present to itself and has presence within Him - because it seizes Him by act and by power, being capable and able to take part in Him."⁶⁴ The act of "seizing" here is something which is of particular interest for an author of spiritual exercises like Francisco, and it supports the second part of the reflexive memory. Bonaventure is identifying an action within the memory which is accessing something eternal and is therefore eternally present. However, this eternally present "presence" of the *imago Dei* has an additionally active, temporally conditioned consequence - the capability to "take part" in the Divine. *Itinerarium* is not a work of spiritual exercises, so we must turn to the Francisco's elaboration on precisely how this seizing and participating in the eternality of God within the memory is achieved in the habit of *recogimiento*.

For the most part, the *Itinerarium* does not aim to describe of the passivity of the mind's union with God but rather concentrates on the activity of "seizing" God. However, contemplation of the Passion is an actively pursued spiritual process, and Bonaventure describes an *ekphrastic* contemplation that places the believer in a series of events, reaching back temporally within the

⁶³ Ibid, 276-278.

⁶⁴ Bonaventure, *Journey of the Mind into God*, trans. Simon Wickham-Smith (2005), Chp. III.2 <http://faculty.uml.edu/rinnis/45.304%20God%20and%20Philosophy/ITINERARIUM.pdf>

memory to create a landscape in the mind. Bonaventure suggests the link between remembrance of various scriptural scenes, with an emphasis on the Passion, and the believer occupying these spaces with Christ. He writes:

*“Whoever looks directly at the Propitiatory, looks directly at Him who hangs upon the Cross, with faith, hope and love, with devotion, wonder, exultation, thankfulness, praise and joy, experiences with Him the Passover, that is the transcendence, passes over the Red Sea through the beams of the Cross, enters the desert from Egypt, tastes the hidden manna, and rests together with Christ on the burial mound as though outwardly dead - sensing, nonetheless, so far as it may be possible within their present situation, what was said to the thief hanging alongside Christ on the cross: Today you will be with me in Paradise.”*⁶⁵

This tour through salvation history in the mind of the believer is inclined towards a reflexive occupation of the mind of God, the promise to the thief next to the crucified Christ. What is fascinating about Bonaventure’s account is the degree to which he believes God’s eternity can be accessed in the memory. The bulk of humanity’s relationship with God occurs in seamless millenia-long leaps within the mind of a believer simply contemplating Christ’s suffering and death. Consider this apparent access in contrast to the tenth book of *Confessions*, as Augustine describes God’s dwelling in the memory in terms of a frustrating unavailability of God as image, affection, or the mind itself.⁶⁶ Francisco pairs Augustine’s frustration with Bonaventure’s awareness of God’s endless accessibility in the infinity of time in exercise of *recogimiento*, as a

⁶⁵ Ibid. Chp. 7.2

⁶⁶ Augustine of Hippo, *Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 200-201.

ceaseless search for God in the memory. The practice is directed toward persistent, controlled presence of God in the memory as Francisco advises, “Loving him in this manner, we will easily hold him in our memories, for close friendship will make memory of him take root and flourish in our hearts....”⁶⁷ God’s availability in the believer’s memory is transformative and therefore reflexive. The trained ability to hold God in the memory will manifest as simultaneous availability for God’s memory, wherein, “...we can offer him all our works inscribed with his name, remembering him through them, performing them out of love for him, and offering them to him as the fruit born from the root of his holy memory.”⁶⁸ The believer whose works are transformed into works of love for God is made memorable to God, placing himself within God’s eternal memory.

While all the pieces of creation, even in their diversity, “never are forgotten,”⁶⁹ Francisco does make reference to some organizing principle within the mind of God. Nothing dies in the mind of God because “it would not perish in God’s memory where all things are recorded and comprehended in such a way that the angels can read as if from a perfect book what God wishes them to know.”⁷⁰ The application of this organizational principle of the perfectly written book to God’s memory is another, deeper step in demonstrating that unity with God is something which occurs through the direct identification of the interior faculties with the same faculties within

⁶⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 327. “...y de esta maner será cosa fácil de tenerlo siempre en la memoria, porque la estrecha amistad hará que so memoria se arraigue y prenda en nuestro corazón....” Trans. Mary Giles, 304.

⁶⁸ Ibid, 327. “...también le ofrezcamos e intitulemos todas nuestras obras, teniendo en ellas de él memoria y haciéndolas por su amor y ofreciéndoselas como fruta que de la raíz, que es su santa memoria, procede.” Trans. Mary Giles, 304.

⁶⁹ Ibid, 319. “...nunca jamás olivándose....” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

⁷⁰ Ibid, 319. “...mas siempre están en ella todas la cosas registradas y muy conocidas según son, para que allí como en perfecto libro de la vida lean los ángeles lo que Dios quiere que sepan.” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

God's own mind. The very application of the known memory metaphor of a book to God's memory serves to connect the human faculty of memory to its creator's, but the choice of a metaphor that depends on deliberate composition is important as well. Carruthers describes the use of the book as a memory metaphor in the context of medieval composition, which is less an instant and creative act and more of a way of organizing previously known concepts.⁷¹

Being forgotten before God is therefore something which occurs through God's activity, an abandonment, just as souls who are remembered by God are committed to the perfect book and are united with the mind of God. He explains, "In that book alone the essence of individual people is found and there they are immortal, participating in the immortality possessed only by God."⁷² Scholars on memory have taken a circumspect approach to the relationships between the written word and mnemotechnics,⁷³ but we may also understand it as Francisco's desire to enlist the same metaphor for the mind of God as he previously did for the human mind.⁷⁴ His elaboration demonstrates the identification to which *recogido* must aspire, "participating in immortality," and in doing so additionally gives the reader the most explicit recognition of the ideal, reflexive relationship of the interior faculties and God's own faculties. The believer is called to create a full and identical union with God through the practice of *recogimiento*. As Francisco explains, "O man, you who are the image of God, do not be so forgetful as to seem an image fashioned in reverse of

⁷¹ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 240.

⁷² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 319. "En aquel solo libro se halla ciencia de los individuos, porque allí son inmortales, participando de la inmortalidad que solo Dios tiene...." Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

⁷³ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 9-10.

⁷⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 318.

what you represent, for if all things live in God and if in you they perish, then surely you are the opposite of him.”⁷⁵ Keeping and holding God in the memory fosters identification and union with God. Language about the reflective image of God is important here to highlight the immediacy of the union. The reflection of God, where our memory which holds God in an accessible interior, is contrasted with an opposite of God, which does not hold anything within the memory. This is the principle of reflexivity in its most distilled form in Francisco’s *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* and it informs the reader of the most basic movement of the *recogido*. This movement is not strictly directional toward God, but, rather, one in which the believer actively conforms himself to receive passively God and to reflect that grace in the interior faculties.

Recreation of a contemplative scene is emblematic of a movement traced by Coleman through Anselm and Bernard that moves from simple training in the monastic context to recalling scripture to rebuilding the memory scripturally.⁷⁶ The memory’s receptive power is matched only by its corresponding ability to re-assemble its contents and recreate worlds from them, and these two writers intended to aid their readers in re-creating the world according to the revealed world of the Gospels. The *Abecedario* focuses on instruction in the prayerful life, and thus largely avoids detailed description of the Passion. However, it does include frequent reference to the crucified savior. These discussions move quickly past gory description and straight toward tropological reading. For example, Francisco reminds the reader that “...Christ is the lantern that lights our road to heaven. The cold and ice of severe persecution the Lord suffered was meant to preserve

⁷⁵ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), “...!oh hombre que eres imagen de Dios!, tan olvidadizo que parezcas imagen contrahecha y muy al revés de aquello que representa; porque si en Dios todas las cosas viven y en ti todas las cosas mueren, seréis muy contrarios.” Trans. Mary Giles, 295.

⁷⁶ Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 155-192.

justice and virtue and to ensure that there would be no delays along the road.”⁷⁷ Francisco’s characterization of Christ’s physical suffering has the power to “*alumbrar*” the spiritual progress of the *recogido*. This capability is a noteworthy divergence from the “radical” theocentrism of *dejamiento* that tended to overshadow Christ’s humanity.⁷⁸ Francisco’s hesitation to provide vivid description of Christ’s injuries serves a different purpose. Eric Jager demonstrates that the absence of specific detail acts as a prompt for the believer to personalize these visual metaphors. In his excavation of the trope of the heart as a book, he explains that it, “... symbolically unified the individual with Christ through a ‘transcription’ of the sacred wounds to an inward, individual ‘copy’ of the Passion. As such, the book of the heart embodied an *imitatio Christi* that was no longer limited to a saintly elite but that everyone could aspire to.”⁷⁹ In the eleventh treatise of the *Tercer Abecedario*, Francisco predictably affirms the importance of meditation on the Passion, but invokes it as a necessary daily practice with an implicitly personalized content.⁸⁰ The result is an invitation for each *recogido* to construct his own *ekphrasis*, where the deliberate construction of a vivid image simultaneously reforms the mind imagining it.⁸¹

Francisco frequently uses the recapitulative quality of scripture to demonstrate the way that Christ can be connected through previously unrelated notions in the memory. In his seventeenth

⁷⁷ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 462. “...De manera que Christo también es antorcha para alumbrar el camino del cielo. Padeció el Señor el frío y el hielo de las grandes persecuciones por guardar la justicia y virtud; y por no torcer el camino y por llevarlo muy derecho para que fuse más breve...” Trans. Mary Giles, 455.

⁷⁸ Jose Nieto, *Juan de Valdes and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation*, (Genève: Librairie Droz, 1970), 69.

⁷⁹ Eric Jager, *The Book of the Heart* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 108.

⁸⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 318-324.

⁸¹ Simon Goldhill, “Ekphrasis Introduction: Eight Ways of Looking at Ekphrasis,” *Classical Philology* 102 (2007), 3.

treatise, he discusses the need to follow Christ's humanity with one's body and His divinity with the soul and, to this end, embeds an allegorical reading of Eliseus' transformation of the bitter water in 4 Kings within Christ's suffering on the Cross, which abrogated human suffering, and then surrounded both with Exodus 15:25, "...where it says that the children of Israel could not drink the waters of Mara because of the bitterness until they threw in a piece of wood to sweeten them."⁸² Surrounding this analysis, then, is a reminder that Christ referred to himself as "green wood" in Luke 23:31.⁸³ The result is a matryoshka doll of scriptural units, each nested within another and pointing towards the same result of Christ's transformative sacrifice on the cross. This dynamic mimes the inter-connectedness of a memory organized around its proper principle. Christ's Passion serves as the principle which organizes and directs disparate impressions in the memory. Taking the Passion as the focus of the recollected mind, however, is not a matter of momentary cognition, but of trained practice through regular, silent prayer.

In his treatise exhorting readers to "Pray before sleep, and return to it immediately afterward"⁸⁴ Francisco goes into depth regarding the importance of silent prayer. The Scriptural progress towards Christ's sacrifice is supposed to be recapitulated in prayer, and standing at the end of the "devout stories and mysteries"⁸⁵ that the believer must hold in the memory is the story of Christ's passion. The Passion's centrality is consistent with Franciscan spirituality as it was articulated in Francis of Assisi's *Christomimesis* and Bonaventure's insistence that "... the passion is the complete expression of the mystery of kenotic love by which God empties himself

⁸² Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 463. "...donde se dice que los hijos de Israel no podían beber las aguas de Marad por ser muy amargas, hasta que fue lanzado un madero en ellas que las tornó dulces." Trans. Mary Giles, 456.

⁸³ *Ibid*, 463.

⁸⁴ *Ibid*, 356. "Oracion antes del sueno ten, y despues torna presto" Trans. Mary Giles, 337

⁸⁵ *Ibid*, 363. "las historias devotas y misterios del Señor..." Trans. Mary Giles, 346.

into human poverty ... in order to open access to the *fontalis plenitudo* of God's own life."⁸⁶ The eternal productivity of God is expressed in time as the life and death of Christ.⁸⁷ Taking the Passion into the memory as a focal point of prayer permits a *recogido* to orient all productive memories towards God as creator and Christ as savior and, therefore, to draw the soul closer to God.

By analyzing Francisco's many discussion about the various dimensions of Christ's Passion, we can see how the specific activity of the memory guides the practice of *recogimiento* towards God. The Passion becomes a guide to his discussion of the tension between the exterior and the interior, Christ's sacrifice and our fallen body, a site for the spatial metaphor, an exhortation to receive the Eucharist, tears and the affections of Christ's followers, and love in the human will. Francisco agrees that "... the most fruitful thoughts that we can entertain are of the sacred passion...."⁸⁸ though he also concedes, continuing the metaphor of the memory as a digestive organ, that some dietary diversity is advisable for the prospectively recollected.⁸⁹ There is another implicit hierarchy in the skills of potential *recogidos* here, as he concedes that trying to manipulate a grand diversity of meditations on holy scenes is not necessarily within the grasp of the "beginners or dull-witted."⁹⁰ *Recogimiento* has heretofore been characterized as a daily habit rather than an ascent, so there is some tension in describing levels of interior achievement, but Francisco's religious background offers an understanding of different

⁸⁶ Bernard McGinn, *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism – 1200-1350* (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1998), 100.

⁸⁷ Zachary Hayes, "Bonaventure's Trinitarian Theology: Historical Orientation of the Trinitarian Perspectives of St. Augustine and St. Richard of Victor" in *A Companion to Bonaventure*, ed. Jared Goff, J.A. Wayne Hellman, and Jay M. Hammond (Boston: Brill, 2013), 241-242.

⁸⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 363. "...los más fructuosos pensamientos que el hombre puede tener son los de la sagrada pasión...." Trans. Mary Giles, 346.

⁸⁹ *Ibid*, 363.

⁹⁰ *Ibid*, 363. "...no parezca convener a los principiantes ni a los idiotas...." Trans. Mary Giles, 346.

levels of spiritual advancement while still insisting on viewing the practice as more of daily cultivation.

A relationship between the exterior and the interior is cultivated further in the sixth volume of the *Abecedario*. The reader can see Francisco attaching meditations to specific spots on Christ's crucified body while simultaneously making use of the more traditional architectural mnemonic of the memory mansion.⁹¹ The body of Christ becomes a site on which the reader can attach specific theological points for memorization and therefore for future spiritual edification. This adaptation of Eric Jager's discussion of the late medieval development of "the believer's own [heart] inscribed with the story of Christ's suffering"⁹² emphasizes the link between Christ's exterior and our interior state, but the spatial metaphor means the believer's imagined presence at site of the crucified Christ further links the believer's interior with Christ's own interior through the faculty of memory.

Francisco attempts to reconcile further the dual parts of the human self in his seventeenth treatise of *Tercer Abecedario* through the moral exemplar of Christ's wounded body. He recognizes that the body will often lag far behind the soul in the ascent to God. Sadly for believers who struggle with physical purity, there is no shortcut but only greater exhortation. Francisco disposes of the possibility of light encouragement for the body to keep up, explaining, "We will have to goad this lazy body, while the soul wishes to be implored as if a grand lady."⁹³ From the perspective of the aspiring *recogido*, the former, more earthly push is what will place him in the

⁹¹ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI Volumen III*, ed. Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1146-1148.

⁹² Eric Jager, *The Book of the Heart* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 108.

⁹³ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 471. "... a palos hemos de llevar este nuestro cuerpo harón, mas nuestra anima, como es grande señora..." trans. Mary Giles, p. 469.

memory of God in direct correspondence to God's place in his memory. The metaphor of pursuit is what joins these two in this section, without the aerial display of the soul in aspiration of God, there is nothing to goad our lazy bodies toward. The sweet taste of "spiritual things"⁹⁴ is not supposed to signify an end to the "penitence and hardship"⁹⁵ but to rather be joined to it as a reversible cause and effect which continues in perpetuity. Here, we can see the fruit of Francisco's reluctance to characterize *recogimiento* as a stable and knowable spiritual trajectory. It is a daily habit of aspiration to proximity to God, a distance which can be reduced asymptotically and infinitely.

The daily fact of spiritual temptation, or even the more ambiguous presence of spiritual distraction in the sensory flood of the created world is what spurs this characterization. In the twentieth treatise, Francisco urges his reader to suffer through temptation and strive to outlast it. He takes the fairly intuitive act of pointing to both the temptation of Christ prior to his return to Jerusalem as well as Christ's suffering on the Cross.⁹⁶

A passage in the twentieth treatise of the *Tercer Abecedario* begins with a somewhat eccentric reading of Augustine's *City of God*, positing the Christian as the builder in this divine city and pushing that metaphor towards a similarly characterized discussion of the placement and quality of the building materials.⁹⁷ Intentionally or not, this backs into the same understanding of the human soul which is posited in ancient and medieval mnemotechnics, that of a building which is constructed carefully and furnished interiorly. Even in his elaboration, he discusses the construction of this edifice as though preserving the interior space from the harm of clutter and

⁹⁴ Ibid, 475. "las cosas spiritual," trans. Mary Giles, 469.

⁹⁵ Ibid, 475. "las penitencias y asperezas," trans. Mary Giles, 469.

⁹⁶ Ibid, 457-470.

⁹⁷ Ibid, 516-517.

distraction was the primary goal. He writes, “Here the living stones of the temple are hewed so that there the sound of neither hammer nor saw nor any other instrument of suffering will disquiet us.”⁹⁸ With the interior safely insulated from surrounding disaster, he begins to furnish this space in ways which safely place Christ in recognizable, and therefore organized and easily retrievable, places in the interior. He writes, “The stone on the portal should be more worked so as to appear more beautiful; because Christ became the new gate to heaven, which previously had been closed, he wished to be hit and hammered repeatedly by living in the earth of his sacred Humanity that was to receive the blows.”⁹⁹ Furthermore, the portal therefore represents a place in which souls should not hope to approach unless their state is one of harmony with the suffering Christ. The way in which this harmony achieved is the “goading” of our lazy bodies towards pursuit of something higher, with the easily anticipated unpleasant answer of physical and spiritual suffering. This is a direct correspondence which Francisco is happy to bring out, observing that in contrasts to Christ’s suffering which brought him nothing personally, “everything we suffer brings us new grace....”¹⁰⁰

Francisco assigns to the crucified Christ’s right foot “trampling hell, releasing the miserable from punishment.”¹⁰¹ Attaching a specific soteriological goal to part of Christ’s crucified

⁹⁸ Ibid, 517. “... porque acá se labran las piedras vivas del temple, en manera que allá no se oirá martillo ni sierra ni otra herramienta alguna de pasión que nos desasosiegue...” Trans. Mary Giles, 516.

⁹⁹ Ibid, 517. “...y la piedra de la portada suele ser más picada para salga más linda, y porque Cristo se hacía nueva porta del cielo, que hasta Él estuvo cerrado, quiso ser muy golpeado y martillado viviendo en la tierra de su santa humanidad, que recibía los golpes.” Trans. Mary Giles, 516.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid, 517. “porque antes que padeciese cosa del mundo fuel leno de gracia.” Trans. Mary Giles, 516.

¹⁰¹ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI Volumen III*, ed. Mariano Quirós García (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1146. “Hollando con el pie Christo los infiernos, soltó de la pena los miseros.”

body represents a knowing nod to the relevance of specific spatial description in the architectural mnemonic. Furthermore, it uses as the foundation the vivid imagery already provided for the reader in the form of a lifetime of education by the Church in the matter of Christ's Passion.¹⁰² The meditative material designed to spark the reader's memory of Christ's victory over hell has been available to sixteenth century readers prior to their engagement of Francisco's work. It was the explicit content of their religious instruction.¹⁰³ What makes this particular adaptation of the architectural mnemonic fascinating is that it invites the reader into a reflexive relationship with the memory of God. Freighted with a sixteenth century reader's assumed image of the crucified Christ is a fuller scene of the crucifixion as a whole. Calvary is, in this sense, an architectural mnemonic for the trainable, artificial memory of God, and our gaze upon his wounded body has the reflexive effect of placing us within God's memory as well.

Though all of scripture points towards the reader toward Christ's sacrifice, occupying the scene of the Passion in the mind is more likely to be spiritually fruitful for the advanced. Because advancement in *recogimiento* cultivates the interior faculties, the habit and consequent spiritual perfection are self-fulfilling. This growth occurs in the interior faculties. Francisco acknowledges the principle of reflexivity in the activity of love as well, observing that "...it is a condition of love that we spend some time thinking about the beloved."¹⁰⁴ He rounds out his analysis with a reminder that all of these practitioners are "obliged" to receive the sacraments and so meditation is supplementary and mutually buttressing with the sacraments, ordered toward interior and

¹⁰² Peter Parshall. "The Art of Memory and the Passion," *The Art Bulletin* 81 (1999): 458-462.

¹⁰³ Eric Jager, *The Book of the Heart* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), 122-124.

¹⁰⁴ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 363-4. "...porque condición es del amor pensar algún tiempo en el amado...." Trans. Mary Giles, 346.

exterior preparation to receive God's grace.¹⁰⁵ Beyond a simple aside, this warns prospective *recogidos* that the cultivation of the interior state is intended to cooperate with the sacramental life in the visible church. As suggested previously, this caution should be read against the anti-sacramental stance of the *dejados*.

The recollected believer who has trained his memory toward God does so through the use of the architectural metaphor, creating mental images out of knowledge of the created world and turning them collectively toward God.¹⁰⁶ Meditation on the Passion is asserted as the most effective means of uniting the memory with God's salvific grace,¹⁰⁷ but doing so has the dual effect of making the believer themselves a memory image in the artificial memory of God.¹⁰⁸ As spectators for the crucified Lord on Calvary, the believer perfecting their artificial memory has deposited themselves in a known, vivid, geographically specific scene in the memory of God. The use of memory images to recall the divine makes the remembered a memory image themselves. If the *imago Dei* can be fully extended to the mental faculties in their specifics, and God does indeed possess the same trainable memory as Francisco's readers, the meditation on Christ's passion - both in recollection of Christ's wounded body and the landscape of Christ's suffering and death on the cross - has a unified purpose for both memories which is reached in the simultaneous reflexivity of the human memory and the memory of God.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, 364.

¹⁰⁶ Ekphrastic reconstructions of physical spaces for the purpose of the famous architectural mnemonic are sometimes called "collectionist ekphrases" and were apparently common in early modern Spanish literature. See: Frederick A. DeArmas, "Simple Magic: Ekphrasis from Antiquity to the Age of Cervantes" in *Ekphrasis in the Age of Cervantes*, Frederick Alfred DeArmas (Cranbury, NJ: Rosemont Publishing, 2005), 23. The descriptive technique during this period in Spain is given further discussion in Elizabeth B. Bearden, *The Emblematics of the Self: Ekphrasis and Identity in Renaissance Imitations of Greek Romance* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012), 100-127.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid, 481-485.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid, 484.

Furthermore, there is a telling analogy between holding the Passion in the memory and consuming the body of Christ during the Eucharist. This passage is attributed in the text to Bernard of Clairvaux¹⁰⁹ and indicates that the practice of holding in the memory “more thoughtfully the blessings of his passion and redemption at least once during the day” is the same as “to eat spiritually of the body of Christ and drink of his blood in remembrance of him.”¹¹⁰ This instruction is elaborated as a practice of the monks of Mont-Dieu, who spent at least one hour each day meditating on the Passion.¹¹¹

The daily requirement is necessitated by the inescapability of mental debris created by the exterior world and the constant threat of restlessness in the mind. As a habit, it also forms a connection between the interior and exterior states, blurring the category of “interior spirituality.” In the seventeenth treatise, another one devoted to the simultaneous development of our interior and exterior selves, Francisco laments the difficulty that many believers have following the road that Christ laid out for them. We are instructed to not just follow Christ as Peter did, in the easier times only “when he sees him taken prisoner, he flees, forsaking his Lord whom he had promised to follow until he himself were seized....”¹¹² Obviously, this is an imperfect relationship with Christ. Francisco elaborates that, though joy in Christ’s redemption is a necessary part of our transformation where, “like the bride, we invite him to the flowering, delectable field of interior

¹⁰⁹ The citation is corrected in the modern critical edition as the work of William de St. Thierry’s *Monte de Dios*. Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), fn. 286.

¹¹⁰ Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 321. “a los menos alguna hora del día, recoger más atentamente los beneficios de su pasión y redención para gozar de ello suavemente en su conciencia, y fielmente en su memoria guardarlo, lo cual es en espíritu comer el cuerpo de Cristo y beber su sangre en su memoria, según Él lo mandó.” Trans. Mary Giles, p. 297.

¹¹¹ *Ibid*, 321.

¹¹² *Ibid*, 458. “...y desde que lo ve preso, echa a huir y deja al Señor, que había prometido de seguir hasta ser con él preso si menester fuse.” Trans. Mary Giles, 450-451.

pleasure....”¹¹³ This invitation is won by following Christ similarly “into some wooded, thorny area....”¹¹⁴ Even beyond scriptural scenes, Francisco pushes his readers to occupy specific geographic spaces with Christ.

Francisco does treat the Passion heavily and in specific and evocative language in the *Primera Parte* of the *Abecedario Espiritual*, published in 1528, just one year after the *Tercer Abecedario*.¹¹⁵ His favorite method is to entice readers into an affective connection with Christ’s followers as they follow his journey from his entry into Jerusalem to the Crucifixion. The path to heaven is the same as Christ’s path with the cross,¹¹⁶ and Francisco invites readers to accompany him by prayerfully contemplating the emotional state of Christ and his followers. He fixes the reader to Mary affectively as he writes that readers are “...admonished to place your heart on the cross with her (Mary’s) son and on the path of the Passion which the Virgin walked together with her son.”¹¹⁷ The reader mentally walks the most commonly known geographic space in Christian history and simultaneously identifies emotionally with Christ’s grieving mother. Tears, particularly in the first volume of the *Abecedario*, surround the reader with emotions that heighten the identification with Christ in the memory along with the generously distributed spatial mnemonics along the path of the Passion. Francisco establishes the link between tears and the memory in the tenth treatise of this volume, claiming simply, “Tears are not forgotten.”¹¹⁸ Christ’s

¹¹³ Ibid, 458. “...como la esposa para ir al campo florido y deleitoso del gozo interior....” Trans. Mary Giles, 451.

¹¹⁴ Ibid, 458. “en algún bosque y espinas....” Trans. Mary Giles, 451.

¹¹⁵ Saturnino Lopéz Santidrián, introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), 27.

¹¹⁶ Francisco de Osuna, *Primera Parte del libro llamado Abecedario Espiritual* (Burgos, 1537), fol. clxii

¹¹⁷ Ibid, fol. Clxii. “...amonestarle q ponga su coraçon en la cruz con su hijo y en la via de las passion por las quales la virgen avia caminando juntamente con su hijo.”

¹¹⁸ Ibid, fol. Lxvi. “Las lagrimas no se olviden.”

agony in the Garden is provided as a geographic site for the *recogido* to occupy in the memory and weep along with Christ. Weeping has the interior effect of softening the soul for God's presence: "My spirit is melted talking about my beloved."¹¹⁹ Francisco uses similar language here to the common memory metaphor of an image being impressed in wax. The soul is open and vulnerable to God's love. This vulnerability leads Francisco to outline a series of successive levels of tears wherein further impressions have active manifestations in the believer, such as increased study of Scripture and tears devoted to thanksgiving.¹²⁰ The causal relationship between interior emotions and exterior activities demonstrating and heightening devotion to God is provoked within the memory, through meditation on geographically specific scenes during Christ's Passion and carefully led identifications between the readers and followers such as the Virgin Mary and the women at the tomb.

His later analyses are devoted to the idea that pursuit of purity and spiritual perfection are not, as some unnamed back-biters would have us believe,¹²¹ conflicting ideals and are rather two objectives which dovetail in search of union with the divine. Resorting again to the metaphor of flight, he explains, "Those who fly and run go unfailingly, for though the perfect may have their conversation in the contemplative life that is in heaven, they are not impeded by the active life

¹¹⁹ Ibid, fol. Lxvi. "Mi anima est derretida hablando mi amado."

¹²⁰ Ibid, fol. Lxvi.

¹²¹ The seventeenth treatise of the *Tercer Abecedario* is marked by two separate references to the *dejado* rejection of any notion of exterior spirituality in their ascent and what Francisco understands as the related belief that human ability has no role in this ascent. See: Francisco de Osuna, *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*, ed. Saturnino López Santidrián (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2005), p. 475. "Y más se ha de presuponer que ninguno en la vida presente de los puros viadores alcanzó tal grado de perfección que dijese no poderse alcanzar mayor." And Ibid, p. 477: "Hay algunos que se dicen ser espirituales tan engañados en esto, que totalmente se apartan y huyen de los que les amonestan pobreza y aspereza...."

they lead on earth.”¹²² The two initially disparate objectives of exterior holiness and interior transformation in the likeness of God parallel the reflexive turn within the memory that Francisco builds through the *Abecedario Espiritual*. The development of *recogimiento* as a spirituality which is mystical in its pursuit of a union with the divine but not characterized as an ascent culminating in a crowning moment of contact with God and rather, as a daily habit of spiritual perfection requires the reflexivity of the human memory and God’s memory because of our lasting engagement with the world. Union with the divine is not a moment in time but rather occurs through the faculty which is most appropriately conditioned to work within the infinitude of God outside of time, the memory. The resulting re-creation placed God at the center of these infinite memory images and, identically, placed the believer growing in holiness at the center of God’s own memory.

The recollected believer who has turned their trainable memory toward God frequently does so through the use of the architectural or geographic metaphor, creating specific, spatial mental images out of knowledge of the created world and turning within them toward God. Meditation on the Passion is asserted as the most effective means of uniting the memory with God’s grace,¹²³ but doing so has the dual effect of making the believer themselves a stone in the mansion of God’s memory where “No stone will be set in the edifice of the celestial building that is constituted of holy souls if it does not harmonize with the stone of the portal, which is Christ.”¹²⁴ In mentally becoming spectators and participants in Christ’s Passion, the believer perfects his

¹²² Ibid, 595. “Aquestos tales con volar y corer andan y no desfallecen porque los perfectos varones no son impedidos de la vida active que anda por la tierra...” Trans. Mary Giles, 605.

¹²³ Ibid, 382.

¹²⁴ Ibid, 517. “... ca ninguna piedra será asentada en el cuerpo del edificio celestial, que se hace de almas santas, si no tuviere alguna conformidad con la piedra de la portada, que es Cristo.....” Trans. Mary Giles, 516.

trainable memory and simultaneously is deposited in a known, vivid, geographically specific scene in the memory of God. The use of memory images to recall the divine makes the remembered a memory image themselves.¹²⁵ If the *imago Dei* can be fully extended to the mental faculties in their specifics, and God does indeed possess the same trainable memory as Francisco's readers, meditation on Christ's Passion - both in recollection of Christ's wounded body and the landscape of Christ's suffering and death on the cross - has a unified purpose for both memories which is reached in the simultaneous reflexivity of the human memory and the memory of God.

In contrast to Hugh of St. Victor's famous work of architectural mnemotechnics, *A Little Book About Constructing Noah's Ark*, which accepts the construction of the architectural mnemonic more explicitly by carefully inscribing Christ's name, letter by letter, at various memorable points on the wooden ark,¹²⁶ Francisco provides conventional methods to occupy the memory of God spatially. In the sixty-third chapter of the *Sexta Parte del Abecedario Espiritual*, Francisco treats his readers to an allegorical interpretation of the wounds of Christ which posit those wounds as mnemonic sites and encourage readers to attach spiritual understandings to those injuries which can persist in an organized form within the memory. For Hugh, meaning is hewn together from these disparate letters just as the ark is from pieces of wood. He writes, "Then the cubit is finished, and, if you ask what this means, what else could this picture say to you, if not that Christ is the Beginning and the End, the Bearer of the Old Law and of the New?"¹²⁷ Francisco

¹²⁵ For a discussion of the dependence of ekphrasis on the processes of memory, particularly with respect to temporality within ekphrastic reconstructions, see: Claire Barbetti, *Ekphrastic Medieval Visions: A New Discussion in Interarts Theory* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011).

¹²⁶ Hugh of St. Victor, "A Little Book About Constructing Noah's Ark" in *The Medieval Craft of Memory*, ed. Mary Carruthers (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), 41-70.

¹²⁷ *Ibid*, 46-47.

applies a much more visually striking opportunity for spiritual proximity to Christ, in the form of his conversation with the criminals being crucified with him.

Discussion of Christ's passion during the sixth volume of the *Abecedario* begins with an observation that the act of love originates in the will, and that therefore there are two types of love.¹²⁸ Analysis then focuses on the selflessness of divine love, which does not motivate works which are performed in public for pious recognition, but rather the ones which are performed selflessly. This "work commanded by interior love"¹²⁹ is recognized by a recollected believer as divine in origin. His choice of the word "mandado" is compelling her because it recognizes that an interior state binds the believer to the life of love.

The highest example of this selfless act of love is, obviously, Christ's redemptive sacrifice on the cross. That a Franciscan would choose to focus on the wounds of Christ as symbolic of this perfect love is not particularly surprising, but Francisco's focus on how these wounds are transformative is worthy of further investigation.¹³⁰ He writes, "...look at what I have sculpted with my hands. With nails, we have been sculpted and carved in the hands of Jesus Christ, as shown by the glorious wounds that he has there."¹³¹ In this sense, Christ's sacrifice is the full

¹²⁸ Francisco de Osuna, *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Volumen III, Sexta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 1082.

¹²⁹ Ibid, 1082. "obra por mandado de los amores de dentro"

¹³⁰ On the topic of intense visual imaginations of the passion and Christ's suffering for the purpose of installing ourselves in the geographic memory of God, we must consider the accepted scholarship of Mariano Quirós García on the unity of the six alphabets in Mariano Quirós García, *Volumen I: Estudio Introductorio* (Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Espanola Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca, 2002), 45-52. Because of the focus in the third alphabet on the habit of contemplation and prayer, we may read a later discussion of Christ's suffering in detail into references in the third alphabet to that event.

¹³¹ Ibid, 1082. "...mira que en mis manos te tengo esculpido. Con clavos fuésemos esculpidos y entretallados en las manos de Jesuchristo según lo muestran las llagas gloriosas que allí tiene"

content of our transformation. The believer is written on Christ's wounded body with the nails used to crucify him.

Francisco fills his work in the *Abecedario* with reminders of the way in which the *recogido* can place himself within the reflexive memory of God. The startling possibility of being forgotten in God's memory operates as a reminder that our own interior faculties are created in God's image and therefore share their function. The process of placing God in our own memory is simultaneously the process of placing ourselves in God's own memory, saved for eternity. The site of this reflexive memory is the extensively described geography of Christ's Passion. The events occurring over the final days of Christ's life offer rich fruit for Francisco to graft *recogimiento* onto the ancient memory arts, primarily through the use of the spatial or geographic mnemonic.

CONCLUSION

In *The Book of Memory*, Mary Carruthers tracks the function and training of memory from ancient discussion through the Middle Ages, with increasing emphasis on its role in prayer and meditation. Her analysis concludes centuries before Cardinal Cisneros' humanist reform and Francisco de Osuna's development of *recogimiento*. However, the tradition that Carruthers describes as her analysis moves toward the end of the Middle Ages is one directed toward the laity that weds intentionally crafted memory images to specific meditational objectives.¹ The growing desire for experiential spirituality in the sixteenth century benefitted from this tradition of using the well-trained memory in the service of interior prayer.

Recogimiento makes particularly heavy use of the tradition of memory training described by Carruthers and Janet Coleman,² and its exposition of memory's reflexivity creates a radical new direction for this faculty. Francisco's memory goes beyond recollective meditation and makes the trained memory of the believer a site for union with God's own memory.

This tradition is carried on beyond Francisco's own career. It is worthwhile to take note of the continuing interest in the Spanish tradition of spiritual exercises and descriptions of the union with God in terms of the use of the faculties of the soul. A primary example would be the vividly reconstructed meditative scenes of Francisco's contemporary, Ignatius of Loyola's writing.

Though Ignatius' instructions feature less specific discussion of the memory, the crafting vivid mental images, *ekphrasis*, is an essential part of the Spiritual Exercises. For instance, in the contemplation on the Nativity, practitioners are told to visualize the road to Bethlehem and the

¹ Mary Carruthers, *The Book of Memory* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 227-229.

² Janet Coleman, *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

accompanying landscape in specific, itemized detail.³ This parallels Francisco's own ekphrastic reconstruction of the road to Calvary, placing the *recogido* in the same remembered geographic space as Christ and, therefore, within God's own memory. The most famous example of *ekphrasis* in Ignatius' *Spiritual Exercises* is his intense visual description of Satan's army lined up on a battlefield.⁴ However, the incendiary language and the clamorous battlefield setting do not mean that the treacherous subtlety of the father of lies was somehow lost on Ignatius. In fact, the visual characterization of Satan's menace and the unmistakable military objectives against his forces were enlisted by Ignatius in the service of struggle against the very quality of subtlety in the devil. He explains, "Here it will be to ask for insight into the deceits of the evil leader and for help to guard myself against them...."⁵

Remembering Paul's admonishment in the second letter to the Corinthians that the devil is often disguised as an angel of light,⁶ a caution on the discernment of spirits that had a long history in the Christian tradition,⁷ Ignatius seeks to use the genre of the spiritual exercise to give readers the chance to grow their own courage against evil.⁸ The implicit trust in the teaching authority of the church to aid in this discernment process appeals to the same activity that is at work in Francisco's spirituality, where the engaged, trained mind has a role in the relationship with the

³ Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises" in *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, ed. George E. Ganss (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1991), 150.

⁴ *Ibid.*, 155.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 155.

⁶ 2 Corinthians 11:14.

⁷ Heiko Oberman, "Some Notes on the Theology of Nominalism: With Attention to Its Relation to the Renaissance," *The Harvard Theological Review* 53 (1960), 57-60; Susan Schreiner, *Are You Alone Wise: The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 261-322; Nancy Caciola, *Discerning Spirits: Divine and Demonic Possession in the Middle Ages* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003).

⁸ Jules J. Toner, *Discerning God's Will: Ignatius of Loyola on Christian Decision Making* (St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources, 1991).

divine. According to Antonio de Nicolas, affections are cultivated through a full re-ordering of the senses in order to more closely imitate Christ.⁹ Ignatius writes with the objective of instilling in his readers a very specific interior affection, an interior pilgrimage finishing with the fortitude to resist the evil opponent's advances.¹⁰ Christ's battle standard is offered as a further buttress to this fortitude where, opposite the devil, the Lord who sacrificed himself on the cross in order to redeem humankind offers the continued grace of his support. He advises readers to "Consider how Christ our Lord takes his place in that great plain near Jerusalem, in an area which is lowly, beautiful, and attractive."¹¹ The affection that this image prompts is then related in Ignatius' text to the virtues that are necessary in order to stand under Christ's banner. All these virtues are framed as oppositions to something worldly that may be tools of Satan's army, "poverty in opposition to riches... reproaches or contempt in opposition to honor from the world... humility in opposition to pride."¹²

Ignatius' own spiritual exercises are rigorously scheduled,¹³ but there is flexibility in the affection that each exercise is designed to elicit, and Ignatius' rather aggressive military imagery is by no means the only standard.¹⁴ Pierre Force's discussion of spiritual exercises in the seventeenth century brings to light the considerable breadth of this category, tethering the objectives of spiritual exercise to identifiable and consistent objectives even as writers like

⁹ Antonio de Nicolas, *Powers of Imagining: Ignatius de Loyola, A Philosophical Hermeneutic of Imagining Through the Collected Works of Ignatius de Loyola, With a Translation of These Works* (Albany, NY: SUNY Press, 1986).

¹⁰ John C. Olin, "The Idea of Pilgrimage in the Experience of Ignatius Loyola," *Church History* 48 (1979): 388.

¹¹ Ignatius of Loyola, "Spiritual Exercises" in *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, ed. George E. Ganss (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1991): 155.

¹² *Ibid*, 156.

¹³ John W. O'Malley, *The First Jesuits* (Boston: Harvard University Press, 1995), 37-40.

¹⁴ John W. O'Malley, "Was Ignatius Loyola a Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism," *The Catholic Historical Review* 77 (1991): 184.

Montaigne and Pascal drifted further from more regulated examples like Ignatius. Force explains that, “reading and conversation are spiritual exercises that do for the soul what physical exercise does for the body: the stronger the training partner is, the more beneficial the exercise is likely to be.”¹⁵

Recogimiento can be settled within this line of guided practice, particularly insofar as it requires an active spirituality alongside its interiority. Training is therefore essential to it, and these writers inherited a millennia-old corpus of material on the function and training of the memory. Several decades after Ignatius’ career, we can see Teresa of Ávila place memory as the site where discursive reflection and transformative interior prayer are joined in the sixth dwelling place of *The Interior Castle*. The simultaneous receptivity and activity of the mind makes it an ideal subject for the ongoing project of reforming Catholic spirituality in Spain to something which is both interior and tied to a positive anthropology. Teresa writes of signs of Gods love, “The intellect represents them in such a way, and they are so stamped on the memory, that the mere sight of the Lord fallen to the ground in the garden with that frightful sweat is enough to last the intellect not only an hour but many days, while it looks with a simple gaze at who He is and how ungrateful we have been for so much suffering.”¹⁶ The able memory, formed to welcome God after five preceding dwelling places, remembers of God’s mercy for the purpose of cultivating spiritual affections that further invite God to dwell inside the believer.

The bulk of scholarly analysis of the training of the memory in the ancient and medieval period brings the field of study up to the beginning of the early modern period, but focus on how

¹⁵ Pierre Force, “Innovation as Spiritual Exercise: Montaigne and Pascal,” *Journal of the History of Ideas* 66 (2005): 24.

¹⁶ Teresa of Ávila, *The Interior Castle*, trans. Kieran Kavanaugh and Otilio Rodriguez (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1979), 148.

individual authors' integrate this tradition of memory training into their interior, experiential spirituality is the necessary next step in that research. The memory's function within *recogimiento* ties the long, earlier tradition of memory training to growing demands for a spirituality which both acknowledges more than the rigid, exteriorized faith of the late middle ages and permits an active anthropology that does not reduce the believer to pure passivity in his own spiritual development. Francisco's discussion of memory's reflexivity creates a point where activity and passivity are perfectly realized within the memory, permitting the believer to welcome God without compromising an understanding of the power of God's grace.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- “Document 12: Excerpts from the Trial of María de Cazalla, 1532-1534.” In *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*. Ed. and Trans. Homza, Lu Ann. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company. 2006.
- “Document 6: Inquisition Trial of María González, Wife of Pedro de Villareal. Ciudad Real, 1511-1513.” In *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*. Ed. and Trans. Homza, Lu Ann. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company. 2006.
- “Document 9: Letter from Friar Francisco Ortiz to Inquisitor General Alonso Manrique, April 9, 1529, Composed Inside the Toledo Tribunal of the Inquisition.” In *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*. Ed. and Trans. Homza, Lu Ann. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company. 2006.
- “Edicto de los Alumbrados de Toledo.” In *Los Alumbrados: Orígenes Y Filosofía 1525-1559*. Ed. Antonio Marquez. Madrid: Taurus Ediciones. 1972.
- “Edicto de los Alumbrados de Toledo.” *Los Alumbrados: Orígenes Y Filosofía 1525-1559*, ed. Márquez, Antonio. Madrid: Taurus Ediciones. 1972.
- “Proceso contra Pedro Ruiz de Alcaraz.” *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI*. Ed. Pedro Santonja. Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana. 2001.
- Ahlgren, Gillian T.W.. “Negotiating Sanctity: Holy Women in Sixteenth Century Spain.” *Church History* 64. 1995.
- Ahlgren, Gillian T.W.. *Enkindling Love: The Legacy of Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2016.
- Ahlgren, Gillian. *Francisca de los Apostoles: The Inquisition of Francisca: A Sixteenth-Century Visionary on Trial*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 2005.
- Andrés Martín, Melquiades. “Common Denominator of Alumbrados, Erasmians, ‘Lutherans,’ and Mystics: The Risk of a More ‘Intimate’ Spirituality.” In *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*. Trans. Esther da Costa-Frankel. Ed. Angel Alcalá. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Andrés Martín, Melquiades. *Los Recogidos: Nueva Vision de la Mistica Española (1500-1700)*. Madrid: Fundacion Universitaria Española, 1975.
- Andrés, Melquiades. “Alumbrados, Erasmians, ‘Lutherans,’ and Mystics: The Risk of a More ‘Intimate’ Spirituality.” In *The Spanish Inquisition and The Inquisitorial Mind*. Ed. Angel Alcalá. New York: Columbia University Press. 1987.

Andrés, Melquiades. “Los Alumbrados de Toledo en el Cuarto Abecedario Espiritual, O Ley de Amor de Francisco de Osuna (1530).” *Archivo Ibero-Americano* 41. 1981.

Andrés, Melquiades. *Historia de la mística de la Edad de Oro en España y América*. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos. 1994.

Asín Palacios, Miguel. “Sadilies y Alumbrados.” *Al-Andalus* 9. 1944.

Aspe, Maria-Paz. “Spanish Spirituality’s Mid-Sixteenth-Century Change of Course.” In *The Spanish Inquisition and the Inquisitorial Mind*. Trans. da Costa-Frankel, Esther. Ed. Alcalá, Angel. Highland Lakes, NJ: Columbia University Press. 1987.

Augustine of Hippo. *Confessions*. Trans. Chadwick, Henry. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Augustine of Hippo. *On the Trinity: Books 8-15*. Ed. Matthews, Gareth B. trans. McKenna, Stephen. New York: Cambridge University Press. 2002.

Barbetti, Claire. *Ekphrastic Medieval Visions: A New Discussion in Interarts Theory*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan. 2011.

Bataillon, Marcel. *Erasmus y España*. Translated by Antonio Alatorre. México D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Economica, 2007.

Bearden, Elizabeth B. *The Emblematics of the Self: Ekphrasis and Identity in Renaissance Imitations of Greek Romance*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 2012.

Belting, Hans. *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art*. Trans. Jephcott, Edmund. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1997.

Bernard of Clairvaux. “Sermon 2: On the Kiss.” in *Bernard of Clairvaux: Selected Works*. Trans. Evans, G.R.. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1987.

Bilinkoff, Jodi. “A Spanish Prophetess and Her Patrons: The Case of Maria de Santo Domingo.” *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 23 (1992).

Bonaventure. “The Soul’s Journey into God.” In *Bonaventure: The Soul’s Journey into God, The Tree of Life, The Life of St. Francis*. Trans. Cousins, Ewert. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1978.

Bonaventure. *Journey of the Mind into God*. Trans. Wickham-Smith, Simon. 2005.
<http://faculty.uml.edu/rinnis/45.304%20God%20and%20Philosophy/ITINERARIUM.pdf>

Boon, Jessica. “Mother Juana de la Cruz: Marian Visions and Female Preaching.” in *A New Companion to Hispanic Mysticism*. ed. Kallendorf, Hilaire. Leiden: Brill. 2010.

Brian Stock. *Augustine the Reader: Meditation, Self-Knowledge, and the Ethics of Interpretation*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 1996.

Carruthers, Mary. "Ars Oblivionalis, Ars Inveniendi: The Cherub Figure and the Arts of Memory." *GESTA* 48. 2009.

Carruthers, Mary. "Rhetorical *Memoria* in Commentary and Practice." In *The Rhetoric of Cicero in Its Medieval and Early Renaissance Commentary Tradition*. Ed. Cox, Virginia and Ward, John O.. Boston: Brill. 2006.

Carruthers, Mary. *The Book of Memory*. New York: Cambridge University Press. 2008.

Charipova, Liudmilla. "Peter Moyhla's Translation of 'The Imitation of Christ.'" *The Historical Journal* 46. 2003.

Chen-Morris, Raz. "Imagination, Passions, and the Production of Knowledge in Early Modern Europe: From Lipsius to Descartes." In *Knowledge and Religion in Early Modern Europe : Studies in Honor of Michael Heyd*. Ed. Herzig, Tamar, Heyd, Michael, Ben-Tov, Asaph and Deutsch, Taacov. Boston: Brill University Press. 2013.

Christian, Jr., William A. "Provoked Religious Weeping in Early Modern Spain." in *Religion and Emotion: Approaches and Interpretation* by Corrigan, John. New York: Oxford University Press. 2004.

Christ-von Wedel, Christine. *Erasmus of Rotterdam: Advocate of a New Christianity*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013.

Chubb, Taryn E. L. "De vita spirituali: San Vicente Ferrer, Cardinal Cisneros, and Fifteenth-Century Devotional Practices in Castilla." *La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures* 41. 2012.

Cisneros, Jiménez de. "Prologus," in *Complutensian Polyglot Bible*. Trans. Olin, John C. *Catholic Reform: from Cardinal Ximénes to the Council of Trent, 1495-1563: an essay with illustrative documents and a brief study of St. Ignatius Loyola*. New York: Fordham University Press. 1990.

Coleman, Janet. *Ancient and Medieval Memories: Studies in the Reconstruction of the Past*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

Conley, Thomas M.. "No Way to Pick a Fight: A Note on J.C. Scaliger's First *Oratorio contra Erasmum*." *Rhetorica: A Journal of the History of Rhetoric* 26. 2008.

Coroleu, Alejandro. "Anti-Erasmianism in Spain." In *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*. Ed. Rummel, Erika. Boston: Brill. 2008.

Coroleu, Alejandro. "Christian Classics and Humanism in Renaissance Barcelona: The Case of Pere Miquel Carbonell (1424-1517)." In *Humanism and Christian Letters in Early Modern Iberia (1480-1630)*. Ed. Coroleu, Alejandro and Taylor, Barry. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars. 2010.

Dag Nikolaus Hasse. "The Soul's Faculties." In *The Cambridge History of Medieval Philosophy*. Ed. Pasnau, Robert and Van Dyke, Christina. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 2010.

Daniel, E. Randolph. "Review: [Juan de Valdés and the Origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation.](#)" *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 41. 1973.

Davenport, Anne. A. "Scotus as the Father of Modernity. The Natural Philosophy of the English Franciscan Christopher Davenport in 1652." *Early Science and Medicine* 12. 2007.

Davidson, Arnold. Introduction to *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. 1995.

De Nicolas, Antonio. *Powers of Imagining: Ignatius de Loyola, A Philosophical Hermeneutic of Imagining Through the Collected Works of Ignatius de Loyola, With a Translation of These Works*. Albany: SUNY Press. 1986.

de Ros, Fidele. *Un maître de sainte Thérèse. Le Père François d'Osuna. Sa vie, son œuvre, sa doctrine spirituelle*. Paris: G. Beauchesne. 1936.

Decker, John R. "Engendering Contrition, Wounding the Soul: Geertgen Tot Sint Jans' 'Man of Sorrows.'" *Artibus et Historiae* 29. 2008.

Delio, Iliia. "Theology, Spirituality and Christ the Center: Bonaventure's Synthesis" in *A Companion to Bonaventure*. Ed. Goff, Jared, Wayne Hellman, J.A., Hammond, Jay M.. Boston: Brill. 2013.

Derbes, Anne. *Picturing the Passion in Late Medieval Italy: Narrative Painting, Franciscan Ideologies, and the Levant*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 1998.

Despres, Denise L. "Memory and Image: The Dissemination of a Franciscan Meditative Texts." *Mystics Quarterly* 16. 1990.

Duclow, Donald F. "'Whose Image is This?' in Eckhart's Sermons." *Mystics Quarterly* 15. 1989.

Dunkelgrun, Theodor. *The Multiplicity of Scripture: The Confluence of Textual Traditions in the Making of the Antwerp Polyglot Bible (1568-1573)*. PhD diss. University of Chicago. 2012.

Dupré, Louis. "Alienation and Redemption Through Time and Memory: An Essay on Religious Time Consciousness." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 43. 1975.

Dupré, Louis. *Passage to Modernity: An Essay in the Hermeneutics of Nature and Culture*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1993.

Edwards, J.H.. "Religious Belief and Social Conformity: The 'Converso' Problem in Late Medieval Córdoba." *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 31. 1981.

Eiximenis, Francesc. "On Two Kinds of Order that Aid Understanding and Memory." *The Medieval Craft of Memory: An Anthology of Texts and Pictures*. Ed. Carruthers, Mary and Ziolkowski, Jan. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2003.

Enenkel, Karl and Melion, Walter S.. "Introduction: Types and Functions of Late Medieval Meditation in the Transition from Late Medieval to Early Modern Culture." In *Meditatio: Refashioning the Self: Theory and Practice in Late Medieval and Early Modern Intellectual Culture*. Enenkel, Karl A.E. and Melion, Walter. Leiden: Brill. 2011.

Firpo, Massimo and Tedeschi, John. "The Italian Reformation and Juan de Valdés." *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 27. 1996.

Force, Pierre. "Innovation as Spiritual Exercise: Montaigne and Pascal." In *Journal of the History of Ideas* 66. 2005.

Fraker, Jr., Charles F. "The 'Dejados' and the Cancionero de Baena." *Hispanic Review* 33. 1965.

Francis of Assisi. *The Testament of St. Francis* (1226).

Francis Yates. *The Art of Memory*. London: ARK Paperbacks. 1984.

Francisco de Osuna. *Abecedario Espiritual V y VI partes: Vol. II Quinta Parte Del Abecedario Espiritual*. Ed. Quirós García, Mariano. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española. 2002.

Francisco de Osuna. *Ley de amor y quarta parte del abecedario espiritual do[n]de se trata[n] muy de rayz los misterios y preguntas: y exercicios del amor: y la theologia que pertenece no menos al entendimie[n]to*. Burgos, 1536.

Francisco de Osuna. *Primera Parte del Libro Llamado Abecedario Espiritual*. Lyon. 1537.

Francisco de Osuna. *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual*. Ed. López Santidrián, Saturnino Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos. 2005.

Francisco de Osuna. *Trilogium Evangelicum: Primum Christi passionem (quam ab infantia praesensit) docet, cui annectitur expositio accomoda canticorum graduum*. Toulouse. 1535.

Franciscso de Osuna. *La Cuarta Parte del Abecedario Espiritual*. Valladolid. 1551.

Frank, Thomas. "Exploring the Boundaries of Law in the Middle Ages: Franciscan Debates on Poverty, Property, and Inheritance." *Law and Literature* 20 (2008).

Frederick A. DeArmas. "Simple Magic: Ekphrasis from Antiquity to the Age of Cervantes." In *Ekphrasis in the Age of Cervantes*. Ed. DeArmas, Frederick Alfred. Cranbury, NJ: Rosemont Publishing. 2005.

Geybels, Hans. *Cognitio Dei Experimentalis: A Theological Genealogy of Christian Religious Experience*. Charlottesville, VA: University Press. 2007.

Giordano, María Laura. "'La Ciudad de Nuestra Conciencia:' Los Conversos y la Construcción de la Identidad Judeocristiana (1449-1556)." *Hispania Sacra* 62. 2010.

Gleason, Elisabeth. *Renaissance Thought in Sixteenth-Century Italy*. Chico, CA: Scholar's Press, 1981.

Goldhill, Simon. "Ekphrasis Introduction: Eight Ways of Looking at Ekphrasis." *Classical Philology* 102. 2007.

Gregory IX. *Quo Elongati* (1230).

Grendler, Paul F.. "Form and Function in Italian Renaissance Popular Books." *Renaissance Quarterly* 46. 1993.

Groult, Pierre. *Les Mystiques des Pays-Bas et la Littérature Espagnole du Seizième Siècle*. Louvain: Uystpruyst. 1927.

Hadot, Pierre. *Philosophy as a Way of Life: Spiritual Exercises from Socrates to Foucault*. Trans. Michael Chase. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing. 1995.

Hamilton, Alastair. "The *Alumbrados*: *Dejamiento* and its Practicioners." In *A New Companion to Hispanic Mysticism*. Ed. Kallendorf, Hilaire. Boston: Brill. 2010.

Hamilton, Alastair. *Heresy and Mysticism in Sixteenth Century Spain: The Alumbrados*. Cambridge: J. Clarke. 1992.

Hayes, Zachary. "Bonaventure's Trinitarian Theology: Historical Orientation of the Trinitarian Perspectives of St. Augustine and St. Richard of Victor." In *A Companion to Bonaventure*. Ed. Goff, Jared, Hellman, J.A. Wayne, and Hammond, Jay M.. Boston: Brill. 2013.

Henderson, Charles. *Construction of Orthodoxy and Heresy: Neo-Confucian, Islamic, Jewish, and Early Christian Patterns*. Albany: SUNY Press. 1998.

Homza, Lu Ann. "Erasmus as Hero, or Heretic? Spanish Humanism and the Valladolid Assembly of 1527." *Renaissance Quarterly of America* 50. 1997.

Homza, Lu Ann. Introduction to *The Spanish Inquisition 1478-1614: An Anthology of Sources*. Ed. Homza, Lu Ann. Indianapolis: Hackett. 2006.

- Hugh of St. Victor. "A Little Book About Constructing Noah's Ark." In *The Medieval Craft of Memory*. Ed. Carruthers, Mary. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2002.
- Ignatius of Loyola. "Spiritual Exercises." In *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works* by Ignatius of Loyola. Ed. Ganss, George. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1991
- Jager, Eric. *The Book of the Heart*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 2000.
- James Wetzel. "Splendid Vices and Secular Virtues: Variations on Milbanks' Augustine." *The Journal of Religious Ethics* 32. 2004.
- Jones, John N. "Honey Without God: Francisco de Osuna's Higher Memory." In *Spain and its Literature: Essays in Memory of E. Allison Peers*. ed. MacKenzie, Ann L.. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press. 2004.
- Kamerick, Kathleen. "Art and Moral Vision in Angela of Foligno and Margery Kempe." *Mystics Quarterly* 21. 1995.
- Kelley, Nicole. "Philosophy as Training for Death: Reading the Ancient Christian Martyr Acts as Spiritual Exercises." *Church History* 75. 2006.
- Kinder, A. Gordon. "Protestantism in Sixteenth Century Spain." *Mediterranean Studies* 3 (1992): 61-70.
- Knuuttila, Simo and Kärkkäinen, Pekka. "Medieval Theories of Internal Senses." In *Sourcebook for the History of the Philosophy of Mind Simo Knuuttila Juha Sihvola Editors Philosophical Psychology from Plato to Kant*. New York: Springer. 2014.
- LaNave, Gregory. "Knowing God Through and In All Things: A Proposal for Reading Bonaventure's *Itinerarium Mentis in Deum*." *Franciscan Studies* 67. 2009.
- Laven, Mary. "Encountering the Counter-Reformation." *Renaissance Quarterly* 59. 2006.
- Levi, Anthony. *Renaissance and Reformation: The Intellectual Genesis*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002.
- Lindberg, David C. *Theories of Vision from Al-Kindi to Kepler*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1976.
- Loewen, Peter. "Portrayals of the Viti Christi in the Medieval German Marienklage: Signs of Franciscan Exegesis and Rhetoric in Drama and Music." in *Comparative Drama* 42. 2008.
- Longhurst, John. *Luther's Ghost in Spain (1517-1546)*. Lawrence, KS: Coronado Press. 1969
- López Santidrián, Saturnino. introduction to *Tercer Abecedario Espiritual* by Francisco de Osuna. ed. Saturnino López Santidrián. Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos: Madrid. 2005.

- Maas, Anthony, "Versions of the Bible," *The Catholic Encyclopedia* 15 (1912).
- Martz, Louis L.. *The Poetry of Meditation: A Study in English Religious Literature of the Seventeenth Century*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1976.
- McGinn, Bernard. "'Evil-Sounding, Rash, and Suspect of Heresy': Tensions between Mysticism and Magisterium in the History of the Church." *The Catholic Historical Review* 90. 2004.
- McGinn, Bernard. "The Changing Shape of Late Medieval Monasticism." *Church History* 65. 1996.
- McGinn, Bernard. *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism – 1200-1350*. New York: Crossroad Publishing Company. 1998.
- McNamer, Sarah. *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2010.
- Meilaender, Gilbert. "Sweet Necessities: Food, Sex, and Augustine." *The Journal of Religious Ethics* 29. 2001.
- Muessig, Carolyn. "Bernardino da Siena and Observant Preaching as a Vehicle for Religious Transformation." In *A Companion to Observant Reform in the Late Middle Ages and Beyond*. ed. Rooest, Bert and Mixson, James D.. Boston: Brill. 2015.
- Nagy, Piroska. "Religious Weeping as Ritual in the Medieval West." *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice* 48. 2004.
- Nancy Caciola. *Discerning Spirits: Divine and Demonic Possession in the Middle Ages*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. 2003.
- Nelson, Lynn H. and Weiss, Arnold H. "An Early Life of Francisco Jiménez de Cisneros." *Franciscan Studies* 42 (1982).
- Netanyahu, Benzion. *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain*. New York: New York Review Books. 2001.
- Nieto, Jose. *Juan de Valdés and the origins of the Spanish and Italian Reformation*. Genève: Droz. 1970.
- Nieto, Jose. "The Nonmystical Nature of the Sixteenth-Century Alumbrados of Toledo." In *The Spanish Inquisition*. Columbia University Press: New York. 1987.
- Nino, Andres G. "Spiritual Exercises in Augustine's *Confessions*." *Journal of Religion and Health* 47. 2008.

Nirenberg, David. "Conversion, Sex, and Segregation: Jews and Christians in Medieval Spain." *The American Historical Review* 107. 2002.

O'Malley, John W.. "Was Ignatius Loyola a Church Reformer? How to Look at Early Modern Catholicism." In *The Catholic Historical Review* 77. 1991.

O'Malley, John W.. *The First Jesuits*. Boston: Harvard University Press. 1995.

Oberman, Heiko. "Some Notes on the Theology of Nominalism: With Attention to Its Relation to the Renaissance." *The Harvard Theological Review* 53. 1960.

Olin, John C.. "The Idea of Pilgrimage in the Experience of Ignatius Loyola." In *Church History* 48. 1979.

Ortega-Monasterio, Teresa. "Textual Criticism of the Bible in the Spanish Renaissance." *TC: A Journal of Biblical Textual Criticism* 13. 2008.

Ozment, Steven. *The Age of Reform: 1250-1550: An Intellectual and Religious History of Late Medieval and Reformation Europe*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1980.

Parshall, Peter. "The Art of Memory and the Passion." *The Art Bulletin* 81. 1999.

Pasnau, Robert. *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages*. New York: Cambridge University Press. 1997.

Pastore, Estafania. "Mujeres, Lecturas Y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan de Castillo." Trans. Josep Monter. *Historia Social* 57. 2007.

Pastore, Estafania. "False Trials and Jews with Old-Fashioned Names: Converso Memory in Toledo." *La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literature, and Cultures* 41. 2012.

Pastore, Stefania. "Mujeres, Lecturas, y Alumbradismo Radical: Petronila de Lucena y Juan del Castillo." Trans. Monter, Josep. *Historia Social* 57. 2007.

Pastore, Stefania. *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)*. Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2010.

Pastore, Stefania. *Una herejía española: conversos, alumbrados e Inquisición (1449-1559)*. Madrid: Marcial Pons. 2010.

Pérez-Díaz, Victor. "State and Public Sphere in Spain During the Ancient Regime." *Daedalus* 127. 1998.

Plotinus. *Enneads*. Trans. McKenna, Stephen and Page, B.S.. London: Aeterna Press. 2015.

Poole, Stafford. "Juan de Ovando's Reform of the University of Alcalá de Henares." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 21 (1990): 575-584.

Post, R.R. *The Modern Devotion: Confrontation with Reformation and Humanism*. Leiden: Brill. 1968.

Quirós García, Mariano. *Abecedario Espiritual: V y VI partes. Vol. I: Estudio Introductorio*. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 2002.

Quirós García, Mariano. "El itinerario del recogimiento en la quinta parte del Abecedario espiritual de Francisco de Osuna. Aspectos doctrinales y léxicos." *Revista de Lexicografía* 5. 1998.

Quirós García, Mariano. *Francisco de Osuna y la imprenta: catálogo biobibliográfico*. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca. 2010.

Rifkin, Adrian. "Addressing Ekphrasis: A Prolegomenon to the Next." *Classical Philology* 102. 2007.

Rodríguez, Carlos del Valle. "Antonio Nebrija's Biblical Scholarship." In *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*. Ed. Erika Rummel. Boston: Brill. 2008.

Roest, Bert. *Franciscan Literature of Religious Instruction Before the Council of Trent*. Boston: Brill. 2004.

Rosenswein, Barbara. "Worrying About Emotions in History." *The American Historical Review* 107. 2002.

Rummel, Erika. "The Importance of Being Doctor: The Quarrel Over Competency Between Humanists and Theologians in the Renaissance." *The Catholic Historical Review* 82. 1996.

Rummel, Erika. *Erasmus*. New York: Continuum. 2004.

Rummel, Erika. *Jimenez de Cisneros: On the Threshold of Spain's Golden Age*. Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies. 1999.

Santonja, Pedro. *La Herejía de los Alumbrados y la Espiritualidad en la España del Siglo XVI*. Valencia: Biblioteca Valenciana, 2001.

Sarraute, Michel-Ange. "La Vie Franciscaine en Espagne entre les deux couronnements de Charles Quint." *Revista de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos* 29. 1913.

Scholte, Bob. "Toward a Reflexive and Critical Anthropology." In *Reinventing Anthropology*. Ed. Hymes, Dell. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. 1972.

- Schreiner, Susan. *Are You Alone Wise: The Search for Certainty in the Early Modern Era*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Selke de Sánchez, Angela. "Algunos datos nuevos sobre los primeros alumbrados. El Edicto de 1525 y su relación con el proceso de Alcaraz." *Bulletin Hispanique* 54. 1952.
- Sherly-Price, Leo. Introduction to *Imitation of Christ* by Thomas à Kempis. New York: Penguin, 1952.
- Silva, José Filipe and Toivanen, Juhana. "The active nature of the soul in sense perception: Robert Kilwardby and Peter Olivi." *Vivarium* 48. 2010.
- Simons, Walter. *Cities of Ladies: Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200-1565*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 2003.
- Slater, John. "History as Ekphrastic Genre in Early Modern Spain." *MLN* 122. 2007.
- Stalnaker, Aaron. "Spiritual Exercises and the Grace of God: Paradoxes of Personal Formation in Augustine." *Journal of the Society of Christian Ethics* 24. 2004.
- Stephen L. Shoemaker. "Mary at the Cross, East and West: Maternal Compassion and Affective Piety in the Earliest *Life of the Virgin* and the High Middle Ages." *The Journal of Theological Studies* 62. 2011.
- Stuczynski, Claude B.. "Pro-*Converso* Apologetics and Biblical Exegesis." in *The Hebrew Bible in Fifteenth-Century Spain: Exegesis, Literature, Philosophy, and the Arts*. Ed. Decter, Jonathan and Prats, Arturo. Leiden: Brill. 2012.
- Stump, Philip H.. "The Continuing Relevance of the Idea of Reform." in *Reassessing Reform*. Ed. Flanagan, David Zachariah and Belitto, Christopher M.. Washington D.C.: Catholic University Press. 2012.
- Surtz, Ronald E.. "La madre Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534) y la cuestión de la autoridad religiosa femenina." *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica* 33 (1984).
- Teresa of Ávila. *The Interior Castle*. Trans. Kavanaugh, Kieran and Rodriguez, Otilio. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1979.
- Thomas á Kempis. *Imitation of Christ*. Trans. Leo Sherley-Price. New York: Penguin. 1952.
- Thomas, Werner. *La represión del protestantismo en España, 1517-1648*. Leuven: Leuven University Press. 2001.
- Toivanen, Juhana. *Perception and the Internal Senses: Peter of John Olivi on the Cognitive Functions of the Sensitive Soul*. Leiden: Brill. 2013.

Toner, Jules J. SJ. *Discerning God's Will: Ignatius of Loyola on Christian Decision Making*. St. Louis: Institute of Jesuit Sources. 1991.

Van Engen, John. Introduction to *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1988.

Van Engen, John. *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Latter Middle Ages*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. 1988.

Van Liere, Katherine Elliot. "After Nebrija: Academic Reformers and the Teaching of Latin in Sixteenth-Century Salamanca." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 34. 2003.

Von Habsburg, Maxmilian. *Catholic and Protestant Translations of the Imitatio Christi, 1425-1650: From Late Medieval Classic to Early Modern Bestseller*. Farnham, Surrey: Routledge. 2011.

von Stuckrad, Kocku. *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities*. Leiden, Brill, 2010.

Webb, Ruth. *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice*. Farnham, England: Routledge. 2009.

Welz, Claudia. "Imago Dei: References to the Invisible." *Studia Theologica* 65. 2011.

Westphall, Alan F.. "On Not Melting into Tears: Managing Meditative Reading in Michigan State University Library, MS1 and Cambridge, Magdalene College, MS Pepys 2125." *Medium Aevum* 74. 2015.

Whitehill, Paul. "The 42 Names of 'Recollection: Meaning and Aesthetics in the Third Spiritual Alphabet." *Mystics Quarterly* 33. 2007.

Zerbolt, Gerard. "The Spiritual Ascents." in *Devotio Moderna: Basic Writings*. Trans. Van Engen, John. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press. 1988.